Welcome to TASA 2016 Conference

The Australian Catholic University hosts The Australian Sociological Association (TASA) Conference 2016. This year’s conference explores the theme ‘Cities and Successful Societies’. Melbourne is a fitting location for TASA 2016. As the ‘World’s Most Livable City’ (The Economist) and the ‘Second Best Student City in the World’ (QR University Rankings), Melbourne is frequently cited by politicians, economists and planners as an exemplar 21st century global city. Yet despite its reputation as a cultural hub and tourist destination, the city is also home to many social problems found in ‘less successful’ societies. From record housing unaffordability, growing inequality to a domestic violence epidemic, Melbourne provides a unique lens through which to study the byproducts faced by so-called successful societies.

If Australia is the ‘lucky country’ and Melbourne the world’s most livable city, then just what do we mean when we label a city or society successful? What are the preconditions of human flourishing? Are Melburnians and Australians ‘happy’? Is there such a thing as an acceptable level of housing and income inequality? To what extent must environmental and sustainability concerns be central considerations of daily life? What is the base level of respect and dignity with which we must treat our most vulnerable and disadvantaged members of society? How do we overcome differences of belief to build a socially cohesive and inclusive society? These are the questions at the heart of the intellectual programme of this year’s TASA conference.

Conference convener
Mark Chou Mark.Chou@acu.edu.au

TASA is the professional association of Sociologists in Australia. Each year TASA hosts its annual conference in different locations across capital cities and regional towns. The aim of each Conference is to further progress the Sociological agenda to local communities and students who might not have the funds to travel. TASA is ably assisted with Canberra-based Conference Solutions and TASA Conferences have the feel of ‘community’, which is great for learning and networking.

The Conference proceedings has been compiled and formatted by TASA member Roger Wilkinson. It is hoped that the proceedings gain wide coverage amongst the sociological community and concerned individuals who might be searching the Internet for contemporary research about local, Australian and overseas research.

Sally Daly
Executive Officer, TASA admin@tasa.org.au

Roger Wilkinson rogerwilkinson333@gmail.com
# Table of Contents

**Critical Friends: Reflections on the ethics of the setting-up process of an Aboriginal Reference Group for an art-based exploratory research project with two Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities**  
*Elinor Assoulin* .................................................................................................................. 1

**The Collapse of Buildings in Cities in Ghana: Reasoning Beyond ‘Scientism’**  
*Festival Godwin Boateng* ........................................................................................................ 7

**Affective Labour in ‘Hip’ Melbourne Cafés and Bars: In defence of Hardt and Negri’s thesis**  
*Alexia Cameron* .................................................................................................................... 13

**‘A Whole New World’: On Peter Wagner and the Political Project of ‘World-Making’**  
*Erin Carlisle* .......................................................................................................................... 19

**Resistance in Australian employment services: A critical account**  
*Simone Casey* ......................................................................................................................... 25

**The Involvement of International Justice in the Exhumation of Timoteo Mendieta Alcalá**  
*Natalia Maystorovich Chulio* .................................................................................................. 32

**Ageing-in-place and the risks associated with housing in later life**  
*Cassie Curryer* ....................................................................................................................... 39

**Imagining LGBTIQ Communities: An Ethnographic Study from Bogota, Colombia**  
*Shai Diner* .............................................................................................................................. 46

**Mad Men and the search for meaning**  
*Scott Doidge* ......................................................................................................................... 56

**Gendered Responsibilisation in the Night-Time Economy**  
*Leisha Du Preez and Phillip Wadds,* .................................................................................... 65
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Constructing nudges: Understanding the public policy phenomenon.</td>
<td>Colette Einfeld</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Undergraduate’s religious affiliation and interpersonal relationships in University of Nigeria Nsukka (Unn) and Nnamdi Azikiwe University (Nau) Awka.</td>
<td>Enyi Blessing Uchenna</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The operation of Zakat and Role of Intermediaries (Sifarish): A case study of social assistance program in Pakistan</td>
<td>Aniqa Farwa</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How Cultural Health Capital Shapes Goal Negotiation in Self-Management Support Consultations</td>
<td>Marika Franklin</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Devil Never Wins Unless One Doesn’t Fight: Human Flourishing in the Poorest City in the World</td>
<td>Peter Green</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Defining health: How users and practitioners of Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicine experience health care in a remote area of Australia.</td>
<td>Aqua Hastings</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does Western knowledge flow into Chinese universities? A case study of Chinese returned academics and academic knowledge flows</td>
<td>Yijun Hu</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards togetherness: Change in financial organisation within couples with transitions towards marriage and parenthood</td>
<td>Yangtao Huang</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>We Don’t Want To Be A Tick Box For Your Quality Control!</td>
<td>Lou Iaquinto</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustaining indigenous connections: Rural-urban orang Asli migrants in peninsular Malaysia</td>
<td>Govindran Jegatesen</td>
<td>139</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Safe(r) Schools & Families for Students with Intersex Variations
  Tiffany Jones ................................................................. 146

Netnographic research of online communities and culture
  Stephanie T. Jong .......................................................... 154

The framing of federal domestic violence policy responses
  Georgia Keam and Kay Cook ............................................. 164

Student Mobility from Central / Eastern Europe: Towards a Shared Europeanness
  Liudmila Kirpitchenko and Lejla Voloder, ............................ 179

Ignorance is Bliss: Why Dementia is a Useful Metaphor for Society’s Coming Energy Descent
  Cathryn Kriewaldt .......................................................... 186

Disindividualisation: Religious Identity Negotiation Amongst Young Australian Buddhist Practitioners
  Kim Lam ............................................................................. 195

The Politics of Space in Dhaka: Informality, Power and Negotiations in the Everyday Life of the Urban Poor
  Lutfun Nahar Lata and Peter Walters ..................................... 201

Theorising internal institutional diversity: Elinor Ostrom on rules and social conflict
  Duncan Law .................................................................... 209

Docile Bodies and Minds: A Genealogy of Chinese Workers in China
  Elly Leung ....................................................................... 215

“Keen as fuck”: The subjectifying effects of young people’s discursive and practical outcomes from participating in semi-structured interviews.
  Ben Lohmeyer ................................................................. 222

Hazara stories of transition from flight to success: Reflecting on embodied interviewing practice in two interviews with post-settlement refugee Australian Hazaras
  Laurel Mackenzie ............................................................ 229
The Lucky Country vs. a Fierce Planet: Gamification and Simulation as Tools for Teaching Complex Social Theories of Sustainability

Liam Magee, Anthony Richardson and Nicole Pepperell. .......................... 236

Governmentality, Case Management and Risk of Young Post-release People.

Joel Robert McGregor ................................................................................. 243

Positioning Transnationalism as a Theoretical Perspective for Understanding Migration

Toniey J Munro. .............................................................................................. 249

Young People in a De-Industrialising City: Metaphors and Spaces of Flows

Meave Noonan .............................................................................................. 259

Responding to the productivist paradigm: Experiences of farmers Victoria’s western Wimmera, Australia

Patrick O’Keeffe. ............................................................................................ 266

Agency and the Interaction Order: The Feminine Tattooed Body

Benjamin C. Pinkard and Peta S. Cook, ......................................................... 273

Risky food and water? Health and environmental knowledge and information-seeking in Australia.

Angela T. Ragusa and Andrea Crampton. ..................................................... 279

Insights from the Sarvodaya Five Stage Village Development Model for Sustainable Development Planning and Strategy Formulation – A Spirituality-based Approach

Praveena Rajkobal. ............................................................................................ 288

Evictions and Urban Socio-spatial Relations: Evidence from a Southeast Asian Metropolitan Area

Redento Recio .................................................................................................... 295

Building Community in Masterplanned Estates: No Place for Culturally Diverse Aspirations?

Christian Roggenbuck. .................................................................................. 303
Infrastructural unevenness in Bangladesh: A ‘privatised world of technological improvisation’

Ritu Parna Roy .................................................. 309

Gender and Civic Engagement: The Bagcilar Municipality Women’s Council in Istanbul

Oznur Sahin .................................................. 315

On Castoriadis and Ricoeur's Conceptions of creative social imaginaries

George Sarantoulias ........................................... 321

Death, Modernity and Harry Potter: Why is a story of magic and mortality popular in disenchanted, death-averse times?

Melinda Turner .............................................. 327

Militarisation of the Urban Environment and the Consequences of the Climate Justice Movement: Dystopian Visions of the late-capitalist city from Melbourne to Paris

Alexander Waters ........................................... 333

Sex as work? Theorising unwanted sex in stable heterosexual relationships

Catherine Weiss ........................................... 340

Social exclusion in the everyday: (Re)conceptualizing student-migrant experiences in Australia

Xinyu Zhao .................................................. 347
Critical Friends: Reflections on the ethics of the setting-up process of an Aboriginal Reference Group for an art-based exploratory research project with two Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities

Elinor Assoulin
School of Global, Urban & Social Studies RMIT University

Abstract
The process of navigating ethical concerns - both formal and informal - when conducting research in Indigenous communities is now well-researched. Indeed, there is a rich literature that spans topics from formal ethical guidelines through to observations from Indigenous scholars on the historical damage caused by poorly designed research (Smith, 1999; Jamieson et al., 2012; Pyett & the Vic Health Koori Health Research and Community Development Unit, 2002; Pyett, Waples-Crowe, & Sterren, 2009; Bullen, 2004; Humphery, 2001; Wolgemuth, Tootell, & Lea, 2008; Dunbar & Scrimgeour, 2014; Crespigny, Emden, Kowanko, & Murray, 2004).

The ethical guidelines from the National Health & Medical Research Council (NHMRC) and the Australian Institute of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander Studies (AIATSIS) are seen as central frameworks for research practice in Indigenous contexts. More specifically, these documents are used in the preparation of ethics applications in order to comply with requirements from Universities and/or Government Departments. These guidelines have attracted a range of responses from scholars in the field with some arguing that too great a focus is placed on individual projects as the drivers of change in research practice, and little on the changes required at the broader institutional and local practices level (Humphery, 2001, p.201). Others have argued for the guidelines to be seen as bases upon which negotiated research agreements can be framed, rather than simply as a static set of prescribed rules that a project must meet (Dunbar & Scrimgeour, 2014, p.58). In addition, other researchers have reflected on their lengthy experiences in order to identify additional principles to enhance and support existing NHMRC guidelines (Jamieson et al., 2012; Pyett & the Vic Health Koori Health Research and Community Development Unit, 2002).

The topic of consultation is central in discussion about research practice within formal guidelines and in much of the literature cited above. The Guidelines from AIATSIS (2012),
includes consultation in the title of three of its 14 principles, and refers to it throughout the document as the foundation for research with Indigenous people. Similarly, the NHMRC (2003) has the concept of consultation interwoven throughout its six core values. However, as Pyett and the Vic Health Koori Health Research and Community Development Unit (2002) have indicated, the guidelines do not provide elaborated specification on what appropriate consultation entails. In addition, Pyett, Waples-Crowe & Sterren (2008, p.52) discuss differences in approaches to consultation with communities in rural and in urban context, suggesting that the later should begin at the broader level with the relevant peak body through which suitable representatives at community level can be allocated for a more tailored consultation. Anderson et al. (1996 In Dunbar & Scrimgeour, 2014, p.58) believe that it’s not viable to create clear and defined guidelines on community consultation. Instead, guidelines should allow flexibility in the actualisation of consultation while providing a framework though which consultation is evident through either formal partnership or research agreement.

In this paper I aim to critically reflect on my experiences of the setting-up process of an Aboriginal Reference Group for an art-based research project with two Indigenous communities in South Western Victoria. In doing so, I will refer back to specific pieces of literature that are either compatible with my experiences, or where my observations suggest that further analysis or elaboration is required. In the over-arching reflections on this process, I have found the common themes of the setting-up process to be: **Locations for Research: Reality vs. Romantic Notions; Contact Person; Trust, Time & Flexibility; Aboriginal Reference Group turned Critical Friends; Information to participants & Consent forms; and Structure vs. Agency.**

I will begin by briefly setting the context for my research, and continue with reflections on the theme of an **Aboriginal Reference Group turned Critical Friends.** While my research design adhered to principles within both formal Guidelines and existing literature, the experience of this process revealed that flexibility remains the driving force for setting up an Aboriginal Reference Group. In order to bridge the gap between guidelines, principles and practice, I have renamed this process **Critical Friends.** Such language was helpful in lifting the need to fulfil set expectations associated with terms such as reference group or steering committee, which also often reflect ‘Western’ way of knowing, from both key Indigenous people in the communities and the researcher while maintain high levels of integrity and ethics. The term Critical Friends has proven to better represent the wish of the communities to have a more individual process of consultation that is based on arising needs, and the interest, skill and availability of key persons within the community.

**Context**

As an art therapist and immigrant to Australia, I have had a lasting interest in exploration of the links between art, race, culture and identity as they are manifested through interpersonal and intrapersonal visual communications. The notion of expressing oneself through an image isn’t new, nor is it exclusive to the discipline of art therapy (AT). However, AT is different to traditional art making in that the focus is on the process of creating and meaning making rather than on an end product, and does not require artistic skills (ANZATA, 2015; AATA, 2015). Art therapy, regardless of its theoretical framing is based on the notion that visual representations are

---

1 I would like to acknowledge a Critical Friend, Faye McMillan, a Wiradjuri woman from Charles Sturt University for introducing this term to me during early consultations. The term means here that the key Indigenous people, with whom consultations take place, are seen as critical friends to ensure this process is carried appropriately yet in accordance with their wishes on how it should take place. That is: on a need basis; often through individual interactions; and without titles such as reference group or steering committees, which can often imply ‘Western’ and highly structured mechanism of operation.
less interruptive and distortive than verbal interpretations of sensory-based experiences (Weiser, 2004).

My research inquires as to the lived experiences of partaking in a group art program that enables the exploration of self-expressions through the combination of art therapy tools and processes and local Indigenous knowledge systems. The hypothesis is that since the use of art making as a vehicle for expression and meaning making is a universal practice, the utilisation of specific AT tools and processes can hold twofold potential outcomes for research alongside Indigenous populations. The first responds to enhancement of individual existential knowing within cultural identities, and the second relates to enhanced communication between two different worldviews. I see the use of art-based methods as a possible response to the claim that traditional research methods have failed to enhance understanding of how improvements to Aboriginal health can be achieved (Anderson, 1996 In Pyett and the Vic Health Koori Health Research and Community Development Unit, 2002).

However, the word therapy inevitably carries a pathologizing shadow, which is amplified in the context of research alongside Indigenous population. This proposed research is not intended to provide AT to Indigenous people, and such starting point from a non-Indigenous researcher can appear oppressive. I found the use of language around this core aspect of the research important to the initial consultation phase, and I discuss this aspect further in the over-arching work. Its important to note here is that while my research design carries a therapeutic dimension, I do not seek to test the hypothesis about the program being delivered. Rather, I seek to use established AT tools and processes as the basis for an open-ended exploration of the experiences of both participants and myself.

The Research Project
The research project consists of 20 weekly sessions of an art-making program with gender-based cohorts of Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples across two locations in South Western Victoria. An Aboriginal community controlled health service in a small country town hosts the research project for a group of Indigenous women from neighbouring towns, and a correctional facility hosts the research program for a group of Indigenous men. The number of potential participants varies from eight to twelve depending on the location. The information to be gathered in these sessions takes on visual, written, and verbal forms. The planning and delivery of the art-making program is a product of collaboration between the researcher, the Critical Friends within each location, and other key professionals associated with the participating organisations.

Aboriginal Reference Group turned Critical Friends
As Tuhuiwai Smith (2005) has argued, establishing reciprocal and respectful relationships is a key feature of an ethical research practice (p.97). The terms: Aboriginal Reference Group; Advisory group; and Steering committees, have been used across the literature to describe a mechanism through which respect for community, ownership and control, as well as accountability to the community, and appropriateness and relevance of the research can be demonstrated (Pyett, Waples-Crowe & Sterren, 2008; Pyett, 2008; Crespigny, Emden, Kowanko, & Murray, 2004; Jamieson et al., 2012; Wolgemuth, Tootell, & Lea, 2008).

Similarly to Pyett, Waples-Crowe & Sterren (2008), I have approached the task of establishing an Aboriginal Reference Group (ARG) for the first community by making contacts with two Elders and the team at the hosting organisation. These people were introduced to me by one of my supervisors who is an Indigenous professor connected with the community. However, while Pyett, Waples-Crowe & Sterren (2008), advise to establish a consistent membership early in the project, I have found that my attempts to do so met with resistance. During an initial meeting, three Elders, an Aboriginal community member, and two non-Indigenous professionals from the
hosting organisation have attended. All the Indigenous people present have expressed willingness to sit on an ARG and have also discussed other potential people for the role. However, with time, I have found, similarly to Jamieson et al. (2012), that membership on the group placed a substantial burden and expectations on one Elder and one non-Indigenous worker to carry the load for the group. Jamieson et al. (2012) have suggested that in such cases, where an ARG is not possible, the role of individual Indigenous staff or community members “becomes even more critical” (p.17). While elaborations on what this critical role constitute are not provided, it can be assumed that such individual might carry the duties associated with membership. I have approached both Elder and non-Indigenous worker to further discuss how they would like to proceed with the formalities associated with the ARG given the challenges in actualising participation from other nominated members. By avoiding direct conversations, I believe the Elder have indicated that the formalisation of the ARG was not of high importance. When we came to finalise the art making program, the Elder brought another Elder with her and together with the non-Indigenous staff we have worked to ensure the needs and cultural perspectives of the community as well as my interest in utilising art therapy tools and processes were met. Few months later, in a conference, I have met with the other male Elder who was present at the initial ARG meeting, and he has explained that consultation on need basis suited him better.

My experience with the process of establishing an ARG with this community echoes the suggestion made by Dunbar & Scrimgeour (2014), that by providing only the outline of Indigenous cultural principles, the Guidelines emphasizes the autonomy of Indigenous people at community level to make decisions about their levels of engagement with research. It seems that while the community leaders were aware of the purpose and role of the ARG, having full attendance to meetings was never possible or desired. The daily reality of members includes far more urgent business that requires their attention. Rather than insist or expect the design to be actualised to its last detail, I had to work with whoever was available at the time. I have kept members updated regularly via emails and phone calls (in moderation), and found these communication methods useful in sustaining the consultation process.

The roles of the ARG, which we have identified as vital for the research project included: the approval for the research to take place; collaboration on the development of the art making program to reflect both local cultural perspective and knowledge as well as the utilisation of AT tools and processes; capacity building through the inclusion and training of an Indigenous co-facilitator; approval of findings for publication; and joint ownership over the findings. I have also committed to volunteer my time and knowledge to the hosting organisation on the development and delivery of a similar program to a different target group in the future.

Jamieson et al. (2012, p.17) argue that researchers should constantly review their study goals with an ARG, Pyett (2012, p.59) states that all research with Indigenous people should have an ARG monitoring them either directly or indirectly, and Pyett, Wäples-Crowe & Sterren (2008, p.53) contend that relationship between the researcher and the ARG should be formalised through a Memorandum of Understandings. While I share the view that such measures reflect ethical research practice, I have found through my experience with this community, that there was no need for constant review of study goals, that members preferred conversation on need basis to regular mechanism of monitoring, and that rather than urgency on producing a memorandum of understanding, they preferred we honour a verbal agreement and focus on ensuring the art-making program is of appropriate standards.

When coming to reflect on the setting-up process of an ARG for the second community, a group of Indigenous men at a correctional facility, I found similar yet also additional different experiences. Proposed research with Indigenous people in a correctional facility requires the completion of an elaborated ethics application designed by the Department of Justice (DoJ).
Pyett, Waples-Crowe & Sterren (2008) have suggested that letters of support for research projects should be sought only after sufficient consultation has occurred (p.52). While this might be applicable for research which takes place within communities, the criteria for submission of ethics application to the DoJ is dependent on letters of support from the Manager of the correctional facility and from the Koori Justice Unit (KJU), and does not require evidence of consultation with an ARG.

Next, I was informed that an ethics application couldn't proceed to the Justice Human Research Ethics Committee (JHREC), before it had been reviewed and supported by the Corrections Victoria Research Committee (CVRC). Upon review, the CVRC requested that I engage in discussions with the Manager of Aboriginal Programs at Correction Victoria (CV) before support can be granted. In this instant the appropriate person at Aboriginal program, JV, granted an approval during early contact. However as Jamieson et al. (2012) has indicated, leadership turnover among Indigenous stakeholders can be high, and the lack of full handover has resulted in the need to undertake an additional process of approval. Jamieson et al. (2012) wisely suggest that the researcher attempt to anticipate such occurrence in advance and seek advice from ARG members. However, in this example, while the DoJ have created the new role of an Aboriginal Program manager, changes were not made to its Ethics application to indicate that a letter of support from the JV Aboriginal Program Manager is required. Furthermore, the fact that this change took place at high-end governance with no formal announcement meant that both my Critical Friends and myself were unaware of it, which made anticipation of such occurrence more challenging to implement.

The relevant finding from this experience to the theme of an ARG is that an official letter from all members to confirm their position in an ARG was requested by the Aboriginal Program Manager at DoJ, while not being specified criterion on the official ethics application form. Unlike the ability to demonstrate flexibility in the actualisation of an ARG with the first community, I was forced by Correction Victoria to obtain official letters from key Indigenous people who either don't operate in such a way (the Elders prefer to give verbal approval), or saw such request as an unnecessary, ‘Western’ way of operation. While the trusts I have built within my relationships with the ARG members prevail over my pestering for their signatures, it was a test I would have preferred to sit-out since it stood in clear contradiction to the notion of culturally appropriate research I was presenting to the group. In returning to the importance placed by Dunbar & Scrimgeour (2014, p.60) on negotiated research agreements in providing a voice for Indigenous people who are involved in research at local level, the experience shared here suggests that such agreements can be hindered by governmental departments. If the fundamental purpose of research practice with Indigenous communities is to decolonise ‘Western’ methodologies and instead reflect Indigenous ways of knowing at the local level, (and it is), the call for changes on broader institutional levels by Humphery (2001) seem to better reflect the learning from this experience.

In summary, decolonised research requires contributions to this call for changes on broader institutional levels through publications reflecting my on-the-ground experiences. Another, more practical measure constitutes a change in use of language and approach to consultation with Key Indigenous persons within a community. When I name such persons- Critical Friends and approach the interaction on a need basis, I better reflect and act on how Indigenous leaders in these communities see ethical conduct in research, rather than prioritising what Western discourse deems as ethical conduct.
References


The Collapse of Buildings in Cities in Ghana: Reasoning Beyond ‘Scientism’

Festival Godwin Boateng

RMIT University, Australia

Abstract

In the event of building collapse, overwhelmed by the massive human lives and achievements destroyed, the conversation usually tends towards unravelling the immediate causes. High emphasis is placed on deficiencies in design, construction materials and inadequate consideration of external events – that is to say, failure to comply with and/or enforce structural/architectural safety requirements. The preoccupation here is with unravelling the well-structured physical/technical defect defined and revealed by the collapse. This way of approaching building collapse is borne out of the conception of the building structure as an assemblage of physical materials based on architectural/engineering specifications, and is undergirded by the notion of ‘scientism’–the view that, ‘natural science’ is the only valid way of seeking knowledge in any field. This paper argues that the building structure is a creation not merely of structural integrity, but socio-economic and even cultural means. It therefore unpacks the scientistic conceptualization of building collapse and makes a case for a multi-layer level of analysis, which places measures to address building failures within a comprehensive understanding of the vulnerabilities they are supposed to reduce. The setting of the study is Ghana, a West African country, whose cities are experiencing interminable incidents of building collapse.

Keywords: Ghana, cities, building, collapse, population, urbanization

Introduction

For some time now, cities in Ghana have had to contend with widespread cases of building collapse, which usually result in deaths, injuries and property losses (GhISEP, 2012; Danso & Boateng, 2015). Not only is structural failure an under researched area in Ghana, but also the conversation on building collapses in the country (as may be expected though) is dominated by engineers, architects, and other physical scientists who therefore naturally skew it towards technical explanations and ignore other areas of inquiry. Emphasis is placed on deficiencies in design, detailing, construction, use of materials and inadequate consideration of external events– that is to say, failure to comply with and/or enforce structural and architectural safety requirements, building regulations and codes (Danso & Boateng, 2015; Asante & Sasu, 2015). This way of approaching building collapse is borne out of the conception of the building structure
as an assemblage of physical materials based on architectural or engineering specifications and is undergirded by the notion of ‘scientism’ – the view that, natural science is the only valid way of seeking knowledge in any field (Hughes, 2012; Atkins, 1995).

However, the building structure is more than an assemblage of physical materials based on architectural or engineering specifications – it is a creation not merely of structural integrity, but social and economic means. A bad brick, lintel or joist is made, it is purchased subject or not to architects and planning requirements and/or procedures. The choice of materials reflects personal economy; it may also reflect image and a person’s sense of pride. But whatever the challenge to structural integrity or safety it is in so many ways socially produced. As Watt (2007) puts it, buildings exist as physical response to people, place and the environment. This may mean that beyond engineering and/or architectural imperatives, knowledge on the various factors and processes underpinning the demand and supply, design, construction, utilization and adaptation of buildings may deepen understanding on why buildings stand or fail. This paper surveys literature on building collapse incidents in cities in a range of jurisdictions along such lines and discusses the implications of the findings for the Ghanaian situation. The arguments are captured under three broad interlocking themes: Urbanization & housing pressure; Urbanization & regulation of building construction, and Urbanization & ‘economization’ of building construction.

Theme 1: Urbanization & housing pressure
The 21st century is marked by increasing concentration of more and more people in cities. For instance, over half of Ghana’s 24.2million population live in urban areas (UN-Habitat, 2011). Projections show that urbanization combined with the overall growth of the world’s population could add another 2.5billion people to urban populations by 2050. The urban population of the world has grown rapidly from 746million in 1950 to 3.9billion in 2014 (UN, 2014).

Notably, urban population growth activates a need for more buildings for residential and other purposes – a development, which is always met by significant increase in construction works. However, in most cases, the construction works are not done in a sustainable manner, which then leads to failures in the wake but also even in the absence of any adverse physical hazards. For instance, He & Wu (2016) argue that while the growing Chinese urban population has come with a substantial increase in construction works and quantity of housing units, the quality of housing and construction is very problematic. There have been several cases of shoddy work failures in cities in China leading to significant loss of lives and damage to property (Feifei, 2014). These include the many research findings that pointed to poor construction quality as a major contributor to the losses and number of deaths that occurred in the wake of the 2008 Wenchuan earthquake (He & Wu, 2016). Further, Tam (2007) argues that the housing deficiency in China resulted by population growth and influx of immigrants in the 1960’s occasioned construction of dangerous unauthorized structures, several of which collapsed and killed people.

Not just in China, however, also in the US, (particularly, California, New York, Florida, Texas and Illinois states), massive influx of migrants coupled with the passage of the baby-boom generation’ into adults created a large cohort of people in need of housing in the 1970s/1980s, which was met by wide scale fast track construction works (Myers & Liu, 2005). Apparently, it was also within this same period that the US experienced widespread cases of structural failures including the infamous Hyatt Regency collapse in Kansas City, Missouri, which killed and injured 114 and 200 people respectively at a tea dance (Heywood, 2010). A key feature of urban housing development is that it always leaves out the poor who also usually find ways to ensure their housing needs. Their response mostly includes building structures on rooftops or attachments to external walls (Li, 2003; Lai & Ho, 2001). There were as many as approximately 600,000 of such structures

1 Baby boomers are people born during the demographic post–World War II period, approximately, between the years 1946 and 1964.
in China as at the year 2007. However, the downside is that such developments come with public safety threats and the evidence suggests that, they normally lead to failures and deaths (Tam, 2007).

As the above cases indicate, in the event of increased urban population, the consequential increase in demand for housing and other building needs is met with frenzy, and in most cases, in an unsustainable way, which manifests in shoddy works, low construction standards and practices. This leads to the creation of structures with questionable integrity, which eventually fail.

Theme 2: Urbanization & regulation of building construction
Implementation or compliance with building regulations is a major way to ensure structural safety. The potential benefits of building regulations may be evident by comparing some raw facts. Wang (2014) found that earthquakes with similar strength in California killed a fewer number of people than that in some developing countries because California has strict building codes in seismic zones. The widespread damage to residences, commercial and government buildings consequent to the 2010 Haitian earthquake, some studies suggest, were largely because of the lack of earthquake-resistant designs and sub-standard construction (Bhatty, 2010).

Building collapse incidents may therefore just as well be a manifestation of non-compliance or non-enforcement of technical requirements. While such a claim might not be wrong, it misses a crucial point: As would be shortly shown, social factors including market forces create the environment for noncompliance and non-enforcement of regulations. Shaw et al (2016) argue that the problem of non-compliance and non-enforcement of regulations is deeply rooted socio-economic, historical and political factors. Their view underscores two broad issues relative to the nexus between building construction regulation and failures: The first pertains to institutional capacity or its lack thereof to enforce building regulations in the context of massive increment in construction works. The other pertains to building developers’ quest to circumvent city authorities long and complicated approval processes. Both dynamically interact and mutually create a self-reinforcing vicious environment for non-compliance and non-enforcement of housing and building regulations to thrive.

There could also be a ‘political economy’ angle to noncompliance and non-enforcement of regulations, where apparent short-term gratifications may blind the stakeholders to their need to create a safer environment for themselves and others. As Thiruppugazh (2008) points out, one has to understand the causes for the failure of compliance and the politics of lack of enforcement, which seem to result in a win-win situation for all stakeholders: the authorities could avoid the regulatory overload, the builders would maximize profits through non-compliance and the public would get houses at lesser costs. Everybody becomes a winner until collapses ensue. The Chinese case exemplifies this point: Sequel to the massive population growth and influx of immigrants in China in the 1960s, poor people heavily patronized the several unauthorized buildings that were erected since they could not afford the relatively safer but expensive alternatives. The scale of the development overwhelmed the authorities who did not do much to control it, until the structures began collapsing beginning from the 1990s to 2002. When the collapses became intense in 2001, the Buildings Department conducted a series of large-scale “blitz” clearance operations and removed over 255,000 of such structures by 2006 (Tam, 2007).

Further, there are also market dynamics related to urban development, which implicate on development control regulations. As noted earlier, growth in urban population activates an increased need for more construction works. Such a booming market usually ‘shocks’ or overwhelms institutional capacity to control, which directs construction services to hazard prone areas. For instance, Thiruppugazh (2008) found that increase in urban population and...
demand for prime urban space in India created enormous pressure on the land in and around the business district, resulting in not only skyrocketing prices of land, but also unregulated growth in otherwise hazard prone areas. However, since the purchase of a house or flat in India is considered a realization of a lifetime dream facilitated by bank loans and borrowings, the middle class who were patronizing such estates were more concerned about the cost of the house, than they were about safety norms. This largely contributed to the crumbling of several number of houses when the earthquake struck the city of Ahmedabad in January 2001.

The above review shows that while noncompliance and non-enforcement of construction and building regulations might lead to technical problems that may eventually account for failures, it is socio-economic and political factors and sometimes the socio-cultural perceptions about homeownership that create and sustain the environment of noncompliance and non-enforcement of the regulations. Consequently, vulnerability reduction for building collapse incidents may be just as much a technical problem as a political, socio-economic and even a cultural one that may need a holistic approach beyond engineering and architectural imperatives.

**Theme 3: Urbanization & ‘economization’ of building construction**

The building process involves design, construction, utilization and adaptation of the building in response to future needs. However, at all levels, economic and safety considerations fiercely compete such that if the right balance is not achieved, structural integrity might be adversely affected (Blockley, 1980). The key point here is that clients do not have access to infinite supply of money and as a result, however paramount safety considerations may be to the design process, the designer may as well have to give economy a firm thought. Effectively, the resources available for the project might serve as a powerful counterweight to safety and structural integrity imperatives.

Structural engineers are enjoined to hold paramount, the safety, health, and welfare of the public against all other considerations. However, their work is also a business, which has to survive: it is a way of earning a living. As noted by Blockley (1980), naturally, the pressures of business are ever-present and sometimes can become so great that engineers may easily lose the wider view of their role in society and see their function only in a straightforward materialistic business sense. In the context of heightened competition (which is the case in cities anyway), religious commitment to ethics and high safety standards might tilt the market to supple competitors willing to adapt safety requirements to clients’ budget and this may lead to the unintended effect of building failures, in cases where the right balance is not achieved. Such was the situation in India, which led to massive collapse of buildings and deaths in the Ahmedabad earthquake. Reports on the quake showed that the urban development market incentivized unethical practices. For instance, engineers who refused to supply builders with low quality structural designs were penalized by the market, rewarding those who agreed to do so. There was also widespread practices of registered structural engineers signing the certificates and drawings prepared by unregistered ones for money and thus, undermining the system of accountability (Thiruppugazh, 2008).

The other leg of the same problem is that increased profit margins that accompany high demand for building/housing services in the context of high growths in cities’ population are usually met by dubious supply, which then lead to the proliferation of shoddy works, poor construction standards/practices. A case in point is the recent collapse of a six-storey building in the capital of Kenya, Nairobi, which reportedly killed about 49 people and injured several others on April 29, 2016. Details about the building emerged a day after its collapse that it did not have occupancy permit. There is a high demand for housing in Nairobi, and the owners of that building apparently...
are part of the many property developers in the city who bypass building regulations to cut costs to maximize profits. Reports suggest that, the structure had been “shoddily” built in less than five months and the 126 single rooms were occupied at a rent of $35 (£24) a month (The Guardian, 2016).

**Discussion**

The reviewed cases suggest that in the wake of high growth in cities’ population, the existing building infrastructure comes under intense pressure, which results from consequential increase in demand for buildings for residential and other purposes. However, in such circumstances, the acuity of housing pressures and the immediacy of the need to have a place of abode create a booming market in which neoliberal imperatives (gratification/consumption and profitable supply/provision of building needs/services) are asserted or given high premium over welfare imperatives (public safety and sustainability). In other words, urban housing pressures incidental to high growth in cities’ population produce adverse conditions, which lead to the relegation of health, safety and well-being considerations of buildings to the backburner. Such developments usually overwhelm the authorities’ capacity to control and thus create a self-reinforcing vicious environment for both the demand and supply of building needs to perpetuate in a manner that compromises not only the involved actors’ safety, but also that of the whole city. These developments share parallels not just with contemporary urbanization; some studies point to similar developments circa ancient, 18th and 19th centuries’ urban civilization in Rome and Britain (see Plutarch, 1916; Nicols, n.d.; Nevell, 2011).

**Implications for the Ghanaian situation**

The review suggests that, undoubtedly, collapses may eventually be defined by a technical or engineering shortcoming, but they usually are not standalone causes since socio-economic and sometimes cultural forces prefigure them. To therefore conceptualize building failures based on only the well-structured technical or engineering cause(s) defined and revealed by the failure without recourse to the prior ill-structured processes and conditions may risk context minimization error (Shinn & Toohey, 2003) – the tendency to ignore the enduring impact or influence of socio-economic, cultural and political forces on phenomena. The extant scientistic scholarship on the Ghanaian case may thus not tell a full story given the failure to account for the social contents or underpinnings of the phenomenon. This may be a fatal omission for there are high chances of decoupling the incidents from the broader proximate socio-economic conditions and practices that usually accumulate into the defined technical cause, which later becomes the subject of forensic examination. This may have lasting implications – impede holistic understanding of the phenomenon, and efforts at social change. A multi-layer approach, which takes into consideration the connections in society that account for the cities’ high vulnerability to the phenomenon, might be needed for a comprehensive understanding of why buildings collapse in the country’s cities. The twin issues of population growth and urban housing pressure may serve as useful points of entry for such enterprise.

Acknowledgment: I am grateful to Dr. Binoy Kampmark, Prof. Paul Ramcharan and the anonymous reviewers for their helpful comments.
References


Dadzie, E.A. (2016). Collapsed storey-building traps workers at Berekuso


GhISEP (2012). Melcom Building Collapse – Statement from GhISEP


UN (2014). World’s population increasingly urban with more than half living in urban areas UN-HABITAT (2011). *Ghana Housing Profile.* Nairobi: UN-HABITAT


Affective Labour in ‘Hip’ Melbourne Cafés and Bars: In defence of Hardt and Negri’s thesis

Alexia Cameron
La Trobe University

Melbourne is internationally renowned for its hospitality culture. This culture is a significant contributor to its high global liveability standard, and here affect performs a crucial function in the industry’s push for product refinement. The market is saturated with bars and cafés offering the same arbitrary product (coffee and alcohol), and affect is what differentiates the value of one venue over another. In this way, the product and its user are ideologically enlarged through the immaterial extraction of meaning: what it communicates and what it represents. This paper uses ethnographic methodology to expose the function of affect in both the accumulation of immaterial value within Melbourne’s café and bar culture, and the corresponding change to workers’ approaches to ‘service’, along with their clientele. The paper concludes that affective surpluses function in excess of the material products they enlarge, and hence move according to their own ethics, rather than the ethics of capitalism.

‘An Economy of Desire is the Order of the Day!’
(Negri 1999, p. 88)

Theorizing Affect and Immaterial Labour

Affect, Brian Massumi writes, unlike emotion, which denotes personal feeling, ‘is a prepersonal intensity corresponding to the passage from one experiential state of the body to another and implying an augmentation or diminution in that body’s capacity to act’ (Massumi cited in Deleuze & Guattari 1987, p. xiv). To the frustration of some, there is no single generalizable theory of affect and, following Melissa Gregg and Gregory Seigworth (2010), nor should there be, inasmuch as affect acts on a constant and ever-renewable basis according to situation. Therefore, theorizing affect means theorizing the realm of the momentary or the ‘this-ness’ of everyday life (Gregg & Seigworth 2010, p. 3). Moreover, to theorize affect we cannot isolate it or take it out of its specific context, for as the authors say, ‘Affect is synonymous with forces of encounter’ (Gregg & Seigworth 2010, p. 2). This is because it is the friction or collision, the points of confrontation between a body and other bodies (or a body and object) that gives way to the resultant affect. Baruch de Spinoza, whose profound work has been advanced the most in affect theory, made it vitally clear that affect is a collective structure rather than an individual faculty: it requires the collaboration of bodies and objects. This informs his famous assertion: to affect is to be affected (Brown & Stenner 2001; Spinoza trans. Curley 1996). Thus by affecting we are opening up the
possibility of moving in a different direction than we might have previously, thus by affecting we open ourselves up to being affected (Massumi 2015). Affect is therefore best defined as the body's transition through one experiential state to another, rendering the body's capacity to act in a heightened or diminished manner in what Massumi (2015) describes as the 'margin of maneuverability' in any given encounter.

But, what does affect mean in the context of labour? In their influential work Empire (2002), Michael Hardt and Antonio Negri explain: 'Since the production of services results in no material and durable good, we define the labour involved in this production as immaterial labour — that is, labour that produces an immaterial good, such as a service, affects, a cultural product, knowledge, or communication', which they then conceptually break into two principal forms (Hardt & Negri 2000, p. 290). On one hand, immaterial labour is immediately intellectual or linguistic in its production of information: for example, linguistic expressions, or symbolic and analytical tasks, are what the authors theorize as informational labour. On the other hand, immaterial labour produces what Maurizio Lazzarato calls the 'cultural content' of the immaterial commodity, and which Hardt and Negri theorize as affective labour. Affective labour, the authors say, is that which manipulates and produces an affect (mind/body transformation) in what they describe as 'labour in the bodily mode' (Hardt & Negri 2000, p. 293). Importantly, both affective and informational labour define and fix cultural standards, fashions, tastes and, more strategically, public opinion, representing the two dominant strands of immaterial labour that drive 'the postmodernization of the global economy' (Hardt & Negri 2000, p. 311). As a consequence, the products of immaterial labour are ideologically enlarged, generating surplus in a market saturated with multiplying arbitrary commodities competing for distinction and differentiation. Coffee and alcohol epitomize this process.

While Hardt and Negri have popularized the concept of immaterial labour in what has been described as ‘the communist manifesto of the 21st century’ (Zizek 2010 p. 190), the term's theoretical origin predates its application in Empire. The notion of immaterial labour put forward by Hardt and Negri was initially coined by Lazzarato, who is part of a larger neighbourhood of social theory known as Autonomous Marxism (in Virno & Hardt 2006). Perhaps most importantly, Autonomist thinkers address the paradox of immaterial labour in the formula: the same surplus that capital strives to subsume is also constitutive of the potential living forces required in overcoming capitalist exploitation, because the very ingredients (affect, general intellect, symbols, discourse) predate their productive application (Eden 2012). This tension is where hope lies for such thinkers, and inspires Hardt and Negri’s belief that ‘an economy of desire is the order of the day!’ (Negri 1999, p. 88) Most critical responses to Hardt and Negri’s immaterial labour thesis, as well as criticisms of affect more generally concern the vagueness of both concepts, and generalizable nature of this newer terminology (Gill & Pratt, 2008). Because, Hardt and Negri’s combining numerous forms of labour into two principle forms, for many, generalises labour and production, and simplifies the link in Spinoza’s picture (to affect is to be affected) (Camfield 2007). This research was initially born out of the critiques that saw Hardt and Negri’s immaterial labour thesis as a conceptually vague and overly generalizable new terminology. In light of such critical responses, I used ethnographic methodology to get closer to the mechanics of affective production, and as a sort of response to or, progression of Hardt and Negri’s work. By my paying close attention to the mechanisms of affect in Melbourne’s café and bar culture this paper exposes: the style of service workers give depends on how they themselves have been affected, their mood, or whether the customer comprehends industry knowledge.

Methods
Ethnographic methodology, like theories of affect and immateriality, is a messy and highly reflexive path of knowledge, open to the subjective pitfalls of epistemology, but that could be
loosely described as the study of walking in the shoes of another (Madden 2010). To conduct the study, I carried out around one-hundred eighty hours of observation, across a range of ten bars and cafés in the inner- north of Melbourne. Hospitality in Melbourne epitomizes the function of affect as central to surplus accumulation given the intensity of product competition, making it an insightful field site to undertake this research. I chose venue's that represent the industry's international reputation because, there are increasingly more of these sorts of venue's opening up in the city, where capital is deliberately affective, and they make up a significant part of Melbourne's urban culture more generally. These I found were located in the inner suburbs, particularly in the North. Because in Melbourne, there is a marked difference between the high end venues, generally within the Inner Northern suburbs, where capital is deliberately affective, compared to those on the outskirts of the city that cultivate more traditional and localized ethics like 'service with a smile', or suburban bakeries, for example, that drive communities of diaspora. The venues participating in this research were located in: Collingwood, Fitzroy, South Melbourne, North Melbourne, the CBD, Northcote and Fitzroy North, and all have featured in leading Melbourne lifestyle websites like Broadsheet and Three Thousand. I sat near where workers and customers congregated most, observing and writing notes based on the dynamics and collisions between the affective labourers and their clientele. I also conducted semi-structured interviews with twenty members of staff across these venues. Our conversations would be guided by open-ended questions, beginning with questions based on the interviewees personal narrative, before moving onto more ambiguous questions that aroused sub-answers, and thus became double or triple barreled questions.

Critical Ethnographic Reflections

Following Massumi (2002), affects work on sensations, atmospheres and, what many workers in the venues describe as, the 'vibe'. Therefore, looking through the lens of affect illuminates the force of visceral and sensory elements of the social which, as I have noted, are crucial to generating surplus value in the postmodern economy. To put it differently, the material products are the same, but their ideological and affective values differentiate them. Across venues, atmosphere and 'vibe' were clearly reified, and perhaps more importantly, became a vehicle for instituting ethics and the products' ideological enlargement more generally. The Northcote café for example, though they never directly stated it, seemed to specialize in purity and newer takes on 'good health'. Each time I would visit this café it seemed to be busy. Their 'superfood salad' was a constant sellout, and the clientele demographics appeared largely consistent with the aesthetic ethics of the venue: hip young professionals and families (who are presumably appreciative of, and can afford, organic ingredients, newly discovered health food, a place to put their pram, or the minimalist design). The café and bar in Fitzroy, on the other hand, had ripped couches scattered everywhere, a turn-table, tagged/graffiti painted walls (both inside and out), plants hanging from the ceiling, and dank odorous toilets. I would meet all sorts of characters during my time in this venue: homeless people, travelers, young artists with hospitality jobs on the side, and once an ex-junkie who pulled his dog into the courtyard on a handmade carriage. What I am saying is, the atmosphere is affective and, becomes ethical through the products’ ideological enlargement; what it communicates and represents. Moreover, it is the affects and the products’ ideological messages that ethicize, organize and filter behavior within the space, by encouraging customers ‘fit in’ to the ‘vibe’ of the venue.

Because of the push to create ever more refined atmospheres, aesthetics, or “vibes”, which efficiently generate surplus value by communicating the product’s ethical and ideological message, the nature of the service worker changes. It is no longer solely up to the worker to ‘wow’ the customer, like the extensively reported on service sector boom of the 1980s (Hochschild 1983).
Service becomes just one part of the affective package. This is demonstrated in the stripping away of the cliché ‘service with a smile’, here replaced with a rawer service reflective of the reality where, for every staff member I interviewed, “the customer is not always right”. In fact, the style of service workers give depends on how they themselves have been affected, their mood, or whether the customer comprehends industry knowledge. Sam, from the Northcote café, revealed that, ‘If I’m in a better mood, I’ll kind of go a bit further maybe’, before Jess nodded and said, ‘I think its mood dependent, so if I’m in a good mood I’ll go above and beyond. If I’m not having a great day, I’ll try and just get through it.’ Jasper too, explained the reality of good service as requiring ‘a bit of give and take on the other end.’ In accordance with Spinoza’s theory — to affect is to be affected — if the customer doesn’t affect, if they don’t engage, then it is not likely that the staff member will. At the café and bar in Fitzroy, with its counter-cultural and rebellious feel, it seemed that the more the customer played up to their ‘vibe’ the more joyful workers would become and the more attempts at rapport grew. And, if customers were un-receptive, then workers treated them much the same way, which comes across as the stereotype of inhospitable snobbery in competitive Melbourne hospitality.

For example, the transparency of workers’ labour efforts functioned as a way of communicating to the customer what is actually involved in getting the product to the seat, in light of the demanding or ignorant customers, who workers portrayed as ‘us and them’. Simple movements like stirring drinks on the bar ledge, or pouring latte art, are a point of affect, reflected romantically in Jack’s pointing out of instances where ‘they all go silent’ as, explicitly revealing the labour time to the viewer. Where so many services go to the greatest lengths to hide and conceal their effort in providing their product, hospitality embraces the almost utilitarian craft of presenting food and beverage. When I spoke with Zara at the café, she pointed out the potential sympathy and satisfaction from customers as long as they see that the staff member is working hard: ‘I think if you’re honest with them um, and if they see you’re trying hard, they won’t give you grief’. And at the café in South Melbourne, when the dishwasher came in and out of the barista’s section to stack clean saucers, the internal division of labour made transparent. The kitchen-hand stood next to a tattooed barista, with strictly combed back hair and dressed in contemporary swag, while he was an older man, visibly dowsed in sweat and the only one wearing an apron. He almost seemed too terrified to look up. But aside from the exposed division of labour, what this kitchen-hand’s presence came to outwardly reinforce is that hospitality is hard work, and there is more to it than tends to be assumed.

After ordering my drink with Zippy one evening, I listened to her explain while she made it just how much love she had put in because it required her to get the bottle of gin from the storage room that was up many cases of stairs. In an uncanny chuckle she said ‘The fruits of my labour right here!’ And on another occasion, as I stood in line to order my drink, I overheard a customer, having waited inline a while, point out ‘It’s a lot of work isn’t it!’ In other words, staff don’t shy away from exposing their labour efforts, or from communicating to their customers what is actually involved in getting the product to the seat. Workers emphasized this when they expressed that ‘normal people’ fail to understand hospitality from an industry perspective. They all portrayed this as ‘us and them’. So a large portion of their service actually involves educating and keeping customers up to speed with insider knowledge, and as guarding against ‘them’: the dis-respectful and un-rehearsed customers.

This research shows that in the context of labour, affect produces the ‘cultural content of the commodity’, which define and fix cultural standards and public opinion. The products of immaterial labour are thus ideologically enlarged, and as such they generate surplus in a market saturated with multiplying arbitrary commodities, all competing for distinction and differentiation. And it is this that drives ‘the postmodernization of the global economy’ (Hardt
& Negri 2000, p. 311). The venues’ emphasis on solidifying their ‘vibe’ helps to ideologically enlarge their product, so that less pressure and attention is on the affective labourer to create the product’s message and ‘wow’ the customer.

Renditions of service then, are based on affects encountered by workers themselves, more than the traditional cliché of ‘service with a smile’ or ‘the customer is always right’. In-fact, styles of service were dependent on a sort of mutual recognition between the customer and worker, drawing on laws of respect, commonality and commonsense, that workers regularly defended by exposing their labour efforts. Affect is largely un-acknowledged and un-paid outside the restricted access of affect theory and yet, as I have un-packed, crucial to accumulating surplus value in the new economy. Moreover, the function of affect in this research, is excessive to the material commodity inasmuch as, affect exists on its own terms, and moves according to Spinoza’s ontology that to affect is to be affected.

More than anything else, this research illuminates why Hardt and Negri’s assertion ‘an economy of desire is the order of the day’ needs to be taken seriously.
References


‘A Whole New World’: On Peter Wagner and the Political Project of ‘World-Making’

Erin Carlisle

Flinders University

Peter Wagner is an important contemporary thinker of modernity. He introduced the notion of world-making alongside Nathalie Karagiannis as a response to the ostensible worldlessness of globalization and individualization (2007). In their analysis, world-making attests to the varieties of modernities acted out across the globe (Karagiannis and Wagner, 2007: 7–10; Wagner, 2005b: 54), which reiterated Wagner’s broader approach to successive and plural modernities (c.f. Wagner, 1994, 2012). That modernities are successive indicates their transformation through collective action; that they are plural implies that the outcomes of action are open to collective creativity and interpretation. The specificities of world-making as a form of political action are not systematically developed by Karagiannis and Wagner, nor so in Wagner’s broader project. Indications of the political dimensions of world-making are present in a sketch: leaning on Hannah Arendt, Karagiannis and Wagner contend that “[the world’s] constant rebirth (or natality) is the characteristic of political action” (2007: 2; c.f. Arendt, 1998 [1958]: 247). World-making, then, refers to a project of societal change via political action. The modern imaginary of autonomy motivates world-making, as an exercise of human agency and collective self-determination (Karagiannis and Wagner, 2007: 7; Wagner, 2012: 22, 163).

This paper presents the key aspects of political world-making that emerged from a hermeneutic reconstruction of Wagner’s oeuvre. This elucidation of Wagner’s thought forms part of a preparatory step, en route to a phenomenology.

1 Wagner appropriates Castoriadis’s notion of the imaginary significations of modernity—autonomy, on the one hand, and the so-called infinite pursuit of pseudo-rational pseudo-mastery, on the other—and employs it as the lynchpin of his theoretical framework of modernity. In this, Wagner also follows Arnason’s (1989) re-interpreted Castoriadis’s hermeneutic of modernity, such that the imaginary constitution of modernity enables the conflict of interpretations to bring about successive and plural forms of modernities (Wagner, 2012). Mikael Carleheden’s article ‘The Imaginary Significations of Modernity: A Re-Examination’ (2010) debates Wagner’s adoption of these aspects of Castoriadis and Arnason’s theories. Space did not permit to undertake a critical reconstruction of Wagner’s dialogue with Castoriadis or Arnason, or an elucidation of Wagner’s theoretical framework of modernity. See Carleheden (2010) for this important critique of Wagner’s thought.

2 This investigation into Wagner’s thought forms part of my doctoral research project that intends toward a phenomenology of political action. The project hermeneutically reconstructs Hannah Arendt, Cornelius Castoriadis, and Peter Wagner’s oeuvres by leaning on a hermeneutic-phenomenological understanding of the world-horizon, beginning from the insight of the human condition in-the-world. Due to space limitations, I am unable to detail the findings of the reconstruction in full here. To this end, I have chosen to emphasise the aspects of socio-political action that emerged from the study, and have left aside the latent hermeneutic and phenomenological currents that underlie Wagner’s (underdeveloped) notion of ‘world’, for now.
of political action. To this end, two aspects are of importance: the interpretative element that prefigures collective critique; and, the interplay of destruction and creation—or, instituting and instituted—in the pursuit of new horizons. The constructivist undertones of world-making motion toward the creation of a ‘whole new world’ ex nihilo; this contravenes the interpretative-creative account of socio-political doing that emerges from Wagner’s thought, which rests on an understanding of the human condition in-the-world.

Revealing the World through Interpretation
In their co-authored introduction to world-making, Karagiannis and Wagner argue of the situatedness of human beings in a meaningful space of experience, but also the reflexivity of human beings within this context through plural bonds of interpretation (2007: 7–8). Wagner’s broader research deepens this understanding. In particular, it emphasises the interpretative moment of action that reveals the world as a precursor to critique, through which novel solidarities challenge the instituted order. Interpretative elements were not overt in Wagner’s first major work, A Sociology of Modernity: Liberty and Discipline (1994).

Instead, the constitution of new commonalities was at the centre of his discussion of the succession of modernities via collective instituting movements at moments of crisis (Wagner, 1994: 37, 48–51, 57, 68, 141–145). Newly formed collective identities (such as ‘the working class’ or the students of ’1968’) challenged instituted social reality based on their shared interpretation of the situation and its deficiencies vis-à-vis the imaginary of autonomy (Wagner, 1994: 49–51, 141–144). Interpretative elements were implicit in this analysis. Interpretative activity not only disclosed the situation as one in-common, it revealed it as problematic through the emergence of novel solidarities based on shared critical interpretations of the social world.

Interpretation became more explicit in Wagner’s thought after the year 2000. Wagner later presents interpretation as both spatial and temporal, expanding on the above. He argues that the interpretative activity is undertaken by singular human beings, whose interpretation of the given is simultaneously that of the shared past (Friese and Wagner, 2000: 28, 32; Wagner, 2001: 126). Interpretation in this sense articulates the given according to those situated within it with a view to past and future, such that actors may distinguish between instituted reality and those latent possibilities for change (Wagner, 2001: 126–127). The given is then either reproduced; or, actively challenged based on the disjuncture of interpretative frameworks versus the collective experience of institutions. Interpretative effort in this manner is “required to determine, together with others, the situation as a shared and common one” (Wagner, 2001: 106), as a precursor to collective action. However, the act of interpretation can lead to the differentiation of perspectives which constitute solidarities that dispute the instituted order. In so doing, “interpretative possibilities” are opened (Wagner, 2001: 112), which potentially go beyond the instituted situation. Wagner later associates this interpretative dimension of political doing to an incipient account of imagination by intersecting the notions of agentiality, historicity, and reflexivity. Reflexive interpretation is the means by which one “step[s] outside of the immediate present” to “imagine other possible worlds” (Wagner, 2005a: 53). Agentiality “may contribute to bringing a particular different future [or, world?] about” (2005a: 53) by altering the relation to past and future via the imagination (as historicity). Critique, in this analysis, arises in the space between interpretation (of the present and past) and the ‘horizon of expectations’ in the future (Wagner, 2012: 59, 61), at the moment in which the social institution no longer aligns with predominant collective interpretative self-understandings (2012: 36).

We can see the intersection of interpretation with critique and time in Wagner’s recent analyses of the South African experience of world-making. Re-interpretation and imagination interweave with understandings of time, as collective past and anticipated future. The colonial encounter was one source of interpretative struggle through which new institutional forms were
are crystallized (Wagner, 2014: 300, 303–304). Yet the explicit moment of self-foundation in South Africa—the new democratic constitution—arose through the reinterpretation of past injustices and the instituted Apartheid order. In this, the autonomous act of self-foundation reshaped the institutional form of society to correct the injustices of the past, in an attempt to realize equality (Wagner, 2011: 494, 2012: 140–141, 2013: 167). The act of interpretation—toward present, past, and future—is in this sense creative, as it rearticulates an imagined future via the given world, as a reference point for collective movement. This reflexive rethinking of the past as a prospect for a novel, normatively-superior future underpins Wagner's later rearticulation of 'progress', brought about via an autonomous and “critical reinterpretation of the world one finds oneself in” (2015a: 29; c.f. Wagner, 2016).

From the above, interpretative action forms one dimension of political action for Wagner. It reveals the world by establishing a meaningful space in-common between interpretative solidarities. Moreover, it situates the given world between past and future, which opens the horizon of imagined possibilities for collective agency. In this, the intersection of experiences and shared interpretations orientate common action, such that the world is an “imaginary reference point for action” (Wagner, 2015b: 113).

**New Horizons to Pursue: Critique, Destruction and the Creative Moment of Crisis**

Interpretation serves as the precondition for socio-political doing by revealing deficiencies of the instituted world, and constituting novel solidarities based on shared, critical interpretations of past, present and future. The secondary dimension of political action that emerges from Wagner's thought concerns the interplay of critique and creation, or put another way, between the instituting and instituted moments. This underscores his and Karagiannis's sketched discussion of 'world-making' as creative agency that “open[s] the space of possibilities” to act “in common with a view to creating a world”, as a form of 'situated freedom' (2007: 7, c.f. 8). From Wagner's broader work emerges an understanding of political action as 'creative-destruction', to borrow from Schumpeter. As critical instituting movement opens the institution, it leaves a destructive path behind it; this is why Wagner warns of the need for an instituted dimension simultaneous to critical instituting—otherwise, the death of institutions remains a latent possibility3.

Wagner's theory of successive modernities as elaborated first in Liberty and Discipline presented the creative moment of instituting movement at moments of 'crisis' (noted above). Crises, as Wagner defines it in Liberty and Discipline (1994: 31) and elsewhere (Wagner, 2010: 14, 2012: 36–37), are moments in which the predominant institutional configuration undergoes a major societal transformation through a shift in collective practices and identities, and that sets society onto a different path (prefiguring his later rearticulation of 'progress'; Wagner, 2016). Creative-destruction is inherent within this understanding, and plays out in Wagner's analysis of the crises of modernities. The working class (a novel solidarity, as a precursor to critique; above) challenged the deficiencies of social reality by disrupting and questioning institutionalized social practices. This opened the instituted world. The collective instituting movement crystallized new institutions after the critical moment of 'disembedding' in the first crisis of modernity (Wagner, 1994: 60–51, 56–57, 62–69). Action in-common, from this analysis, re-created the social world, as an incipient form of world-making.

The second crisis of modernity was, in Wagner's view, less successful in the collective effort of re-institution, epitomized by the missed opportunity of '1968'. The '1968' attempt at

---

3 Alongside Karagiannis, Wagner recently motioned toward an understanding of the 'mortality' and 'death' of institutions in a dialogue with Castoriadis's thought. They connect the 'death of a political form' to the novelities of the 'political imagination', yet do not elucidate these—very interesting—notions further. Arguably, the 'death' of institutions is connected to collective efforts of critique and the failure to crystallize institutional forms thereafter, as I have tried to demonstrate here. See Karagiannis and Wagner (2012:24–26).
liberation effectively disembedded social identities and dismantled the social order, but failed to create novel institutions thereafter, as instituted (Wagner, 1994: 123–124, 141–145, 162–163). Globalization and individualization were for Wagner the consequences of this missed opportunity for autonomous creation, as latent possibilities that emerged from the institutional destruction (1994: 184–185, 2002: 40–41). This underlines the interplay of creation and destruction in Wagner's notion of political doing, in the risk of death or the self-cancellation of institutions through collective political movement. Wagner continues this impetus beyond *Liberty and Discipline* in two important texts, which are (in brief) ‘The Possibility of Politics…’ (2002) and ‘Political Form…’ (2005a) (both later republished in Wagner, 2008: 39–61, 62–74). ‘1968’ was a crisis in the above definition. The protests challenged established institutions whilst offering alternative socio-political forms, yet those proposed were “weak or non-existent”, or socio-historically incompatible (2002: 36–37).

Institutional reconstruction via the protest movement “proved elusive” (Wagner, 2005a: 66); the movement did not successfully create an instituted form amidst the overarching instituting movement (Wagner, 2002: 41, 2005a: 66–67). Although Wagner's thought demonstrates the possibilities of political doing *vis-à-vis* the re-creation of social worlds through collective activity, these reflections underscore that such doing may indeed result in ‘dead-ends’ (c.f. Wagner, 2005a: 71) without an appropriate vision of the instituted world thereafter.

In contrast to ‘1968’, the South African experience highlights a successful creative moment after that of critique. The emancipation from Apartheid and the ratification of the South African democratic constitution is at once a moment of creative destruction, and, world-making. South Africa in Wagner's analysis represents the act of self-foundation that interweaves new solidarities, collective struggles over interpretations and institutions, with a reflexive relation to the past with novel hopes for the imagined future. Unlike ‘1968’, the struggle by the African National Congress and associated groups detailed a “full programmatic alternative” to Apartheid, as democratic republic (Wagner, 2011: 493, 2012: 138); or, put otherwise, it proposed a course for the re-institution of society after the passing of the critical instituting moment. Political doing here destroyed the instituted order, as the “exercise of collective self-determination” through “political change in the direction of collective autonomy”, which reconstituted the social world (Wagner, 2011: 493; c.f. 2012: 138). A new world was thence created through rearticulated societal self-understandings through the interplay of interpretations and solidarities, and the reformation of institutions.

**In Lieu of a Conclusion**

This paper expeditiously detailed two key aspects of Wagner's incipient notion of political action qua world-making that emerged from a larger reconstruction of his thought: the interpretative moment, which gives rise to novel solidarities and differentiates between past and imagined future; and, the interplay of creation and destruction through moments of crisis and critique. In their co-authored introduction, Karagiannis and Wagner offer only a sketch of the political connotations of world-making. Leaning on Arendt, they contend in brief that the world is re-born through political doing *in-the-world* by turning to Wagner’s broader intellectual project.

That the social world is re-born through political doing suggests that the world is not made in the constructivist sense that Wagner (and Karagiannis) portrays it. Arendt clearly differentiated making and creative political acting in *The Human Condition*; her insights help to dissociate the constructivist undertones from world-making here. In Arendt's understanding, to see the world as built through making is precisely to reduce human action to mastery and an instrumental *telos*, as otherwise inherent to the modern condition (1998: 139 n. 3, 143-144, 153-158, 221, 228-230,
Making is undertaken in isolation from others, or only through a purposive relationship. More to this, the maker stands at an Archimedean point of sorts, external to and above the object made through various means and ends. Action, rather—in both Arendt and Wagner’s understanding—is an inherently collective experience and, moreover, *in-the-world* as a form of situated freedom, to borrow from Charles Taylor (1979: 153, 155). Contra the modern teleology of making, action for Arendt is intrinsically unpredictable, as a new beginning collectively initiated (1998: 191–192). This remains true for Wagner, also: the missed opportunity of ‘1968’ in particular underscores the vagaries of collective political action.

In each of Wagner’s analyses of world-making (above) as critical instituting movement and crisis, the world was not made in the instrumental sense, nor created *ex nihilo*, as Castoriadis would have it (1987 [1975]). The South African experience may be seen as world-making *ex nihilo* in the sense that it was one of explicit world-foundation through collective self-determination. However, the South African social world was formed *from-something*. South Africa, as Wagner presents it, successfully reinstituted the world through creation after the moment of destruction. The collective movement forged new institutional forms and solidarities through critical interpretative engagement with the instituted world of Apartheid and through interpretations of shared past experiences. Furthermore, the institutional forms represented the new self-understandings collectively articulated through the political movement. World-making is therefore, fundamentally, *re-making*; or better: *re-forming*.

World-making interweaves varied modes of *being-in-the-world*. It begins from within an instituted common world context. The given world is open to interpretation, as is the shared past and the horizon of the future. Critique is directed toward the instituted world, which opens the world to its re-formation via the creation of novel institutions. Moments of crisis are precisely those world re-formation, when the world is re-born through collective political action. This is to say that political activity does not create a whole new world in itself. Rather, political action *in-the-world* re-creates it by intersecting action, interpretation and imagination, and through which the world is opened onto novel horizons.

**Acknowledgement**

Thanks to the anonymous referees for their positive and constructive feedback on this paper.
References
Resistance in Australian employment services: A critical account

Simone Casey

RMIT University/Jobs Australia

Abstract
This paper summarises the findings of PhD research intended to provide critical insight into resistance in the street-level delivery of Workfare in Australia. This research contributes to critical social policy studies by developing a new theory of resistance: the interest-based account (IBA). It also contributes to social movement theory by observing the conditions in which resistance coalesces into collective action.

Previous scholarship had identified resistance and conflict in the street level delivery of Workfare expressed as strategies of the weak such as concealment, the rejection of discursive labels or active refusal (McDonald and Marston 2005, Marston and McDonald 2008, Brady 2011, Bodsworth 2012). The conflict had been attributed to the high rates of sanctioning imposed by employment services when job seeker behaviour is judged as a form of resistance such as intentional or avoidable non-compliance with the activation and conditionality of Workfare.

This research intended to develop an explanatory account by using resistance to gain access to the conflict caused by the heightened activation and conditionality associated with Workfare. The question “In what ways can resistance in employment services are understood that is useful for welfare to work policy studies?” informed the investigation.

The research methods involved purposive narrative reconstruction of incidents of resistance captured through semi-structured interviews. The interviews were with 15 job seekers (7 of whom were single parents) who had recent experience of employment services and 5 workers from employment services agencies. The narrative inquiry was attentive to the ways the job seekers and workers reflected on the constraining and enabling conditions they encountered while subject to the rules of Workfare.

Theory - Interest-based account concepts
The IBA was developed to explain how resistance is enabled and constrained by the properties of the social context. Bourdieu’s theory of practice was read as a theory of social interaction as well as cultural reproduction (Bourdieu 1977, Bourdieu 1990, Bourdieu and Wacquant 1990).
The theoretical orientation was reinforced by Peillon’s *sociology of welfare* in which he argues that resistance in welfare interactions offer the locations for the analysis of macro-level power relations as they manifest in micro-level contexts (Peillon 1998, Peillon 2001).

In this research, employment services were described as a sub-field of the welfare field. The role of employment services in providing a gateway to paid work makes them a significant location where the redistributive intentions of policy makers are enacted through the street-level management of job seekers.

The narratives provided analytic access to interactions reflecting the broader power arrangements which determine the constraints on action and choice in employment service contexts. In the analysis of employment services interactions the IBA was developed to provide an alternative perspective to accounts which focus mainly on agency and choice as the determinants of decision making.

The IBA shows that resistance is a form of strategic rationalisation that takes place within a context bound by instrumental rules. The IBA provides emphasis on the reflective capabilities of actors and addresses the limitations identified by some of Bourdieu’s critics such as Archer, and Jenkins (see for example (Jenkins 1982, Archer 2000, Archer 2007, Jenkins 2010).

**Interests and agency**

The idea of interests as the drivers of human behaviour at interpersonal and political levels of interaction links the conflicts experienced by individuals to social conflicts more broadly (Swedberg 1996). Fields conditions are identified as comprising separate but interrelated components reflecting instrumental rules and the effects of intersubjective recognition in interactions. The role of interests in informing instrumental field conditions are articulated as classifications and enacted in laws, procedures and resourcing formulas. Interests also inform intersubjective interactions due to their impression in the development of the individual dispositions Bourdieu calls *Habitus*.

As this research was concerned with explaining the implications of resistance for social policy it used the concepts of the IBA to describe policy making as a field in which the struggles are for legitimacy of values and prestige (Peillon 1998, Goldberg 2008, Grenfell 2012). This observation is important for understanding how field conditions are determined through the framework of legitimacy enforced through classifications that serve to validate and invalidate interests.

The IBA describes resistance as a form of field negotiation where agents actively reflect on field conditions and develop strategies to progress their interests. The reflective qualities identified as part of the process of rationalising these field negotiations explain how agents navigate complex social situations bounded by the objective conditions of fields.

**Findings – resistance as reflective strategy**

In the IBA resistance is described as reflecting a position of interest adopted by actors subject to the dominitory social arrangement of Workfare. As the narratives of resistance were analysed it was apparent that job seekers were really engaged in forms of negotiation in favour of their interests. The research found that job seekers rationalise strategies based on their perception of benefit and decide whether there is any benefit in pursuing strategies of resistance. The decisions involve assessment of field conditions and rules to determine if there is any scope for further action.

My attitude has gone from originally trying at all times to follow directions and do the right thing … to seeing the situation as a challenge. I listen to what the ‘experts’ inform me, then check and double check the information. So, I no longer believe what I’m told. (Leanne)
The capacity for active reflection is critical to the ways in which agents negotiate and seek to improve their field positions as they compete for the stakes of the field. The findings illustrate the capacity to reflect on field conditions effectively can inform the effectiveness of agent actions. Leanne adopted strategies to change her own field position by finding ways to have her voluntary work with the school formally recognised and upgrade her qualifications. She went to significant efforts to have her parenting accommodated within strategies legitimated by field conditions.

In contrast, Kelly, also a single parent, used her research on welfare to work rules to avoid conditions she decided were not in her interest. On the eve of being moved off parenting payment where she had been able to work a certain number of hours and maintain her benefits and concessions, Kelly made an unusual decision.

I did know that you did not need to accept a job if it made you worse off which mind definitely situation it was definitely the case by quite a bit. I quit my job the day before I moved to NewStart just in case they hassled me. (Kelly)

Kelly chose to quit her well-paid job to avoid working more hours. The decision was based on the realisation she would have to work more hours that would have made it harder for her to spend time caring for her 8 year old daughter. The strategic rationalisations about interests went as far as complete exits from welfare to as no longer to be under surveillance.

I am a 46 year old solo mother of two teenagers. I do not receive welfare benefits of any kind including Family Tax Benefit. This is because I was accused of failing to report and fulfil my obligations to Centrelink as well as hiding the names addresses of purported ‘tax dodgers’. Centrelink's words. I was left with a debt to Centrelink. Family Tax Benefit was cut off when I resigned politely from NewStart. I was transferred onto NewStart from Parenting Payment during a government review of welfare payments. (Laura)

Although her existence off welfare Laura is a deliberate stance outside of the mainstream, it is also a state into which she has been marginalised through maintaining her desire for freedom from surveillance. This emphasises the limits of the relational context that provide legitimacy within the objective field conditions determined by the rules of welfare conditionality.

Resistance and capital

Laura’s “choice” is one that exposes her to poverty and which she is able to endure due to the strength of her social capital. Laura observations profoundly articulated the degree to which the mutual interdependence of her community and the integrity of her social capital is vital to her survival.

Sometimes I swap my services for someone else's. Sometimes a friend brings a basket of zucchinis and I gift her a basket of greens and jam. The zucchinis get swapped for meat and part voluntary labour on a neighbour's farm. It builds community. It builds friendships. Centrelink wants to put a value on that but cant. You can't count love.

Try explaining that part of your living wage is the gift economy that you operate in that doesn't attribute value to work done and goods exchanged (Laura).

Findings like these reflect the extent to which Workfare is an economy of misrecognition because it disqualifies these communal forms of trade in favour of paid work. Strong social connections provided support for all the job seekers, and particularly for the single parents who were well endowed with social capital.
Job seekers, misrecognition and domination

The IBA identifies conflicts in street level interactions as reflecting broader social struggles over legitimacy of interests. In Workfare the needs of job seekers are poorly accommodated because of the limits imposed on the recognition of their interests. Locations such as employment services become the “spaces of conflict” where social struggles play out in street level exchanges.

The forms of harm of misrecognition identified forms of symbolic violence which have the effect of denying access support, the recognition of interests and instilling fear. The job seekers reported the surveillance and financial threats constantly reminded them that their security, and if they were parents their children’s also, was dependent on the discretion of their employment consultant. The extent of the reporting, surveillance and monitoring made job seekers feel disempowered. Leanne offered this analysis about an incident when she had queried a financial sanction.

It’s taking the basic survival things away there’s that safety thing. That feeling like “Oh maybe I’m not going to be cared for or looked after”, and then something like this happens and it’s an extra blow. I really could lose everything. (Kelly)

The analysis of the interactions involving threats of financial penalty reflected the discursive and material impact of classifications of welfare worthiness. These manifested in the attitudes job seekers discerned in their case workers and employment services agencies more generally. Job seekers keenly observed these judgements and felt worker decisions were prejudiced by these negative views of them.

The language that I have encountered is very punitive. Like participation failure. Why can’t they use terms like disengagement from service rather than saying I failed. I am sure unemployed people have heard that term enough. They used the term ‘release from service” when I left my employment agency which made me think of being released from a jail. It sure felt that way. (Kelly)

The findings indicated that excessive hassle has other negative impacts on safety, well-being and autonomy. For the single parents who had left violent relationships there were dire financial consequences. Two had become homeless and reported having lived in cars with their children. Some like Kelly described how they now lived in converted garages because of the low rent. Financial insecurity led Annie to return to a house still occupied by her an abusive husband.

I cried for weeks and was in a deep depression at the thought of trying to give my girls a better life away from their controlling aggressive father; I’ve ended up having to move BACK IN WITH HIM [her caps] (Annie)

Annie’s anguish at the loss of capacity to maintain a home for her children away from violence reflects the impact of welfare to work on her autonomy and the negative effects on the welfare of her children.

Matthew a young man spoke of how disabling the poverty of NewStart was.

This is how I’ve survived. NewStart, bits and pieces of work, basically only spending money on bare necessities. Not buying anything for myself, like clothes and stuff, like a tree stripped of branches and only keeping the trunk going, and borrowing money off my parents, and using my credit card, and living very unhealthy situations, because they were cheap, which exacerbated my mental health. Because it makes you have to make life choices that aren’t healthy…(Matthew)

Symbolic resistance, escalation and collectivisation

Resistance is expressed in discursive forms as well as in active strategies. Claudia, also a single parent, used demeaning language to describe the behaviour of her provider.
It's not right that some bully is using stand over tactics like some sort of Fat Controller, threatening to stop me receiving money if I don't do as he says, when I am struggling to exist on $500/fortnight. I bet I am not the only person who is being bullied by these Job Service Provider tyrants. Unemployed people need to be looked after by public servants who are bound by probity not by private organisations who benefit from people being out of work.” (Claudia)

Claudia’s language amplifies the injustice she identifies in the authoritarian strategies designed to control the behaviour of citizens, rather than provide useful services.

The research noted when strategies of resistance were escalated they reflected job seekers aspirations to realise greater levels of recognition for their interests. This was triggered for the single parents who reported shock when they realised they had been reclassified as job seekers, rather than parents. Kelly described it “as if someone had waved a magic wand and the value of parenting had changed overnight”.

This symbolic shift caused the parents to pursue strategies to restore the legitimacy of the role of single parenting. The core interest was for better recognition of their parenting which had been subordinated to the new welfare to work rules eligibility for parenting payment. The single parent job seekers experienced a state lost and this underpinned the strong sense of injustice they expressed.

They need to get offended about what’s happened and feel what I’ve been feeling all these years because I think once they get offended they’ll start making noise and getting some change happening. (Rosie).

The research observed the conditions in which struggles for individual recognition convert into social struggles. Through the strength of her social networks, Rosie like the other participants exercised advocacy on behalf of others. Many of the job seekers saw their participation in this research as a form of advocacy and agreed to have their stories promoted as part of a blog. These forms of resistance reflect the way social media is enabling collectivisation and seeding new social movements.

Policy Findings - Capital transfer and the role of workers

The research captured the views of employment services workers about the causes of resistance in job seekers. Surprisingly the analysis indicated they also experience misrecognition and demonstrated the propensity for resistance when their own professional autonomy was threatened. In order to function effectively, they need to be able to transfer the institutional power into an offer for support focused around a co-determined approach to case management. Sarah, a worker was able to articulate that this process involves the conversion of institutional power.

Yes so I have to utilize a bit of authority that I have, and I know some workers weren’t very comfortable using these power strategies, but personally I am comfortable because the world is not that fair all the time. You know everyone has ups and downs in life, maybe you are not very happy and angry, and I am here to help you to maybe ease the pain, or maybe help you get what you want. So if you give them a choice, the feel like they have options that eradicate a bit of anxiety. This was when I was able to have a meaningful discussion with them.

This conversion involves the transfer of legitimacy back to the job seeker so that they are able to realise the exchange has potential to improve their own job prospects. This is the strength and trust-based relationship the excessive conditionality of Workfare has eroded.
Conclusion, the Interest Based Account and Policy implications
The IBA contrasts to quantitative analysis about the effectiveness of employment services or activation strategies because it has explored whether punitive strategies are really effective at helping people find sustainable jobs.

The IBA describes job seekers as interacting in complex relational contexts. Their capacity to find suitable work depends on supporting the growth of their capital and recognition of their interests. Unless the wasteful and harmful conflict and resistance reported in the street level of Workfare will persist. These are ethical and policy concerns about the future role of welfare, social cohesion and integration.

The research also describes policy making as a field with its own struggles for legitimacy So that social policy that promotes genuine social and economic participation I argue policy makers themselves must become conscious of their role in promoting and valuing alternative forms of evidence like this research.
References


The Involvement of International Justice in the Exhumation of Timoteo Mendieta Alcalá

Natalia Maystorovich Chulio
University of Sydney

Abstract
The democratisation of the Spanish state was a careful negotiation by the old guard to ensure their continued place in the new state after a bloody civil war and dictatorship. The negotiation provided a political amnesty in 1977, releasing 89 political prisoners to assist in smoothing the transition to democracy. This process left many people on the margins of society and many more in mass graves across the country. The continued application of amnesty has symbolic and legal affects for the victims seeking to recover their relatives from mass graves in Spain. While since 2000 the Association for the Recuperation of Historic Memory (ARMH, hereafter) has exhumed 162 mass graves throughout Spain, there continues to be a political and legal push back against the recovery of the missing. In January of 2016 the exhumation of 22 victims of the civil war in Guadalajara Spain was conducted on the basis of judicial orders from Argentinean judge María Servini de Cubria. This exhumation marks a significant change in the possibility to exhume mass graves as foreign judges apply universal jurisdiction and may be a first real steps providing victims with reconciliation and justice for the past atrocities committed by the Spanish state. Justice then is not just an individual conviction for criminal activity, but rather a broader social truth seeing the light of day to provide the opportunity of a dignified burial. This bring us to the broader question of why does the Spanish state continue to deny the right to know, forcing international judges to act on behalf of victims?

Keywords: Universal jurisdiction, exhumation, mass graves, human rights, amnesty

With the death of the Franco in 1975, the Spanish state commenced its transition to democracy. This was codified in the form of the Amnesty Law (Ley 46/1977, hereafter), which was a negotiated pact of silence by the political elites as a compromise for a new democratic order. The law allowed for the release of the remaining 89 political prisoners in return for legal impunity for those who participated in human rights violations, maintaining the positions of important political and legal figures of the Spanish state. The discourse used to justify impunity was the need to smooth the transition to democracy to prevent further violence. The dominant discourse claims that the transition was a peaceful process, failing to acknowledge the violence of the period.
There were various attacks against civilians during this period. On 3 March 1976 in the working class area Zaramaga, Victoria a group of 5,000 workers including women and children were conducting a meeting in a church regarding labour rights. On this day over 2,000 shots were fired into the church, killing 5 men and injuring many more (Azumendi, 2013). Until this point in history churches had been impenetrable locations offering safety. Another incident the ‘Atocha massacre’ occurred in Madrid on 24 January 1977, where Franco’s security forces indiscriminately commenced shooting in the offices of labour rights lawyers, killing five and seriously injuring five (Ramirez, 2015). Despite these two examples many leading figures have defended the transitional as peaceful and necessary. A leading socialist Txiqui Benagas argued impunity was necessary to further reconciliation by giving a voice to all. However, this fails to acknowledge that the republicans were left out of the reconciliation process, with no place in the nations historic memory on the basis of the Ley 46/1977. This paper contends that the continued application of impunity has enduring symbolic, legal and political effects for the recovery of the missing in Spain. With no political party willing to derogate Ley 46/1977 and refusal of the judiciary to investigate cases of past human rights violations in Spain.

At the close of the cold war human rights discourse increased in ‘pace’ and ‘scope’ on the basis of the increasing consciousness of the failure to protect victims during mass atrocities (Ashby Wilson, 2006; Freeman, 2006). From 1985 various European courts commenced applying principles of ‘Universal Jurisdiction’ on the basis of its importance to the rule of law in incidences of human rights violations. Khojasteh (2007) defines universal jurisdiction as a ‘legal doctrine which permits domestic courts to try and punish perpetrators of some crimes so heinous that they amount to crimes against the whole of humanity, regardless of where they occurred or the nationality of the victim or perpetrator’. The application of universal jurisdiction was made possible in national courts through an expansion of international human rights and humanitarian law. This is what Humphrey (2011) calls and expression of ‘legal globalisation’ whereby courts and judges act as judicial activists on an international scale (pp.7). The ‘activist role is defined as the role performed when courts develop national law in order to harmonize it with international law, even though their national legislation does not provide for such competence’ (Weill, 2014:158-9).

In 1998 a landmark case investigated by Spanish judge Baltasar Garzón established four precepts of law with respect to human rights and amnesty. Firstly that human rights were universal in nature, thereby it was not necessary that they be codified in national law. Secondly, enforced disappearance is a continuing crime until the individual or their body is recovered. Thirdly, amnesty could not be applied in cases of gross human rights violations. Fourthly, state leaders are not immune from convictions for gross human rights violations (Maystorovich, 2012: 25). This provided an important legal precedent in cases of crimes of lesser humanity, which has paved the path for victims to seek justice internationally.

With the advent of exhumations taking place in Spain, victims have begun to demand a place in the national collective memory and assistance in realizing their rights in relation to the missing. On 14 December 2006 a group of Spanish attorneys brought a case forward to investigate disappearances, killings, torture and forced exile that occurred in Spain. In 2008 Judge Garzón, of the Supreme Court No. 5, declared himself competent to investigate incidences of torture and enforced disappearance opening legal proceedings. In addition he ordered the exhumation of 19 mass graves with the inclusion of over 133,708 missing victims listed among the allegations for investigation. The judge utilised his previous judgments as precedent, that the application of amnesty was invalid in cases of gross human rights violations, as the Law of Historical Memory 2007 (Ley 52/2007, hereafter) provided provision for judges to request exhumations.

With growing political tensions amongst right wing and fascist groups in Spain, the case was suspended pending a judicial investigation as to whether the judge had exceeded his judicial
authority. On 26 January 2009 a complaint was filed by Manos Limpias (a fascist union or syndicate) with the Criminal Chamber of the Supreme Court of Spain, alleging the crime of prevarication. The crime of prevarication is defined in Article 446 of the Spanish Criminal Code as where a ‘judge or magistrate who, knowingly dictates an unjust sentence or resolution’. The judgement against Garzón highlights a failure of the judiciary to remain independent and as an administrative arm it is highly formalistic in its application of the law (See Burbridge, 2011; Langer, 2011). It is also one of the key legal decisions that have led to the case being filed in Argentina against the Franco era crimes. It is an expression of the legal networks forged in the transitional justice field through earlier persecutions by Garzón under universal jurisdiction against the Argentine military officer for crimes against humanity in Argentina. While the court decision cleared Garzón of any wrongdoing, it deemed that he did not hold jurisdiction to investigate the case. He was later suspended on other charges and has a case pending with the European court of Human Rights.

After the failure to access justice through the national courts in Spain, a group of the litigants sought justice in Argentina. This led to the international case 4591/2010 investigating ‘charges of genocide and/or crimes against humanity committed in Spain by the Franco dictatorship between 17 July 1936 and 15 June 1977 as instructed by Judge Maria Servini de Cubria of the Federal Criminal and Correctional Court No. 1, Argentina’. This has been the first instance where an Argentine judge utilised the principal of Universal Jurisdiction in order to investigate crimes that occurred in Spain. To date the judge has taken testimony from victims and has requested the extradition of 22 former Franco era government ministers, nonetheless the Spanish state has refused to extradite. The fact that the first investigations of Franco-era crimes was launched in Argentina highlights the particular difficulty that victims have experienced for over 40 years when seeking justice for crimes against humanity. The case being conducted in Argentina offers renewed hope to victims and allows them a public space to voice what happened to them and or their family. Similarly Ascensión Mendieta after many years attempting to exhume the grave of her father to no avail was forced to join the Argentina case in an attempt to seek access to her right to know. This shows the importance of legal globalization in providing avenues of justice to citizens, when national courts fail in this area.

In order to gain insights into victims attempts and needs in relation to recovering the missing of enforced disappearance, I have utilised ethnographic observations and semi-structured interviews. Over the last 4 years working with ARMH exhuming mass graves it has become apparent that the ability to obtain permission to exhume a grave is dependant on the individual who is asked, no matter at which level of government (Maystorovich, 2012). The Ley 52/2007 allows for relatives and associations seeking to exhume mass graves with access to documents, information and sites. However, the exhumation protocol leaves the final authority with the owner of the land on which they are seeking to exhume the grave from. This can lead to problems when the property owner, refuses access to the site. An example of this occurred in Cacabeles where there is a mass grave in a garden of a family. The association has attempted on numerous occasions to obtain permission from the property owner, however, to date he has denied access to the site on the basis that his roses would be damaged in the process of exhuming the bodies. The law does not offer any remedy to the relatives and they cannot dispute the decision of the property owner.

While Ley 52/2007 states that no institution will impede the investigation or exhumation of a mass grave, it doesn’t guarantee the likelihood of aging access to documents and sites. This has been the experience of the Mendieta family as the many attempts to exhume the grave have been obstructed by the local council as they refused access to the site. Interviews I conducted with the exhumation representatives of the Guadalajara council, accompanied by Rene a member of ARMH, stated they had the right to prevent exhumations, which they had confirmed through
consultations with other councils in the autonomous community of Castilla-la-Mancha. These other officials had claimed that a judicial order was required under the law to exhume a grave. This is interesting as nowhere in Ley 52/2007 does it stipulate the need for a judicial order. This is another example of how the authorities in Spain interpret the law to suit their own ends. To add to this the council demanded a deposit of 2,500 Euros in the event that during the exhumation there was any damage to the cemetery. With taxes or fees levied for each individual removed from the grave as per the council’s regular fee structure. The total charges to date amount to 1,459.81 Euros after the return of the deposit. Under Ley 52/2007 these taxes should not have been charged. These charges are the equivalent of an impediment and further insult to the individuals unjustly killed by the state. This further highlights the administrations attempts to impede access to exhume by the inordinate amount that they were charging to remove the victims from the grave and deposit. Most associations would not have the funds available to take part in the recovery process.

The exhumation conducted in January of 2016 at the municipal cemetery of Guadalajara Patio 4 Grave 2 is a clear example how an internationally led exhumation overcame local obstacles that the Mendieta family had experienced. In this particular case the daughter of Timeteo, struggled for many years attempting to exhume the grave. Requests made to the local authorities continually denied the victim access to her right to know. On 29 November 2013 the 88-year-old victim, Ascensión was forced to travel to Argentina to denounce the disappearance of her father after the Spanish authorities denied her continual attempts to exhume the grave. The historic nature of this exhumation did not go unnoticed by the local media, given it was the first instance where an international judge had ordered the exhumation and identification of victims recovered from a grave in Spain. This particular exhumation is a clear example of the need for international judges to utilise the legal principal of universal jurisdiction to assist victims when local jurisdictions fail to provide access to the exhumation. For the victims of the civil war and dictatorship it has been a long silent road with no public acknowledgement or empathy for their pain and suffering. For individuals like the Mendieta family the globalisation of the legal field has been an important tool in obtaining recognition for their suffering and justice in the form of recovering their missing relative.

The exhumation produced an avalanche of requests by families to exhume, with ARMH receiving more than 108 claims. During this process an initial investigation as to the possible grave where the relative may be located in the cemetery was conducted as well as obtaining testimony from the families. The interesting aspect of Guadalajara was the amount of information available, with a registry of all persons buried in the cemetery by date of burial having been maintained by the council. It was only in witnessing the exhumation in Guadalajara that the fear of families coming forward was ruptured. It also expresses the importance of the legal field to enable people to come forward and demand their right to know. In this case had it not been for the international judges insistence that the grave be exhumed, these families would not have sought to recover their missing from the grave. This has further opened the possibility for future exhumations of the hundreds of victims buried in the municipal cemetery. During the exhumation it was clear that Ascensión became a major protagonist and a ray of hope for the many families of the missing. It was not uncommon to see people, media personalities and photographers wanting to speak with her and partake the personal experience in one way or another. She highlighted that the process of exhumation was not one of revenge but a personal struggle to recover the remains of her beloved father.

In reviewing the legal case it was apparent that despite the requests from an international judge the process involved many challenges and impediments put in place by the Spanish administration to prevent access to the site for the purpose of exhumation. Various judicial requests were made
to the courts of Guadalajara and initially the response in 2014 was an emphatic no. Judge Platero Parada of the Auxiliary National Court No.1 (0000094/2014) cited that she was not confident that exhumation would result in the recovery of Timeteo as it was unclear which grave contained his remains. This was despite the extensive records that had been maintained by the state, including death certificates corroborating the date of death with the burial registry. Initially the association was concerned that Timeteo may not be in the grave on the basis of the small dimensions of the grave. The grave was extremely narrow and small, indicating a depth which would not have been common in the 1930’s. However, once the exhumation was conducted it showed that the grave had in fact reached 3.75 metres deep. Additional complications were created by the fact that the mass grave No. 2 had a grave on either side, due to the depth the walls of the grave required that they be reinforced to ensure the safety of the team. The initial denial of the exhumation is another in a long list of decisions by the Spanish state to prevent the exhumation of mass graves across the country, despite an international order.

In order to refute the judges’ decision Spanish lawyers in collaboration with the association submitted a plan to intervene. This highlighted the possibility of exhumation and that the records indicated a clear location for the grave based on the investigation conducted by the exhumation team. The report further clarified the possibility of exhuming the grave based on the qualifications and experience of the team that was proposed to conduct the recovery of the remains. Judge Servini de Cubria issued a new judicial order on 13 March 2015, citing the right of the family to exhume and provide a dignified burial. On the 22 of December 2015 a judicial order allowing for the exhumation of the grave was provided by the Auxiliary National Court of Guadalajara No. 2 (0000141/2015). The judicial order provided for clear instructions as to how and who could conduct the exhumation. It cited that there had been no legal impediments and on the basis of the Ley 52/2007 these rights were recognized and amplified for victims of persecution during the civil war and dictatorship.

This case is an example of the need for international judges to invoke victims’ rights on the basis of universal jurisdiction. Why does the Spanish state continue to deny the right to know, forcing international judges to act on behalf of victims? Part of the reason for this is the controversial nature of the civil war, after 80 years, it is still a divisive issue within Spain. For external parties to Spanish politics it seems absurd that victims continue to be repressed by the state in one form or another. What for many would just be a group of people wanting to find their father, mother, brother or sister to rebury them in a local cemetery, in Spain, the current socio-political fabric is multifaceted and politically charged. These victims in mass graves have been socially marginalised for so long that society does not see the point in dealing with the past. During the dictatorship the loosing side experienced continued repression in the form of constant surveillance, fines, prison sentences, and social exclusion. The victims remained silent failing to invoke their right to locate their missing during 40 years of dictatorship, due to a genuine fear that history could repeat itself. During the transition to democracy, elites negotiated that this silence should continue and that the state was not prepared to deal with the ramifications of the past, as it may unravel the very legitimacy, authority and continuation of the Spanish state. The discourses of the past remained the same, with the fault of the civil war continuing to be leveled at those same victims in clandestine graves across the country in order to reconstruct and maintain the states symbolic strength and authority.

The maintenance of the Francoist discourses allowed for a continuing repression and trauma for those victims left in the margins of Spanish society. They had never been allowed to mourn the deaths of their loved ones and in some instances were not permitted to know where their relatives had been buried. In addition to this there were many instances of families being stripped of their business, property and worldly possessions. Wives and mothers were forced to work to maintain
their families after the men in their families had been killed. Publically they could not speak of their dead and missing. One victim from Valladolid stated that when she had been at school, one of her classmates had said that her father died from a heart attack asking her what had happened to her father. She had told her that he had died from melancholy. It was only years later when they saw each other again, it turned out that both their fathers had been assassinated by Francoist forces. On one level there was a fear that they could come back for other members of the family, but add to this the shame of not being able to acknowledge your relative. This woman said now at the age of 86 she is sick of being silent and refuses to remain silent and ashamed. She said that she forgave those who killed her father only wanting to locate his remains for reburial, a common desire among victims. She said for her it was cathartic to visit the mass grave in the cemetery of Valladolid, even if her father was not in that grave. This allowed her to visit others who like her father had been killed for political affiliations or views.

The process of exhumation brings to light that which is buried, allowing communities to heal and public acknowledgment of communal trauma by the sharing of testimony. This is made possible by allowing families the possibility of closure through reburial. It adds empirical evidence of political crimes, reinforcing a collective identity of victimhood for republican families. While it does not provide healing in the commonly established criminal justice norms of culpability, the families do not seek criminal prosecutions. In the case of Spain to date this is as far as historical justice can be achieved, with the recovery and reburial of the missing. Meanwhile the state does not provide funding to NGOs exhuming mass graves in Spain, preferring to fund exhumations in Bosnia, Cyprus and elsewhere. It appears to provide the state with a comfortable distance, condemning perpetrators and assisting victims of enforced disappearance in other countries. Meanwhile the responsibility for providing the victims with the opportunity to exhume the mass graves of Spain lies in the hands of NGOs, when in actual fact it is the legal responsibility and obligation of the state, as provided in international law.


Ageing-in-place and the risks associated with housing in later life

Cassie Curryer
Sociology & Anthropology, University of Newcastle

Abstract
How might older individuals adapt and plan for later life within uncertain policy and housing contexts? This paper discusses ageing-in-place (remaining in the home supported by family and community and aged care services) as a cornerstone of contemporary ageing policy in Australia. It explores the role of risk and choice in relation to ageing-in-place and considers the relevance of Beck's theory for research in this area. It draws attention to the ways in which risk is negotiated in later life, and argues that contemporary policy (such as consumer-directed care) idealises ageing in the home as a choice, while downplaying inequalities and the lack of affordable and appropriate housing over the lifecourse. It places risk as the flipside of choice on the research agenda relating to ageing-in-place, and highlights problems with contemporary aged care policy.

Introduction
What are the risks of ageing-in-place (remaining in the home supported by family, community, and aged care services) in contemporary society, and how might older people adapt to increasing uncertainty over time? This paper explores the role of risk and choice in relation to housing and ageing-in-place and the relevance of Beck's theory for research in this area. The paper begins by considering the nexus between ageing-in-place and housing, and discusses the ways in which older people negotiate ageing in the home. It draws attention to the risks associated with increased choice in consumer-directed care in later life. It argues that contemporary policy idealises ageing in the home, while downplaying risks associated with the under-supply of affordable and appropriate housing, and socioeconomic constraints over the lifecourse. It concludes by highlighting the value of attending to risk as the flipside of choice in the research agenda on ageing-in-place.

The nexus between housing and ageing-in-place
Ageing-in-place refers to the policy ideal and voiced desire of many older people to remain living in their own homes, while being supported by family, community, and home care services (Grimmer et al. 2015). The policy is based on evidence that ageing-in-place supports better quality of life (Sixsmith and Sixsmith 2008), reduces costs of aged care services (Chappell et al. 2004), and decreases need for residential care (Productivity Commission 2015). The idea of ageing-in-place is informed by the theory of person-environmental fit (PE-fit) (Oswald et al. 2006). This theory posits a transactional relationship between the individual and the home
environment; a supportive home environment delays the entry of older people into residential aged care, and vice versa (Iecovich 2014). However, successful ageing-in-place is contingent on personal factors (health, coping, resilience, social networks), housing circumstances (ownership, rental tenure, affordability), and economic resources (income to maintain adequate standards of living and to make necessary home modifications and repairs) (Means 2007). Ageing-in-place is based on the premise that people have and exercise choice as they age and gives insufficient attention to the influence of risk and uncertainty on housing options in later life (Colic-Peisker et al. 2014). Further, it ignores structural inequalities and the under-supply of affordable and appropriate housing for older people.

Beck’s theory of risk society and individualisation
Though there has been limited research on the relevance of risk theory to ageing-in-place, Beck (1992) provides a critical lens for examining how older people negotiate choice within rapidly changing policy contexts. Beck (1992) defines risk as a ‘systematic way of dealing with hazards and insecurities induced and introduced by modernisation itself’ (p. 21). He sees risk as an inherent feature of everyday life arising from the loosening of ties with traditional social structures and norms and individualisation of problems that comes with modernisation (Beck 1992; Beck and Beck-Gernsheim 2002). Consequently, individual life courses have become highly complex and diverse as more space is created for the exercise of individual autonomy and choice. In responding to risks and challenges associated with ageing, much depends on individual resources and choices over the lifecourse (Renaut et al. 2015), as well as broader structural, political, and social values prevailing at a particular time (Burke et al. 2007; Croft 2001). As a substantial economic investment, housing risk is both cumulative (arising from various influences over time) and iterative (in that individuals will seek to adapt and respond to actual or perceived risk) (Croft 2001).

Negotiating risk: Adaptation in later life
More people are living into advanced old-age than ever before (World Health Organisation 2015), however, later life is fraught with uncertainty. The idea that people plan for old-age negates this uncertainty and implies they have options and choices. In planning for later life, older people might reorganise their homes or living arrangements to maintain independence (Mackenzie et al. 2015), perhaps by downsizing (Byles et al. 2016), or moving into a retirement village, or service-integrated housing (Jones et al. 2008). For the most part, changes are made to the living environment in response to declining mobility and increasing frailty, such as outsourcing lawn maintenance and household cleaning (Mackenzie et al. 2015), or installing innovative aids and biomedical technologies (Sixsmith and Sixsmith 2008).

In keeping with Beck’s theory of risk, however, there may be unintended consequences. Age-segregated housing and housing modifications may not have the desired effect of increasing independence, but result in loss of meaning of the home, be experienced as stigmatising, or increase social isolation (Tanner et al. 2008). Housing relocation may not minimise risk as intended. Byles et al. (2016) found that moving to a retirement village was associated with early rather than delayed entry into residential aged care. For some, ageing-in-place may not be desirable (Stroschein 2012), or the home may be experienced as particularly burdensome (Sixsmith and Sixsmith 2008). Increased attention to the influence of risk and choice on housing outcomes in later life is therefore needed.

Homeownership and risk
Homeownership has long been a dominant aspiration in Australian society. Around 80% of older people own their homes (Productivity Commission 2015). However, housing vulnerability may result from unanticipated changes to life circumstances, such as divorce, unemployment,
or redundancy. Many on social pensions live in rented accommodation and are subject to the vagaries of changing policy and housing availability that lead to insecurity in older age. Policy mechanisms, such as taxation and negative gearing of investment properties, government subsidies, and measures such as regulations governing housing development, legal systems pertaining to home ownership or rights of tenure, and deregulation of finance and banking industries encourage home ownership (Beer et al. 2006). For the most part, housing is seen as an investment and an asset rather than a liability, and a medium for wealth creation (Atkinson & Jacobs (2016).

Time of entry into the housing market is a crucial factor influencing risk (Croft 2001); and the ability to age-in-place. Increased levels of household debt means that older people are likely to retire with significantly higher mortgage debts than their available superannuation. The household debt of non-retired homeowners aged 50-64 years has risen from 78% (in 2002) to 106% (in 2010) (Kelly Research 2012). This poses considerable risk for future financial and housing security.

Housing affordability has become a major issue, especially in cities like Sydney, where an increasing number of people are unlikely to achieve homeownership; for some, renting may be more cost-effective (Atkinson and Jacobs 2016). Older people who are renting are particularly vulnerable to housing precariousness and homelessness due to lack of suitable and affordable housing. For example, in 2016, less than 2.1% (1,583) of 75,410 rental properties were affordable for a single older person receiving the aged pension (Anglicare Australia 2016). Another study found that 56 % of older people were at risk of homelessness due to inaccessible rental accommodation (Petersen et al. 2015). These risks have not been factored into contemporary policy relating to ageing-in-place.

Little attention has been given to the nature of housing (particularly the maintenance issues associated with older dwellings) or its appropriateness to ageing-in-place (Bleasdale 2016). The Housing and Independent Living Study (HAIL) identified safety risks for many older homeowners in the greater Sydney region, concluding that many homes would be unable to support people’s changing needs as they aged (Byles et al. 2014). This can hamper delivery of services (Green and Sawyer 2010). Petersen et al similarly identified concerns with the accessibility and suitability of both private rental and social housing to support ageing-in-place (Petersen et al. 2015).

Navigating choice and risk within consumer markets

Beck (1992) highlighted that increased choice, such as that brought about by the shift to market-based, privatised housing and welfare services (Productivity Commission 2015), subjected individuals to increased risks, not least because they were left to the vagaries of uncertain, unpredictable market forces. The residualisation of public housing combined with long waiting-lists (projected to be 189,000 older households by 2029) (AIHW 2014), may leave older people vulnerable to unaffordable rental markets and housing stress (Atkinson and Jacobs 2016), particularly within the contexts of tightened eligibility requirements for aged care services and pension entitlements. For example, from 2017, changes to deeming thresholds for investment income and assets will result in lower interest deeming rates being applied to the age pension. Consequently, some aged pensioners will lose eligibility altogether, while others will have their benefits reduced. Government savings are projected to be around $32.7 million dollars in 2017 (Klapdor 2014). This represents a considerable downfall in pension income for older Australians.

In 2003, around 13% of older households were living in rental accommodation; of these, 44% were renting privately (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2005). Projections are that low income older households will increase by 120% (from 110,800 to 243,600 households) between 2001-2026 (Productivity Commission 2015). The lack of suitable and affordable housing means that
many people will have little choice about where they live in later life; consequently, this will influence their ability to age-in-place, and the types of services needed.

Consumer-directed aged care in the home provides greater individual choice in controlling budgets and purchasing services (Gill and Cameron 2015); but may not equate to greater agency, autonomy, or control. Choice is not always equitable or achievable across different policy contexts (Moffatt et al. 2012). Consumer-directed aged care also shifts responsibility for risks from institutions and the state to older individuals as consumers within welfare and aged-care markets (Moffatt et al. 2012). Over time, this can lead to increased uncertainty and risk in negotiating ageing-in-place, and in planning for and adapting to changes in housing over time (Means 2007).

The limits of risk for housing studies
While Beck’s theory of individualisation and the risk society provides a lens for thinking about how older people negotiate risk and choice in later life within the context of housing and ageing-in-place, it has some limitations. Beck (1992) contends that risk has become more universal and diffuse, but studies by Means (2007), Morris (2007, 2009), and Ong et al (2015) provide evidence for the role of socioeconomic and health inequalities on ageing and housing in later life. For example, Morris (2009) highlighted that public housing tenants tended to have lower accommodation costs, greater security of tenure, and quality of life than those renting privately. Both class and gender have profound influences on housing in later life (Sharam 2015). For example, older women are more vulnerable to housing precariousness due to gendered disadvantage over the lifecourse (Colic-Peisker et al. 2014). However, problems associated with ageing-in-place are not seen through a structural lens (Atkinson and Jacobs 2016). Further, the burden of risk tends to fall on those with limited access to social, health, and economic resources, and limited choice within competitive welfare markets (Glendinning 2008). Furthermore, Byles and colleagues examined the influence of health, sociodemographic factors, and housing type on entry into residential aged care. Women who transitioned into residential care were likely to not be partnered, to have poor self-rated health, multiple comorbidities, and to need help with daily tasks. Women staying in their homes were more likely to live in regional or rural (remote) areas; while women living in an apartment were more likely to live in major cities, and to be living alone (Byles et al. 2016).

In short, Beck’s idea of universal risk downplays social constructions of those considered to be risky (or vulnerable) in the first place (Powell and Wahidin 2005), and the influence of sociocultural, historical, and economic disadvantage (Woodman 2009, 2010). Beck writes about risk in highly developed Western societies with little attention to the nuance of non-Western influences within the increasingly diverse societies in which people are ageing (Christiansen and Sorensen 2008).

Conclusion: An agenda for housing and policy research
Notwithstanding the limitations of Beck’s theory, attention to risk, as the flipside of choice in ageing-in-place, highlights problems with contemporary aged care policy and consumer-directed care. As already outlined, health and social inequalities, declining home ownership, under-supply of affordable housing, and shortages in aged care services all increase risk and limit choice for people as they age. The privatisation and marketisation of services has, and will continue to, exert profound influence on ageing-in-place. More research is needed on how these factors impact on older people’s negotiation of choice and risk in later life.
Acknowledgements
Thank you to the peer reviewers and HDR supervisors Professor Mel Gray and Professor Julie Byles for feedback on this background paper, which informs a Higher Degree Research Project. This project receives funding from the University of Newcastle and the Centre for Excellence in Population Ageing Research (CEPAR), UNSW.
References

Kelly Research. (2012). Household savings and retirement: Where has all my super gone? A
report on super and retirement for CPA Australia. Southbank: CPA Australia.


Imagining LGBTIQ Communities: An Ethnographic Study from Bogota, Colombia

Shai Diner
RMIT

Abstract:
This article uses Anderson’s concept of an imagined community to explore how members of the LGBTIQ community in Bogota, Colombia, imagine the boundaries of the community and establish forms of inclusion and exclusion. This research draws on auto-ethnographic observations conducted on a daily basis from January – May 2015, in Bogota, Colombia, with a particular focus on the LGBTIQ nightlife scene and LGBTIQ community centres. Auto-ethnographic observations were supplemented with interviews with fifteen professionals with insights into the LGBTIQ community. The research reveals tensions in the way the LGBTIQ community imagines itself – on the one hand, imagined to be a cohesive community in order to advocate for equal rights; on the other, imagined as internally divided into subcommunities and subcultures along lines of class, sexual orientation, gender identity, and other internal divisions.

Keywords: LGBTIQ; imagined community; exclusion; auto-ethnography; Colombia

Introduction
Colombia is a diverse and unique country, with its capital city, Bogota, concentrating the intense array of people and cultures. Significantly, Bogota has become a migration destination due to the internal conflict within Colombia (Hernández Bello and Gutiérrez Bonilla 2008). Gay, bisexual and trans* persons are particularly vulnerable to violence and the need to migrate, due to their poverty and HIV status (Zea et al. 2013). LGBTIQ persons have created safe spaces within the confines of Bogota, and have established their own communities, with specific institutions and sections of the city particularly expressive of diverse LGBTIQ subcultures (Rodríguez García 2012; Thorrens 2011).

Drawing on the results from auto-ethnographic observations and interviews carried out between January and May 2015, this paper analyses the complex ways in which members of LGBTIQ communities in Bogota understand the boundaries of their communities. Building on

1 LGBTIQ (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Trans*, Intersex & Queer) will be used throughout this paper, as a more inclusive acronym. However, for reasons that become clear throughout the course of the paper, more exclusionary acronyms are used where appropriate, to either name a local organisation or to represent accurately the political perceptions articulated in interviews.
Benedict Anderson’s (2006) concept of an ‘imagined community’, this paper focuses on some of the ways in which members of Bogota’s LGBTIQ communities imagine their community. The paper then briefly explores how the need to mobilise for civil and political rights for the LGBTIQ community as a whole, might have influenced the development of distinctive forms of imagined community.

**Imagined Community**

The term “imagined community” was introduced in Benedict Anderson’s (2006) foundational text *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. For Anderson, nations must be understood as specifically *imagined* communities,

because the members of even the smallest nation will never know most of their fellow-members, meet them, or even hear of them, yet in the minds of each lives the image of their communion. (2006:6)

The imagined community allows individuals to have a sense of belonging, of comradeship to the people around them, without restricting this sense to people with whom individuals could develop immediately personal, face-to-face, bonds. The imagined community can function to secure unity of a large group of people in the face of adversity, providing a locus of identity that can transcend individual differences. This identity is secured, however, in part through the exclusion of others from the imagined nation state.

Anderson explicitly understands that national communities are not unique in being “imagined” – any sufficiently large community must necessarily possess an imaginary dimension, and even the tiniest of communities may do so:

in fact, all communities larger than primordial villages of face-to-face contact (and perhaps even these) are imagined. Communities are to be distinguished, not by their falsity/genuineness, but by the style in which they are imagined (2006:6)

Thus, Anderson’s concept of an imagined community can potentially be extended beyond the nation-state, to all levels of community and subcultural groups (Acosta 2008; Barclay 2004; Chavez 1994; Hughes 2008; Ross 2012; Valentine and Skelton 2003).

The concept of an imagined community has previously been applied to LGBTIQ communities, for example, by Woolwine (2000:13), who analyses gay men’s imaginary identification to one another:

We see the usage of terms ‘community’ and ‘all gay people’ in a way that allows the individual to identify with a grouping larger than a local community or with a fragment of the gay ‘community’ defined purely along ideological and religious and/or class and/or racial and/or political lines.

Woolwine further understands the gay male community as:

one not tied, in speech, to a specific ghetto and there would be no claim, implied or explicit, that its members know each other personally and certainly no indication that they meet face to face on a regular basis. (2000:11–12)

This paper extends Woolwine’s insights to explore the specific case of how LGBTIQ persons in Bogota imagine their community.

**Method**

All data for this project was collected by the principal author. The auto-ethnographic nature of the observations, and the importance of the researcher’s personal background in facilitating opportunities for meaningful participant observation, are reflected in the use of the singular first-person in recounting the method and certain aspects of the observational findings below.
When I went to Colombia for my preliminary fieldwork, I did not initially intend to focus on LGBTIQ communities, but was instead interested in the relation of music subcultures to youth resilience within lower socio-economic communities. After I arrived in Bogota, I identified a number of locally significant music venues, and began to visit each in turn, intending to narrow my focus for future fieldwork. On one of these site visits, accompanied by a couple of my local friends, I discovered the largest LGBTIQ nightclub in Latin America. The vibrant, diverse, hip shaking atmosphere the club emanated ensured that each night spent there was full of adventure and exploration. My research quickly began to focus on the community surrounding this club, and on the wider LGBTIQ community.

When planning my fieldwork, my sense of what would be required to negotiate research as an “outsider” was very abstract: I did not fully appreciate until I was physically present in the field, how challenging it would be to negotiate access to participants and field sites. Once in Colombia, visiting venues, it became increasingly clear that there were many hurdles I would need to overcome as an outsider, and how much I would need to cultivate my own self-reflexive skills (Coffey 1999; Foley 2002; Jordan 2001; Roberts and Sanders 2005).

Entering into the LGBTIQ community, however, felt somewhat more ‘natural’. My own identification as a LGBTIQ gay male meant that, while I was an outsider in the country, I was an insider within this community. My role as an Australian researcher with Spanish as a third language created my outsider status, whilst my identification at the time as a gay male allowed a privileged insider access to the community (Kanuha 2000; Zinn 1979). Navigating the field, I believed honesty regarding sexuality and limited Spanish skills was important in gaining trust with participants. This insider-outsider status allowed for a useful sensitivity to the distinctive ways the LGBTIQ community is imagined in Bogota.

Once this field site had been chosen, I used an auto-ethnographic participant observation method to collect data (Adams 2012; Adams, Jones, and Ellis 2014; Ellis 2004; Ellis, Adams, and Bochner 2011). Observations were conducted from January – May 2015, and field notes were used to capture my impressions of public spaces and events, ranging from publicly held concerts and marches to nightclub venues within the LGBTIQ sector of Bogota. Field notes contained both observational records and self-reflexive analysis of my experiences and observations, to acknowledge my presence as a researcher and as outsider to Colombia (Foley 2002; Hammersley and Atkinson 2007).

In addition to auto-ethnographic participant observation, I also conducted semi-structured interviews with fifteen stakeholders, drawn from a purposive sample including government employees and officials, advocacy workers, academics and community and nightclub workers. Interviews consisted of a series of open-ended questions exploring daily life in Bogota and probing details of individuals’ work and/or the LGBTIQ community (Holstein and Gubrium 1999; Hopf 2004). Interviews were conducted by myself, and ranged from 1 – 2 hours, with thirteen conducted in Spanish, and two in English.

Themes for data analysis were not determined in advance, but were rather allowed to emerge organically from the field work and interviews, and were coded into categories, using a grounded theory approach (Charmaz 2006; Dey 1999; Glaser and Strauss 1967; Strauss and Corbin 1998). Space restrictions mean that many results must be analysed elsewhere. This paper will focus on a single, particularly striking, result: the way that internal divisions and boundaries are imagined within the LGBTIQ community.
Cultural, Political and Legal Context

Bogota & LGBTIQ rights

Colombia’s exuberant culture reflects the country’s diverse and heterogeneous nature. Colombia is divided into five main regions by its topographic character. Following Spanish colonization in the 16th century, the different regions adopted and developed distinct cultural elements, as well as different demographics and varying dialects, following the natural topographic boundaries (Wade 2000, 2006). As with many post-colonial societies, class has generated distinctive patterns of segregation (Safford and Palacios 2002). Colombia has consistently been divided by cultural, political and social difference, yet has remained a unified nation.

Although Colombia’s beauty is in its diversity and difference, its diversity poses particular challenges for how it imagines itself as a national community (Ferro 1995; Wade 2000). Globalisation has added the further dimension of an extensive Colombian expatriate community, whose own reimaginings of Colombia interact in complex ways with local Colombian cultures (Diner 2015). These complexities carry over into the LGBTIQ community in Bogota, resulting in distinctive ways of imagining membership, belonging – and boundaries and exclusion.

Rights for LGBTIQ persons in Colombia were granted through a series of high court rulings, with no rights granted legislatively through the federal government. The Colombian Constitution of 1991, Article 13, states:

All individuals are born free and equal before the law, will receive equal protection and treatment from the authorities, and will enjoy the same rights, freedoms, and opportunities without any discrimination on account of gender, race, national or family origin, language, religion, political opinion, or philosophy. (translated from Spanish)

This grants all citizens equality, and through constitutional challenges by Colombia Diversa, a LGBTIQ advocacy group, LGBTIQ persons have gained equality before the law, most recently with the court ruling in favour of same-sex marriage (Brodzinsky 2016; Ripoll 2009).

Colombian law laid the ground work for Colombian attitudes towards LGBTIQ persons to transform (Avella 2011; Ripoll 2009). Colombia is historically a conservative Catholic country, and the Church remains influential. As a result, although LGBTIQ persons have many legal rights, including the right to freedom from discrimination, they nevertheless face discrimination in practice, especially in regional cities and rural areas (Ripoll 2009; Zea et al. 2014). For this reason, there is a large migration of gay, bisexual and trans* persons to Bogota – which, according to many people I interviewed, is driven by the sentiment that freedom is greater in Bogota (Bianchi et al. 2014; Zea et al. 2013). As an outsider to Bogota, it appeared that, for the most part, Bogota is a progressive, modern and innovative city, and an accepting place for LGBTIQ persons, with the suburb Chapinero particularly known as a place where LGBTIQ persons can freely walk the streets, without fear of discrimination. The acceptance of LGBTIQ persons can also be seen at a local governmental level, where there is a specific department for LGBTIQ persons, Subdirección para Asuntos LGBT (Sub-department for LGBT Affairs), part of the Secretaría Distrital de Integración Social (District Secretariat for Social Integration) in Bogota (Anon 2015). Bogota is, not, however, completely free of discrimination. There are areas that are not deemed safe and where discrimination is more likely.

Some members of the LGBTIQ community are also more vulnerable: lesbian women and gay men, for example, are discriminated against far less than trans women. It therefore remains important that specific institutions, venues and neighbourhoods provide explicit support for members of LGBTIQ communities. Two kinds of supportive institutions – neighbourhood centres funded by local government, and the network of clubs and venues catering to LBGTIQ members – are analysed below.
LGBTIQ Community Centres in Bogota
The local Bogota Government funds two LGBTIQ community centres [Centro de Atención Integral a la Diversidad Sexual y de Géneros (Center of Integral Attention to Sexual Diversity and of Gender)] that operate in Teusaquillo and Santa Fe (Bogotá 2012; Mayorga Bautista 2015). Each centre has a different functionality, largely determined by its location and the clientele in the suburb. Teusaquillo is situated in a middle class area, providing support services and cultural events to people who identify as LGBTIQ. They run various support groups for different segments of the community, such as young gay men, trans* women and mothers of LGBTIQ persons. However, these groups are often run for singularly identified sexualities or genders. They also function as a drop in centre for anyone who identifies as LGBTIQ and provide free counselling to individuals who seek help (Mayorga Bautista 2015).

By contrast, the Santa Fe centre has a greater focus on basic needs, due to its location. Santa Fe is a lower class neighboured, with a large population of internal migrants. Many of those attending the centre are internally displaced due to rural violence, have little to no social support and are engaged in prostitution and drugs. For this reason, the centre focuses more on meeting essential needs, rather than cultural events (Mayorga Bautista 2015). The centre provides a safe space for a vulnerable population, providing attendees with meals, alongside workshops and classes.

Although the centres have differently functionalities, their connection lies in the population they work with. Each centre allows for individuals who identify as LGBTIQ to gather and socialise, to have a sense of comradeship and belonging - ultimately, forming a community. This experience contrasts with the discrimination that is felt within the community.

LGBTIQ Nightlife in Bogota
Bogota has a diverse and thriving nightlife scene, with the nightlife for LGBTIQ persons reflecting this. In a city of 9.5 million people, there are over 60 bars, clubs and restaurants for people who identify as LGBTIQ to attend and express themselves freely (United Nations 2014). While the majority of the nightlife for LGBTIQ persons is in the suburb of Chapinero, nightlife options are also available in Primero de Mayo, Fontibon and Candelaria.

One club in Chapinero is particularly noteworthy, hosting over 3000 people, in twelve different ambient clubs within the one building. The club promotes itself as an all-inclusive LGBTIQ venue, and is known throughout Bogota as an excellent night ‘on the town’, attracting tourists and locals, both heterosexual and homosexual. One of the inner clubs is a woman’s only space, so there is a small population of lesbian women who attend. However, the main clientele are gay men, with two of the environments being exclusive to men. This club is a convergence of sub-communities and cultures providing the perfect research site.

Saturday night is the largest night at this club, with all twelve environments open. Each environment caters to a different music genre, with the main area a grand space with a stage at the front for various shows the club presents throughout the night. The place is packed throughout all twelve environments, with people taking full advantage of the open bar until 2 a.m. A large part of the reason my research changed to focus on the LGBTIQ community was this club. My first impressions were that it was an incredible place for a diverse range of people to meet: a venue that allowed for individuals from various backgrounds, classes, sexualities, nationalities and ethnicities to mingle. It appeared, by all standards, the perfect venue to study music and its relation to resilience. Furthermore, my identification at the time as a gay male, alongside the community’s familiarity with foreigners attending the club, eased my acceptance into the community. This allowed me to be at least a partial insider where I otherwise might have been left on the outside.

Through interviews I was able to gain a greater understanding of the club and its clientele. The club’s main clientele, which was obvious from attendance, was gay men, with a small market for
lesbian women. Trans* women, however, were generally denied entry. One interviewee explained the denial of entry as a class issue: trans* women are often considered lower class due to the high proportion of trans* prostitution in downtown Bogota. Therefore, the interviewee explained, they allow drag queens into the club, because a drag queen is considered to be of higher class. One interviewee, who herself identified as trans*, explained that she has been denied entry to this club on various occasions. She later went on to state, however, that she rarely encounters problems when attending heterosexual venues. This explicit exclusion from the club is just one example where there is internal discrimination within the ‘community’. Discrimination against trans* persons by lesbian and gay persons was a common theme throughout the interview process, rather than the more obvious external discrimination by the wider community.

The choice to study this club was driven by the belief that it was inclusive for the entire community. It would represent all LGBTIQ persons providing a safe space for any LGBTIQ person. When the data complicated this early impression, I spent a while reflecting on my initial perceptions of the community. I concluded that the interview process provided the needed balance for me to understand the field observations, producing the insight required to comprehend forms of exclusion within the community. Observations complimented the interviews, by allowing me to see the reality of the words spoken in the interviews, creating a reciprocal relationship.

It was also mentioned recurrently in the interview process, that bisexuality was not considered a sexual identity in the community. A couple of the individuals interviewed spoke about the lack of understanding within the community around bisexuality, and expressed the view that the community itself expressed a lot of discriminatory views towards bisexuality. Bisexuality was understood in terms of individuals who could not come to terms with their sexuality or who were trying to benefit from heterosexual status. The lack of acceptance alienates individuals who identify as bisexual from the community, not allowing them to be part of the larger whole. The internal discrimination and the lack of acceptance suggests the divisive nature and the lack of cohesion within the community.

Discussion

The LGBTIQ community was formed in Colombia in order to advocate for LGBTIQ rights, and has been incredibly successful in meeting this goal. The need to advocate and fight for individual rights as a collective brought together diverse groups that were required to work alongside one another over the years, suspending, to some degree, an exploration of internal differences within the group. The adoption of the acronym LGBT, for political purposes, formed the foundation for the imagined subcultural community within Bogota (Anderson 2006). The formation enabled LGBTIQ individual to relate to a recognizable community and created wider visibility within Colombia (Burler 2004; Ross 2008).

Similarly, the establishment of community centers is important in providing safe inclusive spaces for LGBTIQ people. It allows community members to interact enabling individuals to develop a sense of community (Chavis and Wandersman 1990; Haag and Chang 1998; Mayorga Bautista 2015; Mcmillan and Chavis 1986). Chapinero and LGBTIQ identified bars develop visibility and community with Colombia (Ross 2008). Such institutions helped to solidify the identity of the imagined community to the wider community, but also within the LGBTIQ population.

Although there has been a common interest which has brought LGBTIQ persons together, there is still internal transphobia and biphobia which manifests itself within the LGBTIQ community. The exclusion of trans* persons from LGBTIQ venues and the biphobia existent within the mentality of lesbian and gay persons in Bogota, suggests that the position you hold within the community shapes how an individual identifies with the LGBTIQ community.
The internal exclusion within the LGBTIQ community further alienates trans* and bisexual persons, prohibiting them from being active members of the wider LGBTIQ community. Intersectionality provides a useful tool in understanding the multi-layered dimensions of individuals within a Colombian context. The intersectionality between gender and sexuality, as well as class, race and ethnicity, can shed light on the discrimination and exclusion that occurs within the community (Crenshaw 1991; Daley et al. 2008; Monro 2015). Exclusions within the LGBT community suggest that class status associated with trans* persons and a lack of education regarding bisexuality are viable causes of discrimination experienced. (Barker and Langdridge 2008; Rosenblum 1994).

Conclusion

Imagined to be a cohesive community in order to make progress in gaining rights, the community nevertheless imported conceptions of ‘respectable’ social classes from the broader Colombian society, while also elevating and privileging certain concepts of gender and sexual orientation over others, further marginalizing already marginalized groups. In this way, the LGBTIQ community replicates some forms of discrimination from the wider community. In the process, an apparently inclusive community ideal – of venues and centres open to all LGBTIQ members – operates to obscure the existence of forms of exclusion and internal discrimination against potential community members. The need to assert a strong, cohesive image in the struggle for rights has driven LGBTIQ people to project itself as a cohesive and unified community. However, this imagined unity presents both a current barrier, and a potential future opportunity, for redefining community boundaries so that the community can become more inclusive of its most marginalized members in practice.
References


Creek, CA: Altamira Press.


Mad Men and the search for meaning

Scott Doidge
Sociology Department La Trobe University

Abstract
The cable television drama Mad Men (2007-2015) has been repeatedly cited as an exemplar of the current Golden Age of television. Critics have drawn attention to the existential musings, complex characters and intricate narrative arcs that have lent the series and other exemplars including The Sopranos (1999-2007) and The Wire (2002-2008) a cultural authority previously reserved for more traditional artistic forms like the novel (Schilman, 2010). At its core, Mad Men engages with the problem of meaning in modernity that was charted in Max Weber’s discussion of the ‘disenchantment of the world’ (Weber, 1948: 151). Despite its unparalleled material achievements, the modern West in this reading is suffering from a crisis of meaning and is no longer able to provide authoritative answers to the only really important question: ‘What shall we do and how shall we live?’ This paper investigates what Mad Men has to say in response to Weber’s question.

Keywords: Mad Men, Nietzsche, Weber, social theory, disenchantment, meaning.

Introduction
Mad Men (2007-2015) is a cable television drama that follows the lives of a group of people working for Sterling Cooper, an advertising agency in 1960s New York. Critically acclaimed, the series won sixteen Emmy Awards—including Outstanding Drama Series for each of its first four seasons—and four Golden Globes. Alongside cable series like the Sopranos (1999-2007), The Wire (2002-2008) and Deadwood (2004-2006), it has been repeatedly cited as an exemplar of the current Golden Age of television (Damico & Quay, 2016). Critics have suggested that the existential musings, complex characters and intricate narrative arcs of these series have lent cable television dramas a cultural authority previously reserved for more traditional artistic forms like the novel (Schilman, 2010). While Mad Men reflects contemporary sociological concerns surrounding gender, identity politics and the merits of consumer capitalism, at its heart the series engages with the big existential questions that remain central to the sociological tradition.

Meaning and Modernity
The problem of meaning in the modern secular West remains one of sociology’s fundamental concerns. The theme principally emerged from Max Weber’s Nietzschean view of the modern condition. In his ‘death of God’ parable (1882), Nietzsche argued that with the loss of a transcendent
ordering principle, life would come to be experienced as meaningless and absurd (Nietzsche, 1974: 181). Following Nietzsche, Weber declared that ‘the modern world is disenchant’d’ (1946: 139). For Weber, secularisation has dissolved the taken-for-granted verities that had traditionally ordered life. Consequently, modern individuals are forced to choose their own beliefs and values between differentiated and irreconcilable perspectives.

More recently, Weber’s concerns have been echoed in John Carroll’s (1998) examination of the modern West’s search for meaning, Zygmunt Bauman’s (2000) depiction of the existential uncertainty in ‘liquid’ modernity and Anthony Giddens’ assertion that ‘amid a puzzling diversity of options and possibilities’ modern individuals have lost the ‘ontological security’ of premodern times (2013: 3). Despite its unparalleled material achievements, the modern West is held to be suffering from a crisis of meaning and is no longer able to provide authoritative answers to the only really important question: ‘What shall we do and how shall we live?’ (Weber, 1946: 143).

In exploring Weber’s question, Mad Men is deliberately genealogical, examining the past in order to trace the conditions that have led to the present. As Mathew Weiner, the show’s creator and auteur, has repeatedly insisted, Mad Men is more than an exercise in nostalgia: ‘You tell me this is a period piece’ he has remarked, ‘the men in the show are asking, “Is this it?” The woman are asking “what’s wrong with me?”’ (Weiner as cited in Armstrong, 2012: 61). Larger than its historical locale, Mad Men is about the enduring problems people face in their daily lives, problems of career, money, marriage and family that ultimately lead into the timeless questions of ‘what should I do?’ and ‘how can I make sense of my life?’ This then, is the story of a people losing faith in their governing narratives and struggling to bring a sense of meaning to their lives.

As the main protagonist of Mad Men, Don Draper embodies the hopes, fantasies and ultimately nightmares of Middle America. Ostensibly, he is a masculine ideal. Don is classically handsome, intelligent, sophisticated and exudes confidence and charm. On the surface, he appears to have it all: the highflying career, picture perfect family and idyllic suburban home. Yet behind the charisma, he is inching towards despair. An exemplary self-made man, he finds little satisfaction in the conventional trappings of the American Dream. Throughout the series, he remains restless, haunted and detached, searching for something elusive that he is unable to articulate. His story begins at the heights of success. Don grapples with a gnawing sense of despair that comes from tasting the best his world has to offer yet finding it is not enough. After making repeated gestures towards career, marriage and family—the normative images of the good life—his story ultimately comes to suggest that a hollow core lies behind the Rockwellian facade of Middle America.

Don’s story deliberately evokes F. Scott Fitzgerald’s The Great Gatsby (1925/1990). Through Gatsby, Fitzgerald gave expression to the sense of manifold possibilities contained within the American constitutional right to the pursuit of happiness. Gatsby became a figurehead for American belief in the idea of total fulfilment. His tragedy lies in the fragility and ultimate collapse of this dream when exposed to the procrustean realities of the world. However, while echoing Gatsby, Don’s dreaming is a far more modest enterprise. Lacking strong attachments, he drifts through life garnering facets of his self-image from advertisements and popular culture. Ultimately, his life is exposed as a collection of bright facets that lack a unifying core. When Don’s wife becomes suspicious of his past, she rifles through his possessions: ‘I went through every pocket and every drawer’ she declares ‘and there’s nothing… All I found were stacks of cocktail napkins with stupid advertising slogans on them’.

Disenchantment

Central to the series’ sense of disenchantment is its portrait of suburban ennui. Betty Draper embodies what Betty Friedan in The Feminine Mystique (1962) labelled ‘the problem that has no name’ (1962:1). Friedan charted how a generation of women, raised on the images of domestic
bliss, suffered from anxiety and painful disillusionment when their lives proved less fulfilling than expected. They were haunted by a voice within that said ‘I want something more than my husband, my children and my home’ (1962: 11). Like Friedan’s homemakers, Betty finds that behind the glossy images of domesticity, a life devoted to family and home is bland and unfulfilling. She tries everything she can think of to shake off her undefinable sense of malaise, but nothing fills the void inside.

For other women in the show the 1960s offer more opportunities. Rejecting the deterministic patterns of suburbia, they embrace the excitement and opportunities of life in New York. ‘The city is everything’ office manager Joan tells Peggy. Yet despite their ostensible freedom, Betty Friedan’s ‘Feminine Mystique’ hangs like a pall over their lives. Through the contrasting careers of Joan and Peggy, the series follows how female hopes and ambitions are both shaped and constrained by the masculine culture of the workplace. They exist on the cusp of second wave feminism, in a period where the governing female narratives are falling out of fashion but nothing has emerged to take their place.

Male identity is similarly shown to be in transition. Echoing the concerns of sociologists of the era, like David Riesman, C. Wright Mills and William Whyte, the series suggests that organisational life fostered a sense of dependency and insecurity that ultimately led to a crisis of masculinity. The young account executive, Pete Campbell echoes these concerns. He struggles to live up to inherited masculine ideals: the self-made man, the hard-drinking womaniser, even the more modest but still authoritative male bread-winner all remain beyond his grasp. He is drawn to strong masculine presences, whether frontier fantasies, cowboy automotive executives, or the heroes in films like John Ford’s *The Man Who Shot Liberty Valance* (1962). Throughout, he is constantly judging himself against masculine standards and embittered by falling short. In *Mad Men*, the rise of the organisational bureaucracies, an inability to comfortably identify with masculine role models and feminism’s disruption to established gender spheres, all lead to the anxieties that Riesman and Whyte had charted as the male analogue to the feminine mystique.

**Modesty and Renewal**

*Mad Men’s* worldview is captured in a pivotal sequence in the final series. While developing an advertising campaign for a fast food restaurant, Don and Peggy brainstorm a series of Rockwellian scenarios all of which feel cloying. Exasperated, Peggy asks ‘Does this family exist anymore?’ Eventually they are forced to acknowledge that the traditional family ideal is no longer serviceable, having become too distant to speak to their lives. The scene cuts to Don, Peggy and Pete sharing a meal together in the restaurant. The traditional notion of family is something that each of them has failed to achieve. Now, having lowered their gaze from the ideal, they have found sustaining qualities in one another. Their ‘new family’ is a bittersweet connection, built on honesty, need and pain. The camera pans out to show their table framed by the architectural lines of the restaurant’s interior: a bright red rectangle supported by a column on either side. It is the essential foundations of a home. As the camera pans out further, other tables come into view seating various forms of the ‘new family’, each managing to find time amidst the clamour of modern life to share little moments together as something more than the sum of their individual lives.

On the surface, the conclusion of *Mad Men* runs against the grain of the series. A final montage leaves several of the characters with uplifting endings. However, as a series of ‘new beginnings’ rather than resolutions, these stories are left deliberately and ambiguously open-ended. Throughout its seven series, the narrative arcs in *Mad Men* have always been more circular than linear, casting doubt on the characters’ ability to make lasting and meaningful changes in their lives. Whilst there have been signs of modest growth, as the characters come to better
understand their personal strengths and weaknesses, the overreaching atmosphere of the series is too existentially bleak to suggest stable touch downs in the happily ever after.

The conclusion of Don's story further emphasises this sense of cyclical repetition. In the final episodes, Don flees his New York life for a Kerouacian road trip across America. He ends up at the Esalen Institute in California, a place that Tom Wolfe would deride as epitomising how the counter-culture's yearning for transcendence devolved into narcissistic self-absorption and the demand for immediate gratification. 'Esalen's speciality', Wolfe writes, 'was lube jobs for the personality' (1976: 145). In Mad Men, Esalen embodies the Gatsbyesque hope of self-transformation that has recurred throughout the series. While deeply cynical of workshops with names like 'Psychotechnics' and 'Divorce: a creative experience', Don begrudgingly attends several sessions. In one, a single mother is criticised for abandoning her young child. In a key scene following the session, Don tries to console her: 'I know how people work. You can put all of this behind you. It will get easier as you move forward'. It is an almost verbatim restatement of advice he gave Peggy in season two. The mother, seemingly functioning as a mouthpiece for the accumulated wisdom of the series, responds 'I don't think you are right about that'.

How shall we live?

Shortly after completing The Great Gatsby, F. Scott Fitzgerald declared that 'America is the story of the moon that never rose' (as cited in Tanner, 1990: xlix). For Fitzgerald, the romantic promise of America, exemplified in Gatsby, was the sense that life was pregnant with the possibility of ultimate fulfilment. The tragedy is that reality continually falls short of expectations. While Don is the Gatsbyesque exemplar of the series, all of the characters in Mad Men have laboured under the yoke of exalted and unrealisable dreams. Having fallen short of their hearts' desires, they are prone to succumb to cynicism and despair. Yet the final series suggests this sense of disenchantment is perhaps a necessary intermediary phase that prepares them to find a modicum of comfort in their everyday lives. In emphasising qualities of honesty, empathy, humility and generosity, Mad Men ultimately suggests that happiness doesn't lie in unrealisable ideals: the dream job, the perfect home or a Hollywood romance. Instead it emerges periodically, in little moments: satisfaction in a job well done, watching a protégé succeed, moments between parent and child and the camaraderie between friends. In the process, Mad Men comes to rest on the same values that are found in Rockwell, yet its moments of grace are too tinged in sorrow and regret to possess the ready-made warmth and security of Rockwell's portraits of American life.

The difficulty in achieving these moments further darkens the picture. In charting the movement of its characters towards honesty and intimacy, Mad Men utilises the aesthetic conventions of melodrama. The exemplary American melodramas, like the works of Douglas Sirk focus upon individuals trapped within their social and psychological circumstances. The typical heroine is a suburban housewife straightjacketed by traditional gender roles. Melodrama here functions as the emotional grammar of the bourgeois psyche that has come to be experienced as a prison. In Mad Men, this sense of social fatalism is extended to include the male characters as well. When the melodramatic mode occurs in the show, it is a geyser of emotional protest that erupts against social and psychological constraint. The movement towards true expression is always a struggle against self-deception, inner resistance and social convention as the characters try to bring their true needs up from the depths of their being. The emotional and psychological strain of these 'moments' make them inevitably short lived with the characters typically withdrawing into their accustomed roles.

Adding further complication, the metaphysical atmosphere of Mad Men is much darker than the standard melodrama, where genuine communication leads towards catharsis. Mad Men is haunted by the annihilatory prospect of death and the consequent sense that life is meaningless. The spectre of death is sometimes apprehended directly, in awkward conversations at funerals.
or in a morbid fascination with suicide. More often its presence is apprehended obliquely. It is carried in moments of silence, in a haunted look or a pained smile. These gestures are mute because they occur in a world that lacks a vocabulary through which to convey their meaning. These moments suggest an enduring and inarticulable absence that can never be fully redressed. Outside of melodramatic moments, these concerns are usually only articulated on the psychiatrist’s couch. The failure of the ‘talking cure’—itself a form of melodrama—is a further illustration of the limitations on what can also be achieved through the triumph over repression. In therapy, big questions like ‘what is it all about?’ are continually met with silence. Frustrated by a lack of answers, Roger Sterling’s complaints could have been uttered by any of the characters on the show:

Life is supposed to be a path, and you go along and these things happen to you, and they’re supposed to change you, change your direction. But turns out that’s not true. It turns out the experiences are nothing, they’re just some pennies you pick up off the floor, stick in your pocket, and you’re just going in a straight line to you know where.

If this was all that Mad Men had to say it would be unremittingly bleak. Starting with Don’s nihilistic musing that ‘You’re born alone and you die alone’ in the pilot episode, there are repeated allusions to Nietzsche and mid-twentieth century existentialists like Albert Camus and Jean-Paul Sartre. Rationally the world is held to be a meaningless parade of disjointed experiences that terminate in the ultimate absurdity of death. Despite the intelligence of the leading characters, they are unable to provide any intellectual counterpoint. Yet the series probes the experiential refractions of these ideas. The literature that occupies this terrain is typically filled with intellectual ‘mad men’ like Fyodor Dostoevsky’s Kirillov and Ivan Karamazov. Accepting that God is dead, they follow the logic of nihilism to its terrifying conclusion. In contrast, the ‘mad men’ of Madison Avenue suggest that while the philosopher and haunted novelist may live out these thoughts to a fevered pitch, for most people they cohabit with other aspects of their lives. While they face moments of acute existential despair, they take place in a world that is filled with a host of responsibilities, distractions and even little moments of redemption.

Ultimately, the world of Mad Men occupies a space between a series of irreducible antinomies: innocence and cynicism, sentiment and intellect, hope and despair. These antinomies frame life but neither side can lay claim to its essence. Instead, the world is repeatedly shown to overflow the categories that seek to contain it. Inhabiting this world, the characters’ lives oscillate between its extremes. Consequently, there is a ‘fluidity’ to their experiences that allows them to recoil from life’s meaningless brutality in one moment only to be captivated by wonder in the next. More often, everyday life rests somewhere in between. Taken as a whole, Mad Men seems to suggest that contentment is born from being able to maintain these tensions throughout the course of life. Its final message suggests a different experience of disenchantment than forecast by Nietzsche and Weber. Mad Men is illustrative of a shift away from grand notions of redemption to finding contentment within the modest parameters of everyday life. Consequently, the process of disenchantment is met not only with frustrations over what has been lost, but also gratitude over what remains.
References


Gendered Responsibilisation in the Night-Time Economy

Leisha Du Preez,
School of Social Sciences and Psychology, Western Sydney University.

Phillip Wadds,
School of Social Sciences, University of New South Wales.

Abstract

Young women engaging in the night-time economy (NTE) are said to be targets of a process of neoliberal ‘responsibilisation’ that places the onus on young women to ensure ‘self-protection’ from any potential ‘risks’. This gendered regulation is underpinned by neoliberalism and has implications for fear of crime and precautionary strategies, as well as young women’s engagement with the NTE. This study, which is based on a research project undertaken in 2015 that involved 10 in-depth, semi-structured interviews with young female revellers from Sydney, examines the highly gendered nature of regulation and responsibilisation in the NTE, with a focus on the role it plays in shaping the lived experience of these spaces for young women. In particular, this paper explores the contradictory dualism of ‘fun’ and ‘regulation’ that often governs young women’s experience of nightlife settings as well as their perceptions and decisions relating to risk-taking while participating in the NTE. The behaviour of young women who participated in this project suggests a gendered embodiment of ‘responsible’ engagement. Indeed, it is argued that the highly gendered responsibilisation process outlined in this paper often curtails women’s ability to fully engage and enjoy the NTE in the same way that their male counterparts do. This project is particularly important as research shows that victim-blaming discourses specifically target women, making them accountable for their own victimisation when participating in public spaces and creating feelings of ‘guilt’ when they ‘risk’ or ‘fail’ to self-protect.

Keywords: Night-Time Economy, Neoliberalism, Responsibilisation, Gender

Introduction

In contemporary Australian society there appears to be an increasing focus on holding individuals responsible for their own safety. Young women engaging in the night-time economy (NTE) are said to be targets of a process of neoliberal ‘responsibilisation’ that places the onus on young women to ensure ‘self-protection’ from any potential ‘risks’ (Brown and Gregg 2012). This
responsibilisation is associated with gendered ideas that continue to regulate women within private and public spaces (Brown and Gregg 2012). For instance, advice given to women is not empirically based; warnings about strangers and public spaces contradict research findings that women are more likely to be victimised by known men, in known places (ABS 2016). When women are victims of crime, they are often doubly victimised by police and the media that question the claim to ‘victimhood’ based on young women’s ‘failed’ management of space and self. This process often includes interrogating the behaviour, alcohol consumption and clothing of female victims (Sheard 2011; Starkweather 2007). The effect is a victim-blaming discourse that diminishes a woman’s right to safety and repositions her as ‘irresponsible’ for engaging in practices that ‘invite’ risk. This study examines the gendered regulation and responsibilisation of young women within the NTE. This gendered regulation is underpinned by neoliberalism that has implications for fear of crime and precautionary strategies, as well as young women’s engagement with the NTE. In particular, this paper will observe the contradictory dualism that often governs young women’s experience of nightlife settings.

A Note on Methods
This paper is based on a research project undertaken in 2015 comprising of 10 semi-structured, in-depth, interviews with female nightlife revellers from Sydney, aged 18-25, which aimed to explore their perceptions and decisions relating to risk-taking while participating in the night-time economy. The study aimed to address the lack of empirical research exploring young women’s responses to precautionary tales. The research design drew on the ‘meaning-making’ possibilities available through qualitative research and applied a thematic analysis to the interview data. By mobilising young women’s voices through this method, the research had the opportunity to explore how responsibilisation narratives were either accepted or rejected by participants. This is especially important as women’s voices are largely missing from this area of literature, something this project aims to address.

Establishing the context: Neoliberalism and the night-time economy
A neoliberal discourse is central to understanding young women’s perceptions of risk and their engagement with the NTE. This discourse developed a hegemonic position in Western politics in the 1970s under the leadership of Reagan and Thatcher in the US and UK respectively. Neoliberal policy transformed the state by moving away from welfare models that had existed since the end of World War Two. The eroded welfare state gave way to a neoliberal model based on efficacy and autonomy. Neoliberalism attributed unemployment, crime and other social problems as issues of the individual, while simultaneously encouraging an increased focus on prevention (Sutton 2000).

Contemporary prevention strategies are informed by neoliberal ideas that “make risk seem unmanageable” and thus promote ‘responsibilisation’ (Pratt 2000, p. 47). The criminal justice system has responded to this shift with extensive punitiveness for offenders (Sutton 2000), while victims are “increasingly invested with personal responsibility for their … actions” (O’Malley 2000, p. 27). The process of engendering responsibility is facilitated by key messages pertaining to crime and safety delivered by key social institutions including the police and media (Wadds 2015). However, media, police and government messages are highly gendered, with women, in particular, being advised to limit their movements in public spaces, dress conservatively and restrict the consumption of alcohol to ensure ‘safety’ for themselves (Starkweather 2007; Sheard 2011).

Feminist researchers, including Rottenberg (2014), argue that neoliberalism has transformed structural issues into individual problems, undermining the feminist fight for equality. The neoliberal woman denies “social, cultural and economic forces producing this inequality but
also … accepts full responsibility for her own well-being and self-care” (Rottenberg 2014, p. 420). Here, young women’s bodies are a site of ‘risk’ requiring management. Guided by key tenets of self-regulation and enterprise, neoliberal governance supports this culture through the gendered binary of public and private spaces (Brown and Gregg 2012). While young women engage in the NTE in increasing numbers, public spaces continue to be patriarchal environments (Tomsen 2014) that young women are required to ‘manage’. Trnka and Trundle (2014, p. 139) argue that this management is “staged not only for the self but also with respect to a broader audience as accountability provides evidence to others that one has prudently enacted one’s responsibilities”. This accountability is particularly important when young women engage in typical NTE practices, such as alcohol and drug consumption, which are seen as practices that ‘invite’ risk. The ‘responsibilisation’ discourse utilises media, political and social campaigns that deploy the concepts of regret and shame to promote responsible behaviour (Brown and Gregg 2012). These campaigns, like the discourse itself, situate the pursuit of safety “as normal, pragmatic and everyday” (Loader and Sparks 2011, p. 77). Here, the focus shifts to the potential female victim and her ability to ‘manage’ precautionary measures, such as monitoring alcohol consumption and dressing ‘appropriately’, to avoid victimisation. That is, choices about alcohol consumption and dress render women “responsible for actions performed by men” (Brown and Gregg 2012, p. 359).

Accordingly, Sheard (2011, p. 620) contends that urban nightlife spaces “maintain a contradictory dualism” that invite young women to engage with the NTE as consumers while at the same time demanding self-regulation and responsible engagement through careful navigation of the space. This dualism is reinforced by Sheard’s respondents who argued their ability to successfully engage in the NTE depended specifically on using public space ‘differently’, through ‘responsible’ decisions and behaviours. While it appears that responsible engagement may ‘successfully’ allow young women to participate within the NTE, the hedonistic nature of these precincts and the agency of young women to actively participate in the same way as their male counterparts is diluted by an ever-growing set of risks that may ‘invite’ blame. With the exception of Sheard (2011) and Starkweather (2007), empirical research for young women as active agents in these economies remains underdeveloped. In response to the call for further research on the ‘exclusion’ of youth and women, this paper aims to examine the “contradictory dualism” (Sheard 2011, p. 620) of engagement and exclusion faced by young women. Women’s engagement within the highly masculine ‘alco-leisure’ cultures of the NTE is characterised by their perceived and actual ”vulnerability to attack and harassment” (Sheard 2011, p. 621). This heightened sense of fear in women contributes to precautionary and avoidance strategies in an attempt to ‘reduce’ risk as careless ‘transgressions’ invite criticism and a broader victim-blaming narrative. The gendered aspects of precautionary strategies and responsibilisation narratives are explored below through analysis of interviews conducted as a part of this research.

Gendered Dualisms: Fun and Regulation
While the NTE was perceived as riskier by most young women in this study, many of them also constructed these spaces as ‘fun’. Here, many female respondents positioned risk as a central part of the fun of nightlife. For instance, Lucy, 22, mentioned that “people come [to the city] with the intent to have the best time and just get drunk with their friends”. When probed further, Lucy and other young women mentioned high levels of intoxication as an example of a ‘risky’, yet fun practice. In making decisions about how these dual perceptions of risk and fun were to be navigated, young women reported that while danger is a possibility, pleasure and fun remained the primary purpose of a ‘night-out’ in the city. This connection between risk, night and ‘fun’ was seen by most of the young women in this study as an accepted part of nightlife. However, there was a gendered regulation of space that often curtailed and impeded on young women’s
‘fun’. One young woman in this research, Victoria, 20, argued that preplanning, awareness and precautionary measures were prioritised above ‘fun’ and ‘pleasure’, comparative to descriptions of ‘hedonistic’ fun and release, stating: “preplanning… is like a restriction measure … it doesn't just place you … being out there not having fun. So that fun kind of is spread out”. While Victoria assured me that this was not ‘being out there not having fun’ or in other words, missing out, her engagement with the NTE was still restricted by preplanning and precaution: “I have to … still be cautious as to what's occurring around me”. Young women were aware that their drinking or ‘fun’ behaviours could be inviting risk. For example, Sophie, 20, explained that risk was ‘putting yourself in situations that … could lead to bad events…like when you go out, that is a risk itself ‘cause like anyone could spike your drink’. Being ‘on guard’ while on a night out seeking fun, ‘drunkenness’ and a release from normative daytime routines was simply an accepted practice among young women. The success of responsibilisation narratives meant that young women often accepted the limitations and exclusion as necessary.

Despite evidence suggesting that women are far less likely to be victimised in nightlife settings (ABS 2016), young women often deployed risk avoidance strategies due to perceived danger: “[as] a woman, you've got … more risk happening” (Mia, 23). These perceptions were reinforced by Claire, 21, in the following excerpt:

**Claire:** We would never come home at night [because the] trains don't come 'til too late … [but] I wouldn't get on the train at that time anyway as a female

**LD:** Yeah, how come?

**Claire:** I don't know, I guess because… as a young woman it is dangerous … ‘Cause I only usually went out with like one other girlfriend or two other girlfriends and we don't catch a train, just the both of us at that time of night.

The gendered nexus of night-time, ‘public’ space and danger was common to all participants. Precautionary tales and advice provided to Aisha, 19, and other young women was simple: “Try to go with someone, don't be alone, don't try to go through like secluded places, always in well populated streets and areas with people”. These messages played a central role in shaping young women's decisions about when, where, how and who to travel with, if avoidance was not an option. The dominance of this risk discourse presents young women's engagement in the NTE as volatile and contradictory, a binary where ‘fun’ is often curtailed by regulation and responsibility.

The responsibilisation discourse had a significant impact on young women's ability to actively and freely participate in the NTE. Young women reported avoiding public transport, certain night-time precincts and walking at night by themselves or with other young women. They engaged in licensed premises with an increased awareness of risk, listening, watching and limiting alcohol to ensure their own safety when in a larger group. However, some participants rejected certain aspects of the risk discourse, including not allowing fear to control their behaviours. For example, Tayla, 25, reflected on her practices: “I feel like I should be more cautious, like I feel like I've got no fear, I'm like 'it'll be right, it'll be fine … [it] should be right’” arguing that most of these ideas came from life experience where “I've done it before, nothing bad happened”. Tayla explained that if her agency was restricted to only ‘safe’ practices then a typical ‘hedonistic’ release or a ‘night out’ would not be possible: “If I'm going to stay inside my whole life because someone could go out and attack me … I could get hit by a bus”. Despite some resistance to responsibilisation, most of the young women interviewed, including Tayla, had to manage or limit ‘risky’ behaviour.

While risky or dangerous nightlife practices are acceptable or even celebrated practices for young men, women were not afforded the same freedom, at least not without significant risk of ostracism. Young women were aware that by engaging in dangerous practices, like drinking to
excess, losing control or engaging in risky spaces, they were ‘inviting’ victim-blaming, as Tayla explains: “I guess if it was me then I would then probably victim-blame myself I’d be like ‘oh well, I probably shouldn’t have been walking out that late, so many people told me that that would happen to me’”. Similarly, Victoria felt the need to engage with responsible practices (such as taking a train into the city with more people) to avoid blame: “If there’s less people on the train, then you’re putting your own self at risk. So if something happens it was kind of oh, it’s kind of your fault that you, you know, didn’t travel with someone else or … you should have … caught a taxi home”. However, the impact of responsibilisation narratives extended beyond travel. Danielle, 22, illustrated this by reiterating the regulatory practices that impacted on the fun and typical drunkenness common in the NTE. She highlighted the dangerousness of ‘letting go’, stating: “It would be the fact that when you get yourself into the state after drinking … It’s like not being aware of your surroundings”. Here, maintaining control at all times is central to being a responsible woman. Deviating from these expected or accepted forms of behavior was to expose oneself to both self and social blame.

From the above evidence, it would seem that women are excluded or limited from engaging in the same practices as men in night-time spaces. While there is a normalised culture of intoxication in nightlife settings, this remains conditional for young women. The influence of regulatory narratives and in particular, young women’s likelihood to engage with these narratives without question, shows just how successful the responsibilisation process has been.

As evidence of the contradiction between male and female experiences of nightlife, young women often contrasted these regulated experiences of the NTE to their male counterparts. For example, Aisha explained that warnings to young women were not equally applied to males who, she notes, are far from ‘safe’ in nightlife settings: “if you are a guy, it’s not like safe or anything for them either, but … the context for them is vastly different in comparison to females”. Here, Aisha was referring to the social and personal pressures to remain in control and conform to certain expectations relating to behavior. Similarly, Tayla found her friends and family shared concerns about her walking alone at night. She argued that her male friends were overly protective and limited her movement in nights out: “The boys I know they’re like ‘oh I hate that you walk at night-time’ … they think I’m at risk, ‘cause I’m a female, ‘cause I’m short, I’m young … I’m like ‘it could happen to anyone’”. Further, Tayla found her mother perceived safety as a gendered construct, “my brother would go out, nine, ten-thirty at night and walk around and then I would start to do it and she’s like ‘oh no, you can’t go’ and I’m like ‘why?’ and she’s like ‘cause he’s a boy’”. Here, the perceived vulnerability of women re-shapes typically ‘safe’ endeavours as unsafe practices that ‘invite’ risk. While night-time may be a key factor in the warnings from family and friends, there was an overarching message that young women would be safer in groups with young men. Sophie, Claire and Nikki were all advised to travel with men and all reported feeling ‘safer’ in night-time settings with them. This reinforces how young women’s agency is specifically removed or conditional of their ‘responsible’ behaviour.

In this study, the decisions young women made as a result of their perceptions of risk were indicative of the self-governing young woman who was ever prepared to mitigate risk and limit her release in night-time precincts. One of the participants, Nikki, referred to this state of being as “preconceived alertness all the time”. This state of pervasive “alertness” engendered practices for self-protection through pre-planning, awareness and avoidance. When the young women reported transgressing these precautionary strategies they talked about ‘irresponsible’ practices. These practices were clouded by shame and regret, encouraging young women to engage in more ‘responsible’ endeavours in the future.
Conclusion

The highly gendered responsibilisation process outlined in this paper often curtails women’s ability to fully engage and enjoy the NTE in the same way that their male counterparts do. The research discussed in this paper provides a base for theoretical critiques of ‘neoliberal responsibilisation’ as a rationality for governing young women’s bodies in the NTE. The behaviour of young women who participated in this project suggests a gendered embodiment of ‘responsible’ engagement. This is particularly important as research shows that victim-blaming discourses specifically target women, making them accountable for their own victimisation when participating in public spaces and creating feelings of ‘guilt’ when they ‘risk’ or ‘fail’ to self-protect.
References


Constructing nudges: Understanding the public policy phenomenon.

Colette Einfeld,
Centre for Applied Social Research, RMIT

Abstract
Government administrations overseas and here in Australia are increasingly adopting the use of ‘nudges’ in public policy development. Nudges make use of cognitive biases and heuristics to encourage citizens to select choices that make them and society better off. Academics and commentators question the use of nudges, arguing they are ineffective and unethical. Despite its increasing popularity and somewhat controversial use, how and why policy makers are nudging in Australia has yet to be explored. Much of the debate on nudging can be seen to fit the positivist paradigm, exploring the problems nudges may be effective in solving, or the situations in which nudges may or may not be ethical. A constructivist approach to nudge will aid understanding of not just why and how policy makers nudge, but would uncover the underlying assumptions of policy makers in designing these polices, as well as the implications of its use for governing practices.

Keywords: Public policy, nudge, governance, policy design, libertarian paternalism

Introduction
In 2008, Richard H. Thaler and Cass R. Sunstein published ‘Nudge: Improving decisions about health, wealth, and happiness’. The book advocated for the use of nudging in public policy, encouraging government to ‘nudge’ citizens towards choices that improve their welfare, whilst not restricting their ability to make alternate choices (Thaler and Sunstein 2008). Since the release of this seminal publication, the use of nudging has become popular with Government administrations around the world (Hansen and Jespersen 2013).

In this paper, I first discuss the nudge approach to public policy, outline its increasing use in administrations internationally and in Australia, highlighting the importance of exploring this approach to policy development. I consider why it has become so popular, but conclude there is little empirical understanding of this in Australia. I then discuss some of the controversy around nudges, to emphasise why this area is worthy of discussion. Finally I argue that while the debates that have existed thus far around nudging are important, what is also needed is an empirically informed constructivist approach to understand the underlying assumptions that policy makers have about nudging.
**Nudging in public policy**

According to nudge theory, policy makers can encourage citizens to make certain choices by changing the decision-making environment. Thaler and Sunstein (2008) use the phrase ‘choice architecture’ to explain the role of context, or environment, in choice, arguing that the way a choice is presented to citizens will influence the decisions made. This is done by using the heuristics and cognitive biases such as status quo bias, loss aversion and inertia (Thaler & Sunstein, 2008).

Thaler and Sunstein (2008) argue that nudging sits within the philosophical approach of libertarian paternalism. Nudging is libertarian, in that citizens are still free to make their own choices, but also paternalistic as it attempts to influence citizens’ choices to improve their lives (Thaler & Sunstein 2008).

In many respects this approach to policy is not new; Libertarian Paternalism is generally considered a form of soft paternalism, or asymmetric paternalism (Sugden 2009) and many of the principles of nudging draw on years of psychology and sociology theory. However some aspects of this approach are new, including the use of the principles of behavioural economics and psychology, including cognitive biases, in the design of public policy (Saghai 2013, Goodwin 2012, Vallgarda 2012, Hansen and Jespersen 2013).

There is debate in the literature on what exactly is a nudge (Yeung 2012, Heilmann 2014), but they are typically contrasted with traditional policy instruments such as regulation or economic incentives (Pelle Guldberg Hansen, 2015; Thaler & Sunstein, 2008). Althaus, Bridgman, and Davis (2012) define Australian policy instruments as ‘the methods used to achieve policy objectives’. In this respect, nudging can be considered as a policy instrument, and it is often referred to in the literature as a useful tool (Baldwin, 2014; Quigley, 2013). The federal Turnbull government, recently introduced nudges as a ‘new tool in the public service kit bag’ (Easton 2015).

**Governments increasing use of nudges**

Nudging was lauded as having the potential to transform governance and policy (Barrett 2011). Following the release of the book, the approach was eagerly adopted in Government administrations around the world. One of the authors of Nudge, Cass Sunstein was appointed to Obama’s administration (Kosters and Van der Heijden 2015), and Richard Thaler became an advisor to the Cameron Government, which established the Behavioural Insights Team (known as the ‘nudge unit’) in 2010 (Quigley, 2013). This unit is now an independent social purpose company, part owned by the UK Government, yet still does most of its work for Government (Rutter, 2015). Such has been the enthusiasm with which nudges are used, they are now seen to be the ‘default policy option’ in the UK (Jones, Pykett, and Whitehead 2014).

In Australia, government is also nudging. In New South Wales, a Behavioural Insights Team was established in the Department of Premier and Cabinet (DPC; Wade, 2013), and in Victoria, a similar Behavioural Insights Team is being established within DPC. In November 2015, the federal government announced a unit specifically for applying and testing behavioural insights to policy (Easton, 2015). Nudging appears to have been embraced by government in Australia, with one Turnbull Minister remarking it “is consistent with our broader deregulationist philosophy” (Arthur Sinodinos, Commonwealth 2015). Academics propose a number of reasons for the increasing use of nudges, which I discuss here in more detail.

Oliver (2013) argues that the popularity of the nudge approach is a response to the 2008 financial crisis, widely seen as failure of regulation. The resulting anti-regulation sentiment extended to exploring options for how to encourage people to limit their ‘self and society’ harming behaviours, resulting in an interest in nudge policies (Oliver 2013).
Nudging also seems to supports some governments’ objectives to be less intrusive in citizens’ lives (Marteau, Ogilvie, Roland, Suhrcke, & Kelly, 2011). For conservative governments, such as the Cameron Government in the UK and the Turnbull government in Australia, the idea of less interference with the everyday lives of citizens appeals, and the relative ease of implementing and administering nudges permits smaller Government – a goal for many conservative administrations (Barrett, 2011).

The increasing number of socio-economic challenges facing Government, including rising rates of obesity, personal debt and climate change, may also be driving the use of nudges (Jones, Pykett, & Whitehead, 2011). Other attempts to change these behaviours, such as information programs and education campaigns, are perceived to have failed, and thus Government has turned to alternate approaches to changing behaviours (Cheung & Ardolino, 2011; Ölander & Thogersen, 2014).

However, much of this discussion is located in the adoption of nudging by UK and USA administrations, with little understanding of the attraction of nudging in Australia. As Governments in countries seem to differ in their understanding and implementation of nudge (Jones, Pykett, and Whitehead 2014) there is a need to understand the situation particular to Australia.

**Debates on nudging**

Despite its popularity, there are discussions and debates in the literature about the use of nudging. Support for nudging in Government runs from advocating for its use (Thaler and Sunstein 2008) to arguing it is a useful tool (Codagnone et al. 2014) to suggestions that nudges are appropriate to use by Government ‘under certain conditions’ or when certain criteria are met (Baldwin 2014, Saghai 2013). However, others argue that nudges are inappropriate for Governments to use, with two persistent criticisms of nudge, whether they are effective and whether they are ethical for Government to use. I also include here debates on the role of policy makers, as this has received less attention, but is arguably as important.

**The effectiveness of nudges**

The effectiveness of nudge as a public policy tool to enact change has been questioned. Thaler and Sunstein argue that nudging is a more effective mode of governing, yet the evidence for this is not clear (Kosters and Van der Heijden 2015). Nudges may make short term changes only and as Marteau et al. (2011) note, to date no nudges have shown sustained impacts on changing behaviour. Goodwin (2012) argues that nudge cannot provide the type of transformative change, made through choices, needed to address some of the ‘big’ problems facing society such as obesity or climate change. Nudges also tend to downstream problems (e.g. an outcome of inequality), rather than upstream initiatives (e.g. the cause of the inequality), and therefore may be limited in their ability to make transformative changes (Cheung and Ardolino 2011, Quigley 2013).

A general critique of nudge theory is that it does not consider structural drivers of problems or socio cultural differences (Brown 2012, Barrett 2011). Thus the degree to which a nudge is effective may well depend on the cultural and economic community (Baldwin 2014).

The current focus of nudge policy making may also be problematic in that it diverts policy makers attention (and budget) away from interventions that may potentially be more effective (Barrett 2011). Traditional economists argue that many of the ‘big’ problems facing society are best addressed with traditional approaches to policies, such as regulation and incentives (Angner 2015).
The ethics of nudging

The ethics of whether government should nudge, and the impact nudges have on freedom of choice and decision-making, has been a focus of much debate. Nudges do not allow citizens to improve their decision-making abilities, and therefore understand whether they are making bad decisions (White 2013). This type of choice is also not seen as empowering for citizens (Goodwin, 2012). Nudges may be manipulative as they make use of cognitive biases and their use is not always explicit to policy targets. By using these biases covertly, rather than using rational persuasion, it lessens the autonomy one has over their decisions, and their ability to consider and judge each decision and its consequence (Hausman and Welch 2010).

The covert nature of nudging is a significant critique of the approach. In response to criticisms about lack of transparency in the use of nudging, Thaler and Sunstein (2008) argue that nudges should be subject to Rawls publicity principle, which they define as government being willing and able to defend nudging to citizens if required (Thaler and Sunstein 2008) (p.247). However, Rawls publicity principle is often interpreted as going further than this, with Government publicising and actively making its citizens aware of these policies or even that public consensus on the policy is required (Barrett 2011, Hansen and Jespersen 2013).

However, it is unlikely that Government would announce when a citizen is to be nudged, as it is the very hidden nature of nudges that makes them effective (Bovens 2008). Bovens (2008) suggests that people tend to correct their own agency, when presented with ‘full knowledge’, and that by making nudges explicit they may be less effective.

The role of the policy maker

A central tenent of the nudge approach is that citizens are encouraged to make decisions that make them better off, as judged by themselves (Thaler and Sunstein 2008). White (2013) argues this is flawed from an epistemological standpoint. Policy makers are unable to act in every citizen’s interest, as they cannot be aware of and consider each individual’s own situation, values and preferences. They also cannot take into account the wide variety of situations and reasons why an individual may not want to make a particular choice. In this way policy makers cannot know whether they are nudging citizens to choices they believe would make them better off (White 2013). This type of policy development can also be an attempt to make a group (in this case policy makers) feel smarter or entitled to make decisions for others (Smith and Moore 2010). Despite the centrality policy makers in designing and implementing nudge policies, their role has received little attention.

A different approach to nudge

Debates on nudges effectiveness sit within the evidence based policy approach, which has an emphasis on ‘what works’. This evidence based approach to policy is located within this positivist paradigm (Bacchi 2009).

Similarly, the focus on policy makers does not acknowledge the role of policymakers in constructing nudge as a tool (or otherwise) in public policy. The same argument is made for the ethics of nudge. Whilst the literature acknowledges, for example, challenges to agency, little attention has been paid to how policy makers reflect and create citizen’s choices when designing such policies.

The approach to nudging through this positivist paradigm is perhaps not surprising, given that much of the literature on nudge has come from the disciplines of law and economics (Baldwin, 2014; Barrett, 2011; Lobel & Amir, 2009; Yeung, 2012). Indeed, the authors of Nudge, Cass Sunstein and Richard Thaler, come from these two disciplines respectively (Wilkinson 2013).
What is needed is a constructivist approach to the use of nudging in public policy in Australia. A constructivist understanding of the nudge policy approach would offer a new way of challenging the premises underpinning nudging in policy analysis. Here I draw on Bacchi's account of policy as ‘producing’ problems. Bacchi (2009) argues policy is a product of the cultural and historical context in which they are developed, and that policy makers actively shape policy problems, contrasting to positivist assumptions that policy is developed to suit problems that ‘exist out there’ (Bacchi 2009).

Government is ‘solving a problem’ through its use of nudging, and research is needed to understand the implicit assumption of policy makers in designing such policies. Empirical research exploring policy makers experience on developing nudge will add to literature on the adoption and experience of nudging will add to literature on the mentalities of policy makers in using this approach. Nudging can be seen to be an alternate mode of governance, contrasting with other modes of governance such as hierarchy, market, networks or persuasion (Mols et al. 2015). Research is needed to understand how this mode of governance is used in Australia, and where are the implications for governing practices.

The approach to libertarian paternalism and nudging differs between countries (Jones, Pykett, and Whitehead 2014), and hence there is a need for an empirical research to nudging in the Australian context. Indeed there is a recognised need to understand the application and implementation of nudge specifically in the Australian social policy context (Biddle 2014).

Conclusion
Despite Governments enthusiastic embrace of nudging, debates on the effectiveness and ethics of using this approach remain. These debates are typically framed in the positivist paradigm, and a constructivist understanding of nudge, that it empirically informed, is largely absent. Research is needed to uncover the underlying assumptions used by policy makers in designing and implementing nudge policies, which though eagerly used, are little understood. This research would also help uncover the implications of its use for governing practices in Australia.
References


Bacchi, C.L. 2009. *Introducing a ‘what's the problem represented to be?’ approach to policy analysis, Analysing Policy: What's the problem represented to be*. N.S.W.: Pearson Education.


Undergraduate’s religious affiliation and interpersonal relationships in University of Nigeria Nsukka (Unn) and Nnamdi Azikiwe University (Nau) Awka.

Enyi Blessing Uchenna

Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka

This study analysed the influence of religious affiliation on the interpersonal relationship of undergraduates in University of Nigeria Nsukka and Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka. The culture conflict theory of Sellin was adopted as the theoretical framework of this study. In order to achieve the objectives of the study, three hypotheses derived from the research questions were formulated and tested. The study participants were undergraduates, who were sampled from the entire population of the two study universities. The study revealed that the interpersonal relationship amongst undergraduates is highly affected by their religious affiliation. The religious affiliation of these undergraduates to a large extent determine with whom and how they relate while in the university. Based on the findings, it was recommended among others that in order to curb or reduce the conflicts amongst undergraduate in relation to religious affiliation and interpersonal relationship, the school authority should improve the facilities and resources available in the university community, develop established rules and regulations by which religious groups should abide, and also train them on conflict management strategies.

Introduction

Nigerian society is a multicultural and diversified entity, where each ethnicity has a defined religious belief and rituals akin to its people. Federal universities in Nigeria were established with the prevailing rational of bridging the gap between the ethnicities, thereby pulling together students of different religious affiliation into one educational system where they would have interpersonal relationships by staying in the same hostel, and using other university facilities, thereby intermingling with each other.

Ethnicity plays a vital role in the identity and value orientation of these students whose religious associative variation is of primal interest to this study, bearing in mind that religious affiliation is a primary identity variable that classifies the members of the university community into variant stereotypes. This paper presents the findings of a study investigating the factors which lead to
conflict on university campuses in Nigeria. It also proposes a set of recommendations for conflict prevention and resolution that could prove instructive to university staff, students and policymakers.

**Religious affiliations and tensions on university campuses**

The word religion comes from the Latin root “religio” which signifies a bond between humanity and some greater-than-human power. While there is no agreed definition of religion, it can be seen as a system of attitudes, practices, rites, ceremonies and beliefs by means of which individuals or a community put themselves in relation to God or to a supernatural world, and often to each other (Wulff 1997). From this system derives a set of values by which to judge events in the natural world.

Durkheim (1961) defined religion as a unified system of beliefs and practices that unite followers into one single moral community called a church. Religion is thus an institutionalized system of attitudes, beliefs and practices with a related set of tenets. Religious affiliation thereby refers to the acceptance, connection or association of a person to any organization which practices these institutionalized systems of attitude, beliefs and practices with a related set of tenets. Such persons can be labelled as members, or an endorser of the related set of tenets, thus making him/her an affiliate to that religious faith.

The values and dictates of a religious faith can have an affect on the interpersonal relationships that exist among people, and in this case Nigerian undergraduates, as religious association can pre-empt with whom, how and when these undergraduates interact.

Intolerance by certain religious groups towards others in the university can be problematic. The allegiants of a faith considered illegitimate or subordinate to another might be ridiculed or coerced by the members of a dominant group, and violent religious splinters may result. Intermingling of different religious adherents with each other would according to some groups lead to a pollution, and alteration to their belief systems, which over years have become a pattern, of sentimental value and a culture, characterizing the social life of its faithful, (Berreman 1972).

Rubin (2007) hypothesized that peer rejection is a result of the combination of a difficult temperament and the development of hostile and avoidant attachment relationships. These hostile and aggressive behaviours toward peers tend to increase with age as these students are indoctrinated into religious beliefs and practices which might inhibit interpersonal relationships.

According to Lund (1997), interests can differ over:

- Access to and distribution of resources (territory, money, accommodations): Resources are limited; thus a tendency exists where allegiants of varied religious factions in the university will engage in unhealthy rivalry and competition over these resources.

- Control of power and participation in political decision making: The university is a polity which presents a political platform. Student engagement in electioneering campaigns and governance predisposes the different religious groups to power tussle and politicking, which often results in conflicting interpersonal relationships.

- Identities; cultural, social and political to which people feel associated: Stereotyping of the undergraduates along lines of religious affiliation is often the case. These labels define who accepts and associates with who, thus breeding schism.

- Political elections: Religious groups strive to influence the outcome of such elections, as they prefer student of their religious faction as leaders to enhance their access to resources. Political tussle thereby ensues over who leads the SUG (Student Union Government).
Faced with the scarcity of resources and facilities, different religious groups try as much as possible to secure these facilities for fellow religious affiliates, there is a tussle over who gets what. These variant religious associations no doubt have differences in belief pattern. Praxis and tenets breed differences amongst undergraduates, possibly affecting the social, political and academic interpersonal relationships that exist among undergraduates and leading to tensions.

Methods
For Ezeah (2004), research design is simply a plan that specifies how data should be collected and analyzed. Cross sectional surveys aim at collecting data on variables in a study population at one point in time. The University of Nigeria Nsukka (UNN) and Nnamdi Azikiwe University Awka (NAU) are federal universities. The two universities, used for this study each have eight registered and recognized religious groups which operate in different dimensions within the school community. These religious groups include the Catholics, Anglicans, Jehovah Witnesses, Methodists, Muslims, Sabbatharians, Eckankar/Grail Messengers and Pentecostals. Each of these religious groups have affiliates. Probability Sampling was adopted so that each element of the population had an equal chance of being included in the sample. The stratified sampling method was used to classify the population along religious lines. Simple Random Sampling (SRS) was used to select among the stratified religious affiliations of the religious groups to be studied.

Considering the population differential of religious groups, proportionate and disproportionate sampling techniques were used to select the study participants. The questionnaire was distributed to about 0.5 percent of the Catholics, Anglicans, and Pentecostal population in NAU & UNN; Thus 0.5 percent of;

Catholics:
NAU :- 5729 students (29 study participants)
UNN :- 6176 students (31 study participants)

Anglicans :
NAU :- 4583 students (23 study participants)
UNN  :- 4941 students (25 study participants)

Pentecostals:
NAU :- 5842 students (29 study participants) UNN :-5435 students (27 study participants)
Questionnaire was distributed to one (1) percent population of the Jehovah Witness Affiliates in NAU &UNN.

Thus; Jehovah's Witness :
NAU :- 2291 students (23 study participants)
UNN:- 2470 students (25 study participants)
While three (3) percent of the Muslim population was studied in NAU & UNN

Thus; Muslims:
NAU :- 458 students (14 study participants)
UNN :- 494 students (15 study participants)
A total of ten (10) religious groups were studied; five (5) groups in each university; two hundred and forty- one (241) study participants was the sample size. The questionnaire and Focus Group Discussion (FGD) guide were the instruments for data collection for the study. The quantitative
data derived from the questionnaire was analyzed using the Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) software program.

**Theoretical Framework**

Thorsten Sellin (1938) acknowledges that where cultures co-exist in the same area, there will be conflict and crime even if there is no identifiable controlling entity. Thus a social system constituted by diverse cultural groups with conflicting interests, values, and norms emerges. Within this Conflict perspective, deviance is conceptualized not as abnormal behavior brought about by faulty socialization or normative ambiguity, but as a normal, political process brought about by inter-group struggle for dominance.

For Sellin, law embodies the normative structure of the dominant cultural/ethnic group. The criminal law contains the crime norms, inappropriate behaviour and its punishment, reflecting the values and interests of the groups successful in achieving control of the legislative process. The conduct norms of other, less powerful groups reflect their specific social situations and experiences and often come into conflict (culture-conflict) with the crime norms. This leads to the production of deviant or criminal definitions surrounding the everyday behaviour of members from less powerful groups. Sellin indicated that as society diversified and became more heterogeneous, the probability of more frequent conflict, therefore deviance, would increase. He outlined three ways in which such conflict could occur between distinct cultural groups:

1. Groups with different standards overlap or interact in border regions;
2. Laws of one group are extended to encompass others;
3. Distinct groups migrate into new territories.

While Sellin's conflicts involve culturally distinct groups, he also distinguished between ‘primary-conflict’ and ‘secondary-conflict’. The former is the conflict of culture norms when two different cultures clash, while the latter occurs within the evolution of a single culture. Vold (1958), suggests an understanding of the social nature of crime as a product of group struggle. Humans are by nature social beings, forming groups out of shared interests and needs. The interests and needs of groups interact and produce competition over maintaining and/or expanding one group’s position relative to others in the control of necessary resources (money, education, employment, etc.). The culture conflict theory basically assumes that differences in culture will breed conflict. According to advocates of cultural relativism, there has never been a unified history of humanity, but only the history of various cultures. Thus it is expected that the variant religious groups should hold and revere divergent views and relics.

Religious affiliates lead lives determined by religious beliefs, these religious beliefs over the years are deemed as culture by the researcher. Adherents, being socialized into these practices, cherish and seek to protect them. Thus an attempt by members of other groups to talk or coerce them out of it will affect the relationships among allegiants of the variant faiths.

Culture-Conflict Theory suggests that crime or conflict is caused due to a clash of values that arise when different social groups have different ideas on what is deemed acceptable behaviour. Thus Sellin's variant of culture-conflict theory is adopted as the theoretical framework for this research.

The primary culture conflict occurs when the clash involves fundamental cultural beliefs while the secondary culture conflict occurs when less fundamental beliefs clash, mostly involving clash of social classes, i.e. between middle-class and lower-class. The primary culture-conflict which results from clash of fundamental cultural beliefs is of primary interest to this research. Religious groups have different fundamental beliefs, rituals and values which differ from each other, thus resulting in social conflict amongst the religious groups. Accordingly, Sellin asserts that distinct groups migrating into new territories are the reason why conflicts evolve among culturally distinct groups. Kriesberg (2001), also describes it as a situation where two or more parties believe that
they have incompatible objectives. It should be noted that conflict requires awareness; that is, the parties must think that getting what each wants is incompatible with the adversary getting what it wants. In the case of this study, for example, a religious group may dominate over other religious groups because of its close association with high placed individuals in the university who may also be adherents of the dominant religious group. This may affect policies as regards the allocation of resources, e.g. allocation of worship halls, allotment of hostel rooms, placement in leadership posts, etc. In this vein, for a conflict to arise, three elements are necessary;

First, the adversaries must have a conception of themselves as a collectively identified entity.

Secondly, at least one adversary must be dissatisfied with the current situation, regard it is unjustified, and believe that they can change it; in other words, there is a correctable grievance.

Thirdly, at least one adversary must develop a goal to rectify its grievance that needs changes from another party who is likely to be resistant to changes.

Culture-conflict theory basically assumes that as different cultural groups overlap or interact in border regions, they are most likely to be in conflict with each other. In this case religious groups in the university uphold different values and behaviour which might enhance or deter cordial interrelationships amongst the adherents. Culture conflict also assumes that conflict occurs when there is migration of people with differing cultures into a territory. The university community is a meeting point for different religious groups, thus the place of residence of undergraduates is investigated by the researcher to determine its contribution to conflict.

Universities are religiously diverse places, with each religion having its distinct culture, cherished by its adherents which might be repugnant to other groups thus manifesting effects on the interpersonal relationship amongst undergraduates.

Summary of data analysis
The study shows that the lack of cordial interpersonal relationships amongst university undergraduates are highly attributable to their religious affiliation. The findings of this study indicated that students tend to enter into friendships with other students who are of the same religious affiliation than with those who are not. The choices of these undergraduates, on who to date and to vote for during student government elections is also influenced by religion. The principles, values, morals and religious rituals of these religious groups and their adherents which differ from each other culminates in frictions between inter-religious affiliates. This often results in conflicts and contentious interpersonal relationships. Furthermore, it was revealed in this study that involvement in religious conflict is influenced by the student's place of residence. The study found out that there was higher risk of conflict amongst the student's residing in the school hostels, than those living off-campus. That is to say, the absence of choice in who becomes their roommates and possible lumping of students with differing religious background, faith and religious rituals together can cause misunderstanding among roommates.

Conclusion
Based on the results of this research, the study concludes that many undergraduates in the university do not have a cordial interpersonal relationship with other undergraduates, because of the part religion plays in their personality, value orientation and lifestyle. It was discovered that their different religious groups determined who they accept and associated with and how. Religious groups believe they are molding undergraduates by restricting them from social activities and monitoring how, and with who they engage in intimate relationships. Yet undergraduates are affected by these hard and sometimes cut-throat principles which ultimately regulate the personality of the students, and thereby reduce them to religious puppets.
The study therefore made the following recommendations to help alleviate social conflict amongst Nigerian undergraduates.

There is a need to teach students conflict management skills, help them to understand and know how to manage their own conflicts. Conflict is not bad in itself, rather it is how conflict is managed that is currently problematic.

School administration and policy makers need to develop a greater understanding of the issues that generate conflict among the undergraduates including religious tensions.

Code of conduct and regulation guidelines should be developed by the university administration which every religious group is expected to observe, and abide by.

Appropriate sanctions for defaulting parties in conflict situations within the university are necessary. These sanctions will be imposed without prejudice to any offending individual or group.

Development and organizing integrative interreligious activities that will bring a healthy interaction and competition amongst the religious groups needs to be encouraged. These programs will provide a healthy platform for religious groups to interact and understand the values and beliefs of the other religious groups. These activities should be aimed to combat the principle of intolerance within and amongst the religious groups.

The government should help matters by providing adequate facilities and amenities within the university for all students and groups.

Higher institutions must restructure their administrative methods, and train their officials in conflict management skills. Discrimination along religious lines, prejudices on the appointment of student government leaders, bias in allocation of hostel accommodations and religious group meeting points need to be actively combatted in order to mitigate the risks of conflict on campus.
References


Rubin, R. M. (2007). *Children's beliefs about peer relations: Links to peer rejection, depression, aggression, and the beliefs of parents and teachers*. from Proquest Dissertations and Theses database. (Section 0060, Part 0451)


The operation of Zakat and Role of Intermediaries (Sifarishi): A case study of social assistance program in Pakistan

Aniqa Farwa

School of Nursing, Midwifery and Social Work, University of Queensland

Abstract
Social assistance programs are one of the initiatives to support the poorest of the poor. In developing countries, such programs are reported to have administration problems and their impact on poverty is trivial, because these programs have poor targeting, and small benefit levels (World Bank, 2007). In Pakistan Zakat is one of the key social assistance programs that operate at the grass roots level. This paper examines the experiences of applicants of Zakat in relation to role of sifarish in receipt of benefit. This investigation builds on a broader doctoral research project conducted in the poorest districts of Punjab to understand perspectives of program applicants regarding its operation. A qualitative methodology was adopted for this study. The findings elaborate how the system operates at grass roots level. It further demonstrate that the applicants of the social assistance program in Pakistan face issues in receipt of the benefit which involve the use of local reference system, discretion and limited funding. Theses element provoke questions about fairness in the system.

Key words: social assistance, Pakistan, Zakat, experiences, sifarish, fairness

Introduction

Social protection is progressively becoming a policy framework for dealing with poverty in developing countries especially due to economic crises, structural adjustment and globalization (Barrientos, 2010). Social assistance is considered part of broader social protection agenda to support poor to combat poverty. Such program are tax financed, non-contributory (Barrientos & Hulme, 2008) and means tested (Alcock, et al., 2012) while provided to very low income households (Norton, Conway, & Foster, 2002). Therefore social assistance has been developed as a development agenda for many developing countries (World Bank, 2007) which also seeks to address the wider movement of Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) (Norton, et al., 2002).

---

i Sifarish is an Urdu word, used to refer to a strong localized reference system. It is based on power, political, cultural and social relations. Sifarish means a person in a powerful position (political, social, and economic) recommends an individual for favour to any other person. In this case the influential person recommends the applicant to the Chairman Local Zakat Committee who determines eligibility for receipt of the benefit and expect his recommendation to be considered. There is an additional dimension to this, the recommending person is not necessarily a powerful person sometimes it's a relative or a friend of the Chairman who have influence over the Chairman.
According to Barrientos (2010) and Barrientos & Hulme (2008) social protection has developed as an effective policy choice for combating poverty in developing countries in the last decade. It has been argued that the role of social assistance in developing countries is much more extensive than those in the developed world, given the central role it plays in development policy (Barrientos, 2010). The majority of the population in developing countries are not covered by any statutory social protection (Norton, Conway, & Foster, 2002). Social Protection Policy of developing countries depends upon factors like identification of vulnerable groups and political and administrative constraints (Ahmed, 1991). A key challenge that developing countries are facing is to provide adequate amounts and levels of assistance to a very large poor population (Barrientos & Hulme, 2008). It is commonly acknowledged that in developing countries social protection consists of programs that are ‘poorly funded and weakly administered’ (Barrientos & Hulme, 2008) and limited in scope (Midgley, 2012). In developing countries where the incidence of poverty is high compared to the amount of financial resources, universal coverage does seem not possible (Barrientos, 2010). Interestingly, Pakistan is spending 2.0% of GDP expenditure on social protection. From this little spending in Pakistan 1.7% goes to social insurance and only 0.1% is spent on social assistance programs, which is very low (Barrientos, 2010).

This paper is concerned with one of the key social assistance programs in Pakistan namely ‘Zakat’. The purpose is to explore experiences of successful and unsuccessful applicants of Zakat. This paper aims to contribute to the existing body of literature regarding the operation and experiences of the Zakat system in Pakistan. As part of a wider doctoral study, this paper provides an overview of the system and further presents insights from program applicants regarding fairness in the operation of the system.

This paper consists of four sections. The first section introduces the policy context of Zakat in Pakistan, where the study took place. The second section explains the research methodology of the project while third part of the paper illuminates experiences of the program applicants’ and their perceptions relating to operation of sifarish in the system and is followed by conclusions.

**Zakat in Pakistan**

The social protection system of Pakistan embraces the social assistance programs which are built on traditional Islamic practices of charity and alms giving, known in Arabic as Zakat (World Bank, 2010; Sayeed, 2004). The Zakat system targets the needs of poor and vulnerable groups (Kabeer, et. al., 2008). Significantly, these religious practices have been formalised into social policy in Pakistan, whereas in mostly Islamic countries they operate independent to government policy.

Zakat is a religious tax levied upon Muslims owning a significant amount of wealth. In Pakistan, the amount is collected through state and redistributed among Muslims. The formal Zakat system was established in 1980 by then President of the country under the provisions of Zakat and Ushr Ordinance 1980. This system aims to help the poor, indigent and needy by providing financial assistance (Sayeed, 2004). It is religious based system of redistribution based on moral standards in which giving a share of wealth to the poor is a responsibility the of rich (World Bank, 2007).

Zakat is collected by the government as an individual tax from bank saving accounts, saving certificates and share dividends (Sayeed, 2004) by a special levy of 2.5 % of the value of assets. It is deducted at the beginning of the month of Ramadan. Before 1999, payment of Zakat, through banks, was compulsory for all Muslims, but since then a ruling for Supreme Court made it optional for all sects of Muslims (World Bank, 2007). Thus currently, the Zakat payment is optional and based on an individual’s own preferences to pay or not pay the tax to government.

---

ii Ninth month of the Islamic Calendar and the month of fasting for Muslims.
Although it is an ‘obligatory transfer’, after Supreme Court’s ruling one can pay it through bank (to state) or directly (to poor).

The levy is transferred to State Bank of Pakistan and then the collected amount is administered by the Central Zakat Council and is allocated to provinces to be distributed through local Zakat committees. Allocation to provinces is based on population size while no system of allocation exists for the intra-district allocations (World Bank, 2007). Figure 1 illustrate the administrative structure of the system:

**Figure 1: Administrative Structure of Zakat System**

![Administrative Structure of Zakat System](source)


Local Zakat Committee consist of nine members which includes a chairman and eight adult members selected from within the community with two mandatory female members. The committee is elected for the period of three years and is responsible for disbursment of funds for subsistence allowance, marriage allowance and welfare rehabilitation fund (discontinued at the time of research). However, the chairman's role is vital as he is also verify eligibility of a local resident for receipt of other Zakat. It is important to note that both the committee and the chairman operates on a voluntary basis and receive no financial benefit or payment.

The Zakat system consists of various programs including support to medical institutions, religious institutions, educational stipend, vocational training, and marriage allowance however this study is focused on the subsistence allowance which covers 60% of the total Zakat budget. It is a recurrent payment of a sum of PKR 500 (almost 5 AUD) per month to a household granted on the determination of deservingness (World Bank, 2007). Subsistence allowance is the category having largest number of beneficiaries of the Zakat program with more than 800,000 household receiving transfers. It is important to mention that there is an official rule that at least 60% of program resources should be allocated to the subsistence allowance (World Bank, 2007). The Local Zakat committee is responsible for the disbursement of the resources (Sayeed, 2004) to the poorest of the poor within a certain locality.

**Methodology and profile of research participants**

This paper draws on interview data of a larger doctoral project that explores experiences of four different stakeholders of two social assistance programs in Pakistan and examine the system from various perspective using bottom up approach. Interviews were conducted with 16 successful and unsuccessful applicants of Zakat in the poorest districts of Punjab. Names of the districts are kept confidential for the purpose of anonymity. However a broader area including these poorest
The applicants includes both males and females with more females among the beneficiaries and more men among the unsuccessful applicants. The study sample was selected on purposive basis to understand the experiences of the program participants. The inclusion criteria was that the successful applicants to be in receipt of benefit in last 12 months while the unsuccessful applicants were the ones who had been denied support during the last 12 months. Data was collected using two data collection methods; in-depth interviews, and field observations during July to November 2013. The participants, aged between 26-76 years, had low levels of income and education, and had comparatively large family size. Among them more than half were unemployed or unable to work due to age or illness while the rest had income in the range of up to PKR 2000 to PKR 6000 (equals $20 to $6, according to currency rate at the time of data collection. Four out of sixteen participants were surviving on community support and had no source of income, while those employed had professions like embroidery and stitching, maid servant, labourer and workshop worker.

Findings: Process of the application
In order to receive Zakat, the first point to start the process is to contact the Chairman of the Local Zakat Committee. People receive information about the Zakat program through different sources. In general, applicants obtained information about the program through sources like friends, family members, relatives, beneficiaries, community influencers, key persons, and the Chairman. After getting information about the program the potential applicant visits the Chairman and inquires about the procedure in case s/he is not already informed about it. The chairman does not operate from a formally established office. They usually use their personal business place, including a shop, a private school, and a travel agency, or a room in their house, to meet applicants and complete formalities. In order to receive a Zakat benefit, applicants must meet several practical requirements. The applicant is required to have a Computerised National Identity Card (from now on ID) to apply for the benefit and to receive the benefit s/he must hold a bank account in their name. Applying for the benefit was unanimously expressed as simple and straightforward. There is no formal application process. Submission of ID card is mandatory to apply for the benefit and is considered as the application. The applicants take their ID to the chairman and requests a benefit. The chairman takes a copy of the ID and keeps it in their records.

There is no gender classification of programs applicants so gender ratio of respondents was not pre-determined.
The applicants are not required to write or complete any application form to apply for the benefit. Decision making on the application does not happen right away. Beneficiaries generally have no clear idea how the decisions are made and if there is any formal process. Participants expressed opinions regarding decisions about eligibility. Mostly applicants said that the power of decision lies with the Chairman and he has the authority to decide. Once the decision is made payment occurs in form of a crossed cheque handed to the applicant.

**Decision on the Application and role of 'sifarish'**

Decision about applications attracted discussion. The interview data revealed that most participants emphasised the role of *sifarish* in the selection of successful applicants. The term was repeatedly used by participants to emphasize the operation of the strong local reference system in the process of Zakat decision making.

The prevalence of *sifarish* in the system is consistent with empirical research in Pakistan (Sayeed, 2004; Irfan, 2003; World Bank 2007). The majority of the applicants from both groups agreed that a *sifarish* is instrumental in the receipt of Zakat. The participants believed that one needs to have a *sifarish* to get it while one of them explained that even she was poor, but she was denied support until she used a *sifarish* to get it:

"My neighbour [an influential government officer] told me that [the chairman] is distributing the benefit. So I went to the chairman, [he said] “I don’t have any funds, I have no money” then the clerk, wife of a local influential and another local influential [who is government officer] did ‘sifarish’ for me. On ‘sifarish’ of three of them I received the benefit.”

Khudija (Successful Applicant)

One of the successful applicants, *Sakeena*, believed that the chairman himself was her *sifarish*. While *Bakhtan* emphasized that *sifarish* is important. She had not received any benefit even after she had managed to get ID. Her source of information was also a local influential family whom she served as a maid servant. During the conversation her response was very meaningful and manifest presence of culture of *sifarish*, which is not new to Pakistani society.

"Don’t you know sister, even so that you are educated? Not everyone gets this! The chairman is not corrupt, but when [influential people] pressurize him, then it is a different story. You know, it creates pressures [for him to consider the applications]."

Bakhtan (Successful Applicant)

*Murtaza* raised the point about having a connection;

“I mean to say that it’s easy to exploit the vulnerable, do you understand! Those having any say, access, reference, [they are being served].”

(Unsuccessful Applicant)

*Khadija*, *Bakhtan* and *Kaneez* endorsed that a personal link is instrumental in the receipt of the benefit. It can be local influential, a politician, a key person in the community, a family member of the influential or clerk of the Zakat Department.

Unsuccessful applicants also mentioned the influence of *sifarish* in determining deservedness. A common belief in this regard was that *sifarish* is required to receive the benefit and those without it have very limited chances of being selected for the subsistence allowance. *Akbar* (Unsuccessful Applicant) explained this scenario by stating:

“The problem is that I do not have a sifarish, if you have one, you will receive.”

Interestingly one of the successful applicants identified a further dimension of *sifarish*. She believed;
“No my child, they don’t give it. No, no, they don’t give at all. You need to have a good sifarish..... So if the sifarish is strong and you go, then they will simply give you.”
Khadija (Successful Applicant)

“[Zakat is given to those poor] who have sifarish and their sifarish is influential and strong.”Khadija (Successful Applicant)

So it is not only important to have sifarish, but the ‘importance of that sifarish’ holds equal significance. Again this is not new to the structure of Pakistani society and the culture of sifarish. Sometimes, an influential promise to do sifarish and then either they do not do it or they are not strong enough to pressurise the other party for favour. This happened in case of Akbar an unsuccessful applicant who used sifarish couple of times but it did not work.

Conclusion: Problem of Fairness
Role of sifarish in successful receipt of the benefit is clearly evident from the evidence provided. People typically believed that to be eligible one have to have sifarish which refers to a strong reference system based on power, and political, social, cultural relations. From the applicants’ perspective this is how a person becomes eligible as opposed to real eligibility criteria devised in policy. This strong localised reference system has various sources and operate form different channels which can be political or social. As a consequence, one applicant is preferred, for receipt, over another applicant who does not have sifarish but is in equal economic hardship. This means the chairman exercise his discretionary powers to decide the applicants, he accepts sifarish and decides the recipient on the basis of that sifarish. The question is whether this attitude of the chairman can be considered as equal treatment of applicants or not? What appears here is that the system is not treating people equally based on the evidence of operation of sifarish in the system.

The program is reported to have a deep rooted issue of limited funds (World Bank 2007; Sayeed, 2004; Irfan 2003) which is another determinant of operation of reference system. Therefore operation of sifarish, exercise of discretion, unequal treatment, and limited funding highlights critical implication for the system which is ‘fairness’. The system appears to lack fairness and the participants of the research also had the similar perception about the program.

In conclusion, the experiences of the applicants of zakat system presents a tension in the implementation of the program. This highlights significant problems in the system including operation of sifarish, discretion and limited funding that leads to questions that are critical to notion of fairness. Efficient mechanisms to generate funds and monitoring and evaluation are required by the government to respond to such vital questions.

Acknowledgements
The author would like to thank you all the participants for their participation in this project. The author gratefully acknowledges her principal supervisor Associate professor Paul Henman for feedback on this paper. Gratitude is also given to both supervisors and associate supervisor Associate professor Paul Henman and Dr. Rose Melville for their PhD supervision for the broader doctoral project. Many thanks to two anonymous reviewers for their valuable feedback. The research project receives funding from the University of the Punjab, Pakistan and The University of Queensland Australia.
References


Marika Franklin
Australian Catholic University

Keywords: Patient-provider interactions, self-management, chronic conditions, cultural health capital, goal setting

Introduction
Chronic conditions such as obesity, chronic obstructive pulmonary disease (COPD) and diabetes mellitus type 2 (DMT2) are rising in Australia, placing significant burden on individuals, communities and the healthcare system. At the same time, there has been a marked shift in chronic condition healthcare, from a traditional expert model, towards a patient-centred, collaborative approach focused on self-management. Healthcare providers (HCP) are encouraged to work with patients to develop self-management goals that integrate patients’ priorities and preferences with clinical treatment planning. This approach aims to shift patient and provider roles, with HCPs needing to share power and control with patients, and patients needing to be active participants in their healthcare.

However, there is little evidence that negotiation occurs in practice or that agreement on goals between patients and HCPs is reached (Heisler et al; 2003; Meis et al., 2014; Morrow et al., 2008). Extant literature indicates a possible disconnect between the goals of HCPs, orientated around evidence-based treatment guidelines and clinical outcomes (Dennis et al., 2008; Kennedy et al., 2014; Wermeling et al., 2014); and the goals of patients, which are shaped by the embodied experience of illness, extent of disruption to everyday life, health beliefs and social patterns (e.g. education, age, gender, ethnicity, and income) (Ong et al., 2014; Willis, 2011). Further, the idea of collaboration, may have negative implications for people from some groups (e.g. lower socioeconomic status, poor health literacy) due to their differential capacity to be involved in their healthcare decision-making (Chang et al., 2016; Rodriguez, 2013; Shim, 2010). Additionally, HCPs may not always be willing or able to relinquish control in consultations due to structural (e.g. time constraints, contractual agreements), individual and interpersonal factors (Mudge et al., 2015; Rodriguez, 2013).

This paper reports on research aimed at answering the research question: How do patient-provider interactions shape the negotiation of goals in self-management support interactions? Drawing on Bourdieu's concept of capital and the related work of Shim on cultural health capital...
I examined how socio-cultural factors, in particular, shape the interaction (Chang et al., 2016; Dubbin et al., 2013; Shim, 2010). For Bourdieu (1990), an individual’s practices result from the relationship between their habitus (their dispositions or social tendencies) and economic, social or cultural advantages (capital), operating within a social arena (field), at a particular point in time. The healthcare field has been largely shaped by the privileging of the biomedical over the embodied experience of illness; cognitive behavioural approaches over social context; and the dominant discourse of individual responsibility (Ong et al., 2014).

Shim (2010) proposed the concept of cultural health capital as “a set of socially transmitted and differentially distributed skills and resources” critical to effective healthcare interactions (Shim 2010:1). Shim proposed that when people acquire values and qualities valued by their HCP (e.g. knowledge of medications and health conditions, ability to communicate that knowledge efficiently, to adjust one’s interactional style, and cues of favourable social and economic status), and leverage these in the patient-provider interactions, collaboration is more likely. Shim and others proposed that HCPs can also leverage CHC valued by patients (e.g. medical expertise, non-judgemental attitude and understanding the personal context of illness) to foster effective interactions (Chang et al., 2016; Dubbin et al., 2013; Shim, 2010). For Shim (2010), CHC is highly influenced by social inequalities (but not bound by them) and she proposed that the exchange of CHC in clinical interactions can contribute to the reproduction and exacerbation of structural inequalities over time.

Extending the work of Shim and colleagues, I present two contrasting cases to illustrate how the differential mobilisation of patients’ and providers’ CHC (cultural resources, strengths and interactional style) not only enhances or constrains the negotiation of goals, but also reinforces the social positioning of both patients and providers. Understanding this dynamic in patient-provider interactions is important to improving our understanding of the enactment of self-management.

Method
Data are drawn from a larger qualitative study examining how goals are negotiated during healthcare consultations for self-management of three conditions, obesity, DMT2 and COPD. Based on Stake’s (1995) framework of instrumental cases, two cases have been purposively selected as exemplars of patients and providers with differing capacity to mobilise CHC. The two cases presented each comprise an observation of a consultation between a patient living with obesity and their provider, and a subsequent separate indepth interview with both patient and provider. Observations and interviews were analysed using an interpretive approach.

Findings
Case 1: Rhonda and Kate
The first case is a consultation between Rhonda, who has a long history of obesity and her dietitian, Kate. Rhonda, an Indigenous women, aged 70, lives in a nursing home, left school at intermediate level, and worked as a telephone operator before being a full-time carer for her mother for 10 years. Rhonda sees Kate every 4-6 weeks. Rhonda attended the clinic in a wheelchair due to weight related limited mobility and was aided by an escort. Kate, a dietician at a public hospital, aged in her 30s, has worked in chronic care for 10 years. The consultation began with Rhonda being weighed in the corridor with the assistance of three people, which took up a third of the 30 minute consultation time. During the consultation Rhonda held her hands tightly in her lap and was teary eyed. There was little eye contact and no physical contact between Kate and Rhonda.
In the consultation Kate emphasised the importance of personal responsibility for self-management to Rhonda by encouraging her to ‘do the right things’ regarding diet and exercise, stick to the meal plan developed for her, refuse gifts of food provided by visitors and follow through on the goal of exercising. In contrast, Rhonda indicated that while she mostly agreed with Kate's advice, she specified she would not stick to the goals at all times, as indicated in the following exchange:

Kate: try not to have the extras, just have what's been given to you…it is up to you, as hard as that is…the thing is the conditions are never going to change.

Rhonda: I know I am overweight, I am 70 years of age, I've had this problem all my life. As well as what I am eating, ahh it's also you know, umm, it's also along the genetic side. But I mean, it's also what I eat. I know that.

Rhonda discussed with Kate a number of frustrations related to decisions made without her involvement, surveillance of her eating and exercise habits, judgements made about her behaviours, and restrictive practices enforced by nursing home staff. Although Rhonda tried to discuss her experiences of being judged and also discussed feelings of loneliness and depression, Rhonda's psychosocial context appeared to be minimised and not addressed in the goal-setting process. Instead Rhonda was instructed by Kate to stick to the goals regardless of her feelings:

Rhonda: it was a party pie ….and they said “you've already had one”, and I thought “I don't need this” and cause like I've been depressed um coming up to Christmas you know… not having any, any family, you know…..

Kate: ….. Last time we said ensure participate in exercise or walking with the physio at least everyday. And we said as a goal regardless of mood. So we said even if you don't really [want to], feeling flat or low, do it.

In Kate's interview she described Rhonda as “disinterested” and “resistant”. Kate expressed frustration that Rhonda was not motivated to change her behaviour and not proactive in drawing on Kate's expertise. This, Kate stated, reduced her commitment to investing in the interaction:

I don't feel like I get to use my mind much… sometimes you think well actually my role is, “I know about diet and what foods are going to help you”…. …. I don't really roll with resistance……I feel like she needs to be brought to account…… So yeah I probably don't do much of, the spirited motivational interviewing with her.

In Rhonda's interview she indicated she questioned HCPs expertise in general due to dietary advice not being tailored to her specific circumstances:

I just don't think that they have enough knowledge….everybody knows about diet and – and stuff like that but what's good for one isn't always good for the other.

Rhonda further discussed a desire to be heard, have choices, be involved in decisions, participate in social events without scrutiny and discussed how these issues affected her willingness to comply with the goals that had been set. Rhonda discussed feeling stigmatised from lifelong negative experiences related to her weight. The experience of being weighed at the start of the consultation appeared to reinforce these feelings for Rhonda:

I don't need this [being weighed]. Not humiliation ….. it's the inward feeling that you have and the feeling that because you're big you're not as good as anybody else…… that makes you feel down and then that makes you eat more – it's a vicious circle…now I am going to go to the Christmas party, I will enjoy myself and if I want to eat something I will.

Kate and Rhonda differed in age, education, working, income, health and living status, and cultural background. Kate indicated she valued personal responsibility, desired a proactive and
instrumental attitude towards health behaviours, and a sense of self-efficacy. Rhonda’s expression of responsibility, use of resources and self-efficacy did not appear to match what was valued by Kate. Rhonda’s beliefs about her weight (i.e. genetics, environment, cyclic emotional eating) appeared to be embedded as enduring habits influencing her perspective about her weight, sense of responsibility and resulting behaviours. These health beliefs differed to Kate, who indicated that Rhonda’s weight was due to a lack of individual responsibility and poor choices.

Kate appeared unable and unwilling to develop a non-judgmental attitude towards Rhonda or to leverage her own CHC (i.e. motivational interviewing skills) to change the interaction and facilitate CHC in Rhonda. Likewise Rhonda was not able to mobilise the medical and moral sophistication required by Kate to shift Kate’s negative perceptions of her. This led to Rhonda’s social context, which was largely present in the consultation, being neglected in the goal-setting process.

Case 2: Sean and Jenny
The second case is a consultation between Sean, who has DMT2 and obesity, and Jenny, a nurse practitioner. Sean, aged 52 years, is university educated, works full-time in his own business, owns his own home and lives with his former male partner. Sean currently sees Jenny every 6-12 months for management of diabetes and weight. Jenny aged in her 50s, is a nurse practitioner at a public hospital diabetes clinic. Jenny has worked in chronic care for over 20 years and has undergone postgraduate studies in diabetes education. The consultation lasted 60 minutes and began by reviewing test results which were described as positive by both Sean and Jenny. Sean was then weighed. Sean and Jenny appeared relaxed throughout the consultation, had a positive rapport, open body posture, lots of eye contact, mirrored each other’s body language, smiled and laughed. Jenny used physical touch during technical procedures (e.g. blood pressure), as well as social and supportive touch (e.g. touch on the arm). She also shared personal information about herself, for example about travel plans and the strategies she had tried when she quit smoking.

In the consultation Jenny and Sean engaged in to and fro conversation. Jenny asked a number of questions to enquire about the meaning behind Sean’s behaviour, checked with Sean to see what strategies he had already tried, asked him for his suggestions and reflected information back to Sean:

Jenny: What is it about smoking that you like? Sean: I find it a relaxation tool.

Jenny: I understand that smoking is something that you really enjoy and I don't want to make your life miserable … perhaps there are some other options….Is it the taste that you like? Actually having it in your hand and inhaling and exhaling?

Sean described a number of self-management strategies he was using including walking up to 2 hours per day, using mindfulness mediation, dietary changes and not drinking alcohol. He expressed concerns about maintaining these lifestyle practices during an upcoming work trip and indicated he had taken steps such as booking accommodation with cooking facilities and negotiated work hours that would allow for daily exercise.

Jenny used the consultation as an opportunity to address preventative healthcare issues, (e.g. skin and bowel cancer screening) and suggested topics of conversation they could “bond” over such as bowel cancer checks now they were both over 50:

Jenny: I picked mine up from my GP last time…. it will be our little thing that we can share, we can bond over that.

Sean: Yes, the joys of getting older, isn’t it?
In the interview Jenny described Sean positively as “a really good consumer of healthcare resources”, a “pleasure to see”, and an “incredible guy with a lot of internal motivation” and someone who readily provided the information she needed:

He's always been incredibly open. He's not been one of those sort of people that you had to tease information out of.

Jenny described her role as assisting Sean to identify what his barriers were and to allow him to come up with his own solutions and acknowledged the positive steps he had taken so far. She felt it was important to have flexibility in her role and to be interested, even when issues raised were not directly related to diabetes.

In Sean's interview, he discussed the importance of making his own choices and having these respected without judgement. He expressed a desire to enjoy life and spoke of the changes he had made to his lifestyle after his diagnosis of diabetes. Whilst he indicated he would not be giving up smoking, he appreciated the conversation he had with Jenny, stating she wouldn't have been doing her job if she had not discussed it. He commented that these conversations occurred without judgement:

I want to live every day as happily as I can… I have to say that Jenny doesn't approach it from a moralistic point of view. If she did I wouldn't feel the same way that I feel about her because the way my mindset works, if you try to moralise with me, you know, no.

Sean and Jenny both appeared to mobilise the resources, skills and attributes that were valued by the other (e.g. sharing valued information efficiently, effective communication, respect, cues of social privilege) and were matched in their interactional style. They were similar in age, education and working status. They shared information on likes and dislikes and exchanged stories about travel. These similarities were exchanged as favourable cues of economic and social status which symbolically facilitated the leveraging of CHC. Jenny and Sean's reciprocal exchange of CHC prevented the interaction from shifting into one dominated by Jenny's expert knowledge. This allowed Sean space to negotiate on goals, even when Sean's choice for smoking was in tension with Jenny's duty of care for risk minimisation.

Conclusion
Despite a policy focus on collaborative interactions to improve self-management outcomes for people living with chronic conditions, the cases presented highlight how goal negotiation is subject to challenges and complexities for both patients and providers. A key component to collaborative goal-setting is that HCPs understand and incorporate patients’ social context into treatment recommendations. In the encounter between Rhonda and Kate, Rhonda's social positioning (Aboriginal, low socioeconomic background) influences how she is perceived in the interaction (as not taking responsibility for health, wilful and stubborn) and reinforces the powerlessness she describes feeling in her broader social context (experiences of stigma, not being heard). In this encounter CHC is not mobilised by either Rhonda or Kate (e.g. lack of cultural or structural awareness; motivational interviewing not enacted). As a result, individual responsibility remains unchallenged and the goals of exercise and dietary restrictions are directive by Kate rather than negotiated.

By contrast, with Sean and Jenny, Sean's social positioning (university educated, employed, higher health literacy) helps him to articulate an understanding of what he should and should not be doing with his health and this is received without judgment by Jenny, despite his choice to keep smoking. In the encounter between Sean and Jenny, CHC is leveraged and acknowledged by both patient and provider challenging the way individual responsibility is privileged. This helps to develop a mutually satisfying interaction in which Sean's preferences are heard and incorporated into the negotiated process of goal setting.
In this way CHC demonstrates the co-constitutive relationship in which structural factors
(e.g. class, race, gender) are both influenced by and influence the patient-provider interaction.
In a contemporary context where individual responsibility is privileged, these contrasting cases
emphasise the importance of reconceptualising how individual responsibility is addressed in self-
management support consultations. Shifting the lens in interactions from the individual to social
structures may help reduce feelings of blame and help foster the mutual understanding needed
for negotiated goal setting to occur.
References


The Devil Never Wins Unless One Doesn’t Fight: Human Flourishing in the Poorest City in the World

Peter Green
Victoria University

“When you educate a man, you educate an individual.
But when you educate a woman, you educate a nation.”
Johnnetta B. Cole 1999

The theme of this year’s TASA Conference is ‘Cities and Successful Societies’. One of the questions “at the heart of the intellectual programme of this year’s TASA conference” is “What are the preconditions of human flourishing?” I want to explore, in this paper, an answer to this question from the dead heart of underdevelopment. To do this, I examine a women’s social movement for peace, that arose in the poorest city in the world—Monrovia—the capital of Liberia, on the Western coast of Africa. Liberia is one of the “ten most underdeveloped countries in the world” (UN Commission on Human Rights 2004).

In the first part of this paper, I survey the history of Liberia—a society in which human flourishing appears to have been extinguished—through the lens of Gunder Frank’s theory of underdevelopment. In the second part, I highlight key moments in a women’s peace movement often credited with helping Liberia emerge from 14 years of war. That movement is, I argue, a living example of what constitutes “flourishing” – a factor that ‘makes a difference’ – one that creates the conditions to shift a stagnant, or an unsuccessful, society into a successful one.

Part 1: The poorest city in the world
All ten poorest cities in the world are in sub-saharan Africa. Why are some of those cities not in Asia, South America, Russia or Europe?

The best answer, I suggest, can be found in Andre Gunder Frank’s thesis on the ‘underdevelopment’ of the third world.

Underdevelopment
Frank sought to discover why “the metropoles” (the parent states of a colony, or ‘centres’) “tend to develop and the satellites” (the ‘periphery’) “to underdevelop” (Frank 1970: 9). Frank argues, counterintuitively: that the regions which are the most underdeveloped and feudal-seeming today are the ones which had the closest ties to the metropolis in the past. (Frank 1970: 13)
Frank cites the West Indies, and areas in Brazil, Peru, Bolivia and Mexico, “cursed by underdevelopment and poverty” although they “once provided the life blood of … capitalist development”. As world markets changed, Frank says, “the metropolis abandoned them to their own devices”. Lacking any economic or social infrastructure, these regions turn “in upon themselves”. (Frank 1970: 13)

The Guyanese historian Walter Rodney argues that a similar process characterises African underdevelopment: “When one society finds itself forced to relinquish power entirely to another society, that in itself is a form of underdevelopment” (Irogbe 2005)

This leaves us with a central question: was Monrovia dependent on, or was it free from, interventions of a metropole? Was Liberia what Frank would call a “satellite” country?

Between 1700 and 1900, country by country, region by region, the slave trade was abolished by nations across the world. Even in the US, where slavery remained legal, the 1840 U.S. Census showed 99.87% of the state’s Blacks as free, and 0.13% as enslaved (Berlin 2009: 276-78), and increasing numbers of freed slaves swelled the numbers of unemployed.

In 1816, a group of white Americans founded the American Colonization Society (ACS) [made up chiefly of slave-owners] to deal with the “problem” of the growing number of free blacks in the United States by resettling them in Africa. (Office of the Historian 1847)

Before the arrival of the settlers (Americo-Liberians), the territory now known as Liberia was an indigenous “African socialist community” (Nmoma, V 1997).

After several failed attempts by the American Colonization Society to find a place to settle freed slaves in Africa, the officer in charge of a U.S. Navy vessel, in 1821, “coerced a local ruler to sell a strip of land to the Society”. A colony was set up, and in 1824, the settlers built fortifications for protection, and named the area ‘Liberia’ (meaning ‘Land of the Free’), and the capital ‘Monrovia’ (in honor of US President James Monroe). (Office of the Historian 1847)

How does a country whose name means “Land of the Free”, come to have, today, a capital that is the poorest city in the world? This circumstance, I suggest, has arisen because Liberia’s citizens never possessed the freedom needed for personal or economic self-determination, but were instead subject to constant foreign intervention. The ‘freedom’ expressed by the word ‘Liberia’ came to imply, instead, that the population could be freely exploited by American colonial interests. This is the same “freedom” that is implied in the term *Terra Nullius* – a territory that is “not under the sovereignty of any state” (Khemka 2015). The native population in the area occupied by the Americo- Liberians was established as ‘Populus Nullia’ – the people of no nation.

**Liberia**

In 1847 Liberia declared its independence - the second (after Haiti – established by slave revolutionaries) black republic in the world at that time (Office of the Historian 1847).

The first settlers (the repatriates) were called Americo-Liberians.

Initially, [she] indigenous ethnic groups were receptive to the repatriates, who they saw as their lost kin, who had returned home, after years of enslavement in the United States … [but] … the repatriates were not interested in joining with their brothers and sisters to build a democratic and prosperous state.

Instead, consumed by a false sense of superiority …, the repatriates perceived themselves to be better than the indigenes.” (Kieh 2012)
They … were generally richer than the indigenous people of Liberia and exercised overwhelming political power… [They] held beliefs in the religious superiority of Protestant Christianity and the cultural power of European civilization. … (Jones 1974)

According to Patrick Martin (2014), “Liberia […] a de facto US colony since its founding by freed American slaves. … has long been the fiefdom of Firestone Rubber”.

The small, privileged Americo-Liberian class, who referred to themselves as “Americans”, imported ideas about governance that seemed modelled on the very master and slave relations from which their forebears had been freed. From 1870 to 1980, the country operated as a single party state. President William Tubman (Liberal politician and President 1944-1971) ruthlessly suppressed efforts to organize opposition parties, including those by the growing indigenous intelligentsia:

… most of his political opponents were driven into exile, murdered or imprisoned on fake charges of treason and sedition… (Gerbian and Lawrence 2005).

During Tubman’s presidency:

Liberia remained a seriously underdeveloped country, with education and health services beyond Monrovia provided largely by foreign missionaries… (Smillie 2010)

Tubman … introduced into Liberian politics … the rise of authoritarianism and political brutality. All of these vices festooned during this period and birthed a political culture that would nurture future wars… (Truth and Reconciliation Commission 2009)

President Tubman was followed by William Tolbert who sought, belatedly, to make his government more democratic. Because of this, the US government undermined him: in Ibrahim’s (2016) words: “… the cold war and its demise has worked against democracy and economic development in Africa”.

Liberia was a special case in the underdevelopment by capitalism of the third world. The US installed a system of government, led by the ruling True Whig Party, based on westernised slave relations. It stalled Liberian economic and social development for over a hundred years. As Said Adejumobi (2015) argues, reflecting explicitly on Gunder Frank’s work on underdevelopment:

… To paraphrase Andre Gunder Frank (1969), “The development of the core states [which Frank had called ‘parent states’] and the underdevelopment of Liberia were parts of the same process—two sides of the same coin”… the resources that Liberia needed for its economic and social development were siphoned off to help promote the development of the United States and other core states… the United States supported various authoritarian regimes in Liberia that ensured… that the workers were kept in check. Firestone denied its workers the right to organize unions… (Adejumobi 2015)

Adejumobi’s description of Liberia fits well with Gunder Frank’s assertion that “the majority of the population” in the third world was locked into an “archaic, feudal, underdeveloped state” (Frank 1970:223).

The first civil in Liberia (1989–1997) started when Charles Taylor, an Americo- Liberian, led a guerrilla war against the Samuel Doe regime which had overthrown the True Whig Party in 1980. A peace agreement in 1997 allowed an election, which was won by Charles Taylor. The Second Liberian Civil War (1999-2003) started when opponents to Charles Taylor, based in Guinea, invaded Liberia. The parties in power before and during the civil wars, first Doe’s, and then Taylor’s, are described by Adekeye Adebajo (2002) as the “lumpenmilitariat”. Charles Taylor was, says Martin Meredith (2011) “Africa’s most notorious warlord”.
Part 2: Leymah Gbowee

What can be done, in the fourteenth year of civil war, to raise the standard of living in war-torn Liberia? How can a brake be put on the continued destruction of a country’s infrastructure? Part of the answer to these questions came from an unlikely direction: a women’s peace movement that has been described in many accounts as helping to bring Liberia out of 14 years of war. I discuss this movement, and analyse its implications for how we think about human flourishing, in the sections below.

Leyma Roberta Gbowee was born in Monrovia in 1972, and was educated in a private school. She recalls clearly the day when the Liberian civil war came to Monrovia.

All of a sudden one July morning I wake up at 17, [planning to go] to the university to fulfill my dream of becoming a medical doctor, and fighting erupted. (Gbowee 2011a)

On that day, she says, she changed “from a child into an adult in a matter of hours” (Rashed 2011).

… daughters and wives were … taken away as sex slaves or cooks while … husbands and sons were being forcibly conscripted … (Mtata 2012)

Gbowee trained as a social worker assisting in the Liberian Trauma Healing and Reconciliation Program, where she worked with others to rehabilitate ex-'child soldiers' of Charles Taylor’s army. She called the civil war another “boy’s war”, and added “if any changes were to be made in society it had to be by the mothers” (Andrews 2015:141)

Gbowee joined a local peace group, and began reading the works of Martin Luther King Junior and Gandhi. In 2003, the Second Civil War was in its fourth year. Charles Taylor, had lost control of two thirds of Liberia. Rebel forces started shelling Monrovia. Gbowee, and thousands of women across the country, had had enough.

The following is a summary account of the struggles of the women’s peace movement in mid 2003.

**How to end a war in five months**

**March, 2003:** Muslim and Christian women joined together to form Mass Action for Peace.

**April 1:** Using the radio to spread the word, Gbowee and a female Liberian journalist encouraged the women of Monrovia to speak out for peace. Wearing all-white clothing, the women gathered at the fish market every day for a week. They sat, danced, and sang for peace. Some held banners that read, “The women of Liberia want peace now”. They agreed that they would go on a sex strike:

The men in our society were really not taking a stance. … We decided to do a sex strike to kind of propel these silent men into action…

The [sex] strike lasted, on and off, for a few months. It had little or no practical effect, but it was extremely valuable in getting us media attention. (Andrews 2014)

**April 11th:** Gbowee recounted how a thousand women, dressed in white, held a protest march, from the fish market, through Monrovia, chanting “We are fed up”, to City Hall.

… There were women here who’d lost children and were filled with rage, women who were political radicals interested only in ousting Taylor, and women who were just drunk. (Gbowee 2011b)

She addressed the crowd “Women are sick of seeing our children dying… they want peace, and they want it now.” The demonstration was shown on international media, which strengthened
the women in their resolve. Gbowee heard later that Taylor’s guards had been told to “flog us if we marched in the streets” (Gbowee 2011c).

**April 23**

Two weeks later, 2500 women gathered outside Taylor’s palace in Monrovia, demanding to speak to him. He said he wasn’t feeling well, and would only meet with ten of them.

Leymah Gbowee, addressing the crowd, said “Hell, no, he will see all of us”. Taylor finally agreed. Gbowee spoke “… we believe, as custodians of society, tomorrow our children will ask us, ‘Mama, what was your role during the crisis?’ Taylor then spoke ‘No group of people could make me get out of bed but the women of Liberia, who I consider to be my mothers.’” He agreed to attend the peace talks. (Tripp 2015)

The women’s mass actions, said Gbowee later, appeared to many to be a spontaneous uprising, but there was a core group of a dozen or so women, organising “daily, twelve-hour, massive sit-in protests … across the country between 6am and 6pm”.

**June**

Peace talks held in Ghana to end the civil war were not making any progress, so a hundred women surrounded the building where the peace negotiations were taking place.

When security forces attempted to arrest Leymah, she displayed tactical brilliance in threatening to disrobe – an act that according to traditional beliefs would have brought a curse of terrible misfortune upon the men. (Rashed 2011)

We were going to almost a third month of a peace process that should have lasted three weeks…. we seized the entire hall, locked the men in and said they would not come out until we had a peace agreement signed. … two weeks later we got a peace agreement signed. (Gbowee 2015)

“Leymah …understood that the devil never wins unless one doesn’t fight” (Jeng 2012).

**August**

The war ended. Taylor stepped down, and, although he initially went into exile, he was later charged with eleven different war crimes and gaolled for fifty years.

Gbowee continued in her efforts to improve conditions for women and helped to bring the country's first female head of state, Ellen Johnson Sirleaf, to power as Liberia's president in 2005. In 2011, Gbowee, Ellen Johnson Sirleaf and Tawakkul Karman (a Yemeni democracy campaigner) were awarded the Nobel Peace Prize.

**Conclusion**

Gbowee and the Mass Action for peace dramatically changed two traditional stereotypes. In 2003 they worked to overcome the division between Christian and Muslim women. And after the end of the civil war, they helped to elect the first female president, and worked to improve women's education as well as increased female participation in all areas of the economy and state institutions. In particular, they ensured that women were included in every aspect of conflict resolution.

Gunder Frank, 15 years before Liberia’s Mass Action for Peace, stated that social movements in underdeveloped regions could be regarded as:

… an army able to completely eat through the essential structure of … a society

… what motivates them is the sense of injustice and oppression to which their members are subject by the society in which they live. (Simmons 1987)

Such movements, Frank said, when they have the

…active participation and leadership of women, can also be the initiators, instruments, and beneficiaries of [a] more democratic development. (Frank 1991)
Mass Action for Peace was just one of many global popular social movements—a massive, active force against the civil war and the immiseration it brought. In its flourishing, it was able to “eat through the essential structure” of the stagnant Liberian order, under the control of a ‘lumpenmilitariat’.

Marx’s ideas about the standpoint of the proletariat in the mid 19th century can be broadened to describe struggles, such as that by Mass Action for Peace in Liberia, as (in the words of Geoge Lukacs, just under 100 years ago) a “conscious intervention” (Lukács, 1920, 1) of oppressed people, whether workers, women or blacks. In this case it was an intervention by predominantly black women, against the injustice, oppression and exploitation that had been, in the case of Liberia, immanent in their historical underdevelopment for the previous 150 years.

In the absence of a working class movement today, ‘standpoint theory’ describes any social justice movements, any “collective struggles” that “reflect an alternative rationality” (Blackledge 2006), or, in Marx’s words, any revolts “against … inhumanity” (1845) that help to expose the fact of the oppressive violence inherent in capitalism.

Such social movements by the oppressed in the periphery are based on, they provide us with, a more “objective understanding of the nature of society” (Lukács, 1920, 1), and give us a better knowledge of how all social relations are “integrated in the concrete totality” (Lukács, 1920, 2) than do the fetishised explanations of social relations in the developed centre, which are blind to the property and class relations of which they are a part.

Leymah Gbowee's own words describe why Mass Action for Peace was successful:

… local community members and unarmed civilians can help turn our upside-down World, right-side up. (Gbowee 2011d)

The work done by Gbowee, in her work to organise the women of Liberia (against the violence that had doomed Liberia to be an ‘unsuccessful’ society) is, I would suggest, the universal meaning, the “precondition”, of ‘human flourishing’.
References


Colonialism%3A+American+foreign+policy+and+the+first+Liberian+civil...- a0306514669


Lukács, G (1). III: The Standpoint of the Proletariat, History & Class Consciousness. 1920 Date accessed September 1st, 2016, from https://www.marxists.org/archive/lukacs/work/history/hcc07_1.htm

Lukács, G. (2) III: The Standpoint of the Proletariat, History & Class Consciousness. Date accessed September 1st, 2016, from https://www.marxists.org/archive/lukacs/work/history/hcc07_5.htm


Defining health: How users and practitioners of Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicine experience health care in a remote area of Australia.

Aqua Hastings
The University of Newcastle

Abstract
Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicine (TCAM) approach health care with definitions of health beyond the hegemonic ‘absence of disease’. The World Health Organisation recognises the role of TCAM in improving health equity because of its cultural accessibility, especially in remote areas. Given that people in remote Australia have comparatively poor health and higher usage of TCAM this study fills a gap in the literature by increasing sociological understanding of what health means and what socio-cultural factors makes TCAM health care relevant to people living remotely.

A constructionist approach and a feminist theoretical framework has been taken because this recognises the multiple determinations of people’s health realities and the ways power is dispersed through health knowledge and practices. Interviews were conducted with people who use and in most cases also practice TCAM in a remote area of Central Australia, and the data analysed using thematic and narrative analysis. Emerging findings show that health is experientially constructed through the interactions that people have with factors in their social and geographic environment.

Greater understanding of how people conceptualise and experience health through their use and practice of TCAM can help address health access and needs, and thereby improve health outcomes.

Keywords: health/ remoteness/ Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicine.

Introduction
Traditional, Complementary and Alternative Medicine (TCAM) consist of a diversity of medicine systems, therapies and modalities made up of cultural practices based on cultural ways of knowing (Baer, 2009; World Health Organisation [WHO], 2012). This study aims to better understand what health means to people in a cultural context hitherto unresearched: the TCAM community in Central Australia. How do people who live in an area classified as geographically remote understand health in relation to their experiences of TCAM health care? Research shows that globally, TCAM has a higher prevalence of use in remote areas (WHO, 2009) and non-urban areas (Adams, Sibbritt, Broome, et al., 2011; Wardle, 2011), although there are important
differences in the way this is played out. Biomedicine is said to be the dominant form of health care worldwide (Baer, 2009; Willis, 2007) and is founded on a biological premise that is distinctly different to the ‘holistic’ or cultural underpinning of TCAM. Biomedicine assesses health as either an absence of disease or by chronic conditions (Australian Bureau of Statistics [ABS], 2011). This different way of understanding health needs further examination because recent research indicates that the higher usage of TCAM in remote areas is not due to difficulties accessing biomedicine. Rather, higher usage is due to the cultural accessibility of TCAM as a form of health care (Bainbridge, McCalman, Clifford, et al., 2015; Poche, 2016). TCAM holds an important place in health care in Australia and worldwide, and the WHO acknowledges the essential role of TCAM in addressing health inequities especially in remote areas where health outcomes are poorer than in cities (WHO, 2012). It is important therefore, to understand what aspects of health and healing people find attractive in TCAM and therefore, what it is about TCAM that makes it culturally accessible. This study fills an important gap in research by exploring the intersection of people’s experiences of health and understandings of healing in the TCAM context, in a remote area of Australia. It does this by analysing interviews with people who use or are practitioners of TCAM, and who live in Central Australia, focusing on the Alice Springs area.

Background
TCAM consists of the health care practices that are based on the philosophies, beliefs and experiences indigenous to, or emerging from, different cultures (Phelps and Hassed, 2011; WHO, 2013), and exist largely outside of institutions that practice biomedicine taught in medical schools (Zollman and Vickers, 1999). Some of these medicine systems are newly emerging (Baer, 2009), and some are built on fundamentals that are thousands of years old (WHO, 2013). Not static, they are constituted of dynamic and diverse practices that have been appropriated and hybridised across different countries and different temporalities (Alster, 2005; Baer and Sporn, 2009). When they are practiced in their country of origin they are called Traditional Medicine (TM) (WHO, 2013). When they are not part of that country’s own traditions, they are called Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM), (WHO, 2002). This paper uses the WHO’s preferred term ‘TCAM’ specifically because it is inclusive of Australia’s traditional Indigenous medicine as a modality of medicine practice.

In Australia, TCAM consists mainly of acupuncture, aromatherapy, Traditional Chinese Medicine [TCM], chiropractic, herbal medicine, homeopathy, hypnosis, massage, meditation, naturopathy, osteopathy, reflexology, shiatsu, spiritual healing, vitamin and mineral therapy, and yoga (Cohen et al., 2005), and traditional Indigenous Medicine (Panzironi, 2013; Saethre, 2007). In addition to addressing symptomatic relief of ill health, TCAM practitioners use a holistic approach to emphasise preventative health and interconnectedness with the patient’s social context with the aim of enhancing full wellbeing (Australian Traditional Medicine Society, [ATMS], 2012; Baer, 2009; Maher, 1999). Contextual factors may include the patient’s community and relational network, emotional and mental wellbeing, spiritual equilibrium, and domestic and geographical environments (ATMS, 2012; Baer, 2009; Oliver, 2013; Saethre, 2007). How the TCAM practitioner endeavours to treat their patient in relation to these contextual factors, and the contingent meaning of these factors in relation to remoteness, is the focus of this study.

This paper will overview recent literature on the topic, explain the method and theoretical approach used in the study, discuss some of the preliminary findings found in the data, and then finish with some conclusions about what health means in a remote location and how this may impact on the role of TCAM in providing culturally accessible health care.
Literature Review
Recent literature explores how health is understood in different social, cultural and political contexts and how this plays out through TCAM practices, globally and locally. There are significant differences, similarities, and overlaps in the ways that traditional Indigenous Medicines (TMs) and Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM) are used. Likewise, the ways that TMs and CAM are validated or not, as healing modalities, and therefore recognised as effective treatment have both sameness and difference. It is these differences and similarities that this research paper focuses on, and how these factors constitute people's understandings of health and experiences of healing. These factors make up the cultural aspects of wellbeing that characterise TCAM and attract people to it. Remote living is remarkably different to urban living, and results in different health experiences and outcomes. It is these key differences that may provide insight into what aspects of TCAM are culturally relevant, and what are not, to people who live remotely.

The appeal and prevalence of TCAM
TCAM practitioners are key providers of health care with the WHO reporting that 80% of the world's poorer populations use TM (WHO, 2009) and up to 86% of the world's richer populations use CAM (WHO, 2013). Literature states that there has been a rise in popularity of TCAM in recent decades. Reasons for this are cited as resistance to biomedical authority (Adams, 2007; Saks, 1994; Wardle, 2011), an affinity with new-age ideologies (Baer, 2009), mistrust of biomedicine, dissatisfaction with biomedical providers, and lifestyle choice (Sointu, 2006; Stratton and Mcgivern-Snosky, 2008). Nissen and Evans (2012) suggest that rather than an increase in popularity, TCAM has undergone a mainstreaming which renders it more visible. They link this to healthcare choices, issues of worldview and philosophy, and to cultural developments characteristic of the 20th and 21st century. Similarly, Ross (2013:np) states that TCAM is “a well-established cultural strategy” that people use to “maximize their chances for well-being”. Giddens (1991) claims that use of TCAM is part of a generalised social change based on factors that are common to the late modern period such as a more assertive consumer; greater acceptance of diverse ideas and knowledge systems; and an increase in people establishing themselves as ‘new experts’ in their field.

Cultural affinity and accessibility of TCAM
Although TCAM is seen to be expensive, when compared to biomedical service providers Bodeker and Kronenberg, (2002) report that CAM is affordable, available and accessible in wealthy countries, and the WHO, (2013) report that TM is affordable, accessible and available in poorer countries. This is largely because TCAM systems are situated locally and use local resources and local practitioners (WHO, 2001). In reference to localised cultural TCAM practices, Bodeker and Kronenberg state that there is a “vast informal and until recently silent health care sector” in all countries about which little is known in academic literature (2002:1583). The Poche Indigenous Health Network (2016:2) states that “Aboriginal traditional medicine is yet to be enacted into Australian health policy in a significant and practical way”. not found as a core component of Australia's Indigenous health policy?’

This study explores the less formal face of health care further, and the understandings of health which may underpin people's choice of TCAM. Regardless of geographical location, people describe a constructed cultural affinity with TCAM that Wardle (2011a) found is a key reason for their decisions to use it. This study explores what it is about health and healing in TCAM practices that people find appealing.

Remoteness and health
The vastness of Australia is reported to have a profound impact on the health and life expectancy of people who live in rural and remote areas, resulting in shorter lives and higher rates of injury
and disease compared to people living in major cities (Australian Institute of Health and Welfare [AIHW], 2016). The AIHW (2016:1) states that specific disease factors contribute to the reported poorer health outcomes although it is unclear whether this relates to differences in access to services, greater risk factors and the regional/remote environment itself. Discourse on rural and remote health is dominated by the ‘problems’ of access and quality of service providers and these are challenged by Malatsky and Bourke (2016) in very recent literature. The findings from this study also uncover different information about the nature and prevalence of health and disease finding that participants experience remote living provides a higher standard of health, a higher quality of life, and high quality service providers.

This study uses the AIHW definition of remoteness: a geographical classification characterised by “very restricted accessibility of goods, services and opportunities for social interaction” (AIHW, 2004:9) and is based on the road distance to access such services.

Given that Australia is multicultural and given that TCAM is comprised of culturally diverse practices and ideologies, which are both locally situated and hybridised, TCAM is well placed to appeal to a wide array of people. Bodeker and Kronenberg (2002) and Thompson and Nichter (2015) have found that TCAM is attractive to a cultural diversity of users. Meurk et al. (2013) and Wardle (2011a) conducted studies on rural users of CAM and found that they have a cultural affinity with CAM and identified the values of holism, prevention and individualised medicine inherent in (T)CAM practices. These need further exploration and this study endeavours to understand in greater depth and breadth what this may mean.

Method and Theory

Using a constructionist and feminist approach is a way to recognise the multiple determinations of people’s health realities and extend the possibilities of understanding. Additionally, a feminist perspective has the capacity to engage with experiences and perceptions of health that often stand in resistance to normative notions of health (Grigg and Kirkland, 2016). Feminist theories such as Grigg’s (2016) theory about new paradigms of health, and Hawkesworth’s (1989) theories of ways of knowing are frameworks to explore how power is exercised through TCAM usage because they are not normative practices of health care. Feminist theory is a way to critically explore how power is dispersed amongst community members in relation to the provision, practice and consumption of TCAM. Grigg and Kirkland (2016) declare that a feminist analysis of (women’s) health must consider the roles played by the social construction of health, new paradigms of health, structural variables, and also political power in determining how and which people’s health needs are being met. TCAM is sometimes criticised as ‘unscientific’ (Flatt, 2012). Referring to feminist health care research, Agassi (2000, p. 4), points out that a feminist approach is not a reactive effort to be anti-scientific and anti-positivist, or irrationalist and subjectivist (2000:9); rather it is an intention to emancipate research outcomes from the constraints of positivist scientificism. A feminist theoretical approach is apt for sociocultural research on TCAM because of the way that multiple truths of knowledge, many ways of knowing, and the subjective nature of reality is recognised and made visible (Chilisa, 2012; Hawkesworth, 2012; Moosa-Mitha 2005). This study engages with feminist theories to critically explore beyond the parameters of normative assumptions about what constitutes health and health care.

Over 40 face-to-face interviews were conducted with people who live within a 500km radius of Alice Springs, a community classified as geographically remote and situated in the heart of the Australian continent. The Alice Springs township has a highly mobile and multicultural populace of around 28 000 (ABS, 2012) and is located more than 1500kms from major capital cities. The study was conducted in accordance with the guidelines and approval of the University of Newcastle Human Research Ethics Committee, Approval No. H-2015-0161. Participants of this study are aged 18 and older who responded to community notices inviting participation in the
research project, or were recruited through snowball sampling. The area’s population is comprised of 20% Aboriginal people, 20% people born overseas (ABS, 2007-2011), and 60% non-Aboriginal born in Australia. Respondents were using or practicing TCAM at the time of interview, with additional reported use and practice within the last 7 years. A range of modalities were reported and included acupuncture and TCM, Bowen therapy, bush medicine, Check system personal training, chiropractic, crystal journeys, energy healing, herbal medicine, homeopathy, kinesiology, massage therapy, meditation, mindful life coaching, naturopathy, psychic and spiritual healing, reiki, shamanic healing, shiatsu, sound healing, traditional Aboriginal medicine, vision quests, watsu, and yoga. Respondents live in Alice Springs or surrounding region, and are recognised as TCAM practitioners in the community. Interviews lasted half to one hour, were recorded in situ. Whilst, Aboriginal people were not particularly sought for the research, they were included in the grouping for this research. Interviews were scripted but with only a few key questions to encourage participants to freely tell their stories about their experiences of TCAM health care. They were transcribed and then coded thematically by hand and with NVivo software. Data was analysed with thematic and narrative analysis. Well over 60 themes were identified and then categorised into three main groupings. These were: health as feeling, especially as it related to spirituality; health as therapeutic landscape, and health as community and belonging. According to Reissman (2008), when people are interviewed they co-construct a story of identity, values and ideology, agency, social relationships, and interaction within a certain context that has symbols of meaning to them. It is these rich meanings which reveal the understandings of health and healing that give TCAM its cultural appeal to people.

Preliminary Findings
Health is a complex notion with different meanings and different experiences for people. The emerging findings indicate that concepts of health are experientially constructed through the interactions that people have with factors in their personal, social and geographic environment. Participants tell about the many factors that constitute their experiences of health and health care within the TCAM context. The dominant categories that emerged pertain to “community”, “the desert landscape”, and “spirituality”. These were described as important facets of wellbeing in people’s explanations of health in relation to their TCAM use and practice. These factors also were seen to be hinged on the positioning of individuals and social groups on class, gender, race, and economics.

Community was central to people’s experience of living remotely with emphasis on “belonging”, “goodwill”, “helping”, “generosity”, and inclusion. These same concepts were anthropomorphised onto the desert landscape which was described as “a womb”, “loving”, “embracing”, and was repeatedly reported as “singing” people to it, or calling its own to it. Other people were “tossed out” if the landscape did not “sing” them in. The people in the wider community and the TCAM community were reported as exceedingly charitable, generous, and non-competitive, “not like in the city”.

The experience of living remotely in the desert was, understandably, inseparable from how people understand and explain health. Concepts of numinousity were common with people actively seeking to “connect” with the desert landscape. Some TCAM modalities were directly shaped by this concept with a number of practitioners building practices related to the landscape as a form of therapeutic renewal. The desert landscape is harsh, and participants constructed identities of “resilience” and “adventure” amongst other notions of TCAM-related ideologies.

Spirituality featured strongly in narratives of health. This spiritual element was described as an experiential dimension of health that was “felt”. Rich descriptions of these feelings were proffered and made frequent links between feelings and such things as fire, heat, rocks, dryness, ocean, sounds, colour, emotion, love, and energy. Interestingly, sentimental allusions to traditional Aboriginal
culture had strong links to spiritual themes rather than linking to building community with Aboriginal people themselves. The racial “problems” that are said to exist in the region play a part in this. Altruism and themes of social justice were found, with a number of practitioners moving to the area with the express intent to provide TCAM services to the Aboriginal population. These participants had limited success finding that their efforts were obstructed by politics, economics, and cultural differences.

Findings indicated that people seem to imbue health with different meanings according to sociocultural influences in their situated context, and that these different experiences result in different experiences of health care. The cultural meanings given to understandings of wellbeing within the TCAM community had a distinct ideological basis with references to social justice, sustainable farming practices, moral identities, environmental ethics, and alternative systems of education for children. These seemed to represent the specific ways that such notions of health become normalised in TCAM communities. The cultural expressions of health care practices within the TCAM community also seem to shape their professional practitioner definitions of health care. These health and wellbeing-based definitions are contrary to the AIHW reports (2016) which focus on specific disease conditions.

**Conclusion**

In conclusion, health is experienced and perceived as multidimensional in the TCAM community of Central Australia, and extends beyond physiological parameters to include concepts of community, the centrality of feeling, especially as it related to spirituality, and the therapeutic landscape. Greater understanding of how people conceptualise and experience health and health care through their use and practice of TCAM can help address health access and needs, and thereby improve health outcomes. There is a dearth of research on TCAM in remote areas of Australia and much of the existing work has focused on the interface between TCAM and biomedicine. Research is missing that explores remote practitioner and user experiences and perceptions of health and TCAM practice. Greater understanding of the different ways that health and health care are experienced and enacted increases knowledge of people’s health care needs in remote areas. It also increases understanding of what aspects of health care, including TCAM health care may make it culturally accessible to people.
References


Does Western knowledge flow into Chinese universities? A case study of Chinese returned academics and academic knowledge flows

Yijun Hu

School of Education and Professional Studies, Griffith Institute of Education Research
Griffith University

Abstract

From the outset of China's Reform and Opening up period in 1978 and until 2015, 2.2 million Chinese students returned to the country upon completion of their qualification abroad. Among these returnees are a large number of overseas-educated academics who have been enticed back to Chinese academia by the government and universities in order to facilitate China's competition in globalised higher education. Therefore, an investigation of the contributions of this cohort to the Chinese academic community is considered both timely and worthwhile. This paper draws on interview data collected as part of a doctoral research study. In particular, it examines the experience of one Chinese returned academic's engagement with knowledge flows. Detailed analysis of the interview accounts suggests that, on the one hand, the participant recognises the fundamental position of certain disciplinary knowledge. On the other hand, he opposes “borrowism”, advocates critical appropriation of Western knowledge, and emphasises the need to re-contextualise exotic ideas and to incorporate these within Chinese knowledge. The analysis also highlights the significance of personal involvement in society to better understand and document local knowledge.

Keywords: academic mobility, returned academics, knowledge flows, borrowism, local knowledge

Flows of academics and academic knowledge

Appadurai (1996) highlights that in the era of globalisation, we live in “a world of flows”, one which features the intensification of movements of capital, human resources and ideas. In the case of higher education, globalisation prompts continuous flows of international students and academics. Many previous research papers and government statistics have documented the enormous number of students from less developed countries that enrol in the higher education

sector in developed countries. However, in recent years, with remarkable economic development as well as the implementation of beneficial policies by the government of some developing countries, the number of students who have returned to their home country upon the completion of their qualification abroad has also dramatically soared.

Previously known as the largest international student export country, China is currently welcoming a greater number of students returning to their home country after overseas study. The deputy director of the Chinese Education Ministry’s Overseas Students’ Support Centre suggested that the strong Chinese economy and an appealing domestic job market are drawing back approximately 70% to 80% of students from abroad in recent years. A government report shows that in 2015, a record 409,100 Chinese students returned from overseas, bringing the total number of returnees since China’s Reform and Opening Up (1978–2015) to 2.2 million².

Despite the intensive return of students and academics, the inferior position of Chinese universities is still commonly acknowledged. A recent empirical study interviewed some academics and revealed their recognition of a wide gap between China’s best universities and world-class universities in advanced Western countries (Chen, 2015). To alleviate this challenge, the Chinese government has implemented policies to entice highly-educated returnees to homeland academia. The returned academics are therefore committed to bring back disciplinary knowledge, skills and advanced methods, in an attempt to upgrade China’s academic level to an international standard.

The significant impacts made by returned scholars on China’s academic development have been noted in previous studies, especially those concerning international collaboration and knowledge transformation (Choi and Lu, 2013; Jonkers, 2010; Welch and Hao, 2014). Drawing on these findings, this study aims at a more specific investigation into the engagement of returned academics with such knowledge transformation in a way that makes use of their knowledge of the world and demonstrates their ability to bridge the gap between China and the world (Meyer et al., 2001). Some detailed statements may be considered here; for instance, how returned academics perceive knowledge flows in the context of globalisation of higher education, and how they choose to disseminate and produce knowledge upon return. Before this study proceeds to explore these topics, it is useful to elaborate on the concepts of knowledge and knowledge flows.

In this study, knowledge refers to the academic-related information that the returned academics have acquired through education and experiences as well as academics’ professional interpretation of such information. This concept can be both “materially manifest in the form of books and journals” and “culturally embedded in the manner of its expression” (Qi, 2014: 14). The concept of “knowledge flow” in this paper therefore indicates the movement of such knowledge, especially the flow manually achieved by returned academics in order to realise the transformation and reappearance of “certain concepts, theories and methods among distinct social and economic groups, geographic regions and cultural settings” (Qi, 2014; Kuhn, 2012; Moran and Keane, 2009).

Just as the review on academic mobility shows that the typical movement of academics is from the less developed countries to developed countries, the flow of knowledge seems to follow a reverse trajectory, where knowledge is introduced and perpetuated from the West to the East or other peripheral places. To explain this, McMahon (1992) underlines an inextricable relation between the flow of knowledge and political, economic, and cultural factors. She illustrates that due to the political and economic dominance of Western society, the academic community attached to it gains more legitimacy in dominating knowledge production and circulation. In a similar vein, Castells (1997: 412) also points out the cosmopolitan global elites’ dominance of the “cultural world of flows”.

How do the developing academic communities survive the knowledge hegemony and meanwhile maintain local characteristics within the course of globalisation, known as an “intensification of consciousness of the world as a whole” (Robertson, 1992: 8)? Appadurai (1996: 4) discusses the relation between the global and local, suggesting “a space of contestation in which individuals and groups seek to annex the global into their own practices of the modern”. In other words, he argues that globalisation should be interpreted differently in different contexts, and therefore new kinds of localities could be produced. This notion has been applied by researchers to analyse the national and local engagements that characterise the internationalisation of Chinese higher education (Jokila, 2015; Schulte, 2012).

This study believes that the relationship between the global and the local should be regarded as a dialectic process in which the local is remade by the returned academics in interaction with the previous and ongoing global encounters (Schulte, 2012). Adhering to this belief, the current study examines the potentially more flexible trajectory of knowledge flows, which may no longer be confined to traveling from the West to the East only. Moreover, the role that these academics play in promoting such flows of knowledge and their attempts to maintain or generate local characteristics from imported knowledge will also be explored.

**Research methods**

The paper draws on data collected in a wider study of the Chinese academic returnees' transnational and transcultural experiences as well as their perceptions of academic identity. Based on this research purpose, I have adopted a qualitative approach with semi-structured in-depth interviews, which entail a collection of rich and detailed information (Stake, 1994; Creswell, 2007). Nineteen early-career academics who acquired higher research degrees from English-speaking countries and then returned to work in a prestigious university in Beijing, China, were recruited as participants and individually interviewed. The choice of this research setting has been made not only because of geographic location—Beijing is the capital city and the political, economic, and cultural centre of China—but also because this university has an established status and influences China’s higher education.

The analysis to follow is derived from one participant’s interview account, which highlights a representative perception of the returned academics’ roles in knowledge flows. This participant, Young (a pseudonym), is currently working as an associate professor in the chosen university after obtaining his PhD degree in Economics and Politics three years ago from an American university. The interview embraced a range of topics regarding his educational experiences in both China and the United States, his perceptions of identity as a returned academic, and his teaching work that is expected to facilitate the globalisation and internationalisation of Chinese higher education.

A framework adapted from Bernstein’s approach is employed for analysing data. In this analytical framework there are two types of language of description representing respectively theoretical interpretations and empirical interpretations on the same issues (Bernstein, 2000). In this study, the theoretical perspectives encompass Appadurai’s ideas on globalisation and locality relationship, as well as the conceptualisation of identity construction and communication in the Information Age. These concepts and perspectives are considered to facilitate the analysis of interview data on the one hand, while on the other, they can be construed and modified according to the empirical evidence.

**From a knowledge borrower to a critical thinker**

The analysis first addresses the participant’s perceptions of the traditional or classic knowledge that is believed to have originated from the West. In the interview, Young is asked to account for his teaching practices and how he is influenced by his previous educational experiences both in China and in the US. He starts by recounting an overall view on Chinese university classrooms:
It has been a common practice in the Chinese academia to bring in and introduce Western theories and points of views, especially those originated from the United States. When a Chinese teacher teaches in a university classroom, he takes it for granted that he should start with a Western theory and then, maybe there is a chance for him to relate this theory to some of the Chinese problems.

His views accord with Appadurai’s arguments regarding the hegemonic knowledge of the West. Arguing against the uneven positions of learning and knowing the world (Robertson, 2006), Appadurai (2000) suggests that “theory and method were seen as naturally metropolitan, modern and Western. The rest of the world was seen in the idiom of cases, events, examples, and test sites in relation to this stable location for the production or revision of theory” (pp. 4-5). In line with the statement, Young’s explanation reveals a prevailing belief that higher education teachers, regardless of their origins, always regard Western theories as authentic, fundamental knowledge that they should use to initiate their teaching, and as useful resources to lead students into a new scholarly area.

However, Young, taking a more tolerant attitude towards this distinctive standing, tries to justify such common practice by using one example derived from his own subject area:

There must be a reason or two for a theory or a paradigm that is regarded as the mainstream of the academic discourse. And once it becomes the mainstream or norm of one discipline, its substantial inertia will make it stand still for a long time and not easy to be altered. Let me take Keynesianism as an example. This classic doctrine has had great influences in Economics studies for decades before neo-classicism or neo-Keynesianism came into being.

He attributes the established positions of academic knowledge and certain theories to the division of labour in academia and to other historic reasons. Also, he recognises the difficulties in changing such a situation. Meanwhile, consistent with the argument of Santos and Rodriguez-Gavarito (2005) that “the result of what counts as relevant knowledge” deserves more consideration, Young draws our attention to rethink introspection “identifying, validating or hierarchising … western-based scientific knowledge” and valuing “other knowledges derived from practices, rationalities or cultural universes” (Santos and Rodriguez-Gavarito, 2005: 12). He turns the focus from whether to teach “must-learn” knowledge with potential Western orientation towards the actual practices that teachers adopt to disseminate the knowledge. Continuing his description of the situation in which teachers start their classes by presenting Western knowledge and introducing relevant Chinese issues now and then, he criticises (referring to some domestically educated teachers) the teachers’ inactive role in drawing up a disseminating agenda:

However, in general, this teacher regards himself as an outsider of this academic discourse. What he employs in his class towards the knowledge is ‘borrowism’ which requires no critical thinking.

In this extract, “borrowism” is a nonce word used by the Chinese writer Lu Xun, which indicates that during the Republic of China era, people approached exotic knowledge with no selection or differentiation between “essence” and “scum”. By using the term borrowism, Young points out a similar problem of university teachers: they employ limited critical thinking to the knowledge they disseminate in terms of whether it suits the Chinese local context. With Young’s academic experiences of travelling between the cradle of well-established knowledge and the place where the knowledge is frequently adopted and strongly challenged, he recounts that

I’m more and more aware that we can’t purely rely on Western concepts and its knowledge system without any criticism.
He constructs an identity of “critical thinker” in disseminating knowledge: to be a critical thinker, sensitivity to the Chinese context and practical issues is significant. Thus, his perception of being critical in interpreting and disseminating knowledge can be further extended to his appreciation and awareness of Chinese local issues.

To unpack how Young encourages exploring Chinese local knowledge, I first present Young’s comment on the widespread concerns of some academics studying Chinese issues:

It’s natural for academics in the Chinese context to take a Chinese local lens and propose research to solve domestic issues, no matter where they were educated, in the West or in China. I don’t think there’s a problem with this. The problems that are regarded important by Chinese academics may not mean the same to American ones, and vice versa. It’s not indicating the significance of the problem itself, instead these different views simply result from different stages of social development. America may have experienced what we are experiencing now and therefore their research focus has been altered to something else.

Because of its economic development, China is moving higher in the “international hierarchy”, which results in its negotiation and reconstruction of national identity. Acknowledging the ideas of Castells (2001), who suggested that China can “affirm itself as a nation and as a civilization rather than as an alternative social system” (p. 307), Young reports his increasing perceptions of viewing himself as a member of the nation and of his responsibility to solve national problems which aligns with this identification (Tajfel and Turner, 1986). As a result, the doubts about “Is studying Chinese issues too far from the mainstream?” or “Will anyone care about the study of Chinese local issues?” can be gradually dispelled, according to Young:

Having been witnessing the remarkable economic development in China, Western countries are becoming more interested in knowing about Chinese stories. They want to know how things are worked out in China.

Young’s following account provides a reference for his above-mentioned advocacy of being both critical and locally sensitive in disseminating knowledge. The constant development of Chinese society may have highlighted the inconsistencies, tensions, and even the clashes between the accepted, or Western, knowledge (and/or theories and paradigms) and the Chinese local demands and practices. Therefore, Young claims that he is motivated to undertake the re-contextualisation of Western knowledge and then incorporate indigenous interpretations and knowledge to explore Chinese issues and problems. His account corroborates well the paradigm of Appadurai (1996) concerning the reproduction of global with local characteristics, which has been formerly discussed in this study.

I always feel that the Chinese society is a very dynamic one. This characteristic is especially valuable to academics in disciplines of social sciences because the constant changes in the society provide us with inspirations, and therefore they provoke thinking to challenge and reconsider the existing theories.

In the final part of this paper the topic for discussion comes to how the incorporation of indigenous interpretations on knowledge can be achieved. With the potential for all communication to take place online in the Information Age as proposed by Castells (2001), the spread and dissemination of knowledge seems attainable via virtual methods; thus, the need for physical involvement is rapidly fading. However, in Young’s interview, he explains that the desire for real and personal immersion in the dynamically transforming society of China informed his decision to return to the country to pursue his academic career, a choice that challenges Castell’s assumption of the Information Age. Young perceives that:
I can observe closely the current changes of the society which stem from the Chinese tradition and its long history. In the age of Internet, though, I feel completely different between sitting in an American university to look for Chinese issues on my computer or mobile phone, and being personally immersed in the course of China’s development.

According to Young, no matter how powerful virtual communication can become, in order to facilitate re-contextualising of Western knowledge and producing local knowledge, academics’ involvement in, and experience of, real communities and cultures is still critical.

**Concluding remarks**

Similar to the multi-directions of academics’ flows, knowledge flows achieved within the context of the academic community globalisation have also become more diverse. As suggested in the analysis of the interview account, while returning with Western knowledge, disseminating it to students, and applying it to their academic work, the returned academic also differentiates between **borrowism** and critical engagement in Western knowledge. Critical appropriation of Western knowledge, particularly Western theories and paradigms, refers to the re-contextualisation of ideas and the incorporation of these within Chinese knowledge to explore local issues and problems.

Admittedly, emerging knowledge with indigenous characteristics has limited power to shake or replace the dominant, or established, knowledge. However, the trend that is argued here is “the dominance of Western knowledge is much more likely to be challenged or even transformed and assimilated into local knowledge systems” (Qi, 2014: 31). Therefore, this paper concludes that, in order to develop and reinforce the diversification and localisation of knowledge, academics returning to developing countries should manage to instigate the emergence of knowledge power all over the globe. They also should advocate re-consideration and re-interpretation of existing knowledge by both the local and international academic communities.

**Acknowledgements**

I gratefully acknowledge Professor Parlo Singh for her insightful editorial suggestions and support.
References


Towards togetherness: Change in financial organisation within couples with transitions towards marriage and parenthood

Yangtao Huang

Institute for Social Science Research, The University of Queensland

Abstract
This paper constitutes the first to empirically examine patterns in bank account transitions accompanied with pathways into marriage and parenthood using the state-of-the-art sequence analysis and multilevel discrete outcome modelling with predicted probabilities in bank account choices on a nationally representative sample. We find a great shift from financial separateness to jointness as couples transit to marriage and parenthood, and a strong time effect of marriage and parenthood transitions on couple’s bank account choices. Trends in the predicted probabilities of bank account choices are characterised by noticeable gaps between the prior and posterior trends at the time of the event occurrences.

Keywords: financial togetherness, bank account, marriage transitions, parenthood transitions, panel data, Australia

Introduction
Pathways into adulthood are often accompanied with major life-changing events, most notably marriage and parenthood. The transitions towards marriage and parenthood are associated with transitions in various aspects of couple’s lives, among which finance is a noteworthy case. Within-couple financial organisation is reflective of couple’s economic, life-course and social-cultural characteristics (Huang et al., forthcoming), and couple’s financial organisation is observed to change over time (Kan & Laurie, 2014) and across generations (Vogler & Pahl, 1993). However, changes in couple’s financial organisation accompanied with marriage transition and parenthood transition are under-studied. This is particularly lacking because finance is the central part of life in intimate relationships, and which direction couple’s financial arrangements move towards after transiting to marriage and parenthood signifies the way couples perceive their relationships and the extent of their relationship quality as well as satisfaction (Pahl, 1999). Separate financial management is associated with unhappiness in marriage, reduced investment in the relationship (Roman & Vogler, 1999) and degraded life satisfaction (Vogler et al., 2008), while improved psychological wellbeing is found among couples with joint savings and investments (Kan &
Laurie, 2014). Studying the transitions in finance, therefore, provides a lens into understanding couple’s financial behaviours, financial mentalities, and perceptions of their relationship at the turning points of their family life.

In this paper, we operationalise couple’s financial organisation by using their bank account choices. The choice between a ‘common pot’ (joint bank account) and ‘separate purses’ (separate bank accounts) is one of the most straightforward ways of observing couple’s financial arrangements (Treas, 1993). Changes in bank account choices reflect changes in the way couples organise, and view, their money. The transition from separate account holding to joint holding at the time of marriage and parenthood manifests couple’s commitments to and trust, confidence and satisfaction in their relationships, whereas the change from financial togetherness to separate banking implies couple’s need of financial autonomy and independence and, in some cases, low expectations of marital continuity (Treas, 1993). This is because ‘our money’ is fundamentally different from ‘my money’ and ‘his/her money’: the former views family as an integral part with resources sharing and assets pooling, whilst the latter makes clear distinctions in the source and ownership of money with family finance easily separable. Bank account transitions hence provide insightful viewpoints on the extent of financial togetherness and separateness in intimate relationships.

The aim of this paper is to examine the transition of within-couple financial organisation accompanied with their transitions towards marriage and parenthood using panel data from the Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia (HILDA) Survey. To do so, we use sequence analysis and multilevel discrete outcome modelling with predicted probabilities of bank account choices to estimate and visualise changes across different states of bank account ownership. Changes in bank account choices within couples have been overlooked in household finance literature, and the limited prior research has all been qualitative and descriptive. We are the first to empirically investigate the bank account transitions among couples who experienced marriage and parenthood transitions.

Data and methodology

Data
Our analyses are performed on the Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia (HILDA) Survey. The HILDA Survey is a nationally representative panel survey initiated in 2001 with 13,969 respondents from 7,682 households. Data were collected primarily via face-to-face interviews and self-complete questionnaires with in-scope respondents residing in private dwellings aged 15 years and over (Watson & Wooden, 2002).

The wealth module within the person questionnaire of the HILDA Survey collects information on participants’ finances. This information has been collected in four occasions: 2002, 2006, 2010 and 2014. Respondents are first asked whether they have any bank accounts in their name only (i.e. separate accounts), and then whether they hold any joint bank accounts with other people (i.e. joint accounts). For respondents who indicated holding joint accounts, the number of joint accounts and the names of other household members on each of the accounts were asked. These names were coded into person identifiers in the households to facilitate identifier matching, which enables us to identify bank accounts held with partners.

Sample
To assess the transition patterns in bank accounts associated with transitions to marriage and parenthood, we retain couples whose marriage and first childbirth (i.e. from childless to having children; respondents who became parents before entering [left censoring] or after exiting [right censoring] the survey are not included) were observed in the survey and who provided
valid information of bank accounts. This results in a sample of 2,050 observations for marital transition and 2,731 observations for parenthood transition. These are our analytical samples for the multilevel models. We further select couples whose bank account choices changed over the observation window. This results in a sample of 716 observations for marital transition and 888 observations for parenthood transition. These are our analytical samples for the sequence analysis.

Methodological approaches
Our goals are (i) examine the trajectories of couple’s bank account choices as they experience marriage and parenthood transitions, and (ii) longitudinally model the changes in these account choices. To accomplish these, we use sequence analysis and multilevel modelling with predicted probabilities of account choices.

Sequence analysis is a holistic statistical approach that allows us to investigate the overall transition patterns of each record and capture the trajectories of the variables of interest across the survey window (Abbott & Tsay, 2000). The trajectories can be visualised using sequence index plots, while the patterns of transitions can be described using sequence concentration and diversification. The descriptive transition patterns can be further collapsed into three categories: (i) towards jointness, i.e. choices that monotonically increase the degree of jointness; (ii) towards separateness, i.e. choices that monotonically increase the degree of separateness; and (iii) fluctuant transitions, i.e. choices that bounce between joint and separate accounts. In accompany with the sequence index plots, this categorisation quantifies the magnitude of bank account transitions and simplifies the interpretations.

The multilevel discrete outcome modelling takes account of the categorical nature of the bank account choices and the longitudinal dependence (repeated measures for individuals) in the data (Huang et al., 2015). We model the probability of having joint accounts using the multilevel binary logit regression, and the probability of multiple banking strategies (i.e. choices amongst three different scenarios: separate account only, both separate and joint accounts, and joint account only) using the multilevel multinomial logit regression. Mathematical details can be found in Huang, Perales and Western (forthcoming).

Results
Bank account transitions using sequence analysis
There are three states of bank account ownerships in the sequence index plots (Figure 1): separate account only (in blue), both joint and separate accounts (in green), and joint account only (in red). These three states represent the degree of financial togetherness in an ascending order: the state of separate account only shows the lowest degree of financial togetherness, while the state of joint account only shows the highest. This is reflected in the colour arrangement on each of the three states in the plots: the brighter the colour (blue-green-red), the higher degree of financial togetherness the state shows. Changes in bank account ownerships are represented by changes in colours. In the plots, one horizontal line represents the account ownerships of one couple over the participation window. As these couples meet the criteria of having experienced changes in their bank accounts with the transitions to marriage/parenthood, each line has at least two different states of bank account ownerships. One vertical line represents one period in which couples’ bank account ownerships are observed. Since bank details were collected in four occasions (2002, 2006, 2010 and 2014), we de-unitise the four years and replace them with enumerated time periods. We align all cases with gaps such that all observations begin in time period one and are stacked adjacent to each other to visualise the data and interpret the patterns more clearly.

We find a great shift from financial separateness to jointness as couples transit to marriage and parenthood. In the marriage transition sequence, 68.8% of couples held separate accounts only
in time period one, but this percentage reduces to 17.1% in time period two. Similarly, in the parenthood transition sequence, 64.1% of couples held separate accounts only in time period one, but in time period two it reduces to 19.7%. Altogether, there are 49 different patterns of bank account transitions accompanied with marriage transition and 55 accompanied with parenthood transition.

To simplify the interpretations, we further collapse the bank account transition patterns into the aforementioned three categories: (i) towards jointness, where couples change their bank account choices from no joint account (i.e. separate account only) to having joint accounts, or from having both joint and separate accounts to having joint accounts only. (ii) towards separateness, where couples relinquish joint account ownerships or change from having joint accounts only to having both joint and separate accounts. (iii) fluctuant transitions, where there is no monotonicity towards jointness or separateness in account changes. Results in Table 1 resonate with our findings in sequence index plots: 77.35% of couples transit their bank accounts towards togetherness as they got married, and 66.9% of couples do so as they became parents. Conversely, only 5.13% and 15.52% of couples shift their bank accounts in the opposite direction as marriage and parenthood took place. These results support the argument that pathways into a more integral family unit via marriage and parenthood is mirrored by arranging finances towards more collectivity.

**Predicted probabilities of bank account transitions**
While sequence analyses provide straightforward interpretations in bank account transitions, there are two limitations sequence analysis did not address. First, the patterns of bank account transitions should differ before and after the *time* of marriage and parenthood transitions, but

**Figure 1 Transition in Bank Accounts Accompanied with Transitions to Marriage and Parenthood**
this is not captured in the sequence index plots. We posit that while the overall trend for separate accounts is declining and that for joint accounts is increasing, the decline of separate accounts and the increase of joint accounts at the time of marriage and parenthood transitions would be more pronounced. This is because within-couple financial arrangements are more likely to be changed at the turning points of marriage and parenthood and to be stable thereafter than otherwise. Second, the transition patterns of bank accounts are likely to be confounded by couple’s demographic and socioeconomic characteristics. Controlling for these characteristics by modelling couple’s bank account choices would reveal a more precise relationship between transitions of bank accounts and pathways into marriage and parenthood than sequence analysis does.

Multilevel binary and multinomial logit model results (Table 2) show that the marriage transition and its timing significantly increase the likelihood of having joint accounts ($\beta_{\text{married}}=1.811$, $p<0.001$; $\beta_{\text{before}}=0.176$, $p<0.05$; $\beta_{\text{after}}=0.196$, $p<0.001$) and reduces the likelihood of having separate account only ($\beta_{\text{married}}=2.451$, $p<0.001$; $\beta_{\text{before}}=-0.270$, $p<0.05$; $\beta_{\text{after}}=-0.292$, $p<0.001$) as well as joint and separate accounts ($\beta_{\text{married}}=-1.197$, $p<0.01$; $\beta_{\text{before}}=-0.151$, $p<0.001$) (vis-à-vis joint account only). Similarly, while the effect of the parenthood transition per se is not statistically significant, there is a significant time effect of this transition on couple’s account choices. Both years before and after couple’s first childbirth significantly predict an increase in the probability of joint accounts ($\beta_{\text{before}}=0.244$, $p<0.001$; $\beta_{\text{after}}=0.102$, $p<0.05$) and a decline in the probabilities of separate account only ($\beta_{\text{before}}=-0.427$, $p<0.001$; $\beta_{\text{after}}=-0.155$, $p<0.01$) as well as joint and separate accounts ($\beta_{\text{before}}=-0.175$, $p<0.05$; $\beta_{\text{after}}=-0.078$, $p<0.05$) (versus joint account only).

To further explain the time effects of the marriage and parenthood transitions on bank account transitions, we estimate the predicted probabilities of couple’s bank account choices after fitting the multilevel models. Holding all the control variables at their mean, we present the trends of bank account transitions before and after the event occurrences (Figure 2).

Both events yield remarkably similar patterns of bank account transitions: in the binary model, we find a discontinuously upward trend in the probability of having joint accounts, characterised by an upward prior and posterior trend. There is a sharp increase in the probability of joint accounts as the events occur, indicating an augment in the probability of joint account ownership after couples marry or become parents. The prior trends are steeper while the posterior trends are smoother, suggesting that the event occurrence has a boosting effect on the increase of joint account ownership, and that the account ownership stabilises after couples complete their marriage and parenthood transitions.

The trends in the multinomial model resonate with findings in the binary model: Couple’s probability of separate banking reduces whereas their probabilities of mixed and joint banking grow over their marriage and parenthood transition periods. This reduction/growth is most noticeable at the time of marriage, but is not at the time of parenthood (coefficients of the childbirth variable are statistically insignificant). Couples are most likely to bank separately at the beginning of the events, shown in the graphs as having the largest probability on the left. The trends of separate and mixed accounts intersect before the event timing, and the trends of separate

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Transition in bank accounts (%)</th>
<th>Transition to marriage</th>
<th>Transition to parenthood</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Towards togetherness</td>
<td>77.35</td>
<td>66.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards separateness</td>
<td>5.13</td>
<td>15.52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluctuant</td>
<td>17.52</td>
<td>17.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of observations</td>
<td>716</td>
<td>888</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of couples</td>
<td>234</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

only and joint only intersect after the event timing, hence couples are least likely to use separate accounts only in the long run after the completion of marriage and parenthood transitions.

4 Discussion and conclusion
In this paper we are the first to examine patterns in bank account transitions accompanied with pathways into marriage and parenthood which are overlooked and under-studied in the within-couple finance literature. Using the state-of-the-art sequence analysis and multilevel discrete outcome modelling with predicted probabilities in bank account choices on a nationally representative sample, we provide empirical evidence that marriage and parenthood lead couples to organising finance jointly.

Sequence analyses show a great shift from financial separateness to jointness as couples transit to marriage and parenthood. The transition table further quantifies this shift, indicating that over three quarters of couples transit their bank accounts towards togetherness as they marry, and that over two thirds of couples do so as they become parents.

Multilevel analyses point out a strong time effect of marriage and parenthood transitions on couple's account choices. Both years before and after the events significantly predict an increase in the probability of joint account ownership and a decline in the probabilities of separate account only as well as joint and separate accounts vis-à-vis joint account only.

The predicted probabilities of account choices feature a discontinuously upward trend in the likelihood of joint accounts and a consistently downward trend in the likelihood of separate accounts. These trends are characterised by noticeable gaps between the prior and posterior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Transitions to marriage</th>
<th>Transitions to parenthood</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Joint vs. no joint</td>
<td>Separate only vs. joint only</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Married/Childbirth</td>
<td>1.811***</td>
<td>-2.451***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years before marriage/first birth</td>
<td>0.176*</td>
<td>-0.270*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Years after marriage/first birth</td>
<td>0.196***</td>
<td>-0.292***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean age</td>
<td>-0.043**</td>
<td>0.083***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education (both degree)</td>
<td>-0.253</td>
<td>-0.157</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men degree only</td>
<td>0.047</td>
<td>-0.536</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women degree only</td>
<td>-0.528</td>
<td>-0.124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither degree</td>
<td>-0.099</td>
<td>0.135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Employment (both employed)</td>
<td>-0.823*</td>
<td>0.567</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men employed only</td>
<td>-0.441</td>
<td>0.180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women employed only</td>
<td>-0.314</td>
<td>0.413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neither employed</td>
<td>-0.406</td>
<td>0.496</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Men born Australia only</td>
<td>-0.323</td>
<td>0.874</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women born Australia only</td>
<td>0.267</td>
<td>-0.213</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total income (log)</td>
<td>0.144</td>
<td>-0.382**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of dependent children</td>
<td>2045</td>
<td>2045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second child (yes)</td>
<td>929</td>
<td>929</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>2045</td>
<td>2045</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Three or more children (yes)</td>
<td>0.752</td>
<td>0.762</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Notes: * p < 0.10, ** p < 0.05, *** p < 0.01, **** p < 0.001. Under both marriage and parenthood transitions, the first column displays the results of the multilevel binary logit model, and the second and third columns display the results of the multilevel multinomial logit model.
trends at the time of the event occurrences. Overall, these results demonstrate that within-couple financial organisation leans towards togetherness in accompany with transitions towards marriage and parenthood.

**Figure 2** Predicted probabilities of bank account transitions across the time of marriage and parenthood transitions

While we have leveraged the power of panel datasets, an important limitation of this study is that our findings are based on a relatively small sample. A number of reasons contribute to this: (i) bank details are only collected in a rotating module every four year; (ii) over their participation windows, few couples experienced marriage or childbirth; and (iii) over the four waves in which we observe couples’ bank account choices, few couples actually experienced bank account changes. The suitable sample will grow as the HILDA Survey continues to mature.

Our findings do not imply that togetherness in bank account choices is equivalent to joint control in and access to money. Joint bank accounts have symbolic meanings of mutuality, collectivity and commitment, but such jointness may also conceal the unequal power in deciding how money should be spent, because the psychological sense of ownership associated with the source of money entering the joint accounts may transfer into decisions in family spending (Burgoyne, 1990). While equality in money control and power distribution in financial decision making within couples are beyond the scope of this paper, we posit that the power dynamics in couple’s finance differ before and after marriage and parenthood transitions just as bank account choices do. This is because major family life events like marriage and childbirth are likely to not only transform couple’s views of money (manifested by bank account choices), but also reshape couple’s visions on spending priorities (e.g. from personal spending to strategic financial planning).
Acknowledgement
This research was supported by the Australian Research Council Centre of Excellence for Children and Families over the Life Course (project number CE140100027). This paper uses unit record data from the Household, Income and Labour Dynamics in Australia (HILDA) Survey.


We Don’t Want To Be A Tick Box For Your Quality Control!

Lou Iaquinto

RMIT University, Melbourne, Victoria

Society forms attitudes towards others that impact on a person’s behaviour in both positive and negative ways. Goffman (1986: 8) refers to this in his discussion of the process of stigmatization and the creation of what he calls a person’s “social identity.” Shier M, Jones & Graham (2011: 368) describe this as the influence of sociocultural factors, which are a combination of the collective values and beliefs of a society, its social interactions, and the dynamics of its institutions. The authors describe how these factors, which frequently label service users as defective or contaminated, impact on service users by creating and maintaining their vulnerability. Often these attitudes and labels have no connection to the causes of a person becoming a client. Gupta (2015: 134) speaks of how the simple fact of using a service leads to feelings of shame and humiliation. Such feelings are often compounded by the impact of dehumanizing treatment from professionals whose purpose - one would assume - is to build resilience and self-confidence in their clients, not to inflict further damage to their psyches. This points to the significance of an organisation’s professional culture.

A professional culture is composed of a set of values that determine how a specific group of practitioners approach their clients. Argyris and Schön (1974: 162) have highlighted the significance of a practitioner’s personal values and the need to have a strong commitment to these. The literature offers examples of professionals resisting change for fear of losing power and control and their perception of client participation as an attack on their professional expertise (Bennetts, Cross & Bloomer 2011: 160). One study found the main barriers to change in mental health services lay in the attitudes of professionals (Happell & Roper 2008: 578), and another reported that service users and carers often complain of not being listened to by professionals (Barnes D., Carpenter & Bailey 2000: 190). The attitudes of professionals determine how social services treat clients and staff.

The participation literature, beginning with Arnstein’s Ladder of Citizen Participation (1969: 216), draws attention to the prejudicial, racist and sometimes dismissive behaviour of professionals and its potential to cause significant harm to service users. The preconceived ideas of professionals precipitate exclusion, vulnerability and contribute to the stigmatization of service users as inadequate people.
This paper is concerned with how to operationalise client participation in the practice of social services. Although most service providers would agree client participation is important, necessary and a basic human right, the academic literature offers a paucity of concrete recommendations for social services on how to actually implement client participation. This underscores the degree to which a large-scale, quantitative study, based on self-assessed performance by social service organisations – the sort of measure often used in assembling indicators of participation – could inaccurately reflect conditions on the ground. The study summarized below therefore concentrates on examining, through open-ended focus group discussions and qualitative data analysis techniques, what client participation means in practice, in the context of service delivery in social services and, more importantly, what must service providers do, to do client participation well?

Method
Stewart, Shamdasani and Rook, (2007: 41) suggest that focus groups stand out in situations where little is known about the subject of interest. Stewart, et al. (p. 40) hold the view that selecting focus groups as a method of data collection, as opposed to other suitable methods, is its “nature” and “character.” By this, the authors suggest the data gathered through the focus group is unique to the individual participant in that it comes in their own words and is subject to their views and perceptions.

For my purposes, the focus group offered a number of advantages as a method of data collection. In the selection of participants, Kruger and Casey (2009: 64) advise to let the purpose drive the study. In focusing the study on the enablers and barriers to participation, my requirement for participants was to possess a breadth of knowledge and experience in social service programs. My assumption was participants would also have insight into the effort and determination required to operationalise participative processes in their practice. An added advantage of having this insight may increase a participant’s interest in the usefulness and form of the rubric. Finally, as a group of practicing social service professionals, their participation may increase their awareness and enthusiasm for client participation and, in time, encourage them to become users of an adapted version of the focus group discussion rubric, as well as contributors to the development of the discussion rubric for both practical and research purposes in the future. In this way the benefits of participating in the study would be shared with participants.

Participants
The five organisations that participated in the study were recruited by contact through email to the Chief Executive Officer (CEO) of a random selection of service providers in the Melbourne metropolitan area. Participants were all at coordinator, supervisor or manager level, and had a minimum of three years’ professional experience in social services. I facilitated, recorded and transcribed each focus group.

The Design and Social Context College Human Ethics Advisory Network (CHEAN), a sub-committee of the RMIT University Human Research Ethics Committee (HREC), approved this study in October 2014. Data collection took place between November 2014 and May 2016.

In designing this study my aim was to establish why, after decades of research into participation, social service organisations remained unclear on how to imbed client participation in their practice. First, I conducted a pilot study consisting of 29 semi structured interviews with: clients, some with complex barriers to participation; staff and board members, at three social service organisations. This pilot examined two questions: is there disagreement over what represent good practice of participation in social services; and does the academic theory of participation conflict with the practice needs of service providers and/or their clients? The study concluded that other
factors were at play and that it was therefore necessary to return to the sector for further open-ended investigation.

For the results presented here, data was then collected from seven focus groups, including a total of 35 professional practitioners, representing five social service organisations. The purpose of the focus groups was three fold. First, this study sought to engage in a dialogue with participants regarding their experience of participation that sought to highlight the key enablers and barriers to client participation. Second, the research elicited feedback on what I refer to as a discussion rubric that summarizes the academic literature on participation and the results of the pilot study. In designing this document, I followed the lead of Rifkin, Mueller and Bichmann (1988: 931) who offer one of the few practical examples of measuring client participation using an ordinal scale that is oriented to social service practice, rather than strictly academic classification. The rubric seeks to provide a simple, concrete, practical method for social service organisations that wish to examine and improve their participative processes. Third, this study sought to examine whether a structured, guided conversation based on a document that summarizes the academic literature of participation, could provide a useful means for organisations to reflect on barriers and enablers to best practice. By focusing on a structured conversation guided by a concrete, practice-oriented, document, the study sought to avoid overly academic, idealistic, or vague descriptions of practice that service providers might perceive as useless motherhood statements.

Results

Data analysis relied on coding qualitative data into four main themes (and three sub-themes): Experience of Client Participation (values and relationships, operationalising participation, fear and client capacity); Content, Structure and Possible Use of Discussion Rubric, Rubric Indicators and Descriptors.

The data revealed a number of telling examples of the importance of personal values and beliefs in shaping the practice of an organisation, as well as the role these basic tenets can play in both developing and sustaining meaningful relationships with clients on the one hand and cause them harm on the other. The data also included positive responses to the discussion rubric’s usefulness as a prompt for engaging staff in a professional conversation on client participation. For purposes of this paper, I will leave aside a detailed discussion of the full results – which necessarily requires a longer treatment – in order to focus on one striking result: Fear.

The participation literature offers numerous examples of the resistance professionals display toward sharing their power and control with clients or examining their professional assumptions, prejudices or pre-conceived views of clients. The notion of fear arose from three distinct standpoints of participants, and all three perspectives appear to originate from, and are sustained by, the internal beliefs and values of the leadership that set the environment of an organisation. I refer to the first perspective of fear as knowledge. This stems from a feature of the disrespectful practice employed by some professionals, which suggested an inability to see value in taking the time to gain an understanding of the experience of being a service user and appreciating what this knowledge has to offer them as professionals. As one participate expressed this concept:

A lot of organisations feel their clients don’t have the capacity to contribute and that is a personal judgment. If there are communication issues you can include a carer but by offering them that opportunity to participate we’re not putting our judgment on consumers about whether they can or cannot contribute. I think that’s a failure of a lot of the community health sector is they feel consumers can’t offer expertise but often they can.

Sennett (2003: 52) usefully speaks of respect in this sense, defining it in terms of: “taking the needs of others seriously.” Organisations that choose to remain ignorant of who their clients are
will arrive at the conclusion that sharing power with clients serves no purpose and will only harm the business.

The quotations below provide further examples of knowledge as a barrier expressed particularly in moments when workers underestimate the capacity of clients to participate. This fundamental disregard for client capacity, which Mills (2007: 35) would refer to as an “epistemology of ignorance,” manifests in the first quotation as simply assuming clients have nothing to contribute. The second quote notes the potential damage to clients through the use of tokenistic approaches to participation:

- "We involve our consumers in our strategic planning day... the ones that are there want to give their time and feel empowered to have a contributory role. I think there is a fear of some organisations that consumers will turn up and speak up and things will go in the wrong direction.
- "in trying to develop capacity for consumer participation is that people's good will is that we want to involve our consumers but it actually becomes disempowering to collect data and shelve it. You create a disheartened consumer base that feel disempowered. They never see any fruit of their input.

The second perspective of fear is education, which reflects the complexity of the task of applying participative processes in the practice of social services that address the specific goals of the service, client needs and staff skills. Some organisations appear to fail to think through these issues or seek examples of good practice in other services. The task becomes overwhelming or simply too hard, as the following quotations express:

- "When we talk to organisations about auditing their consumer participation we really need to talk with them about their fears. We learned that with one organisation where we hadn't done that initial work and had this huge resistance and when I unpacked it we found that it was fear.
- "Another thing that stands out for me is that a lot of organisations don't understand what consumer participation is. Some are also scared of it because if you share power with consumers it will harm the business.

Risk presents the third perspective of fear – a perspective which could be described as the culmination of the two previous perspectives. Some participants described their experience of organisations as being risk adverse in their approach to service delivery:

- "Management needs to understand and be honest about risk. It really does play a role because if you're engaging with consumers who are technically in a more fragile space at that particular time than are the providers of the service there is a risk element that needs to be considered.

While others provided examples of how a change in management brought about an emphasis on creating a collaborative and less restrictive environment, which resulted in a more reasonable approach to risk taking:

- "The ability to do that (take risks) and to know you're being supported gives you the comfort to make those decisions because there are times when you question yourself but I believe as long as I can justify the reasons I did those things I'll always be supported.
- "It's true about the rules, there's a lot more flexibility about the residents - send that back to management so they can then provide a discussion rather than being punitive. It is far more effective, punitive responses don't work."
I was here when there was a change and our new manager came in and the change in our service was a dramatic shift. The service was run very punitively. It was us versus them environment.

Discussion
The focus group data overall offered four main barriers to client participation, of which fear stood out as the most significant barrier (knowhow, attitudes towards clients and resources were the others). A consistent view for overcoming barriers was to start with being honest with clients about what the organisation can offer and explanations about how and why decisions are made.

Fear, as a barrier, has its roots in the power imbalance that plays out between workers and clients. The power imbalance never disappears, but comments from focus group participants suggest it can be addressed through the actions of honesty and explanation that assist in building trust as the following quote expresses:

Thirty people a month come through and the experience of most is a distrust for us. All day, every day what we’re doing is building trust. We have this stream of people at the other end saying ‘you guys are amazing’. It’s like ground hog day.

Organisational culture can both benefit or harm its clients, depending on the professional and personal values that have shaped the culture of the organisation. The data provided examples of the significance of such values, as well illustrations of the principles that underpin participation and the professional attitudes and fears that prevent it.

For some organisations, not knowing where to start overwhelms the good will and motivation that is assumed to be intrinsic in social services - to an extent that it seems unachievable. It becomes easier not to do it.

Although considerable future work is required to ensure the rubric’s descriptors represent an exhaustive list of what is necessary for organisations to imbed participation in their practice, responses from participants support the notion that there are a core group of pre-conditions for participation that are critical to success in operationalizing participation. Examining these pre-conditions for participation will be included in further research.
References


Sustaining indigenous connections: Rural-urban orang Asli migrants in peninsular Malaysia

Govindran Jegatesen

Royal Melbourne Institute of Technology

The term Orang Asli meaning ‘original people’ refers exclusively to the non-Malay indigenous peoples of Peninsular Malaysia. Numbering approximately 180,000 individuals (JAKOA, 2011), the Orang Asli community consists of 18 non-homogenous ethnolinguistic subgroups who inhabit different areas of the Peninsula. Historically, the majority of Malaysia’s Orang Asli groups inhabited the contiguous forest networks at the base of the Titiwangsa mountain range in the central regions of Peninsular Malaysia (Tarmiji, Masami & Norhasimah 2013, pp. 86-90). The rapid development and modernization of the Klang Valley – Malaysia’s wealthiest and most urbanized region, presents attractive employment opportunities for Orang Asli individuals from other parts of Peninsular Malaysia – due to the scarcity of economic opportunities at their rural settlements. Despite the large body of scholarship that is available on Orang Asli communities at the rural settlements of Peninsular Malaysia, it would seem that the lives of the Orang Asli who migrate to the urban areas of the Klang Valley have received little ethnographic attention. This gap in Orang Asli literature concerning the lives of migrant Orang Asli individuals limits contemporary discourse on the Orang Asli, and presents for an interesting area of research on their lives in Malaysia’s urban spaces, and the ways in which rural-urban Orang Asli migrants continue to maintain socio-cultural and economic ties to their communities in the rural villages across the Peninsula.

Although the indigenous respondents of this paper lived and worked in the Klang Valley – some for many years, virtually all the respondents who were interviewed tended to not see themselves as urban indigenous participants, but as indigenous participants within an urban space who were still members of their communities at the rural settlements. Peter (2002) made a similar observation when citing from a 1978 report on the Survey of Band Members of Canada’s First Nation peoples:

> Although a large number of Indians have left their home reserves… this cannot reasonably be interpreted to mean that these people are rejecting their Indian culture and traditions, their home reserves or their fellow band members… the general discussions

---

1 Nobuta 2007, p. 481.
2 Jabatan Kemajuan Orang Asli (The Department of Orang Asli Development).
that interviewers held indicate that the vast majority of Indians living in cities still
consider themselves to be members of their band—not urban Indians. (p. 85).

Most respondents interviewed were unmarried; of the total 23 female and male respondents in
this paper, four were married, and of that number, two had children. Almost all respondents who
wished to have children wanted their children to maintain connections with the rural settlements
in the form of frequent visits and extended stays in order to cultivate and maintain cultural ties
with their respective Orang Asli cultures. In this regard, most respondents appeared to associate
the raising of children at the village with the imbue of Orang Asli culture, beliefs and value
systems. While all respondents did not share this view, a majority of them did appear to entertain
the notion that a close relationship with the settlement is necessary in fostering the development
doing Asli identity, and its associated value systems and cultural norms. This finding also bears


Marriage and Divorce:

Marriage and Divorce:

When discussing the question of marriage with a number of female respondents, it was clear
that the selection of prospective partners and the processes leading up to marriage necessitated
the involvement of their family and communities back at the settlements. It appears that while
women and men were free to marry whomever they chose, certain traditional cultural observations
still had to be followed — including the seeking of permission by both the bride and the groom
from their respective potential in-laws, and certain community customary laws revolving around
courship and betrothal. The exclusion of their families and communities - in particular those of
the bride's, may have dire consequences for the bride should the relationship sour in the future,
or face any form of complications. According to respondents, neither the bride's family, nor her
community, would bear the responsibility of intervening and assisting the bride in the event of a
troubled marriage, as the bride would be considered as to have 'made her own choice.' However,
should the community decide to assist the bride in the end, she would be reprimanded, and
punished in the form of a fine. In this regard, rural-urban connections are kept alive through the
involvement of the community and family in the respondent's marital decision-making processes
via the platform of Orang Asli customary laws - the exclusion of which may result in the loss of
both filial and communal support structures in the event of a negative marriage outcome.

It is particularly important to note that Orang Asli individuals appear not to approach
institutions and organizations outside of their respective communities for assistance with
regards to marital or domestic problems. When discussing the matter of divorce or abuse with
respondents, almost all hinted at the role of their respective indigenous leadership structures in
mediating such issues, while stressing the exclusion of external non-indigenous influences in
conflict resolution. The involvement of the family and community at the initial stages of courtship
and marriage appears to provide Orang Asli women with a safety net structure grounded on filial
and communal relational worlds, in the event of a divorce or if faced with an abusive relationship.
For instance, among the Semelai (one of the 18 Orang Asli groups in Peninsular Malaysia), men
who abuse their wives are punished through a customary Semelai tribunal system that may have
implications even after his death. An example of this is if his son wished to marry a girl from
the community, members of the community may dissuade the bride-to-be's family by informing
them of the groom’s abusive father’s past. In this way, shame is used as a deterrent within the Semelai community to prevent incidences of abuse.

The involvement of the community structure in marriage – especially in the scenario of abuse, has far-reaching implications that carry on to the abuser’s children. From my interviews, it appears that such indigenous structures appear to also be important when seeking marriage-related compensation, or when pleading one’s domestic case before indigenous Orang Asli tribunal systems. Thus, despite the educational or professional backgrounds of the respondents, the role of the community in marriage appears to play a crucial role in maintaining rural-urban connections between respondents and their respective Orang Asli communities.

The Sociality of Sharing:
A recent study (Thambiah, Zanisah & Rusaslina, 2015, p. 463) noted that “Orang Asli identity and roots are linked to their land. Most of them continue to connect with their ancestral land by visiting their family and attending weddings and funerals in their villages.” The bulk of the respondents involved in the interviews were between the age of 25 - 35, and with this younger generation, a form of cultural code-switching could be observed with regards to their ability to negotiate both the Orang Asli value systems of their rural settlements and the urban environment of their employment, using both locations as reference points in determining their behavior in the Klang Valley. However, the ties connecting urban Orang Asli respondents to their communities were not exclusively grounded on traditions and customary laws. While cultural institutions that originate in rural Orang Asli settlements such as the gedo semaq of the Semelai and the lembaga adat of the Hma’ Meri, as well as varying forms of non-institutionalized codes of conduct found in other Orang Asli communities may encourage adherence to Orang Asli cultural and value systems, there were also connections that originated from the urban space towards the rural realm, that play a role in maintaining urban-rural connections. In this regard, a recurring theme I came across in my conversations with respondents were their attempts to reach out to their friends and younger members of their community who were still living at the settlements, in order to encourage them to venture into the Klang Valley and partake in its economic opportunities.

This need to share what they felt were economic opportunities with members of their community bears striking resemblance to the foraging patterns of many pre-sedentarised Orang Asli communities, who similarly shared bountiful forest resources with other members of their immediate bands. Observations have been made by a number of scholars on the sharing practices of various pre-sedentarised Orang Asli communities, and the cultural taboos that facilitated this sharing. Although most pre-sedentarised Orang Asli communities appeared to have regarded the nuclear family as the basic unit of the community (Tachimoto & Baer 2001 p. 65; Gomes 2004, p. 44; Nobuta 2008, p. 95), with complete autonomy in its movements and foraging practices, substantial food items procured from the forests by a family were typically shared with other members of the community. Gomes’ (2007) observation was that “sharing is a way of redistributing resources which are naturally spread widely and unequally among people in a group in order that everyone benefits and nobody is disadvantaged from the vagaries of the food quest” (p. 112). While Gomes was discussing the sharing of food among the Menraq at the level of the rural community, the sharing of economic opportunities in the city by urban Orang Asli

4 The Semelai leadership structure.
5 The Hma’ Meri leadership structure.
6 One of the 18 indigenous ethnonlinguistic groups that make up the Orang Asli community.
7 Sedentarization is one of a number of strategies implemented by the Malaysian administration in its rhetoric of Orang Asli development.
migrants closely resemble the related notions of community survival, as reflected in the following statement by a respondent:

They [parents] keep reminding me, me and my brother. I mean their sons, not to forget where they come from. I mean while we’re in the city, we’re able to receive all the goods from modernization, and all the information and technology, but at the same time we still maintain contact with our community back in the village. So in that sense we do influence… men and women to we let them see the potential of moving outside the village.

The statement above illustrates the Orang Asli migrant’s experience of the positive aspects of urban living as well as its associated privileges, while simultaneously reflecting the migrant’s efforts to draw members of their community into the urban space, so that they too may access the opportunities available therein (the act of sharing). In this regard, respondents further explained that they want their communities to achieve the same level of development as the other major ethnies in the country, and that exposure to an urban environment would play a significant role in facilitating the advancement of their communities, as reflected in the following excerpt,

We motivate the kids, and the villagers, also our relatives… since we’ve been out to the city, we share with them the challenges we faced while we were there. We tell them what opportunities are available there. I think this is already of great help. We’re not talking about giving them money, because money isn’t necessarily going to help them. In fact, the advice we give them is more valuable than money.

This paper argues that the migration of respondents to the Klang Valley is an extended form of the foraging exercise that was practiced among pre-sedentarized Orang Asli communities. Historically, while foraging may have involved shorter distances and more immediate returns, foraging for the Orang Asli today necessitates migration to urban areas for work. What appears to remain the same – at least metaphysically, is the sharing of their findings with other members of their community, so that all may partake of available opportunities. To this end, it could be said that opportunities for dialogue with members of their community, creates a platform that contributes not only to the formation of additional connections between urban Orang Asli migrants and their communities at the rural settlements, but also fulfills a functional role – that of sharing resources which may potentially contribute to Orang Asli survival and resilience in an urbanizing Malaysia. This dynamic process echoes Gomes’ (2007) observation on the “sociality created by sharing in the functionalist sense, [in] that it establishes and maintains social relations among members of the band” (p. 112), promoting cohesiveness for all members of a particular Orang Asli community – both those at the settlements, and the urban migrants in the city.

The Community as Mediators:

Despite their movement to the urban space of the Klang Valley, when married Orang Asli couples face domestic issues, the intervention of the settlement community as mediators appears to be the norm. From my personal observation, it appears that there is a likelihood that this could be a result of the relatively high degree of autonomy still held by Orang Asli women in comparison to other Malaysian ethnies, and the lack of stigma should she decide to return to her parents’ domicile, or if she should action divorce – thus removing her from situations where she might otherwise be at higher risk of experiencing physical abuse. This lack of stigma among Orang Asli communities towards female members who are divorced or who are single mothers appears to stem from the egalitarian value systems that many academics consider the defining trait of Orang Asli communities. Furthermore, there appears to be a direct correlation between the support a woman receives from her family and community, and her risk of staying in an abusive relationship. According to Adam’s and Trost (2004, p. 153), certain “marriage traditions

are such that they undermine the ability of women to escape abusive relationships," citing examples of parents of Indian women with abusive husbands who were unwilling to take their daughters back due to fears of having to pay back, or repay, a second dowry to the husband's family. The authors further add, “women are socialized within such a dominant patriarchal value system that they accept the rights of husbands to discipline them, especially when the wife violates traditional gender norms” (ibid.), indicating the influence that community structures have in incidences of domestic abuse. Although physical abuse appears not to be a common feature amongst Orang Asli communities, the monetization of the same appears to have given rise to incidences of economic abuse at the settlements, as narrated by one respondent:

Abuse well… I very rarely hear of [physical] abuse among the Orang Asli. There might be one or two cases that are alcohol or drug related. However, some of these Orang Asli men hold back from giving their wives money so she can buy what she needs. Men whose wives don’t work; in these cases, the men should fulfill their responsibilities but they don’t.

During the course of my interviews, I asked both female and male respondents if they were aware of a shelter, or safe space that was available to Orang Asli women in the Klang Valley who might need to escape mental or physical abuse, and if such centers – were they to be established, would be useful. Although a majority did think having such centers could potentially be useful, many of them also thought that it would be redundant, and perhaps not achieve its intended goal as a safe space for Orang Asli women. The reason for this appeared to lie in the importance that the Orang Asli placed in their communities as mediators in resolving domestic issues. An Orang Asli respondent pointed out that:

In our community, I feel that most cases involving domestic affairs will be resolved through customary law at the village. This is why I don’t know if a shelter should be established. We may need a center, but I think the problem is usually resolved sooner [at the village]. I mean, even divorce...

It appears that it is not only the indigenous leadership structure of the Orang Asli community in question which functions as a mediating force, but also linkages formed through marriage customs with members from each individual’s in-laws. Among the Semelai, this system is known as the wali system, and it is held in particularly high regard within the community. A Semelai respondent explains that in addition to the Semelai's gedo semaq, Semelai women are also protected through the wali system:

In the Semelai community, women are protected by the entire community. Because when you get married, you have [a] wali10. The bridegroom has a wali from the bride’s side of the family, and the bride has a wali from the bridegroom’s side of the family. I mean it’s like [a] cross. The representative of the man must come from [the] woman’s family, and the representative of the woman must come from man’s family; because if anything should happen in the marriage, then the woman can refer to the uncle from the man’s side of the family. She will consult him, and if they can’t avoid divorce, then the wali [from the husband’s side], will speak to the other wali [from the wife’s side] and they will try to resolve the issue [between the walis] first, and if they still can’t, then they will talk to the parents.

In conclusion, this paper finds that rural-urban Orang Asli migration appears to indicate towards a certain transformative relationship between the individual and their community through the fostering of settlement-urban bonds and the formation of unique relationships between migrants and their communities. Succinctly put, rural-urban migration does not translate into a lack of continuity in indigenous identity or the replacement of the settlement Orang Asli culture into

---

10 A representative.
an urban Orang Asli one. The attempts by respondents to create new ways through which to build connections between their rural communities and the Klang Valley appear to indicate that they view the urban space to be more than just a monolith that grants them access to economic opportunities, but also as a dynamic space that could be tapped into toward increasing the socio-economic conditions of their communities.
References


Safe(r) Schools & Families for Students with Intersex Variations

Tiffany Jones
ARCSHS, La Trobe University

Abstract
Students with intersex variations—congenital atypical sex characteristics (chromosomal, hormonal and/or anatomical)—face a highly significant risk of early educational drop-out. This paper draws on data from the first national study of 272 people with intersex variations to explore the complex dynamics of relationships and school safety for this group. Most participants learned of their variations aged under 18yrs and many experienced a period of suicidal ideation in the aftermath, but inter-family secrecy hindered many individuals’ knowledge of variations in their families or access to family-based support. Few participants disclosed their variations to school staff, although more than half had to their classmates. Appropriate school counselling services/sex education inclusion were lacking. Only a quarter of participants rated their school experiences positively and many reported bullying related to having a variation. This paper argues that, given the lack of information from medical services and potential tensions in families surrounding intersex variations, schools are the most logical place for both generalised and specific dissemination of information about intersex variations and puberty differences. This could enhance safety and strengthen relationships and retention for students with intersex variations, whilst improving general understanding of the complexity of human sex traits for all students.

Keywords: safe, education, intersex, family, relationships

Introduction
People with intersex variations are born with atypical somatic sex characteristics (chromosomal, hormonal and/or anatomical). Their variations can include for example having 47XXY chromosomal Karyotypes (47XXY), Androgen Insensitivity Syndrome (AIS), Congenital Adrenal Hyperplasia (CAH), and over 40 other variations (Jones, 2016). Whilst all humans have the potential for both male and female sex development traits in the first seven weeks in the womb, it is generally estimated that 1.7-4% of people are born intersex (Carroll, 2005; Dreger, 2015; Fausto-Sterling, 1993), and this may be a conservative estimation given the more frequent incidence of extreme physical hyperandrogenism from hormonal conditions such as Poly Cystic Ovarian Syndrome (Huang, Brennan, & Azziz, 2010) is rarely included in any estimation.
People with intersex variations have a right to non-discrimination in schools which has been recently affirmed in key global human rights legislation (UNESCO, 2015; United Nations, 2012) and Australian anti-discrimination legislation applying across all school types including all religious schools without exemption (Australian Parliament, 2013). However, in a recent Australian-based survey of 272 people with intersex variations, I found that this group faced a highly significant risk of early educational drop-out – 18% of participants only had a primary school education compared to 2% of Australians (Jones, 2016). In the Sex Education article I argued that school drop-out appeared to be tied to issues of educational disruption from medical interventions, particularly ‘corrective’ interventions that were not wanted or consented to, and issues of bullying and a lack of sex education inclusion around the grades generally associated with puberty (often years of ‘atypical’ physical development for participants; Jones, 2016). I did not consider how family and education-based relationships impact students with intersex variations.

Critical & Post-modern Intersex Studies
The study was conducted in response to the lack of sociological research on people with intersex variations. Existing studies were largely conducted in medical frames positioning people with intersex variations as aberrations (specifically, disorders of sex development/ DSDs) and mainly considered the individuals or small groups in Western settings in the USA, Europe or Australia in terms of how their ‘failed’ sex development could be ‘corrected’ (Balen, 2007; Lux et al., 2009; Schnitzer & Donahoe, 2001; Wärne et al., 2005). Physical, psychological and DNA tests/ buccal smears were common. The group were also occasionally subsumed within critical studies of LGBTI people or ‘transgender and/ or intersex’ groups with only varying levels of representation (Hillier et al., 2010; Jones, del Pozo de Bolger, Dunne, Lykins, & Hawkes, 2015; Smith et al., 2014).

Based on consultation with people with intersex variations I have argued the need for an ‘Intersex Studies’ framework devoted entirely to intersex issues; foregrounding the goals, perspectives and experiences of people with intersex variations (Jones et al., 2016). It acknowledges the tendency to privilege more whole-scale reforms to thinking on intersex status and variations, sex development and human bodies in general within intersex activism; reframing people with intersex variations as a marginalized group whose rights to non-discriminatory treatment and empowered selfhood are under threat from society’s key institutions (Liao & Simmonds, 2014). It considers how intersex bodies could be accepted, valued and celebrated whilst liberal medical orthodoxy and nomenclature (including DSD terminology) can be challenged (Davis, 2015; Liao & Simmonds, 2014). This paper uses that framework, considering the topics of education and family relationships from the under-represented perspectives of people with intersex variations themselves. I specifically consider how family and education-based relationships impact on safety in the school years for people with intersex variations.

Methodology
This paper reconsiders the quantitative and qualitative data from the first national anonymous survey of 272 people with intersex variations conducted in 2015, entitled ‘Australians born with Congenital Variations in Sex Characteristics (Intersex/ DSD/ hormonal, chromosomal or other biological variations/conditions)’. This study was organised around an Intersex Studies framing: casting key intersex community representatives as advisors on the research and their perspectives as central, yet seeing constructions of people with intersex variations as somewhat socially determined (rather than innately ‘true’). The project’s conceptualisation was aided by people with intersex variations themselves and also their representatives, including some of the community reference group (Morgan Carpenter, Bonnie Hart and Gavi Ansara) and other community allies and key organisations. The survey was hosted by Survey Monkey, which provides data formatting compatible with analysis programs such as SPSS. Participants were recruited through a range of
techniques including paid advertising and promotion in support groups and services, Facebook posts, e-lists, and media interviews.

Participants ranged in age from 16-85+, and 4% were Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander. They came from all states of Australia in proportion to the broader population, a fifth currently lived internationally. Overall, 52% of the participants were allocated a female sex at birth, 41% male, 2% X, 2% unsure and 4% another option. Whilst most identified as female or male now, a smaller portion now identified as male compared to the portion assigned male at birth; and a greater portion now used X or another option. Participants mostly lived in stable situations with loved ones. Some (27%) had disabilities. For this paper, I will explore the quantitative and qualitative data on family dynamics and family and professional relationships to understand how this impacted school safety.

Findings

Secrecy and Tension

Most of the 272 participants learned of their variations aged under 18yrs (64%), a third as adults, and a small number of individuals were still learning about their variations at the time of the survey. The survey asked participants to share how they found out (from whom, why and how) in a short-answer response. The largest portion of responses (87 responses) involved a participant being told about their intersex variation/s by one or more parent/s, most commonly just their mother (39 responses) or both parents (37 responses); less commonly just their father (11 responses). These discussions usually occurred at the home or in the car, and were often stimulated in relation to appointments at the doctor’s or a hospital (such as before, after, or because the participant asked a question about these appointments). Typically, they involved a tense conversation, inadequate information and little follow-up.

Because of the largely congenital nature of intersex variations, the survey investigated the participants’ knowledge of whether their variations or similar had been experienced by others in their family backgrounds. Overall, the largest portion of participants (48%) knew they did not have a relative who shared their variation/s or similar. In addition, a group of 30% were unsure whether any of their relatives shared their variation/s, 22% knew they did. The participants in this latter group usually had more than one relative with their variation/s – including siblings (10%), parents (6%), parents’ siblings (6%), grandparents (2%) and/or another biological relative (8%). Inter-family secrecy around whether or not relatives had variations and how they experienced them if they did, was a strong theme that emerged in the qualitative data from the majority of participants (including both those who were unsure whether their relatives shared their variation/s and those who knew that they did). A comment typical of most responses from those who were unsure when asked about the incidence of their variation/s in their family backgrounds, was that an individual had ‘no idea’ if any variation/s had been expressed in their families. There were also instances where a participant who had selected ‘Unsure’ strongly suspected a specific family member shared their variation/s, but this could not be verified. Sometimes a participant’s parent or grandparent suspected that a much older relative may have had their variation, but these family members had passed away long before medical methods of diagnosis were even possible.

Those who did know relatives with their variation/s often found out too late to discuss their experiences, or struggled to share information given an established context of silence. For example, one participant with PCOS/ Hyperandrogenism experienced strong facial and bodily hair, infertility and a variety of features which she learned a relative had also experienced before dying of related complications. Another reported there was an atmosphere of tension around her chromosomal variation and she explained that it prevented her finding out if there were others in her family background with the same chromosomes, as there was simply no way she
could ever even ask them if they shared her difference. There were participants with CAIS who had siblings, Aunts, parents and grandparents who either had CAIS too or carried the gene. One participant noted that whilst they assumed this pattern continued back throughout their ancestral line, they could never know for sure as nearly all the people in their family and in their medical communities had been extremely secretive.

**Figure 1: Participants who had relatives who shared their variation/s or similar (n=250).**

![Figure 1: Participants who had relatives who shared their variation/s or similar (n=250).](image)

**Puberty and Pressure**

People with intersex variations were asked if they had experienced any counselling, training, or pressure to act in a more feminine or more masculine manner from any one in their life. Of the 211 participants who responded, 44% of the group reported experiencing this counselling/training/pressure from institutional practitioners (doctors, psychologists etc.), and 43% from parents. In total 103 comments on these experiences were provided by respondents; 44 focussed on counselling/pressures to be feminine, 28 on counselling/pressures to be masculine and the remainder on a range of other smaller themes most notably including the pressure to mature. The comments that focussed on femininity often discussed clinical or familial pressure towards becoming a ‘normal woman’; often conceptualised within the comments as pressure to wear dresses and long hair, remove any bodily or facial hair, play with girls, learn and do domestic duties and hobbies, become physically capable of penetrative sex, and marry a man, for example.

The comments that focussed on counselling/pressure to act in a more feminine or more masculine manner often discussed pressure to be strong, to go to the gym or build muscle, to be unemotional, to avoid clothing or behaviours seen as feminine, to engage in HRT or ‘corrective’ work on genitalia, to fit fathers’ or other males’ conceptualisations of maleness. Unfortunately, a few individuals reported being hit by a parent within contexts of being shamed for perceived femininity or encouraged to increase their masculinity/strength. The comments that focussed on counselling/pressures to be more mature discussed the pressure to ‘grow up’, to engage in adolescent or adult interests and activities and forego those considered ‘childish’, and to engage in or show interest in dating.

There were several participants who discussed this pressure which particularly came from parents and family members, including people with Kallman’s and Turner’s Syndromes which may impact puberty and development. Individuals were called a late bloomer, a late developer, short, childish, immature, scared, unlike the other boys/ girls and other labels. Participants felt keenly any parental disappointment in their inability to physically mature.
Support and Safety

Participants in the study were asked about who knew about their variation in their lives. The participants’ doctors, family and classmates were most likely to have been told (see Figure 2). Fewer participants had told school staff including teachers (43%) and principals (27%) for example. Asked how key people in their lives treated them regarding their intersex variations; participant responses showed that people at school were the least likely to be supportive and most likely to be unsupportive (particularly principals, classmates and teachers, see Figure 3). Participants were asked whether any of their schooling (primary/secondary) offered or provided links to counselling that affirmed people with an intersex variation. Overwhelmingly (for 95% of the 178 participants who answered this question), the response was ‘no’.

Figure 2: Percentage of participants who had key people in their lives know about their intersex variations.

Figure 3: Responses participants experienced from key people in their lives about their intersex variations.
Of the 178 participants who responded to a question about their overall rating of their education/school service experiences in general, approx. a third (34%) of people with intersex variations rated their overall experiences with education/school services negatively, and a smaller portion (24%) rated them positively (see Figure 4). Participants offered 102 comments about their school experiences overall. In total, 77 of the participants made comments about being bullied, ranging from daily to occasional incidents. The bullying ranged from occasional rude questions which the participant tried to dismiss or could distract themselves from with study or engagement in sports, through to regular insults (like dyke or boy-girl) or physical violence requiring staff or family interventions, which participants sometimes reported as linked to negative wellbeing outcomes such as dropping out or engaging in suicidal ideation. Perpetrators were mainly students and occasionally staff. Sometimes the bullying was directly on the basis of a known variation, more often it was on the basis of unusual traits (such as tallness or shortness, lack of energy, lack of development, learning disorders or various sex characteristics) or engagement in treatments (and subsequent time off school) related to participants’ particular variations or treatment plans. Secondly, 14 participants made comments about their variation not being known at school (on family advice or their own plan), and thirdly, 11 participants made comments about good experiences they had including the ability to be open, social support, a lack of discrimination, and teachers encouraging the students to do further projects on their variation (such as a film in one case, written project and web research). The latter comments mainly referred to university or TAFE environments rather than schools.

**Discussion and Conclusion**

Whilst most people find out about their intersex variation aged under 18, there is a lack of information from families and medical or counselling services for people with intersex variations, which can be hard to overcome in a world where internet restrictions and age-restrictions on certain information from communal sources (particularly around genitalia and the sort of topics relevant here) prevent youth researching their diagnoses alone safely. The potential tensions in families for people with intersex variations around individual and familial secrecy, and familial and medical pressure around fitting in to set expectations of one of two (feminine or masculine) gendered and age-appropriately ‘matured’ identities, exacerbate these issues in ways which make family and medical settings less ideal sites for information dissemination about variations.

The statistical limits on disclosures at school and the potential for bullying provide additional safety-related reasons why people with intersex variations cannot rely on individual information dissemination methods at school requiring their own initial disclosure of their variations as a prompt for information access. To aid people with intersex variations and for the contribution it
would make to students’ general knowledge about physical sex, it would be most logical and safe to generally disseminate information about intersex variations within a context of information about sexed bodies in school. Relevant subjects may include science, PDHPE or puberty education. Sending home information about body variations and puberty experiences may also help families to understand – in the cases where their child experiences variations or attends school with those experiencing them – the need to de-stigmatise difference. This could contribute to creating safer spaces for such children in the home, school and elsewhere.
References


Netnographic research of online communities and culture

Stephanie T. Jong
Flinders University, South Australia

Abstract
This paper explores the use of netnography, an online adaptation of the method ethnography, in a study of online fitness culture on social networking sites (SNSs). For many millions of people around the world, the Internet has become an essential communication and information medium, mediated by SNSs, specialised networks, and eMail. The combination of text and images in these communications presents new opportunities for research that can potentially offer a deep investigation of participant behaviour in online cultures and communities. It is through these computer mediated communications where community and culture are (re)produced/adapted. In the provision of a common set of methodological procedures and protocols, netnography contributes to the debate of researching online populations, transitioning traditional techniques of cultural anthropology to an online setting, and innovation in appropriate settings. This paper outlines the guidelines of netnography. Furthermore, it will discusses opportunities, and challenges in exploring online cultures and communities with reflections from a netnographic researcher of online fitness culture.

Keywords: Netnography, online culture, online communities, qualitative research

Introduction
Given the wide-ranging interest in academic publication output, researchers are increasingly using the Internet as a research medium for data collection. A number of methodological tools have been adapted from traditional methods to research an online setting. Netnography is one adaptation that has emerged from the research method ethnography. Netnography draws upon computer-mediated communications or network-based data (i.e. textual and visual) to arrive at an ethnographic understanding of a social or cultural phenomenon (Kozinets 2010).

Online fitness communities are a social and cultural phenomenon that have transitioned to the online platform of SNSs. These communities include general health and fitness, bodybuilding, and wellbeing and healthy living. Although their goals may be diverse, specific, attention is given to diet and food, inspiration, exercising, the body and body weight, and representations of fit bodies (Andreasson & Johansson 2013a, 2013c; Smith & Stewart 2012). Previous research
about online fitness communities has investigated the hash-tag fitspiration (an amalgamation of the words ‘fitness’ and ‘inspiration’) used within online fitness communities, the effect of fitspiration tagged images (Boepple, Ata, Rum, & Thompson 2016; Tiggemann & Zaccardo 2015), body perceptions in a bodybuilding community (Smith & Stewart 2012), and gender and the body in the ‘blogosphere’ (Andreasson & Johansson 2013b, 2013c). Despite this, few studies have explored fitness culture on SNSs, and more specifically, young females’ experiences and expressions of online fitness culture.

This paper explores the netnographic process underpinning a research project of online fitness communities. Furthermore, it will discuss opportunities, and challenges in exploring online cultures and communities with reflections from the project.

**Netnography**

Kozinets describes netnography as primarily concerned with online communication as a source of data to form an understanding of a cultural phenomenon (1997, 2002, 2010, 2015). It adapts common participant-observation ethnographic procedures to an online context where social interaction takes place. Like ethnography, netnography is natural, immersive, descriptive, multi-method, and adaptable (Kozinets 2010). Through immersive cultural participation and observation, netnography offers researchers the opportunity to focus on new areas of social life (Nind et al. 2012), and to explore how communities and cultures are produced through computer-mediated communications (Kozinets 1998). It is a means of researching online communities in the same manner that anthropologists seek to understand the cultures, norms and practices of face-to-face communities, by observing, and/or participating in communications on publically available online forums (Nelson & Otnes 2005; Sandlin 2007).

There has been a growing use of netnography by researchers from diverse fields (1,300 results in a systematic search of Google Scholar conducted by Bengry-Howell et al. 2011). Three recent netnographies have been conducted in the field of sport and fitness, relevant to the study of online fitness (see Andreasson & Johansson 2016; Kavanagh, Jones, & Sheppard-Marks 2016; Smith & Stewart 2012). Several other studies have been conducted on online communities using similar methods termed under a plethora of labels: ‘virtual ethnography’ (Hine 2008), ‘online ethnography’ (Crowe & Bradford 2006; Crowe & Watts 2014), ‘digital ethnography’, ‘webnography’, ‘network ethnography’ and ‘cyber ethnography’ (Grbich 2007). Aspects of these online research methods underpinned the research process for the study (for example, the work of Beneito-Montagut 2011; Chapman & Lahav 2008; Fortun et al. 2014; Gallagher, Wessels, & Ntelioglou 2013; Paccagnella, 2012; Postill & Pink 2012; Underberg & Zorn 2013). For example, Postill and Pink’s (2012) social media ethnography played an influential role in helping the researcher understand online interactions (e.g. ‘weak ties’), and the idea of media mixing in order to maintain social relationships with potential participants across SNSs.

Key strengths of these online methods are the ability to conduct ‘fieldwork’ from researcher offices (Hine 2000), the ‘ease’ and ‘cost’ of data collection, the ability to connect with geographically dispersed online community groups, and the ease of collecting various types of data (Kozinets 2010). They provide understanding of the online world, interaction styles, and lived experiences of online users (Kozinets 2015).

While online ethnographic methods are burgeoning in the field, some discrepancies still remain across the specific methodological practices employed by researchers. In providing a common set of procedures and protocols, netnography offers stability, consistency, legitimacy and the ability to aggregate other netnographic research (Kozinets, 2010).

---

1 The PhD research commenced in 2013, however, digital ethnography is currently flourishing in the field, and one important, recent publication is (Pink et al. 2016).
The netnographic process

Kozinets’ (2010) netnography offers a rigorous set of guidelines including: research planning, entrée, data collection, interpretation/analysis, and research representation. Underpinning these steps is the capacity to ensure ethical standards. Adapting Kozinets’ (2010:61) simplified flow of a netnographic research project, a neat representation of the netnographic process is depicted in Figure 1 below:

**Figure 1: An adapted simplified flow of a netnographic research project**

The study: Online Fitness culture

Adhering to the Kozinets’ guidelines, the researcher conducted a netnography to explore the experiences and expressions of online fitness culture with young females aged 18 to 24 on Facebook and Instagram. In selecting netnography as a method fit for the study, it aimed to establish a boundary of thinking about online fitness communities and culture through the observation of photographs, videos, comments and general interactions on Facebook and Instagram.

---

2 After the completion of the study, Kozinets (2015) expanded on the original steps of netnography from five to 12: introspection, investigation, information, interview, inspection, interaction, immersion, indexing, interpretation, iteration, instantiation and integration. The steps include additions and explicit descriptions; however, the new steps primarily subdivide the previous five phases. Notably, there is a greater emphasis on narrowing the community group of interest, and the use of an interactive researcher website to add insight to netnography (an additional source), and to surmount some ethical dilemmas with researchers as active participants (Kozinets 2015).
Following a year of observation of online fitness communities, and ethical approval, the researcher created Facebook and Instagram alias researcher accounts in order to have full access to the SNSs to conduct the netnography without the use of a personal profile, a method suited to netnography (Kozinets 2010). The process followed Lamb’s (2011) recommendations from an online research project based in the United Kingdom. The study included both archival data and field note data. Hashtags were utilised to obtain data pertaining to popular fitness trends, for example, ‘#fitspiration’. Textual and visual data was captured through NVivo for Facebook, and Microsoft Excel and Evernote for Instagram. All other relevant data were recorded in a Microsoft Excel spreadsheet. Thematic content analysis was selected to analyse the data following Braun and Clarke’s six-step analysis model (2006).

Opportunities in exploring online cultures and communities

Netnography provides three main opportunities in research: (1) opportunity in researching communities that may not exist without the Internet, (2) developed understanding of online culture and meaning making processes, and (3) collecting data using an unobtrusive method to explore sensitive issues.

(1) Opportunity in researching communities that may not exist without the Internet

Nind et al. (2012) claim that netnography offers researchers the opportunity to focus on new areas of social life. According to Kozinets (2002), the Internet provides opportunities for participation in social groups that are united around the achievement of particular lifestyle goals and characteristics.

Importantly, netnography is appropriate to those communities that would not exist without the Internet. Online communities are considered no less ‘real’ than their physical counterparts, leading to consequential behavioural effects (Kozinets 2015). The use of netnography in researching these online communities broadly allows researchers to examine human society and social relationships online, as well as providing an insight into people’s online behaviour, and an understanding of how people negotiate their Internet activity. Beneito-Montagut (2011) affirms that netnography is particularly relevant for understanding new forms of human interaction and how people create and maintain personal relationships online.

(2) Developed understanding of online culture and meaning making processes

Culture and community are at the centre of netnography. Following anthropological and sociological contested and shifting notions, the term ‘culture’ is referred to as ‘commonly held beliefs, norms, values and ways of doing things’ (Wagner 2001:121) shared by a population, in a particular place at a particular point in time (Jackson 1998). Culture is understood as a world of shared social meanings (Hall 1996) and values (Wagner 2008), created by interacting individuals, where there is a ‘momentary construction of common ground’ (Amit & Rapport 2002:11). It is vital to understand that these concepts are fluid ‘worlds of meaning’ (Kozinets 2015). Netnography has the potential to gather first-hand naturalistic data from computer-mediated communication in exploring how culture and community are adopted, understanding worlds of meaning. Through the researcher becoming a participant online within a specific culture or community, not only do they see worlds of meaning created by interacting individuals, but they are also offered the insight to understand their meaningfulness, and continuance. Netnography offers the ability for the researcher to become involved in online communities, in order to provide a ‘thick description’ of people’s worlds (Langer & Beckman 2005:192). It is through the interactive nature of netnography that researchers can begin to understand the online world, interaction styles relative to the exchange of meaning, and lived experiences of online users (Kozinets 2015).
Specifically, linking to the study of online fitness communities, netnography allowed the researcher to come to terms with new interactions, understanding rituals and norms from within the created culture, and to note the transition from fitness culture to an online platform. Through fieldnoting, the researcher documented people’s online behaviour within the community, as well as language used, and the meanings given to some of the new neologisms. It was through participation within the community that the researcher was also able to note developed social hierarchies, for example, through large follower bases, and through popularity in posts (shown through a thumbs up button on text or an image).

(3) Collecting data using an unobtrusive method to explore sensitive issues
The use of netnography offers the opportunity to explore sensitive topics within online communities that may be difficult to access by more traditional means. Netnography offers researchers a potentially less obtrusive method to research sensitive topics compared to other methods of social investigation (Isupova 2011). For example, research in pro-ana (short for anorexia) online communities has gained traction through using netnography (Brotsky & Giles 2007; Crowe & Watts 2014), as well as cosmetic surgery (Langer & Beckman, 2005), sex and porn on the Internet (Jacobs 2010), and male bodybuilding (Smith & Stewart 2012).

Considerations and challenges of netnography:
Whilst the development of online communities and cultures brings innovation through the adaptation of method techniques, such adaptations also bring potential methodological challenges. Reflecting on previous research and the current researcher’s netnography, three main issues arose: (1) lack of face- to-face interaction, (2) size of data set, and (3) ethical justification.

(1) Lack of face-to-face interaction
Lack of face-to-face interaction is a common objection to online research (Beaulieu 2004; Liamputtong 2013). Some researchers suggest that the online environment, where the data is represented as ‘text-only’, reduces social cues such as expression, emphasis and movement (Mann & Stewart 2000). This limitation is also apparent in offline research pertaining purely to text.

The challenges created by a lack of face-to-face interaction are refined by Kozinets (2010) who argues that where the research focus and questions are specific to online content, a netnographic approach is sufficient. Furthermore, these limitations can be somewhat ameliorated by a blended netnography where the data collection methods connect online and offline research in a systematic manner (Kozinets 2002). Kozinets (2015) strongly advocates the inclusion of an interview stage within the new 12 phases of research. In using a blended netnography, including interviews with online fitness participants, the study offered a deeper understanding of the culture.

(2) Size of data set
Paechter (2012) described potential size of the data set as a methodological challenge faced by researchers concerned with studies of online communities. At the commencement of the current study, the category of ‘online fitness culture’ was broad and difficult to define. This lack of specificity made the size of data collection difficult. Searching hash-tags and key word searches also proved difficult with a high abundance of data available. Each page and profile that was visited created new avenues within the fitness community to look at, enlarging the data set. As a consequence of this large dataset, the process of data analysis can be extremely time-consuming (Kozinets 2010), calling for the use and literacy of Computer Assisted Qualitative Data Analysis in order to manage, tag, name, sort and classify the abundance of data.
(3) Ethical justification

SNSs are proving to be an ‘ethically’ problematic field for researchers in the collection and confidentiality of data and deceptive undercurrent in the method. However, ethical guidelines have not yet been fully developed for research of online social interaction. Some emerging literature is beginning to provide useful insights (James & Busher 2015; Zimmer 2010). Previous research has emphasised ethical concerns of privacy, confidentiality, respectful representation, protection and safety and falsification of research data (Association of Internet Researchers Ethics Working Group 2012). Although ethics laws and policies developed in the context of offline research apply to online investigations, questions about the need for and means of obtaining informed consent, anonymity, and the conceptualisation of public versus private information pose certain problems for conducting netnographic research.

The debate over who owns the data posted to public forums is also important when referring to an online setting, as well as the distinction between public and private spaces. On the Internet or SNSs, the lines between what is private and what is public are blurred, and ownership of data is contentious (Henderson et al. 2013). Some researchers have concluded that data that can be accessed without site membership can be considered in the public domain (Attard & Coulson 2012; Whitehead 2010). Although Facebook and Instagram require membership to access some accounts, most accounts are still searchable via the Internet (e.g. a Google search). It must also be recognized that SNSs also maintain part ownership of images posted by their users (see Facebook 2014). However, ethics for accessing comments on SNSs has been granted for other research on SNS data in a public space (see Attard & Coulson 2012; Barnes et al. 2015).

The researcher approached ethical approval from the Flinders University SBREC following the four principles from the National Statement on Ethical Conduct: respect for human beings, research merit and integrity, justice, and beneficence (National Health and Medical Research Council, Australian Research Council, & Australian Vice-Chancellors’ Committee, 2007 updated May 2015). Ethics approval was granted for the project by following the procedures outlined by the University Ethics Committee.

Conclusion

The aim of this paper was to provide an overview of the guidelines of netnography, and to reflect on the study of online fitness culture and communities in order to raise a number of opportunities, and considerations for future netnographers. In the provision of a common set of methodological procedures and protocols Kozinets (2015) offers researchers new to researching in the online environment a clear and prescribed method, allowing aggregation of netnographic knowledge in different online cultures and communities.

Netnography creates opportunities in researching communities that may not exist without the Internet, allows for the development of an understanding of online culture and meaning making processes, as well as providing an unobtrusive method to explore sensitive issues. Reflecting on the current study, the researcher was able to utilise these opportunities to participate in a community that has adapted to an online platform. It is through the use of this method that experiences of participants within the communities themselves had the opportunity for their voices to be heard. Netnography also allowed the researcher to have an in-depth understanding of the rituals, norms, meanings, neologisms, language, and behaviours that are produced through the community. Collectively, the application and blend of netnography with other methods will improve the quality of insight in this online area of social life.

Within the study netnography also brought methodological challenges. Retrospectively, refinement of the research process, including narrowing the ‘field site’ to one online fitness community would have limited the data set, and provided a more narrow data collection ‘space’.
It is vital to continue to invest in netnography and online research methods in the field of digital sociology. SNSs offer one area that is yet to be completely explored by researchers as a rich source of qualitative data. Qualitative research methods such as digital ethnography (Pink et al. 2016), as well as netnography (Kozinets 2015), provide valuable tools for understanding constructed online spaces.
References


of intercultural wedding message boards. *Journal of Business Research, 58*(1), 89-95. doi: 10.1016/s0148-2963(02)00477-0


The framing of federal domestic violence policy responses

Georgia Keam
RMIT University

Kay Cook
School of Global, Urban and Social Studies, RMIT University

Abstract
This paper analyzed the Australian Government’s response to the 2010 Report on Family Violence produced by Australian Law Reform Commission (ALRC) which, at the time, represented one of the most significant documents framing the problem of domestic violence in Australia (Bacchi 2009). By focusing on two specific sites of purported ‘policy reform’ in response to the Commission report, Bacchi’s (2009) problematisation framework revealed how the Government framed their action and inaction on the issue of domestic violence. An examination of how the social problem of domestic violence was residualised (Jamrozik & Nocella 1998) found that the Government framed their response to the recommendations as behavioural and technical concerns amenable to educational and administrative solutions. Consequently the aim of the report to improve the safety of victims has not been achieved.

Keywords: domestic violence; family violence; gender; policy analysis; problem framing

Introduction
This paper analyzes the Australian Government’s response to the 2010 Report on Family Violence produced by Australian Law Reform Commission (ALRC) which, at the time, represented one of the most significant documents framing the problem of domestic violence in Australia (Bacchi 2009). By focusing on two specific sites of purported ‘policy reform’ in response to the Commission report, we examine how the social problem of domestic violence was residualised (Jamrozik & Nocella 1998) into behavioural and technical concerns amenable to educational and administrative solutions.

Former Prime Minister Kevin Rudd (2008: 1) commissioned the ALRC report in 2008 in order to reset the political agenda on domestic violence, contending “as a nation, the time has well and truly come to have a national conversation – a public national conversation, not a private one – about how it could still be the case that in 2008 so many Australian women could have experienced violence... It is my gender – it is our gender – Australian men – that are responsible. And so the question is: what are we going to do about it?”. A response to the ALRC
Report was prepared by then Prime Minister Julia Gillard in 2013. The ALRC Report has not been addressed at a federal level since the Gillard Government left office in 2013. The following analysis examines how the framing of the problem of domestic violence within the Report and subsequent Response shaped its utility and the possibility of it ‘resetting the political agenda’.

Methodology
The ALRC Report contained 187 recommendations, however, in order to achieve a rigorous analysis within the limits of the paper, a small number of recommendations were purposively selected for analysis. To focus on federal government responses, of the 187 recommendations, 56 were “identified as appropriate for the Commonwealth to respond to separately, independent to the responses of the states and territories” (Australian Government 2013: 1). These 56 recommendations became the focus of thematic analysis, through which 12 solitary recommendations focused on niche issues or responses were excluded (as outlined in Figure 1).

This resulted in 44 thematically focused recommendations analysed in depth. These 44 recommendations (see Appendix 1) were then subject to Bacchi’s (2009) analytical techniques to examine problem framing and the trajectory of subsequent government responses, which included an analysis of the 2013 Australian Government Response document, Hansard transcripts and statements by relevant Ministers. Our analysis is presented in two thematic sections; first focusing on recommended changes to the Family Law Act 1975, followed by the AVERT and DOORS education and training programs.

Reforming the Family Law Act 1975
In the ALRC Report, 33 federal-level recommendations were specific to the Family Law Act 1975 (hereafter referred to as ‘the Act’). Of these recommendations, the Government agreed with three, which were subsequently implemented (Table 1).

Fulfilled Recommendations
The fulfilled ALRC recommendations were Recommendations 6-4, 171-1 and 17-6., which called for: a widening of the definition of Family Violence in the Act; a widening of evidence available
for courts to consider in parental custody arrangements; and repealing Section 114(2) in the Act that allows courts to order a person in a marriage to perform their conjugal rights, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Breakdown of Reform of the Family Law Act 1975 Recommendations:</th>
<th>Total out of 33 selected for analysis</th>
<th>Individual Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commonwealth Specific Recommendations about the Family Law Act Recommendations that were Fulfilled</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6-4, 17-1, 17-6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The Response document noted that Recommendation 6-4 had been implemented to “better capture harmful behavior” which was necessary so that the Act was “clearly setting out what behavior is unacceptable” (Australian Government 2013: 3). According to the government (2013: 3), the widening of the definition of family violence illustrates that Australia “takes the issue of addressing and responding to family violence and the safety of children very seriously”. The new definition supports the government’s assertion that they placed an increased emphasis on family violence within the Act, where the definition of family violence was not only broadened but also moved from the interpretation section of the Act into its own section, 4AB. The government’s (2013: 3) purported rationale for this decision was that the definition’s more prominent position would “improve the understanding of what family violence and abuse are”. Applying Bacchi’s (2009) problematisation framework reveals that the government framed the Family Law Act 1975 as lacking clarity on what constitutes family violence, and this lack of clarity would be detrimental to the safety of women and children. This framing is in line with the government’s goal to make the Act more effective when handling domestic violence cases.

The Gillard government’s response to Recommendation 17-1 was that the courts should have as much information as possible to determine what is in the child’s best interests, and that they had already implemented this recommendation in 2011 legislative changes (Australian Government 2013: 7). The then Minister for the Status of Women, Kate Ellis justified the 2011 legislative changes, contending that “the amendments in this bill will make it easier for the court and other decision makers to inform themselves about family violence when determining matters under the Family Law Act…. We know that this violence does exist. We need to make sure that the court is in a position to receive and weigh evidence on it” (Parliament of Australia 2011: 4804).

While recommendations 6-4 and 17-1 were implemented in 2011 amendments, recommendation 17-6 was fulfilled in a 2014 amendment. Recommendation 17-6 called to repeal Section 114(2) in the Act that allows courts to order a person in a marriage to perform their conjugal rights. The Gillard Government (2013: 9) noted that the idea that the law gave a husband irrevocable consent from his wife is “no longer consistent with the societal values...
of Australians”. Underlying this reform is the assumption that changing societal attitudes warranted the reform. Notably, by declaring male legal entitlement to women unacceptable, the government touched upon the argument that patriarchal society was also coming to be regarded as unacceptable. However, the argument that the root cause of domestic violence can be in part attributed to a mindset of entitlement that society reinforces in men is a silence both with respect to this recommendation and the government’s ALRC Response. For example, the fact that “one in three Australian women have experience physical violence since the age of 15, and almost one in five have experience sexual violence” could also have been framed as related to a male mindset of power and control (Australian Government 2010: 1), but such connections were not made. While domestic violence is a gendered issue, the government did not embed such an understanding of domestic violence in the Family Law Act 1975.

The fulfillment of these recommendations illustrate that the government made small changes to highlight the importance of domestic violence awareness and remove legislation that references male entitlement to women’s bodies. While the implementation of these recommendations is positive, by not challenging the current patriarchal power structure, they are unlikely to have impact on the incidence of family violence in Australia. At the same time, the government deemed another 30 recommended changes to the Act as unsuitable for implementation.

Unfulfilled Recommendations

The Government did not fulfill 30 of the 33 level recommendations relating to the Act. Twenty-six of the recommendations called for federal criminal legislation involving sexual assault, sexual abuse, age of consent and rape as well as call for further education for those involved in all levels of the family law system in regards to these types of abuse. All twenty-six of these recommendations were given identical responses by the Gillard Government: “Commonwealth criminal law does not contain family violence or general sexual assault offences” (Australian Government 2013: 18).

Two recommendations called for federal provisions for injunctions for personal protection and breaches to be made a criminal offence within the Act. However the government (2013: 8) responded that state and territory courts already provided a “simple, quick and low cost” service and consequently asserted the appropriate avenue for this injunction already exists. A notable silence within the government’s responses is that state and territory laws differ and the legislation in one state may not exist in another. By making personal injunctions available federally would also have streamlined the process for victims who are already using the Family Court of Australia rather than have multiple proceeding occurring in multiple courts which can create unnecessary emotional & monetary strains on family violence victims (Astor & Croucher 2010).

Recommendation 7-3 was one of the most vigorously opposed Recommendations; and one that was opposed on a number of grounds. This recommendation sought to detail the reality of domestic violence in Australia within the Act, including that it is “while anyone may be a victim of family violence, or may use family violence, it is predominately committed by men” and “can involve exploitation of power” (Australian Law Reform Commission 2010: 19).

In their response, the government (2013: 4) stated that the Act should remain “gender neutral”, framing a gendered understanding of domestic violence as unsuitable for inclusion in the Act for two reasons: First, that a gendered understanding of the dynamics of family violence had already been covered in the Best Practice Principles for Use in Parenting Disputes When Family Violence or Abuse is Alleged, a tool that provides “useful background information for decision makers, legal practitioners and individuals involved in these [family violence] cases” (Family Court of Australia et al 2012: 2). Here, the government’s response frames the solution as the education of the legal system after an instance of family violence instead of using the law foster cultural change in order to prevent gendered family violence. Second, the government (2013: 4) responded to
recommendation 7-3 was with the statement that the Act should remain focused on the “best interests of the child”. In doing so, the government implied that acknowledging the gendered nature of domestic violence would detract from the Act’s 'first' priority to ensure that the best interests of the child are met.

Recommendation 16-4 urged that Section 60CG of the Act be amended to state when arranging a parenting order, primary consideration should be given to protection of people “over all other factors that are relevant to determining the best interests of the child” so that a parenting order does not expose a person to the risk of family violence (Australian Law Reform Commission 2010: 28). The government responded to recommendation 16-4 by agreeing with it in principle but would not implement it, contending that the existing legislation was already adequate in protecting both victims and children from future domestic violence incidents.

The critical difference between the existing legislation and the recommendation is that the ALRC recommendation wanted the protection of the victims to have “primary consideration” when determining what parenting orders, while the government (2013: 6) contended that “the best interests of the child [remain] as the paramount consideration”. As has been reported elsewhere (Cook et al 2015), the current legislation, however, may put victims, most commonly mothers, at risk as a result of the facilitation of the child’s relationship with the abuser.

As this analysis demonstrated, there were only minor legislative changes made to the Act on the recommendation of the ALRC. These changes, while demonstrating some commitment to helping domestic violence victims using the family law system, had only a minimal impact. The government avoided addressing the gendered nature of domestic violence and making major changes to the Act. The analysis demonstrates that the Australian Government refused to intervene in or give any opportunity to discuss the underlying patriarchal power relation contributing to the domestic violence epidemic in Australia today.

The Development of AVERT & DOORS
There were 12 recommendations from the ALRC 2010 Report into Family Violence that the Australian Government contends it has fulfilled though the development of the AVERT and DOORS family law education and training programs (Table 2). In doing so, the government (2013: 2) framed the development of AVERT and DOORS as the key achievements to come from the ALRC Report, highlighting that they have improved “the capacity of the federal family law system to respond to family violence”.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Breakdown of AVERT and DOORS Recommendations</th>
<th>Total out of 12 selected for analysis</th>
<th>Individual Recommendations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Commonwealth Specific Recommendations about AVERT and DOORS that were Fulfilled</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>21-2, 21-3, 21-5, 22-2, 22-3, 22-5, 23-6, 23-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commonwealth Specific Recommendations that were problematically fulfilled</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7-3, 21-1, 21-4, 29-3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

TABLE 2: AVERT AND DOORS RECOMMENDATIONS
What is problematic about this response from the government is that alongside the minor changes made to the Act, AVERT and DOORS are the only interventions the federal government made to the family law system.

AVERT is “a multidisciplinary training package known as AVERT-Addressing Violence: Education, Resources, Training; Family Law System Collaborative Response to Family Violence” developed. The Detection of Overall Risk Screens (DOORS) tool is “a standardized common screening and risk assessment framework and tool” to be used “across the family law system (Australian Government 2013: 2). AVERT is intended for use “by practitioners, judicial officers, counselors and other professionals working in the family law system, to improve levels of understanding about the dynamics of family violence and the handling of domestic cases” (Australian Government 2013: 15), whereas DOORS is flexible enough to meet the needs of “different professionals, locations and client demographics” (Australian Government 2013: 11). The implementation of these two programs is meant to result in less victims slipping through the cracks of the fractured legal system and an improvement in victims experience in the family law system.

Since the development of AVERT by the Attorney General’s Department and DOORS by Relationships Australia South Australia there have been no evaluations, reviews or funding reports of AVERT or DOORS undertaken. How successful these programs have been is unknown. However, both AVERT and DOORS are technical solutions to the social problem of domestic violence that is framed as best addressed post hoc by a better-informed family law system (Jamrozik & Nocella 1998).

According to Jamrozik and Nocella’s (1998: 4) theory of residual conversion, the way issues are operationalized into technical problems results in the solution being targeted to “individual cases” which are “the ‘private problems’ of the affected population” and not addressed as “social problems that are the outcomes of much wider societal arrangements”. The development of AVERT and DOORS to educate and train those working in the family law system is a technical solution because it is based on individual participation in two programs after incidences of domestic violence have occurred. These technical solutions works to educate the family law practitioner who then educates the family violence victim about their legal options. Jamrozik and Nocella describe this process as a “dual conversion”, that is, “conversion of a collective problem into a individualized, personal problem; and conversion of the now-personal problem into a form of pathology that fits into the framework of the professional’s intervention method” (1998: 49), in this case, by the family violence victims choosing more effective legal options. Though the changes made to the Act, described above, are in Jamrozik and Nocella’s theory reflective of structural change, analysis in the previous section also demonstrates that the changes were minor and do not make any significant changes to the Act 1975 to address the social problem of the gendered nature of family violence.

Conclusion
In 2010, the ALRC released Report 114 on Family Violence with 187 recommendations on how to reform the family law system to improve the safety of victims of family violence. Here, we analyzed how the government responded to the Commonwealth-specific recommendations. Bacchi’s (2009) problematisation framework reveals how the Government framed their action and inaction on the issue of domestic violence. While some recommendations were fulfilled, the majority were not and consequently the aim of the ALRC Report to improve the safety of victims has not been achieved. Using the conceptual lens of the residual conversion of social problems (Jamrozik & Nocella 1998), analysis found that the minor amount of recommendations that were implemented were also only technical solutions to the domestic violence epidemic in Australia.
This research has demonstrated when undertaking policy research into the actions of Government it is essential to first understand how Governments are framing issues and defining the parameters of the problem. The findings have highlighted the need for further research into how acknowledging and challenging the male patriarchy of society can lead to stronger domestic violence policy, rather than the development of technical solutions.
References


Australian Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) (No.53)


Parliament of Australia 2011, Parliamentary Debates, Family Law Legislation Amendment (Family Violence and Other Measures) Bill 2011 Second Reading, viewed August 1 2015, http://parlinfo.aph.gov.au/parlInfo/search/display/display.w3p;db=CHAMBER;id=chamber%2Fhansard%2F89661273-1a1b-44f9-9a5c-d98a0d7d3125%2F0052;query=Id%3A%22chamber%2Fhansard%2F89661273-1a1b-44f9-9a5c-d98a0d7d3125%2F0058%22

Appendix 1:

Recommendations from the Reforming the Family Law Act 1975:

Fulfilled Recommendations

Recommendation 6–4 The Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) should adopt the same definition as recommended to be included in state and territory family violence legislation (Rec 5–1). That is, ‘family violence’ should be defined as violent or threatening behaviour, or any other form of behaviour, that coerces or controls a family member or causes that family member to be fearful. Such behaviour may include but is not limited to:

a. physical violence;
b. sexual assault and other sexually abusive behaviour;
c. economic abuse;
d. emotional or psychological abuse;
e. stalking;
f. kidnapping or deprivation of liberty;
g. damage to property, irrespective of whether the victim owns the property;
h. causing injury or death to an animal, irrespective of whether the victim owns the animal; and
i. behaviour by the person using violence that causes a child to be exposed to the effects of behaviour referred to in (a)–(h).

Recommendation 17–1 The ‘additional consideration’ in s60CC(3)(k) of the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), which directs courts to consider only final or contested protection orders when determining the best interests of a child, should be amended to provide that a court, when determining the best interests of the child, must consider evidence of family violence given, or findings made, in relevant family violence protection order proceedings.

Recommendation 17–6 Section 114(2) of the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth), which permits a court to make an order relieving a party to a marriage from any obligations to perform marital services or render conjugal rights, should be repealed.

Unfulfilled Recommendations:

Recommendation 7–3 The Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) should be amended to include a similar provision to that in Rec 7–2 explaining the nature, features and dynamics of family violence.

Recommendation 7–2 states:

State and territory family violence legislation should contain a provision that explains the nature, features and dynamics of family violence including: while anyone may be a victim of family violence, or may use family violence, it is predominantly committed by men; it can occur in all sectors of society; it can involve exploitation of power imbalances; its incidence is underreported; and it has a detrimental impact on children. In addition, family violence legislation should refer to the particular impact of family violence on: Indigenous persons; those from a culturally and linguistically diverse background; those from the gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgender and intersex communities; older persons; and people with disabilities.

Recommendation 16–4 Section 60CG of the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth)—which requires a court to ensure that a parenting order does not expose a person to an unacceptable risk of family violence and permits the court to include in the order any safeguards that it considers necessary for the safety of a person affected by the order—should be amended to provide that the court should
give primary consideration to the protection of that person over the other factors that are relevant to determining the best interests of the child.

**Recommendation 17–3** The Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) should be amended to provide separate provisions for injunctions for personal protection.

**Recommendation 17–4** The Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) should be amended to provide that a breach of an injunction for personal protection is a criminal offence.

**Recommendation 25–2** Federal, state and territory sexual offence provisions should provide a uniform age of consent for all sexual offences.

**Recommendation 25–4** Federal, state and territory sexual offence provisions should include a statutory definition of consent based on the concept of free and voluntary agreement.

**Recommendation 25–5** Federal, state and territory sexual offence provisions should set out a non-exhaustive list of circumstances that may vitiate consent including, at a minimum:

a. lack of capacity to consent, including because a person is asleep or unconscious, or so affected by alcohol or other drugs as to be unable to consent;

b. where a person submits because of force, or fear of force, against the complainant or another person;

c. where a person submits because of fear of harm of any type against the complainant or another person;

d. unlawful detention;

e. mistaken identity and mistakes as to the nature of the act (including mistakes generated by the fraud or deceit of the accused);

f. abuse of a position of authority or trust; and

g. intimidating or coercive conduct, or other threat, that does not necessarily involve a threat of force, against the complainant or another person.

**Recommendation 25–6** Federal, state and territory sexual assault provisions should provide that it is a defence to the charge of ‘rape’ that the accused held an honest and reasonable belief that the complainant was consenting to the sexual penetration.

**Recommendation 26–2** Commonwealth, state and territory Directors of Public Prosecution should ensure that prosecutorial guidelines and policies:

a. facilitate the referral of victims and witnesses of sexual assault to culturally appropriate welfare, health, counselling and other support services at the earliest opportunity;

b. require consultation with victims of sexual assault about key prosecutorial decisions, including whether to prosecute, discontinue a prosecution, or agree to a charge or fact bargain;

c. require the ongoing provision of information to victims of sexual assault about the status and progress of proceedings;

d. facilitate the provision of information and assistance to victims and witnesses of sexual assault in understanding the legal and court process;

e. facilitate the provision of information and assistance to victims and witnesses of sexual assault in relation to the protective provisions available to sexual assault complainants when giving evidence in criminal proceedings;

f. ensure that family violence protection orders or stalking intervention orders are sought in all relevant circumstances; and
g. require referral of victims and witnesses of sexual assault to providers of legal advice on related areas, such as family law, victims’ compensation and the sexual assault communications privilege.

Recommendation 26–3 Federal, state and territory governments and relevant educational, professional and service delivery bodies should ensure ongoing and consistent education and training for judicial officers, lawyers, prosecutors, police and victim support services in relation to the substantive law and the nature and dynamics of sexual assault as a form of family violence, including its social and cultural contexts.

Recommendation 26–5 Federal, state and territory legislation should:

a. establish a presumption that, when two or more charges for sexual offences are joined in the same indictment, those charges are to be tried together; and

b. state that this presumption is not rebutted merely because evidence on one charge is inadmissible on another charge.

Recommendation 26–6 Federal, state and territory legislation should permit the tendering of pre-recorded evidence of interview between a sexual assault complainant and investigators as the complainant’s evidence-in-chief. Such provisions should apply to all complainants of sexual assault, both adults and children.

Recommendation 26–7 Federal, state and territory legislation should permit child complainants of sexual assault and complainants of sexual assault who are vulnerable as a result of mental or physical impairment, to provide evidence recorded at a pre-trial hearing. This evidence should be able to be replayed at the trial as the witness’ evidence. Adult victims of sexual assault should also be permitted to provide evidence in this way, by leave of the court.

Recommendation 26–8 The Australian, state and territory governments should ensure that relevant participants in the criminal justice system receive comprehensive education about legislation authorising the use of pre-recorded evidence in sexual assault proceedings, and training in relation to interviewing victims of sexual assault and pre-recording evidence.

Recommendation 27–1 Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that complainants of sexual assault must not be cross-examined in relation to, and the court must not admit any evidence of, the sexual reputation of the complainant.

Recommendation 27–2 Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that the complainant must not be cross-examined, and the court must not admit any evidence, as to the sexual activities—whether consensual or non-consensual—of the complainant, other than those to which the charge relates, without the leave of the court.

Recommendation 27–3 Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that the court must not grant leave under the test proposed in Rec 27–2, unless it is satisfied that the evidence has significant probative value and that it is in the interests of justice to allow the cross-examination or to admit the evidence, after taking into account:

a. the distress, humiliation and embarrassment that the complainant may experience as a result of the cross-examination or the admission of the evidence, in view of the age of the complainant and the number and nature of the questions that the complainant is likely to be asked;

b. the risk that the evidence may arouse discriminatory belief or bias, prejudice, sympathy or hostility;

c. the need to respect the complainant’s personal privacy;
d. the right of the defendant to fully answer and defend the charge; and (e) any other relevant matter.

**Recommendation 27–4** Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that evidence about the sexual activities—whether consensual or non-consensual—of the complainant, other than those to which the charge relates, is not of significant probative value only because of any inference it may raise as to the general disposition of the complainant.

**Recommendation 27–5** Federal, state and territory legislation should require that an application for leave to cross-examine complainants of sexual assault, or to admit any evidence, about the sexual activities of the complainant must be made:

a. in writing;

b. if the proceeding is before a jury—in absence of the jury; and

c. in the absence of a complainant, if a defendant in the proceeding requests.

**Recommendation 27–6** Federal, state and territory legislation should require a court to give reasons for its decision whether or not to grant leave to cross-examine complainants of sexual assault, or to admit any evidence, about the sexual activities of the complainant and, if leave is granted, to state the nature of the admissible evidence.

**Recommendation 27–7** Australian courts, and judicial education and legal professional bodies should provide education and training about the procedural requirements for admitting and adducing evidence of sexual activity.

**Recommendation 27–8** Federal, state and territory legislation and court rules relating to subpoenas and the operation of the sexual assault communications privilege should ensure that the interests of complainants in sexual assault proceedings are better protected, including by requiring:

a. parties seeking production of sexual assault communications, to provide timely notice in writing to the other party and the sexual assault complainant;

b. that any such written notice be accompanied by a pro forma fact sheet on the privilege and providing contact details for legal assistance; and

c. that subpoenas be issued with a pro forma fact sheet on the privilege, also providing contact details for legal assistance.

**Recommendation 27–9** The Australian, state and territory governments, in association with relevant non-government organisations, should work together to develop and administer training and education programs for judicial officers, legal practitioners and counsellors about the sexual assault communications privilege and how to respond to a subpoena for confidential counselling communications.

**Recommendation 27–11** Federal, state and territory legislation should authorise the giving of jury directions about children's abilities as witnesses and responses to sexual abuse, including in a family violence context.

**Recommendation 27–13** Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that, in sexual assault proceedings, tendency or coincidence evidence is not inadmissible only because there is a possibility that the evidence is the result of concoction, collusion or suggestion.

**Recommendation 28–1** Federal, state and territory legislation should prohibit a judge in any sexual assault proceedings from:

a. warning a jury, or making any suggestion to a jury, that complainants as a class are unreliable witnesses; and
b. giving a general warning to a jury of the danger of convicting on the uncorroborated evidence of any complainant or witness who is a child.

**Recommendation 28—2** Australian courts and judicial education bodies should provide judicial education and training, and prepare material for incorporation in bench books, to assist judges to identify the circumstances in which a warning about the danger of convicting on the uncorroborated evidence of a particular complainant or child witness is in the interests of justice.

**Recommendation 28—4** Federal, state and territory legislation should provide that, in sexual assault proceedings:

a. the effect of any delay in complaint, or absence of complaint, on the credibility of the complainant should be a matter for argument by counsel and for determination by the jury;

b. subject to paragraph (c), except for identifying the issue for the jury and the competing contentions of counsel, the judge must not give a direction regarding the effect of delay in complaint, or absence of complaint, on the credibility of the complainant, unless satisfied it is necessary to do so in order to ensure a fair trial; and

c. if evidence is given, a question is asked, or a comment is made that tends to suggest that the victim either delayed making, or failed to make, a complaint in respect of the offence, the judge must tell the jury that there may be good reasons why a victim of a sexual offence may delay making or fail to make a complaint.

**Recommendation 28—5** Federal, state and territory legislation should:

a. prohibit an unrepresented defendant from personally cross-examining any complainant, child witness or other vulnerable witness in sexual assault proceedings; and

b. provide that an unrepresented defendant be permitted to cross-examine the complainant through a person appointed by the court to ask questions on behalf of the defendant.

**Recommendation 28—6** Federal, state and territory legislation should permit prosecutors to tender a record of the original evidence of the complainant in any re-trial ordered on appeal.

**Recommendations from the Development of AVERT and DOORS:**

**Fulfilled Recommendations:**

**Recommendation 21—2** The Australian Government Attorney-General’s Department should:

a. promote and support high quality screening and risk assessment frameworks and tools for family dispute resolution practitioners;

b. include these tools and frameworks in training and accreditation of family dispute resolution practitioners;

c. include these tools and frameworks in the assessment and evaluation of family dispute resolution services and practitioners; and

d. promote and support collaborative work across sectors to improve standards in the screening and assessment of family violence in family dispute resolution.

**Recommendation 21—3** The Australian Government Attorney-General’s Department, family dispute resolution service providers, and legal education bodies should ensure that
lawyers who practise family law are given training and support in screening and assessing risks in relation to family violence and making appropriate referrals to other services.

**Recommendation 21–5** The Australian Government Attorney-General's Department should take a comprehensive and strategic approach to support culturally responsive family dispute resolution, including screening and risk assessment processes.

**Recommendation 22–2** The Australian Government Attorney-General's Department, in consultation with family dispute resolution practitioners and family counsellors, should develop material to guide family dispute resolution practitioners and family counsellors in determining the seriousness of a threat to an individual's life, health or safety, and identifying when a disclosure may be made without consent. Such guidance should also encourage family dispute resolution practitioners and family counsellors to address the potential impact of disclosure on the immediate safety of those to whom the information relates, and for that purpose:

a. refer those at risk to appropriate support services; and
b. develop a safety plan, where appropriate, in conjunction with them.

**Recommendation 22–3** Bodies responsible for the education and training of family dispute resolution practitioners and family counsellors should develop programs to ensure that provisions in the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) and in state and territory child protection legislation regulating disclosure of information relating to actual or potential abuse, harm or ill-treatment of children are understood and appropriately acted on.

**Recommendation 22–5** The Australian Government Attorney-General's Department should coordinate the collaborative development of education and training—including cross-disciplinary training—for family courts' registry staff, family consultants, judicial officers and lawyers who practise family law, about the need for screening and risk assessment where a certificate has been issued under s 60I of the Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) indicating a matter is inappropriate for family dispute resolution.

**Recommendation 23–6** The Australian Government Attorney–General’s Department and state and territory governments should ensure that family violence screening and risk assessment frameworks indicate the importance of including questions in screening and risk assessment tools about:

a. past or current applications for protection orders;
b. past or current protection orders; and

c. any breaches of protection orders.

**Recommendation 23–7** Family dispute resolution service providers should ensure that:

a. tools used for family violence screening and risk assessment include questions about past and current protection orders and applications, and any breaches of protection orders; and

b. parties are asked for copies of protection orders.

**Problematic Recommendations:**

**Recommendation 7–3** The Family Law Act 1975 (Cth) should be amended to include a similar provision to that in Rec 7–2 explaining the nature, features and dynamics of family violence.

Recommendation 7–2 states:

State and territory family violence legislation should contain a provision that explains the nature, features and dynamics of family violence including: while anyone may be a victim of fam-
ily violence, or may use family violence, it is predominantly committed by men; it can occur in all sectors of society; it can involve exploitation of power imbalances; its incidence is underreported; and it has a detrimental impact on children. In addition, family violence legislation should refer to the particular impact of family violence on: Indigenous persons; those from a culturally and linguistically diverse background; those from the gay, lesbian, bisexual, transgender and intersex communities; older persons; and people with disabilities.

**Recommendation 21–1** The Australian Government Attorney-General’s Department should continue to collaborate with the family dispute resolution sector to improve standards in identification and appropriate management of family violence by family dispute resolution practitioners.

**Recommendation 21–4** The Australian Government Attorney-General’s Department should continue to provide leadership, support and coordination to improve collaboration and cooperation between family dispute resolution practitioners and lawyers.

**Recommendation 29-3** The Australian, state and territory governments should prioritise the provision of, and access to, culturally appropriate victim support services for victims of family violence, including enhanced support for victims in high risk and vulnerable groups.
Student Mobility from Central / Eastern Europe: Towards a Shared Europeanness

Liudmila Kirpitchenko,
Deakin University

Lejla Voloder,
Monash University

Abstract
Contemporary European border landscape has experienced a number of contradicting tendencies. The borders of the European Union (EU) have been expanding and shifting eastward to include the new member states. At the same time the established member states have debated the secessionist intentions and in fact, the UK has voted to leave the EU in a move known as Brexit. These contradicting tendencies are taking place in the face of what has been called a “refugee crisis” in Europe. This paper aims to discuss the shifting geopolitical and symbolic borders of the EU and the impact these shifts have on the reimagining of the shared European identity, termed “Europeanness” in this discussion.

In particular, this paper focuses on the opening of borders and increased opportunities of mobilities for students from Central/Eastern Europe (CEE) who have eagerly embarked on traveling for studies and professional development by participating in a large number of student mobility programs. In interviews (Florence, April-May 2015) with mobile students from CEE, the issue of developing a shared European sense of identity, belonging and inclusion was found to be one of the leading aspects of their experiences of mobility and everyday intercultural integration.

Keywords: identity, Central/Eastern Europeans, educational mobility, Europeanness

Introduction
The borders of the European Union (EU) are shifting eastward to include the new member states. Cartographic borders, bureaucratic taxonomies and symbolic schemas are some of the modes through which the European identity or Europeanness is reimagined. European mobility is configured most potently through the formation and expansion of the EU and its emergent borders. These borders become most significant when considered through the impacts symbolic boundaries have upon reimagined identities (Lamont et al. 2015).
The Erasmus Plus mobility program, and the establishment of the European Research Area, Marie Curie Actions, European Network of Mobility Centres and EURAXESS are the institutions which facilitate student mobility. The scale of mobility can be shown in the fact over 3.3 million Erasmus students and 470,000 staff spent time abroad since its launch 27 years ago. With an annual budget of over €580 million, 272,000 students and over 57,000 staff participated in Erasmus mobility programs in 2013-2014 (EC 2015). Mobility programs seek to promote international cooperation and the standardisation of higher education in Europe and inevitably participation in such programs impact upon the identities of participants. This paper examines structural conditions enabling movement within Europe, more specifically, our interest is in the movement of students from Central/Eastern Europe (CEE) and the influence their participation in student mobility programs has upon identity.

This paper's conceptual framework derives from qualitative fieldwork conducted by the first author at the European University Institute (EUI) in April-May 2015. The first author conducted individual face-to-face and online interviews with forty-two CEE researchers and alumni affiliated with the EUI. This paper begins with a brief overview of the structure and aims of the networks and institutions involved in facilitating academic mobility within an institutionally united Europe. Next, we introduce the dominant discourses which produce symbolic differences within a nominally united Europe. Third, we draw upon interview material to indicate how notions of European integration and European identity are spoken of by academics involved in these institutions. This paper points to tensions that academics from Central/Eastern Europe confront in challenging legacies of East/West Europe divides and in embracing and promoting notions of class-inflected cosmopolitan European identities.

Factors Facilitating Student Mobility

Academic mobility is one of the areas of migration and mobility that can be viewed as speaking of privilege. In stark contrast to the miseries experienced by asylum seekers, the barb-wired fences they confront, and their objectification as causes of the refugee-crisis in Europe, academics of EU member states are continually encouraged to move, to expand their horizons, develop networks with such movement facilitated by a range of structural enabling factors. Here we identify three key factors involved in facilitating academic mobility.

First, contemporary academic mobility is situated within the context of an instituted Schengen area. The 1985 Schengen Agreement is a legal framework intended to provide the structural conditions for the “free movement of persons” (Eur-lex 2016) within and across member states of the EU, that is, the Schengen area, while at the same time making entry difficult for those outside its borders.

Second, whilst Schengen Agreement provides a broad legal framework enabling movement within the EU, academic mobility is enabled by a number of institutions and processes across local, national and international levels (Hampshire, 2016). The Bologna Declaration plays an important role in this. The 1999 Bologna Declaration has been implemented in 48 states, and these state come to constitute the European Higher Education Area (EHEA). The Bologna Process is a collective effort of nation-states, public authorities, universities, and international organisations with an objective of the standardisation of education and creation of “comparable, compatible and coherent systems of higher education in Europe” (EHEA 2016). One of the intentions of such standardisation is to enable the movement of people within the EU.

Third, the EU plays an active role in promoting and managing programs of student exchanges. For example, the Erasmus mobility program was established in 1987 and it has now expanded into a more comprehensive program called Erasmus Plus for the period until 2020. The importance of academic mobility is evident in the policies of the European Commission (EC)
to create a common European area for research. Initiatives, such as the European Research Area, Marie Curie Actions, European Network of Mobility Centres and EURAXESS, testify to this intention. Apart from Erasmus, other EU supported academic mobility exchange programs include Socrates, Marie Curie, and Tempus amongst others. One broad rationale offered by the EC for supporting these programs is that: “investment in knowledge, skills and competences will benefit individuals, institutions, organisations and society as a whole by contributing to growth and ensuring equity, prosperity and social inclusion in Europe and beyond” (EC 2016). The bursaries, grants, fellowships offered through these schemes are additional sources of support for academic mobility.

These identified factors enable academics of EU member states to participate in exchange and professional development programs outside of their home nation-state. This paper is concerned with the movement and experiences of academics from Central/Eastern Europe, especially after 2004, when the EU enlargement process has included the entrance of former Eastern bloc countries into the EU and this has resulted in new forms of migration taking place. In characterising contemporary shifts in East-West migration, Favell (2008:705) comments, “A whole new generation of researchers from East and Central Europe are now completing fascinating PhDs in sociology, anthropology and human geography on the new East-West migration many at prestigious West European academic institutions. Their careers are themselves the fruit of the EU’s forward-looking inclusion of candidate member-states in European-wide education mobility schemes well in advance of full membership.” In writing about the integration and movement of academic movement from “East and Central Europe” to “West” Europe Favell points to continuing significance such significations hold.

Legacies of East / West European Divides

In this paper, the qualifier Central and Eastern Europeans (CEE) is chosen to denote the geographical origins of our migration group while acknowledging a cloud of controversy surrounding both terms “Eastern European” and “Central European”. Eastern Europe is generally used in opposition in Western Europe and continues to be evoked as a convenient way of demoting “the other” in Europe reviving the ideas of Orientalism. Such discourses impact upon the ways migrants from such regions have negated or negotiated their identities when in Western Europe. For example, the continuing circulation of such discourses is one reason why many Poles, Hungarians and Czechs insist on identifying with Central Europe, and rejecting the Eastern European qualifier. In this paper, we have combined both Central and Eastern European terms in recognition of the social and political differences and commonalities perceived in these countries. We have also strived to show overarching issues of integration pertinent to the CEE migrants as a “new minority” in Europe (Johns 2014; Malyutina 2013; Fox, Moroșanu & Szilassy, 2012).

The post-Communist period has created increasing social and economic uncertainties and insecurities in the lives of young people in Central and Eastern Europe and generated increased incentives and varied pathways to mobilities (Kirpitchenko 2014). Vast movements of students and professionals, Johns (2014) suggests, have created ‘new minorities’. These minorities differ in many respects from the ex-colonial, ‘guest-worker’ or refugee migrations of the early 1990s. Limited scholarly attention has been directed to the mobilities of high skilled and professional migrants from Central/Eastern Europe that has intensified in the recent two decades. In fact, the cohorts of ‘new immigrants’ have been under-represented in the migration scholarship, with an only noteworthy exception of Poles (Fox et al. 2012). This modest scholarly attention in the general migration literature is partly due to the relatively recent noticeability of CEE migrants represented in considerable numbers in the migrant-receiving countries. Insufficient attention is also partly due to the relative ‘invisibility’ of CEE migrants. “This ‘invisibility’ has a more
mundane dimension, which is represented by them being physically undistinguishable from an average ‘white European’ (Malyutina, 2013: 110).

The symbolic divisions across the continental European territory during the latter half of twentieth century positioned West Europe, often referred to as simply “Europe” in contrast to Eastern Europe. The ideological divisions of the democratic West with the socialist East carried additional connotations. Leontidou (2004:609) points out that despite the efforts for integration in a post-Cold War context and inclusion of many Eastern European nation-states, “borders with memories of bipolarity and of the ‘Iron Curtain’” remain. Eastern Europe has tended to be portrayed by the ‘West’ as the backward other, unenlightened to the progress of democracy and capitalism. Thus, Hammond (2004: xii) observes that while populations of the East were previously considered victims of communist ideology, the post-1989 discourse constructed these same populations as culturally and morally backward. Studies of ‘ balkanism’ have explored the historical, political and cultural influences on constructions of Balkan ‘otherness’ in Europe. Balkanisation is one variant of Eastern Europeanness often evoked to connote the backward, the primitive, and barbarian (Todorova 1997). Impacts of such cultural evocations of regions of Eastern Europe impact upon the ways migrants from such regions have negated or negotiated their identities when in Western Europe.

The continuation of divisions between East and West is perhaps best captured by the discourses of fear of increasing immigration from the East that followed the expansion of the EU and admittance of Eastern European countries (Favell 2008; Hampshire 2016). Taking the case of Polish immigrants in the UK as an example, Garapich (2008:736) explains that, “Poles have constituted a highly mobile and visible migrant workforce for more than a century in Europe, and the 1990s were not exceptional in that respect… The recent influx of Poles into the UK should be regarded as a continuation of a process that began more than a decade ago. Our preoccupation with the phenomenon shows a change in perception rather than a qualitatively different reality on the ground.”

The idea of Europe often carries class-inflected associations, for Europe is often evoked to connote cachet, refinement, and prestige (Bauman 2004). When considered from this perspective, the association between one’s identification with Europe and one’s professional standing is particularly intriguing, for identity as an academic is also associated with the cultural capital of cachet, refinement and prestige. This may be why Colic-Peisker (2010) contends that identification with their profession occupies a more significant position than identification with local communities and national polities for mobile professionals.

Towards a Shared Europeanness

Education institutions are key sites of socialisation and nationalisation. With European civic principles promoted within member nations, European identity is strived for amongst students. For many, mobility does not obscure ethnic and national identity nor does it supersede the need for emplacement. Students might be conceived as simultaneously mobile and emplaced, able to move between territories, but always assisted and limited by spatially-grounded relationships and activities (Amit 2012). Whilst universities are organised to accommodate international networks, they are embedded in national education system and informed by particular historical trajectories (Bönisch-Brendich 2010) and consequently linguistic, local and national configurations within such sites continue to impact upon practices and individual’s identities (Bilecen 2014). To explicitly transcend the national configurations, pan-European educational institutions have been created, such as College of Europe in Belgium, European University Institute (EUI) in Italy, and Central European University in Hungary. They have now overgrown their pan-European orientation and became truly international universities.
Interviews among participants affiliated with the EUI reveal that academic culture of learning and teaching at these universities has impact on the cultivation of Europeanness, as their alumni described these university environments as “multinational”, “multilingual”, “multicultural community of ours”, “cosmopolitan” and “very-very international”. The appreciation of ethnocultural differences within the university was noted by participants with their multiple references to “inclusive culture” of instruction, described also as “attentive to differences”, “friendly”, “open-minded”, “polite” and “respectful”. The EUI university might be considered as one site in which particular universalist and cosmopolitan dispositions are promoted.

We can consider the work of the university in relation to other initiatives within the EU which are intended to provide the institutional setting and frameworks for fostering shared intercultural dispositions amongst the populace. The Intercultural Cities programme is one such initiative focused upon promoting its vision of ‘Inclusive Integration’. The intercultural paradigm as it is known seeks to “promote cultural reciprocity and symmetry in interethnic relations, adopting a public discourse fostering a pluralistic - as opposed to ethnocentric - regional or national identity, encouraging social mixing and interaction in the public space, neighbourhoods and institutions, as well as rendering governing bodies more diverse and developing the diversity/intercultural competence of public officials” (CoE 2016). How this is put in practice can at this stage only be speculated upon, but this research amongst mobile academics reveals that there is a willingness among this strata of the population to embrace this discourse. However, other studies have notes that identification with Europeanness, “does not belong to all who inhabit Europe and is not tied to clear territorial markers. Rather it is predicated upon exhibiting particular modes of behaviour, being of a particular class, and inhabiting certain states” (Voloder and Andits 2015).

Concluding Remarks
According to the UN (2016: 16), 40 million international migrants in Europe are from within Europe, and to what degree a European identity is significant in the lives of migrants is an appealing matter for future empirical investigation. This brief overview reveals the competing discourses that seek to define and delimit European identity and the way upwardly mobile and geographically mobile academics engage with such matters. The shared educational space by the Bologna Process and its accompanying educational mobility are seen as inspiring and contributing to an increased sense of European sense of identity, belonging and inclusion. At the same time, many commonly see this change as pertinent to the privileged strata, and this remains dependent upon differentiating the cosmopolitan Europeans from others.
References


Council of Europe (CoE) (2016) What is an intercultural city? At: https://rm.coe.int/ [accessed 17 June 2016]


Routledge, 107-122.


Ignorance is Bliss: Why Dementia is a Useful Metaphor for Society’s Coming Energy Descent

Cathryn Kriewaldt
RMIT University

Social theories of ignorance try to grapple with ignorance, or even denial, across society. This paper examines the current predicament that society faces from the end of cheap oil ("peak oil"), why it has not been more widely debated, and why it is generally not considered as a cause for broad-scale concern. It is conjectured that dementia is a useful metaphor for reframing our thinking and understanding of peak oil. In particular, it helps illuminate why this major force, which is likely to shape society for the next few decades, is being largely ignored. The metaphor provides some possibilities for understanding the ways in which the coming energy descent will be experienced by modern societies. Finally, the metaphor highlights some useful beginnings for dealing with our peak oil predicament.

Key words: peak oil, epistemology of ignorance, social construction of ignorance, societal collapse, societal decline, energy descent

Introduction
This paper examines the current predicament that society faces from the end of cheap oil ("peak oil"), why it has not been more widely debated, and why it is generally not considered as a cause for broad-scale concern. It is conjectured that dementia is a useful metaphor for understanding peak oil in society, because the juxtaposition of something fairly common place and understood (dementia – gradual mental decline) jars us into understanding the unknown: peak oil and the energy descent of society (with a likely gradual decline in taken-for-granted systems). This paper first reviews some of the sociological literature on ignorance, with particular attention to widespread ignorance, before examining how metaphors can help to shift thinking. The basics of peak oil are explained before the proposed metaphor is briefly elaborated. Finally, some new insights are considered.

Social Theories of Ignorance
Thinking about ignorance has a long history, at least dating to Socrates, who observed that it was better to be aware of one’s own ignorance, than not (Reeve 2012:25-26). Despite this, there has been, until recently, a lack of theoretical attention to the area. Proctor and Schiebinger (2008:vii) call ignorance “remarkably undertheorized”. Rayner (2012:122) observed, “the study of the social...”
construction of ignorance remains in its infancy”, and McGoey (2012:3) concurs: “Until fairly recently, there has been a marked absence of theoretical attention to the value and practical uses of ignorance in economic and social life.” Gross and McGoey (2015) are a significant recent exception.

Perhaps for this reason, recent literature has seen a plethora of inter-related ideas, with varying and overlapping definitions, often originating in different disciplines. These include the sociology of ignorance (McGoey 2012), social theory of ignorance (Smithson 1985), social construction of ignorance (e.g. Ravetz 1986; Rayner 1986), epistemology/ies of ignorance (e.g. Mills 1997; Tuana & Sullivan 2006; Sullivan & Tuana 2007), antiepistemology – “how knowledge can be covered and obscured” (Galison 2004:237), willful ignorance (Wieland 2016; Moody-Adams 1994; Lynch 2016), anthropology and ethnography of ignorance (Mair et al. 2012) and agnotology – “the study of culturally induced ignorances” (Schiebinger 2004:237; see also Proctor 1995; Proctor and Schiebinger 2008; Croissant 2014).

The literature acknowledges that some ignorance is necessary – for example to have greater impartiality and remove potential bias. However, there is also recognition that “Ignorance is often not merely the absence of knowledge but an outcome of cultural and political struggle” (Schiebinger 2004:237). Ignorance can be actively fostered, or knowledge actively hidden (e.g. Galison 2004; Kaerlein 2013; Proctor 1995; Stocking and Holstein 2009). Ignorance can even be beneficial for the ignorant because it imparts innocence, or removes the need to take responsibility (Proctor 1995, Davies and McGoey 2012; McGoey 2007; Cohen 2001).

A more specific question asks how it is that large portions of society remain ignorant about matters about which they ‘should’ be aware. Mills’ epistemology of ignorance (Mills 1997; 2007; 2013a; 2013b; 2016) examined the phenomenon of white ignorance - the ability of white people to remain ignorant about the racial realities of society and history, particularly in his home country, the USA. His theoretical approach has been furthered (e.g. Alcoff 2007) and applied to feminism (Tuana and Sullivan 2006), women’s health (Tuana 2004; 2006), drug use (Ettorre 2015) and more (e.g. Bohmer and Shuman 2007). In a similar vein but from the history of science, Proctor (1995) coined agnotology, which studies “how ignorance is produced or maintained” (Proctor and Schiebinger 2008:vii). Rayner (2012) examines “uncomfortable knowledge” – knowledge which could challenge or “undermine the organizational principles of a society or organization” (Rayner 2012:111) but which conversely also may lead to problems if it is not acknowledged. His term seems to encompass what Davies and McGoey (2012:66) call “unsettling facts”.

Many of these theories are trying, if you like, to theorise how it is that we can have widespread ignorance, whether at the level of society, or within substantial subgroups of society. These differing approaches show that it is indeed possible, and often serves a purpose, for certain parts of society to remain ignorant, or even to be complicit in maintaining their own ignorance. It is not the purpose of this paper to try to reconcile these different theoretical perspectives, nor even to apply them beyond acknowledging that similar, at some level intentional, social constructions of ignorance would seem to be at play regarding the science of peak oil and the need to plan for societal energy descent. Instead, I aim to show that one way to break down or disrupt the mental landscape – to try to shift the ignorance or denial to acceptance or at least consideration – might be achieved through poetic or artistic means: through use of a metaphor.

Metaphor as Useful Mental Tool

In art, juxtaposing two colours has the effect of changing our perception of both – known as simultaneous contrast. Similarly, the power of the metaphor – juxtaposing two ideas from very different areas – has long been acknowledged. Sontag (1978/2001) argued that the use of metaphor in health contexts was ultimately disempowering, and Lakoff and Johnson (1980)
showed the power at play when metaphors are used unthinkingly. However, I argue that in this context, metaphor can be a useful way to reframe our thinking, disrupt previous ways of thinking and generate creativity. It has long been recognised (e.g. Black in the 1960s, see Miller 2000), that metaphors are linked to creativity (Glicksohn et al. 1993). Indeed, some definitions of creativity prioritise the idea of having “novel combinations of old ideas” (Boden 1996: 75). I argue that the metaphor of dementia is a useful metaphor for thinking about society’s coming energy descent because the juxtaposition of a known and somewhat understood phenomenon (dementia, or mental decline) can help to highlight an ignored phenomenon (peak oil, or energy decline). The well-understood breakdown of processes associated with gradual-onset dementia serves to help understand the gradual breakdown of taken-for-granted systems that society relies on but which are no longer tenable in an energy descent society.

**What is Peak Oil?**

In this paper I argue that peak oil is an issue that society should be more concerned about, but that we cannot fully confront because of its challenge to our current way of life – it is an ‘uncomfortable knowledge’ (Rayner 2012) and an ‘unsettling fact’ (Davies and McGoey 2012). To a certain extent, we need to remain ignorant of it so that we can continue to live our lives ‘normally’. To understand why I argue this, it is necessary to understand a little about peak oil.

Oil is a finite resource, being the remains of plants and animals from the time of dinosaurs, leading to it also being called “ancient sunlight” (Hartmann 1999). The concept of ‘peak oil’ was first described by Hubbert (1956) as the time when productive (flow) capacity of production peaks, and can be applied to an individual oil field, a region or even globally. Generally, the ‘easy’ oil is the oil which is extracted first and the remaining oil is much more difficult to extract and/or is situated in ever more precarious locations (e.g. deep ocean, distant wildlife reserve). Hence, the amount of energy you need to invest to extract the same quantity of oil (known as the Energy Return on Energy Invested, EROI or EROEI) is usually higher the more you extract (Heinberg 2005; 2010b; 2013b). Recent increased production of unconventional oil (e.g. shale oil, tar sands) follows these trends – it is both more expensive monetarily and energetically to extract than was early (easy) conventional oil, not to mention the higher environmental cost (Heinberg 2013a). Although there is dissent regarding the concept of peak oil, there is not the space here to restate these debates, and this paper assumes that peak oil is a serious challenge facing societies. (For recent overviews of the debate, see Alexander 2014 and Chapman 2014). It is generally agreed that conventional global oil production has already peaked, or will do so in the next decade (Kerschner et al. 2013; Sorrell et al. 2010).

**Why Peak Oil Matters: The Likely Impact on Society**

Much of the world is highly dependent on oil, and there are no ready substitutes. All other sources of energy (renewable, nuclear, etc.) have major issues with the concentration of energy available, with the transportability of the energy, and/or with the EROI (Fridley 2010; Weissbach et al. 2013). Greer (2013:21) sums it up thus, “none of the alternatives to fossil fuels is capable of providing the same cheap, concentrated, abundant supply of energy that industrial civilization currently gets from fossil fuels, especially petroleum.”

Generally speaking, as the cost of oil rises this somewhat reduces demand and somewhat stimulates supply, both of which have a lag time before they impact back on the market, and so may partially affect the price downward at a later date. Peak oil theorists refer to this time period as the ‘bumpy plateau’, where the price bounces around a new norm, while supply and demand respond to the new norm. However, over time, the general trend is for ever costlier oil because reducing our dependence on oil is not easy. In economic terms, it is a somewhat inelastic product (demand remains fairly constant regardless of price). With few ready substitutes, energy...
conservation and energy efficiency is one of the few ways to reduce demand, but is limited (Heinberg 2010a: 9-10).

Oil enables almost every facet of our lives, from driving to just-in-time manufacturing and global supply chains built on the back of affordable shipping. Oil is consumed in producing and transporting our food, mining other resources, making plastics and supplying water. Except for some subsistence and hunter-gather societies, oil is now needed for the very basics of human life. It is essential, not a luxury. A US Department of Energy’s commissioned study estimated that it would take approximately twenty years of preparations to have society ready for peak oil, and to avoid the worst social and economic impacts (Hirsch, Bezdek, & Wendling 2005, as quoted in Greer 2013:14). Peak oil is destined to shift the way we understand good city design, how we provide for ourselves, most likely global human carrying capacity (population levels), in short: how we live. This change in the way society is organised, accommodating the reality of peak oil, is variously labelled energy descent, decarbonisation, or low- or post-carbon societies amongst others.

The Coming Decline in Complexity

These physical constraints on society have been pondered by a small group of theorists, and some argue this necessitates a decline in social complexity (Tainter 1988; Casti 2013; Homer-Dixon 2008; Urry 2013). There is always the possibility that there will be a technological innovation to help ameliorate our dependency on oil (cornucopians squarely pin their hopes on this). However, in the absence of such a technofix, the imperative to reduce our dependency on oil does not feature on our collective social or political horizon, and it is not getting the media (Becken, 2014), social nor political attention that it warrants.

This silence may be because peak oil is an uncomfortable knowledge (Rayner, 2012) which threatens the current way that society is organised. To disrupt this ignorance, I propose that the metaphor of dementia could be useful as a mental tool to help gain traction for considering energy descent. Dementia is a well-known mental illness and a very basic understanding of dementia suffices to make the metaphor meaningful. I will now briefly elaborate on various ways in which the metaphor of dementia helps to illuminate aspects of society’s coming energy descent. The following are small points where the metaphor has clear parallels:

A: No Cure
As with dementia, as outlined above there is no cure and no quick fix for peak oil. It is terminal.

B: Masked at First and Gradual Adjustment to the New Normal
Dementia is usually undetected or masked at first. Small glitches can be explained away or overlooked, and life continue as per ‘normal’. If the adjustments required to deal with the dementia are small enough, they are incorporated into the ‘new normal’ with a minimum of fuss, or perhaps hardly even noticed. Once signals are observable, the process of dementia has been well underway, undetected. It can be argued that the process will be similar with peak oil. The impacts of more expensive oil will be accommodated by those who can, with perhaps minor adjustments to their way of life.

C: Denial
Often, dementia patients and those who love them do not want to admit that it is really, finally happening. Similarly peak oil is like having to admit to our own decline, in part. This helps to show that peak oil is an uncomfortable knowledge, making denial appealing.

For this reason, the academic literature on, and specialist knowledge about, dementia is not necessary for the purposes of this paper.
D: Loss of Freedom
If we admit that the decline is happening, we have to admit that we need to curtail our freedom. Urry (2013: esp. 6-7) highlights exactly how dependent modern society is on mobilities, but that mobile lives have the assumption of cheap oil.

E: Catastrophic Reaction and Disruptive, Undeniable Event
When someone with dementia is placed in a situation that they suddenly realise is out of their abilities to deal with, but previously it was quite normal, they can react with anger, or break down in tears. This is known as a ‘catastrophic reaction’ (Mace, 1984). There are also more disruptive events associated with dementia – the iconic night-time escape through the window in a nightie to roam the streets – which suddenly means that the new reality can no longer be denied nor ignored. It can be surmised that it may be similar with societal responses to energy descent. Perhaps there will be a sudden, localised collapse in a particular oil supply, for example, which serves to highlight the precariousness of food supply in nearby large cities (Steel, 2008: 64-66, 100-101, 161). Catastrophic events may be the trigger for more widespread attention to the problem.

F: Earlier Treatment is Better
If we admit there is a problem early on, we can take much more effective steps to remedy the situation, and make the decline a little more controlled and less problematic. The aim is to have a less catastrophic, more gradual energy descent.

Breakdown of Metaphor
Like all metaphors, the metaphor of dementia for society’s coming energy descent only holds up to a certain point. The major breakdown comes when we start to contemplate what ‘death’ of a dementia sufferer equates to metaphorically. Hopefully, it is not that all of society will die - rather, what will end is society as we have come to know it.

Lessons for Society/ Us
Embracing the metaphor of dementia offers a window of insight into the coming society energy descent. The metaphor can help to illuminate some important points for us, just two of which will be briefly examined here.

Lesson 1: Relying on Assumptions That No Longer Hold True
First, in the absence of major technological innovations, so many of the assumptions upon which we base our lives and societies at some stage will no longer hold true, e.g. cheap oil, clean (cheap) water, (cheap) food. Transportation, which is integral to our just-in-time society, will no longer be quite so dependable (Urry, 2013).

Lesson 2: In the Midst and Not Know
A second corollary lesson is that we can be in the midst of a societal decline and not even realise it, nor fully understand it. Much like white privilege, we can be swimming in this, and have no idea. When we are first exposed to the idea, it can take real intellectual and creative work to keep being mindful of our own incorrect or ignorant assumptions, particularly when most of society is making those same assumptions. One reader from a leading peak oil education site, peakprosperity.com, explains the feeling that she and her husband felt as they tried to live their life with peak oil in mind, in this way:

---

3 Another breakdown concerns to what the loss of the mind for a dementia sufferer equates, but this rather interesting consideration must be left for a subsequent paper.
We started tracking credible commentaries and advice from Peak Prosperity and digging like kindergartners into fiscal policies, politicians, agendas and economics. We felt like we were starting a new line of tin foil hats. We challenged ourselves at every turn “Should we stop this nonsense? Have we lost our minds? Would we feel better if we just stopped all of this time and resource-intensive activity?” (“J.S.”, as quoted in Martenson and Taggart 2015: 194-195).

The psychological work required to not slip back into willful or chosen ignorance can be taxing.

**Conclusion**

This paper has outlined a useful metaphor for thinking through the implications for society of life in the face of the end of cheap oil. Widespread ignorance of this high-impact physical reality can be understood using epistemologies of ignorance but must be overcome to allow us to plan for an energy-scarce future. The metaphor of dementia can help to break through and re-frame our understanding, by allowing consideration of the similar decline facing societies because of the realities of peak oil.
References


science with policy implications”.


Disindividualisation: Religious Identity Negotiation Amongst Young Australian Buddhist Practitioners

Kim Lam
Monash University, Australia

Abstract
This paper presents a new theory for conceptualising work on the self in relation to young people and religion, in an era which is characterised by detraditionalisation, majority-minority conflict, and anti-religious sentiment. In contrast to existing perspectives of youth religious identity, which emphasise self-interest via the development of discrete and defensive religious identities, the theory proposed in this paper takes into account the efforts of young Australian Buddhist practitioners to enhance interconnectedness, social cohesion and mutual respect. Data from a qualitative study of 22 young Australian Buddhist practitioners shows how participants seek to actualise these priorities by purposefully working on the self to become, or remain, religiously indistinct. I refer to this process as ‘religious disindividualisation’, and note that this is facilitated by Buddhist teachings about the self, which emphasise interdependence and the loss of self. In contrast to multicultural policies, which assume that social cohesion is enhanced by facilitating the preservation and expression of discrete religious identities, these findings of my study present an alternate way for thinking about how social cohesion, mutual understanding and participation can be enhanced in contexts of religious diversity.

Keywords: Buddhism, religion, youth, identity, social cohesion

In recent years, studies of youth religiosity in Western societies have drawn attention to the role of young people themselves in negotiating religious identity. Scholars of minority religious identity have challenged conceptualisations of youth religious identity as a unidirectional transmission of religion from first generation immigrants to their children, emphasising youth resistance to traditional ethno-religious socialising influences, as well as youth influence on first generation religious practitioners (Hopkins, Olson, Pain & Vincett, 2010). Similarly, ‘defensive’ conceptualisations of minority youth religious identity have given primacy to the ability of young people to defend their religious identities in mainstream Western contexts which involve Judeo-Christian privilege and anti-religious sentiment (Amarasingam, 2008; Kurien, 2005; Vassenden & Andersson, 2010). Individualised conceptions of youth religious identity have portrayed young people as myopically self-referential in their religious identity negotiations, bypassing traditional religious authorities in the development of their religious identities (Mason, Singleton
& Weber, 2007; Smith & Denton, 2005). This emphasis on individual agency is compatible with conceptions of the individual in modernity, which conceive of an autonomous individual with human rights, who is no longer bound by traditional communal obligations (McMahan, 2008).

While each of these perspectives vary in emphasis, they all propose a conceptualisation of youth religious identity as something to be discovered, developed or defended in conditions of detraditionalisation, majority-minority conflict and anti-religious sentiment. This paper presents an alternative way to conceptualise work on the self in relation to religion under such conditions. It proposes a theory of religious disindividualisation, which refers to the process of purposefully working on the self to become, or to remain, religiously indistinct. Unlike the abovementioned approaches, which envisage some form of conflict between religious youth and others in a range of social contexts – such as the family, traditional religious institutions and the national context more broadly – a theory of religious disindividualisation proposes that young people may pursue more pro-social means to negotiate religious identity. To this end, the purpose of becoming religiously indistinct is to reduce conflict, and enhance mutual respect and social connectedness.

To illustrate this possibility, I draw on findings from a qualitative study of 22 young Australian Buddhist practitioners, aged 18 to 30, who had lived in Australia for at least five years, and were either raised as Buddhists, or had been practicing Buddhism for at least five years. Drawing from recent observations regarding the globalisation of Buddhism in the West and its spread beyond ethno-religious institutions (McMahan, 2008; Rocha & Barker, 2011), the current study adopted a narrative approach to investigating Buddhist youth identity. As Nancy Ammerman (2003: 216-7) explains, a narrative approach draws attention away from particular contexts for doing religion, and places more emphasis on the act of narrativity itself; that is, the process through which ways religious identity is both structured and constructed within and across diverse settings. This approach was further useful in capturing work on the self, and the way this was perceived by participants across three key dimensions of religious identity – socialisation, belonging and participation.

Semi-structured interviews with participants showed how, in contrast to existing models of youth religious identity, participants from my study negotiated religious socialisation, belonging and participation in pro-social and interconnected ways. The remainder of this paper provides a brief snapshot of how the socialisation, belonging and participation experiences of young Australian Buddhist practitioners from my study supports a disindividualisation thesis. I also discuss some of the implications of this for the management of religious identities on contexts of religious and cultural diversity.

Socialisation

A significant paradigm in studies of youth religious identity in the West relates to the socialisation of second generation religious youth. This paradigm – which I refer to as the ‘ethno-religious socialisation’ paradigm, is concerned with the ways young people are faced with the pressure of maintaining the ethnic and religious traditions of their parents, amidst the influences of secularism, religious plurality and national cultural norms regarding religion. This model focuses on the role of families, religious institutions and ethnic groups in passing down an ‘authentic’ version of religion to second generation youth through regular, and often frequent, face-to-face interaction (Kurien, 2005; Peek, 2005). The findings of my study reveal a different story, with alternate modes of religious socialisation also considered to be legitimate and authentic sources of religious support and authority. These influences included: communication with monks overseas via email; consumption of Buddhist ideas and literature via Internet sites and television documentaries; and engagement with Buddhism in related fields of knowledge and practice, such as psychology, secular mindfulness meditation and martial arts. Findings from my research showed that these alternative socialising influences were considered to complement, rather than
challenge, traditional ethno-religious socialisation, indicating a more pro-social engagement of such influences than typically conceived in the literature.

**Belonging**

Regarding belonging, the notion of majority-minority conflict has strongly shaped conceptualisations of minority youth religious identity. This notion has been most notably explored in studies of Muslim and Hindu identity and citizenship. Particularly since the events of September 11, 2001, a number of Muslim scholars have noted that Islam has been portrayed by media and political commentary as incompatible with Western culture and values (Saniotis, 2004: 54; Northcote & Casimiro, 2010: 142). Adis Duderija (2008: 381) argues that Muslim identity construction can be understood through a framework called the 'self-other civilization mutual identity construction dialectic'. In other words, Muslim identity is the product of interdependent binary processes between the Muslim Self and the Western Other. Scholars researching second generation Hindu immigrants have developed similar conceptualisations of Hindu identity. Prema Kurien (2005: 441) argues that American Hindus are often stigmatised on the basis of being a non-White minority, and as a result, tend towards a 'militant religious nationalism' whereby they utilise the discourse of multiculturalism to argue that they are 'an oppressed global minority, to highlight the history of victimisation, and to argue for the need for recompense and self-determination'.

In contrast to the rhetoric of minoritisation outlined above, the findings of my study did not support the idea that young Australian Buddhist practitioners developed defensive identities in response to perceived threats from mainstream Australian or Western culture. Rather, for participants in my study, conceptualisations of national culture were difficult to pinpoint or define, preventing participants from drawing a stable reference point or ‘Other’ to construct distinct, defensive religious identities. Additionally, participants in my study also took active steps to negotiate a sense of belonging by engaging positively with existing Buddhist groups and creating their own communities of belonging. These included interfaith groups on social media, community garden initiatives, and communities developed around place of residence. Finally, participants in the study accepted rather than challenged norms regarding cultural diversity and the expression of religion in Australian society, including secularism and anti-religious sentiment. In contexts of religious and cultural diversity, participants adopted a stance of ‘cosmopolitan irony’, to borrow Bryan Turner’s (2002) term, distancing themselves from their own culture in order to respect other cultures. In my study, participants distanced themselves from their Buddhist identities by avoiding speaking about and practicing their religion in public, and not bringing up the topic of Buddhism or religion unless it was brought up by others, to avoid stigmatisation.

**Participation**

The breakdown in the boundary between the self and others was most strongly illustrated in young Australian Buddhists’ accounts of civic and political participation. For many participants, helping the self was the same as helping others, with Tenzin, for example, stating: ‘You have to help yourself in a sense, so that you can be of benefit to others’. Yoshi, similarly, said: ‘I find that when I actually reduce the sense of the ego, to believe that there is no self…I’m more willing to serve others.’ Candice, in explaining her reason for helping others, said:

I don't feel like I’m just trying to be the person who’s like, helping others, like I feel like, when I’m, when I’m working, ideally I’m trying to build something that’s also, that I’m a part of...you know, it's not just like...me go help the poor people, and here you go. Well they are part of my community and I’m part of their community. That sense of connection.
In some cases, the creation of community and a sense of belonging was central to participants’ participation efforts. As Tenzin said of his efforts to create an interfaith youth group:

> What we've really done is, as kind of the spiritual black sheep of our faith communities, we've created our own community of other people who are questioning their faith identity. And the sense of belonging of those projects has been really strong. It’s been fleeting, because you come and go, and there's no real glue, like we're not practicing together…but at those moments, when we come together and go, oh my gosh, you're like me, and we share these same conflicts. That sense of community and belonging at that moment, like on those camps that we've done, or at those workshops has been really good.

This account bears resemblance to Vinken's (2005: 155) characterisation of contemporary youth participation as involving ‘open, weak-tie relationships and more fluid, short lived commitments’, as well as Maffesoli’s description of neo-tribal groupings of people who are bound together temporarily for the sake of sociality, rather than commitment to a particular ideology. According to Maffesoli (1996: 43), such groupings result in an 'affective warmth' which promotes a sense of 'disindividuation', or less of a sense of self within a 'collective subject' (Maffesoli, 1988: 145).

These examples illustrate the perceived interconnections between the self and the other for participants in my study, and further emphasise the lack of interest in constructing a distinct and autonomous self in relation to others. In some cases, participants referred directly to Buddhist teachings about the self to explain the rationale behind their actions. The concepts of anatta¹ (no-self), sunyata² (emptiness) and pratityasamutpada³ (dependent origination) are particularly relevant here, as they challenge the idea of a distinct self, and emphasise the interdependence of individuals.

**Disindividualisation**

As a result of these findings, I propose a new theory of conceptualising work on the self in relation to religion in conditions of detraditionalisation, majority-minority conflict and anti-religious sentiment. Participants in my study showed little, if any interest in developing or maintaining individual religious identities which indicate a separation between themselves and others in society. In other words, they were not interested in identity politics. Rather, participants in my study demonstrated the co-constructed nature of their religious identity negotiations by emphasising the significance of communities they were immersed in, accepting rather than challenging ant-religious sentiment, and de-emphasising the self in contexts of religious diversity as well as in civic and political participation. I contend that rather than developing distinct, individual Buddhist identities, participants in my study emphasised ‘disindividualisation’, seeking to remove barriers between themselves and others. I further argue that for young Australian Buddhist practitioners, sociality and a sense of belonging or connection to others was more important than developing, preserving or identifying with a distinct self, or a Buddhist identity. These findings have implications for the management of religious identities in contexts characterised by religious and cultural diversity, such as Australia. Australia’s multicultural policy is widely recognised as an exemplary model for managing cultural diversity, which respects and encourages the expression of religious and cultural identities within the limits of Australian law, values, identity and citizenship (Australian Government Department of Social Services, 2013). Yet the question that can be asked, and should be asked, is why young Australian Buddhists in my study felt the need to hide their religious identities in contexts of religious diversity? Furthermore,

---

¹ Refers to the aspect of not being anything which pertains to a self (Harvey, 2013: 58).
² The contemplation of phenomena as being empty of self (Harvey, 2013: 81).
³ The teaching that all things arise due to certain conditions; nothing exists independently of itself. It complements the view that there is no independent of permanent self (Harvey, 2013: 65).
why did participants feel that doing so enabled them to more effectively respect, understand and interact with other cultures? The ‘disindividualisation’, or withdrawal of Buddhist identity from Australian social life as a strategy to enhance belonging, connection and participation gives pause for thought about best practice for respecting diverse religious identities and maintaining social cohesion in multicultural Australia. In contrast to multicultural policies which assume that social cohesion is enhanced by facilitating the preservation and expression of discrete religious identities, these findings of my study suggest that the notion of ‘disindividualised’ religious identity offers an alternate way for thinking about how social cohesion, mutual understanding and participation can be enhanced amongst minoritised religious youth in Australia and other societies characterised by religious and cultural diversity.

Conclusion
This paper has proposed an alternative theory for conceptualising work on the self in relation to religion in conditions of detraditionalisation, majority-minority conflict and anti-religious sentiment. While it draws from the findings of a study of young Australian Buddhist practitioners, it is not possible to tell from this qualitative study of 22 participants whether the findings are applicable to Buddhist youth more broadly, or to other religious youth in Western contexts. Additionally, while this paper has presented some positive consequences of religious disindividualisation relating to the enhancement of social cohesion and participation, it also acknowledges the potentially negative consequences of concealing religious identity and practice in public spaces. In particular, it is possible that a deliberate concealment of religious identity and practice may further perpetuate anti-religious sentiment and religious illiteracy. While these challenges are ongoing, it is suggested that the findings presented in this paper raise alternative theoretical possibilities regarding work on the self in relation to religion, which can be further investigated in future studies.
References


The Politics of Space in Dhaka: Informality, Power and Negotiations in the Everyday Life of the Urban Poor

Lutfun Nahar Lata,
School of Social Science, The University of Queensland

Peter Walters,
School of Social Science, The University of Queensland

Abstract
Many urban poor in Dhaka depend on access to negotiated urban space to earn livelihoods. By 'negotiated space', I refer to any kind of urban space that is used by the urban poor to earn livelihoods through some kind of negotiation processes. The urban poor often face the threat of eviction from their spaces of livelihoods either by the government or local level administration or local residents as they use public and parochial space (Lofland 1998). Use of these spaces for selling products is formally illegal; hence they apply different strategies to appropriate these spaces to earn their livelihoods. Using Sattola slum in Dhaka as a case study and drawing on data from qualitative interviews with 99 street vendors, this paper seeks to explain the power relations and negotiations that the urban poor of Dhaka utilise to access space both within and beyond the slum for earning a livelihood.

Keywords: public space, negotiated space, power, negotiations, resistance, contestation, urban poor, Dhaka

Introduction
Urban space plays an important role in the livelihood practices of the urban poor in Southern megacities, where poor people mostly earn their income running informal and small scale business. People start their own business with a small amount of capital, sometimes with the help of family members and in many cases informal workers use urban public space to earn livelihoods (Brown 2006b). Control of these spaces is tenuous and requires a delicate mix of negotiation, threats of violence and rent-seeking behaviour by the powerful. The power relations that determine these negotiated spaces are the subject of this paper.

Theoretical Framework
Informality, Power and Negotiations
In Southern megacities, street hawkers and vendors operate a vast range of informal businesses. They are the most visible informal workers in cities (Jones 1988; Cross and Balkin 2000). Most
vendors sell goods; however, some sell services and some sell a mixture of goods and services (Bromley 2000). Street hawkers sell anything from water to state of the art electronics to earn income (Daniels 2004). There are thousands of street vendors in Southern megacities and they are an indication that “capitalism does not need to be taught or that the poor and the migrants can be entrepreneurs without the need to be wealthy” (Daniels 2004: 503). Common street services in Southern megacities are shoe-shining, hair-cutting, document-typing, and the repair of shoes, clothes, bicycles and motor cycles (Bromley 2000). Food vending is also highly visible activity along with rickshaw-pullers in Asian megacities. Around 97,000 street vendors in Dhaka sell prepared food items and around 425,000 people or 2.9 percent of Dhaka’s total population depend on the income generated by food vendors (Etzold 2015). These informal actors usually use negotiated spaces to earn their livelihoods.

An important issue related to the access to and use of negotiated space is the threat of eviction that hawkers and vendors face from dominant actors and how they negotiate with these groups to operate their business often determines their success. Hence it is important to discuss how power is “dispersed throughout the society” (Few 2002: 31) rather than concentrated in only a few. This implies that poor and marginalised groups also possess agency to “negotiate options that help to secure their livelihoods” (Bohle 2007: 130). Referring to Foucault, Sharp et al. (2000) outline the positive and negative dimension of power incorporating the idea that power not only refers to domination, it also refers to the ability to resist. They further differentiate between ‘resisting power’ and ‘dominating power’, defining resisting power as ordering from subtle moments to pronounced forms of social organisation and social movement. Sharp et al. (2000) also view the entanglements of power as inherently spatial and geographical and point out power also emerges from contestation. Referring to Lefebvre’s writing on the production of space, they emphasise the relationships between power and space; “Different social groups endow space… with amalgams of different meanings, uses and values. Such differences can give rise to various tensions and conflicts within society over the uses of space for individual and social purposes, and over the domination of space by the state and other forms of dominating social (class) power” (Sharp et al., 2000: 25-26).

In the context of Dhaka, Bangladesh, where I did my fieldwork, Sharp et al.’s (2000: 26) last point, “other forms of dominating social (class) power” is particularly important. In the case of informal settlements in Dhaka local forces are mostly visible rather than the state. The State plays peripheral role whereas local forces are often characterised as informal in their activities and legitimisation and through this process they negotiate social space and power relations (Etzold et al. 2009; Hackenbroch and Hossain; 2012, Hackenbroch 2013a). In these informal spheres local contestations bring to the fore forces that can be termed as de facto state (Roy and AlSayyad 2004). Sharp et al. (2000: 4) also refer to these diffuse characteristics of power: “where power is more diffuse and clearly not restricted to the formal process of governing, researchers need to take cognisance of the more nuanced ways in which the ability to shape social action takes place”.

The above discussion indicates a socially constructed urban space where different actors have different interests, needs and desires and they have differential amounts of power to dominate space (Holston 1999; Smith 2000). The following empirical analysis will make use of this theoretical frame to establish linkages between power relations, contestations and negotiations among different actors both within and beyond the study slum, Sattola.

**Methodology**

I collected empirical data in Dhaka between November 2015 to February 2016 in both qualitative interviews and by observation. Qualitative interviews were carried out using a basic interview guide with local street vendors, hawkers, local leaders, some government officials and other key informants. Research participants were selected according to a balance of gender, occupational
type and relative power. The study highlights gender due to the stark differences between how men and women use and are permitted to use space in the slum. The empirical data-interview transcripts and field notes were analysed in a process of open coding until typologies and categories emerged from the data, with the aid of Nvivo.

The Politics of Space: Power and Negotiations within and beyond Sattola Slum

Contestations regarding access to negotiated spaces are an important focus for this research. Consistent with previous studies on the use of space by informal workers (Etzold 2011; Hackenbroch 2013b; Pratt, 2006), the study found a number of different categories of actors (see, Figure 1), who exercise power to appropriate and distribute negotiated spaces. These actors can be categorised into two groups: informal and formal actors. Formal actors comprise actors with dominant power, such as, police officers, locally elected Ward Councillor, officials of different government hospitals and health research institutes adjacent to the study area and other state officials. Formal actors do not appropriate space themselves; however, they have the regulatory power or institutional authority to control activity within space. Though formal actors are the most powerful actors within and beyond the slum in determining access to public space, local informal actors play a more important role than formal actors in Dhaka due to long standing patron-client relationships. Informal actors, such as, mastans (local enforcers) mostly act as mediators/brokers between formal actors and the urban poor. Informal actors comprise followers of the current ruling party - Awami League¹, and mastans². They mostly collect security, or ‘protection’ money from informal business owners with the help of linemen. A lineman is an individual who collects security money from hawkers and vendors and distributes it to other groups; such as police, local thana³, mastans and political leaders. Beside these groups, staff of surrounding hospitals and inhabitants who have economic resources (such as, landlords and shops owners) are equally powerful. Residents of Sattola who have a strong kin network or social network are also powerful. However, power does not follow in a linear way, rather people become more powerful when they maintain affiliations with local political leaders/ruling political party as well as having either strong kin networks or social networks. In contrast to dominant actors, the urban poor live in the other continuum of the power structure and have limited power to resist this dominant group. Hence they often negotiate with the dominant group to win access to negotiated spaces.

Sattola slum is located on public land and the adjacent areas that the urban poor use for earning livelihoods are more or less negotiated spaces as the government has not provided space for the urban poor to operate their business; however, they often have to pay local leaders or their enforcers for using these spaces. ‘Being a local’ is a significant source of power and very often these locals are supporters of AL. This group has appropriated most of the spaces of the slum and they rent shops to tenants, who are bound to pay whatever rent is demanded. Most of the tea stalls within and nearby slum areas are in rented shops. I asked the shopkeepers why they pay rent to an ‘owner’ as their shops are on government land. They replied “the owner built it and so we pay them”. Though some of these locals do not live in the slum anymore they collect money from their tenants. For example, on the first day of my visit to the slum, I found a man shouting at a barber: “I will not rent my shop to you anymore. You are a cheat. Why didn’t you take my call? Where is my money?” He even tried to assault the barber; however, local residents intervened and

¹ The Awami League (translating as ‘People’s League’) is the oldest political party of Bangladesh. This party was established in 1949 in East Pakistan. At that time its founder broke with the Pakistani Muslim League and named it as Awami Muslim League. Later it was renamed as Awami League in 1955 to underline its secular character, building on its identity based on language rather than religion, which it upholds till today (Hackenbroch 2013b).

² A mastan refers to a ‘local youth who is employed/used’ by powerful leaders, for example to organize election campaigns. In terms of behavior, a mastan is not considered a gentle person and he is not appreciated because he is engaged in unlawful activities, e.g. land grabbing, extortion, fighting or even murder. In return for his services, he is paid by the political leaders’ (Hackenbroch, 2013b: 361).

³ A police station is popularly known as thana in Dhaka/Bangladesh.
bought some time for the barber. This is a regular occurrence and shows how local influential people exercise power to control the use of public space first by appropriating it informally and then renting it out to the urban poor by building permanent structures on public land.

Apart from locals, local politicians and their enforcers (mastans) often dictate the use of space and collect money from informal traders. Cross (1998)’s study in Mexico and Singh’s (2000) study in India also show that vendors usually make links with political parties or local politicians to secure livelihood space. In Sattola the second group of powerful actors are known as mastans. Mastans collect money from street traders and also take food (known as fao khaowa in Bangla) or cigarettes from vendors without paying them. Monem (28), a food vendor, said,

The local leaders of Banani sometimes get drunk and come at night. At that time, they tell me to fry whatever I have and they eat without paying. If I do not give them food, they try to destroy my van.

In addition to informal actors, formal actors further determine access to public spaces for the urban poor and they often deny poor people’s right to access to public spaces. This group have institutional authority. Hence the urban poor cannot fight with this group due to lack of tenure security over negotiated spaces. For example, the Bangladesh Medical Research Council (BMRC) which adjoins the slum is one example of this kind of authority, whose officials recently evicted street vendors from the nearby footpaths and installed bamboo fences so that the vendors can no longer operate shops. Apart from BMRC and other government hospitals, sometimes central government Ministers or local government officials move hawkers and vendors from footpaths and other public spaces. For example, interviewees said that there used to be many shops on both sides of the footpaths of Sattola. The health Minister came to visit the BMRC in 2014 and there was a traffic jam on the nearby BMRC road. On the next day the Dhaka North City Corporation
(DNCC) sent a magistrate and bulldozers\(^4\) to demolish all shops on that road as the Minister had ordered them to do so.

The roles of the central and local governments and their views on the use of negotiated spaces by informal workers are also important. Several studies have found hawkers and vendors are bound to pay the local police and other actors due to the nature of the space they occupy for their business (Brown 2006c; Pratt 2006). They occupy an ambiguous legal position even though their business is legal (Pratt 2006). Due to this ambiguity of public space, the police may evict them anytime if they operate their business on footpaths near the various main roads of Dhaka. The urban poor do not have direct access to state officials. Hence they are usually forced to negotiate with state officials through local power brokers/informal actors, despite the fact these people are often the source of exploitation. In most cases one or two ‘linemen’ collect money from street traders. This is a common practice in informal business in different parts of the developing world (Brown 2001; Brown 2006a; Brown 2006d; Brown 2006c; Pratt 2006). This practice is reflected in Sakib’s (16) statement, who is a food vendor and sells snacks in a pushcart at Banani,

My brother pays 300 BDT\(^5\) (he explains it as rent for space) for doing business in Banani (an affluent neighbourhood in Dhaka). He pays 20 BDT to lineman for the Police, 100 BDT to a local AL leader and 40 and 50 BDT to two other leaders. They are local leaders. That is why we have to pay them whether we like it or not. Otherwise they will not allow us to run our business there. Police do not help us in this regard.

In some cases police officers come directly to collect security money from the linemen. As Dilip (65), an owner of a semi-permanent tea stall, explained,

A lineman comes to collect security money. Police, local goons, Ansar, everyone wants money. I have to pay them otherwise they will not allow me to do my business over there. Police never come to us. They send someone else to collect money. An individual (lineman) collects money but it is distributed among many individuals.

The discussion so far indicates the urban poor ensure security of space by paying linemen or the local police officers. Apart from bribing police as a negotiation strategy, the urban poor use other strategies to avoid confrontation with dominant actors. For example, most of the time the urban poor quietly encroach public space to operate business with the help of their kin networks. If necessary, they change their vending places frequently to avoid paying protection money. The urban poor also reclaim their vending places within a very short period of time after every eviction. Some vendors negotiate with local shopkeepers disclosing their vulnerable and poverty ridden life and seeking permission from shopkeepers to sit in front of a corner of their shop. Using this strategy, sometimes they also able to avoid paying protection money as the owners of those shops told linemen/police that that individual is running his business.

Apart from this, the urban poor negotiate with local shopkeepers to keep their business materials (both goods and products) in their shops. The urban poor usually use this strategy to operate business in the affluent areas; such as, Banani, Gulshan and Baridhara in the diplomatic zone. Due to recent political instability and Islamic extremist groups’ attacks on some foreigners, hawking is strictly prohibited in these areas. However, some hawkers still operate business with the help of local shopkeepers. This negotiation strategy indicates the importance of social network for street vending. The importance of social networks and political connections are also evident from

\(^4\) The local newspaper also published a report regarding this eviction. The news reported that a team of DNCC led by Deputy Secretary, Mahbubur Rahman, began the eviction drive at 11am. The deputy secretary for Health, Hafizur Rahman Chowdhury, further told the journalists that the DNCC team will evict all illegal structures from in front of the hospitals in Mohakhali area. He said, “Some 145 acres of land of the directorate in the area had been occupied by illegal establishments for many years” (newsnextbd.com 2014).

\(^5\) BDT refers to Bangladeshi Taka/currency of Bangladesh.
Tania’s interview. Tania (35) used to operate a semi-permanent tailoring shop on the footpath adjacent to the AL office. However, recently the members of the local Ward Committee told Tania and some other semi-permanent shopkeepers to move their shop away from the footpath. They said, “It looks bad if they run shops in front of the local police office/party office”. They told Tania and other shopkeepers to find other open spaces within Sattola. Tania selected a place near the party office and told Manik (48), a local Ward Committee member, to give her that space. Tania did not get that space, Manik gave it to another shopkeeper and Manik advised Tania to find another place for her business. Later Tania moved her shop in front of the BMRC. Tania was able to secure her business spot due to her political connections with local politicians as well as her status of ‘being a local’. Tania campaigned for the Ward Councillor in the last ward Council election. This is how the ordinary residents sometimes are able to negotiate with the dominant actors using their social and political connections.

It becomes apparent that negotiation power is linked to political power and other sources of power. The more connections an individual can establish with different groups of powerful actors, the more likely they will be able to negotiate with the dominant group and will be able to secure their livelihood space in Dhaka. In most cases the poorest of the urban poor have less access to these dominant sources of power. They lack agency and less negotiating power than some other groups in Sattola, such as, longstanding residents or owners of houses or members of local Ward Committee. Now the question might arise why do they negotiate or bribe the dominant group? Why they do not resist? When asked these questions, most participants said they are powerful people, we cannot fight against them. Tareq (28), who was selling chick peas and puffed rice standing on the pavement near the Cholera hospital, said,

This is government’s land, if the police tell us to remove our stalls, we have to move. There is no other alternative. It is better to give some money to them rather than fight with them.

Conclusion

The urban poor have very limited power to resist the dominant group due to lack of tenure security of livelihood space. Therefore, they negotiate with the dominant actors by paying them security money or giving them food rather than starting a fight with them. This is also consistent with Etzold et al.’s (2009) study on the street food vendors of Dhaka.

The dominant actors use power to dictate use of negotiated spaces using traditions of ‘patron-client’ relations, connections with local politicians, social status, violence power or their affiliations with government institutions and state officials. The urban poor of Dhaka have lack of negotiating power to fight against the dominant actors due to their relative powerlessness and vulnerable position in society. Furthermore, the urban poor have little power to resist due to lack of legal and institutional rights to use negotiated spaces to earn income as well as lack of knowledge about their constitutional rights to work (Constitution of the People’s Republic of Bangladesh, Article 20, clause [1]). Hence they apply strategy that Bayat (2000) termed as the ‘quieter encroachment of the ordinary’ as well strategies; such as, paying security money to the dominant actors and maintaining good relationships with local shopkeepers, police and politicians. This confirms the importance of including power, power relations, negotiations, contestations and resistance in the discussion of livelihoods of the urban poor.
References


Theorising internal institutional diversity: Elinor Ostrom on rules and social conflict

Duncan Law

RMIT

Abstract
In this paper I analyse the work of Elinor Ostrom through the lens of Granovetter’s critique of New Institutional Economics. I argue that Ostrom’s work escapes Granovetter’s critique of theories that presuppose either under- or over-socialisation of economic actors. I argue however that Ostrom’s theoretical apparatus, while accommodating high degrees of institutional diversity between economic institutions, falls short in its ability to theorise institutional diversity within economic institutions. This has implications for Ostrom’s ability to analyse both social conflict and institutional change. While Ostrom’s work therefore represents an important advance on some alternative forms of institutional economics, a more complete theorisation of economic institutions must be capable of better analysing internal institutional diversity.

Keywords: Elinor Ostrom, New Institutional Economics, commons, governance, institutions, social conflict

Introduction
In his seminal paper on embeddedness, Granovetter (1985) contrasts economics with economic sociology by arguing that the former unrealistically abstracts from the social norms that influence all economic action. For Granovetter, economics oscillates between theories of under- and over-socialisation: the economic actor is seen as either a rational atomised individual, without any social determinants of action, or as so completely constrained by others’ decision-making as to lack agency altogether. The specific object of Granovetter’s critique is ‘New Institutional Economics’, as represented by the work of Oliver Williamson (1975). Granovetter argues that Williamson’s theorisation of his fundamental distinction between markets and hierarchies treats actors within firms as over- and within markets as under-socialised, thereby replicating a core feature of the neoclassical economics that new institutionalism otherwise appears to reject. Granovetter advocates a ‘third way’ between these extremes of absent and absolute socialisation - and proposes economic sociology as the discipline best placed to realise this approach.

Influential though Williamson’s work is, however, it is only one of the theoretical strands within ‘New Institutional Economics’. In this paper I will examine the work of Elinor Ostrom, the co-recipient, with Williamson, of the 2009 Nobel Memorial Prize in Economic Sciences. I will argue that Ostrom’s approach to new institutional economics walks a line between individual agency
and local social constraints that escapes Granovetter's critique. Nevertheless, I will argue that there are important weaknesses in Ostrom's theorisation of socialisation in economic institutions. Specifically, I will argue that Ostrom retains a tacitly unitary and homogeneous understanding of socialisation, which is not adequate to her own empirical insights into social conflict and conflictual norms within economic institutions.

Ostrom on the commons
The principal focus of Ostrom's work is the analysis of commons governance institutions. In a very wide range of case studies Ostrom analyses governance structures that fall outside the traditional dichotomy of market exchange versus state or firm hierarchy. In particular, Ostrom studies the institutions that manage common-pool resources: depletable resources like fisheries, irrigation systems, pastures and forests, where over-exploitation of the resource is a danger, and access to the resource is difficult or costly to restrict. For traditional economics, such common pool resources will 'naturally' be over-exploited by narrowly self-interested economic agents: a 'tragedy of the commons' in the sense defined by Garrett Hardin (1968). On that approach, over-exploitation can only be averted by either centralised state control of the resource, or the enforcement of exclusive private property rights.

For Ostrom, however, this traditional approach underestimates the range of governance structures that can effectively manage common pool resources. In her influential book Governing the Commons (1990), Ostrom discusses a wide range of case studies of local 'polycentric' commons governance systems - cases where local communities have self-organised governance structures involving neither top-down state control nor private property rights: communal land management in small communities in Switzerland and Japan; irrigation systems in Spain and the Philippines; groundwater basin management in the US; and others. In all these case studies Ostrom is concerned with understanding what makes for effective commons governance institutions.

Methodologically speaking, Ostrom's approach to this question has three dimensions. First, the collection and synthesis of detailed qualitative data examining how specific commons governance systems function in practice; second, the development of a theoretical framework aiming to understand in very general terms how to model institutions and institutional change; third and finally the application of this framework to the empirical data, in an attempt to discover shared features of successful commons governance systems, as well as shared features of institutions that fail.

As Ostrom notes, the theoretical dimensions of this approach cannot be cleanly separated from the empirical:

Theories affect the way that a problem is framed, not simply the particular assumptions used in an explanation. (Ostrom 1990: 46)

Two presuppositions in particular have, in Ostrom's view, lead many economists astray in their analysis of commons governance.

First the idea that commons governance is best modeled game-theoretically as a 'prisoner's dilemma' - that is, a game in which 'rational' self-interested strategic play is likely to lead to the outcome of universal non-cooperation, despite the fact that all players would receive greater benefits from universal cooperation. The prisoner's dilemma, Ostrom argues, is one possible incentive structure associated with commons governance; but it is not the only one.

Second the idea that the rules of the 'game' that constrain social actors' decision-making are given and unchangeable. Ostrom argues that while some of the constraints on economic actors' decisions are indeed exogenous to social action, at least in the short term - for example, the
material constraints of environmental attributes - many such constraints are themselves social, and can therefore be transformed by collective social action.

To challenge these presuppositions, Ostrom makes several related moves. First, she distinguishes the rules that shape actors’ actions into three kinds: those that indicate what social actions are permitted, forbidden and required. Second, she analyses institutions in terms of ‘nested sets’ of rules:

All rules are nested in another set of rules that define how the first set of rules can be changed. (Ostrom 1990: 51).

This allows Ostrom to develop an account of how social actors can change the constraints they are operating under, remaking the social game they play into one more likely to incentivise stable and cooperative outcomes. For Ostrom the ordinary day-to-day decisions made by economic actors take place within a framework of ‘operational rules’: who has access to which resources when; what sanctions will be directed at those who transgress those rules; and who is responsible for monitoring actors’ behaviour and imposing sanctions. These ‘operational rules’ are, however, nested within ‘collective choice rules’, which govern how economic actors can form or transform the operational rules; and these are in turn nested within ‘constitutional rules’ which govern how collective choice rules are made and applied.

Ostrom’s system is not reliant on this specific tripartite division; the important point is that each set of rules is nested within another, ‘deeper’ set of rules that governs how the lower level rules can be transformed. By shifting to this ‘multi-level’ analysis Ostrom aims to explain how prisoner’s dilemmas can be overcome, not just through cooperative play within the dilemma, but by transforming the entire institutional framework within which decisions are made.

This approach marks a significant advance on many traditional approaches within economics. At the same time, however, there are important weaknesses in Ostrom’s theoretical account. In the remainder of the paper I will explore one such weakness: Ostrom’s unitary and homogeneous understanding of institutional rules.

Rules as common knowledge

For Ostrom, as for Douglass North (1990: 5), institutions should be understood as the ‘rules of the game’ that structure economic action (cf. Ostrom 2005: 3, 179). But how does Ostrom understand these rules as influencing economic life? In Governing the Commons, Ostrom argues that these rules must be shared by all the members of an institutional space:

One should not talk about a ‘rule’ unless most people whose strategies are affected by it know of its existence and expect others to monitor behaviour and to sanction nonconformance. In other words, working rules are common knowledge… (Ostrom 1990: 50)

Ostrom is not here using the term ‘common knowledge’ in its ordinary-language sense, but as a technical term from game theory:

Common knowledge implies that every participant knows the rules, and knows that others know the rules, and knows that they also know that the participant knows the rules [and so on]. (Ostrom 1990: 50)

Common knowledge in this sense is a very strong assumption for Ostrom to incorporate into her definition of rules. Notably, it is an assumption that has been rejected by many ‘traditional’ game theorists. In an influential 1982 paper, for example, Kreps and Wilson showed that even very minor departures from the assumption of common knowledge can produce dramatic changes in equilibrium behaviour, including cooperative behaviour arising from ‘reputational’ effects.
Ostrom cites this paper favourably, but does not discuss why the common knowledge assumption is nevertheless incorporated into her own definition of game rules.

Even if we do not take Ostrom to be committed to the strict ‘common knowledge’ assumption, however, it is clear that for Ostrom an institution is a single set of rules shared by all its members. In other words, for Ostrom an institution is a unitary and homogeneous set of rules. The private interests and preferences of the members of an institution may differ, but the rules that are binding on their actions are shared and agreed.

By its nature, this theoretical framework does not permit Ostrom to theorise institutional structures that involve more than one set of conflicting rules. And yet such scenarios are common in economic life, including in case studies that Ostrom herself discusses.

In the fifth chapter of Governing the Commons, for example, Ostrom discusses a case study by Anthony Davis, of small boat fishing communities in Southwest Nova Scotia (Davis 1984). Davis describes the incompatibilities between locally enacted property rights and practices and the regulations mandated by the Department of Fisheries and Oceans. In Davis’ words:

these two sets of systems and rules often have different origins, reflect different principles and are motivated by different objectives. In fact, much of the conflict between small boat fishermen and the policies and regulations of the federal government can be explained by these differences. (Davis 1984: 140)

Similarly, in a later work on decentralised forestry management (Karmacharya et al. 2007), Ostrom and her coauthors write about conflicts over Leasehold Forest usage in Nepal. In a number of the authors’ case studies, government-assigned community usage rights were perceived by local forest users to conflict with traditional community usage, leading to social conflict over access to the land. Some communities resolved these conflicts by shifting de facto usage rights to coincide with local community norms; in other cases social conflict was ongoing.

In her qualitative overview of these cases, Ostrom discusses the conflicts created by different economic actors having different perceptions of the rules that should or do govern usage of these common pool resources. But Ostrom’s theoretical framework cannot easily accommodate this class of ‘collective action failure’ since, as we have seen, for Ostrom institutional rules are, by definition, shared by all participants. In terms of Ostrom’s theoretical framework, therefore, conflicts between rules must be understood in one of two ways. Such conflicts can be understood as either:

1. An outright failure of collective action, in which no institutional rules have been established at all.
2. An established institution with agreed-upon rules failing due to high rates of non-compliance among its members.

However, neither of these perspectives fully capture the relevant social reality in cases like those just discussed. It is not accurate to present a scenario in which multiple conflictual sets of rules inhabit the same institutional space as a failure to establish any rules. Lack of consensus around rules and lack of rules are not the same. Furthermore, what may appear from the perspective of one social actor as non-compliance with a consensus set of rules governing the institution, may appear from the perspective of the non-complying actor as compliance with a different set of rules which that actor also takes as - de jure or de facto - governing the institutional space. As sociologists are well aware, one person’s deviance is another person’s norm - but Ostrom’s theoretical framework is unable to capture this insight. Ostrom’s approach is therefore unable to theorise scenarios in which multiple sets of rules inhabit the same institutional space.
Conclusion
I began this paper by discussing Granovetter’s claim that New Institutional Economics presents economic actors as either under- or over-socialised. In this paper I have argued that Elinor Ostrom’s work successfully escapes this critique. Ostrom’s economic actors are not atomised individuals; they inhabit a normative space in which their actions are informed and constrained by collectively-determined rules. But neither are they automata whose actions are fully determined by social context. On the contrary, Ostrom’s actors exhibit agency in three distinct ways: a wide range of actions are available within the institutional framework they inhabit; actors can transgress the rules of that framework, in following individual preferences that do not match the expectations of the community; and actors can transform that framework, changing the rules of their institutions via collective social action. In all of these ways, Ostrom’s work provides a more nuanced and sophisticated account of socialisation within economic institutions than the forms of New Institutional Economics Granovetter criticises.

I have also argued, however, that Ostrom’s account of this socialisation is flawed in important ways. Most centrally, Ostrom assumes that all social actors within an institutional space regard the same set of rules as binding on their actions. Ostrom’s theoretical framework therefore cannot easily accommodate internal institutional diversity - institutions in which more than one set of rules are operative - and this limits Ostrom’s ability to theorise important forms of social conflict. A more complete theory of economic institutions must be capable of addressing this shortcoming.
References


Docile Bodies and Minds: A Genealogy of Chinese Workers in China

Elly Leung

Business School, University of Western Australia.

Abstract
This paper draws on a historical elaboration of Michel Foucault’s (1980) concept of power-knowledge to analyse how worker consciousness has been shaped in China to reflect ‘docile bodies and minds’. After presenting this discussion the paper concludes with considering the implications of the future labour activism in China.

Keywords: Genealogy; Worker Consciousness; Confucianism; ‘Docile Bodies and Minds’; Thought

Introduction
Foucault’s genealogical study of the effects of power relations in conditioning individuals into a certain “kind of thinking” is contrasted to the traditional conceptualisation of a continuous, knowing consciousness (Bacchi 2012). In opposition to the notions of continuation and ‘true’ knowledge (or universal knowledge) as the ‘final point’ of human development (Weeks 1982), Foucault’s analysis of the emergence of ‘prison practices’ (1977); the institutionalisation of ‘madmen’ (1976; 2006); and the construction of ‘sexual regulation’ (1978) has shown that individuals are the products of power relations. Thus, Foucault’s critique of knowledge (or episteme) is that traditional historians aim to write history in a way that maintains and reinforces a continuous narrative with little or no critical explanation (Smart 1985). However, whilst recognising the deficiency in traditional, historical writing, Foucault does not advocate abandoning knowledge and investigation of the past (Thacker 1997). Rather, Foucault suggests that the quest for a more authentic and accurate knowledge of the past is about re-interpreting earlier interpretations (Thacker 1997). Thus, history is written from a subjective perspective to make sense of the past (Thacker 1997). In so doing, writing history enables us to think, act, judge, and open up new possibilities for knowledge and thought in our present interpretations of history (Poster 1982; Thacker 1997).

This paper uses Foucault’s genealogical method to analyse how key events in Chinese history have shaped worker consciousness in the present day. The research questions guiding the paper are to understand how worker consciousness has been shaped in China, and how this affects the potential for organised labour activism in China. Beginning with the Zhou dynasty (13th B.C.E), we argue that the li rules with Confucian elements created docile bodies and minds amongst
Chinese workers that were sustained through the Mao period and still exist today. It is argued that this has had significant implications for labour activism in China. After presenting this discussion, we conclude with considering briefly the implications of the potential for Chinese labour activism.

**Li Rules and Confucianism**

Li (or proprieties) rules are a Confucian moral concept that equated ‘proper conduct’ to social status, that were used by the Zhou dynasty emperors to regulate individuals’ behaviour in imperial China (Yang 1978). Zhou society was hierarchical with a sharp distinction between the royal ruling class and the peasants (masses) (Cheng 1979; Yang 1978). Li rules reinforced this social order as they became a code of capital punishment (or death penalty – *sihsing*) to forbid certain speech, thought, and actions amongst the peasants (Lu 1998). Thus, *li* rule acted to suppress the thought and actions of the masses to those of the ruling class (Marx 1982).

Confucius (551 – 479 B.C.E) and his disciple Mencius (372 – 289 B.C.E) drew on the *li* rules to solidify this social hierarchical order of superior-inferior relationships (Yang 1978). ‘Proper’ conduct in Confucian society was defined by individuals acting appropriately according to their place within the hierarchy (Fouts & Chan 1995). Superiors, such as the emperors, acted as moral guardians and preachers to the ‘inferior’ masses, who were expected to unquestioningly obey and respect their authority (Fouts & Chan 1995). The theory was that if the entire population conformed to this Confucian ideology then social harmony, unity, and order would prevail across China (Whyte 1988).

Education was the key to developing social conformity. However, there were also informal social networks that used schools and family to reinforce the social order of the day (Madsen 2008; Rojek 1989). One example was the teaching of filial piety to children (Rojek 1989). Thus, the behaviour of individuals was regulated by others on the basis of a collective moral judgement (of others), as well as the self (Fairbank & Goldman 2006; Rojek 1989). Through this process, Confucius sought to internalise and strengthen the ‘inner-control’ of individuals via informal social processes (Rojek 1989). This system of social control was maintained in China from the Han Dynasty (206 B.C.E. – 220 C.E.) through to the Qing dynasty (1644 – 1911) – the last imperial dynasty of China (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009; Rojek 1989).

**China under Mao Zedong**

Towards the final years of the Qing dynasty, Western moral values were introduced into China and began to challenge the Confucian tradition (Chen 2002; Dreyer 1993). The inability of the Qing emperors to stem the imposition of Western influences through foreign trade relations, diplomatic missions, and ideas of democracies made it difficult for the Chinese state to exert the degree of control they would have liked over people’s lives (Whyte 1988). Social conflicts, particularly after the fall of the Qing dynasty in 1911, became apparent as the nation came under the influences of cultural diversity (Whyte 1988). In the period after 1919 (the ’May Fourth Movement’), Chinese pro-Western intellectuals had asserted that the ‘backwardness’ of Confucian culture was the root cause for individual passivity, and it accounted for the restriction of individual freedoms (Whyte 1988). Subsequently, new Western cultural and political values, ranging from socialism to liberalism, were advocated as alternative moral frameworks to guide Chinese society (Whyte 1988).

In 1949, the Chinese Communist Party’s (CCP) declaration of the founding of the People’s Republic of China (PRC) appeared to signal a ‘defeat’ over Confucianism and a victory for these Western cultural values (Whyte 1988). The CCP itself was a product of the ‘May Fourth Movement’. Chairman Mao Zedong and other CCP founders deplored the ‘intolerable elements’ of Confucian values, exalting instead the socialist ideology of the USSR (Whyte 1988). Therefore,
Mao denounced a range of Confucian values and proclaimed the *Thought of Mao Zedong* (or Maoism) as an ideological framework to guide the new socialist China (Whyte 1988).

**Creating Docile Bodies and Minds**

However, in order to construct and lay the groundwork for his model of Chinese socialism, Mao initiated the Confucian inspired thought reform programme *zhengfeng* (or ‘Rectification Campaign’) to alter individuals’ norms and behaviour in adhered to the Party’s communist agenda (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009). Mao’s thought reform programme sought to first control the inner will of the CCP members in the early 1940s (Perry 2002), and then extended this to non-party members to eliminate negative thoughts about Maoism after 1949 (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009; Lu 2004). Using the principle ‘from the masses to the masses’, Mao utilised all possible means of propaganda, including newspapers and public broadcasts to transmit principles of obedience to the Maoist doctrine (Weatherley 2006). This was strengthened by a more personalised method of ‘compulsory study groups’ conducted by party cadres (Weatherley 2006). Either willingly or under duress, the masses had to self-criticise and confess any ‘incorrect’ personal thoughts that ran counter to the will of the Party (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009; Lu 2004). Party cadres were required to report the political thought of the masses to the CCP leaders (Dittmer 1973). These strategies enabled CCP leaders to evaluate the thought of the masses to then implement the most appropriate techniques to continuously cultivate their ‘docile bodies and minds’ (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009).

In 1958, Mao mobilised the masses to transform China into an industrialised, socialist country under the Great Leap slogan of ‘overtaking Britain’s steel production in less than fifteen years’ (Breslin 2014). To accelerate industrial productivity, the masses were asked to labour in both agricultural and industrial sectors in the collective farms (Withington 2008). This led to the reduction of peasants harvesting the fields which in turn led to crop failure and caused the subsequent nationwide famine in 1959 and 1960 (Grasso, Corrin & Kort 2009). Following the Great Leap crisis, Mao sought to regain political power by removing his opponents from the CCP through a programme of mass criticism (later the Cultural Revolution) (McCormick 2010; Tsou 1969). In this event, the masses were ordered not only to destroy anything associated with traditional Chinese culture, such as books and paintings, but to murder the ‘intellectuals’ (Weatherley 2006). Their ‘willing’ participation in these events demonstrates that social consciousness was spiritually and bodily made docile according to the will of Mao.

It is argued that these events of Chinese history indelibly shaped a worker consciousness that continues into the post-Mao reformed China. It is this consciousness that has been at the foundation of success by the Chinese State in transforming China from a rural, agrarian economy into a modern, urbanised and industrialised economy (Gabriel 2006). It is argued that these ‘old’ forms of consciousness and interactions that had existed in Mao’s period indelibly influenced worker consciousness in the present day.

**Methodology**

To explore the research questions, two phases of data collection were conducted between 2011 and 2014. The first was in Shenzhen in Guangdong Province; Hefei city in Anhui Province; and Hangzhou in Zhejiang Province (2011 and 2012), while the second was in Panyu, Foshan and Haizhu cities in Guangdong Province between 2013 and 2014. Figure 1 below depicts these locations in China. Figure 2 provides a profile of respondents.

---

1 Approximately 142,000 teachers, 53,000 scientists and 2,600 writers and artists, as well as his CCP opponents (Weatherley 2006).
Included in the sample are workers who never participated in protests (G1: n=52), and those who engaged in protest action (G2: n=22). All interviews were transcribed and analysed using Nvivo 10 software.

**Findings and Discussion**

**G1:** The significance of workers thought about how social status determined their position in society was evidenced by the linking of poor working conditions to their lack of education:

I didn’t even complete primary school… because I am uneducated; I’ll never get a better job in my life…  
(Security Officer A, M, Shenzhen, 2011)

As a result, most worked in ‘sweatshop-like’ conditions (Chan & Senser 1997), where working hours varied between eight and thirteen per day without a fixed rest day, despite Chinese labour laws stipulating an 8 hour work day, six days a week, and no more than thirty-six hours overtime per month (Lehman 2008). Despite this, there was further evidence that workers ‘obeyed’ these working conditions because of their social status:

Our overtime hour finishes at 9.30pm – some of us may finish our tasks before 9.30pm – but we must complete the required overtime hours…  
(Head of sewing division at garment factory, F, Hangzhou, 2011)

…we rarely refused doing overtime work because our work leaders had made the arrangement for us already… so we must obey our leaders… otherwise three days of our wages would be deducted (Jewellery worker A, M, Haizu, 2013)
Furthermore, even though leaders used humiliating measures to control the behaviour of workers – once again – workers indicated that they deserved to be controlled by these methods to ensure that they performed the job correctly:

Apart from paying the fines for the mistakes we made, our work leaders wanted us to stand at the door and read out the company's rules and policies, such as the types of mistakes we were not allowed to make, in front of other workers… so we always remember to do our tasks properly… (SOE manufacturing worker, M, Hefei, 2011)

This account suggests that workers not only had a sense of fatalism that their living and working conditions were linked to their social status, but also an internal acceptance of the 'right' of those higher than them - that is, superiors - to subject them to this treatment. In other words, these findings show that workers appear to have internalised a power regime that leads to their acceptance as subordinates to their work supervisors. As a result, workers demonstrated their willingness to abandon any sense of reclaiming rights against matters such as long working hours and forced overtime. Thus, they remain 'captive' within a particular societal position and demonstrate a 'passive' disposition in terms of exhibiting any willingness to engage in protest activity.

G2: Similar to G1 workers – these workers also showed a sense of fatalism that they were destined to poor treatment because of a lack of education:

We, street cleaners, do not have ‘culture’ in us – we are illiterate, extremely grassroots, extremely dirty, we should not expect much because we are at the bottom of the society… (SOE street cleaner D, F, Foshan, 2013)

Whilst these workers had engaged in protest actions, they also indicated that this action was contrary to their social status:

If I could start it all over again I wouldn't want to go against my employer… I don't think work protest is an appropriate strategy – I don't think anyone should participate in work strikes at all – it's very tiring process and it's very difficult to get everyone to stay on the same boat because everyone is selfish” (Jewellery worker B, F, Panyu, 2013)

In summary, although these workers had engaged in protest action, there is evidence of similar thought to G1 workers that ultimately made their protest actions ineffectual in changing their status in the long term.

Conclusion
There are many limitations to this study. However, our application of the genealogical method to the exploration of worker consciousness has illustrated how Confucius thought has historically created ‘docile bodies and minds’ amongst Chinese workers from pre-reform China through to the present day. Most significantly, has been the internalisation of the Confucius concept of social status in the minds of today’s Chinese workers which guides them to think of themselves as destined for marginal positions in society, and behave in accordance with a ‘given’ position in China. It is argued that because of this, it is difficult to conceive how workers will mobilise an organised labour movement beyond this power- knowledge framework.
References


Lu, X 1998, Rhetoric in Ancient China, Fifth to Third Century B.C.E.: A Comparison with Classical Greek Rhetoric, University of South Carolina Press, South Carolina.


“Keen as fuck”: The subjectifying effects of young people’s discursive and practical outcomes from participating in semi-structured interviews.

Ben Lohmeyer
Flinders University; Tabor College, Adelaide.

There is a growing body of literature around young people’s experience of participating in qualitative research. This literature explores the outcomes experienced by young people resulting from participation. This literature overlooks the discursive effects and practical outcomes which result from young people’s participation. This gap will be addressed through findings from semi-structured interviews during which young people expressed their reasons for participation in research. In this paper I will argue that the current problematisation of young people’s reason for participation in research obscures practical and discursive effects of participation. Governmentality provides the theory by which it is possible to problematize the interview space as a discursive exercise and young people’s participation as action that changes their world.

Key Words: Subjectifying effects, Young People, Qualitative Research, Discourse, Governmentality

Introduction
There is growing interest in the experience of “being researched” and attempts to understand the outcomes people experience from participation in qualitative research. Within the youth studies context this represents a continuation of a process of decentring the adult within research. However, the current focus often fails to prioritise an analysis of power within knowledge production that moves beyond a hierarchical constructions of the researcher-participant relationships, ironically the very issue that such decentring attempts to address. To rectify this there is a need to engage with young people’s expressed reasons for participation. Governmentality provides the theory to problematize the power-knowledge relationship within qualitative interviews through which I will argue there are at least two outcomes young people experience that are not centred around the adult. These outcomes will be categorised as 1) practical, and 2) discursive. After providing some context within which the young people’s reflections were gathered, I will discuss the implications of these findings for the subjectification of young people as objects or subjects of research.

Literature review
The movement in the 1990s in youth research towards youth centred methods reflected a shift in the understanding of young people from objects to subjects of research (Allen, 2008, p. 565;
This acknowledged the right of the child to participate in research (Åkerström & Brunnberg, 2013, p. 530) and initiated the consideration that young people might have their own reasons for participation. The coinciding push towards creative and visual mediums for engaging young people in research has been acknowledged as obscuring the multiplicity of power-knowledge dynamics and the adult centric nature of research (Hunleth, 2011, p. 82; Lomax, 2005, p. 106). Attempts to find mediums which are more engaging for young people overlooks the possibility that young people experience inherent value in the process. This in turn reinforces the adult centric nature of research. Despite this, young people continue to choose to participate in research suggesting that they have their own reasons for participation.

In 2010 Clarke asked why people participate in qualitative research. His findings suggested that people engaged with research for multiple reasons. Individual’s participated in research for “subjective interest, curiosity, enjoyment, individual empowerment, introspective interest, social comparison, therapeutic interest, material interest and economic interest” (Clark, 2010, p. 404). People also participated for collective reasons including: “representation and giving voice; political empowerment; and, informing ‘change’” (Clark, 2010, p. 411). Clarke notes, however, that there are usually few attempts by researchers to gather the expressed experience of participation by those “being researched”. Others (Harris, Jackson, Mayblin, Piekut, & Valentine, 2015, p. 585; Lyon & Carabelli, 2015, p. 4) have argued that claims of empowerment are often overstated, and Clarke concluded that the findings were inevitably “representative of those researcher viewpoints who took part in the study” (Clark, 2010, p. 415).

Building on Clark’s work, Wolgemuth et al. (2015) found that different research paradigms adopted by researchers had little effect on the participant’s experience. Instead the relationship with the researcher proved to be a significant influence on a participant’s experience (Wolgemuth et al., 2015, p. 368). However, attempts to consider the research experience often overlook a systemic problem in youth research, described by Allen, as the historical practice of youth focussed research taking place through ‘adult proxies’ (i.e. parents, family members, teachers, etc.) (2009, p. 396). Whilst it may no longer be considered best practice to conduct research about young people by engaging adult proxies, the adult continues to be central to the identification of benefits of young people’s participation.

“Empowerment” is identified as an important outcome for participants in youth research (Allen, 2009, p. 398; Clark, 2010, p. 411; Gillies & Robinson, 2012, p. 162; Harris, Jackson, Mayblin, Piekut, & Valentine, 2015, p. 584; Lyon & Carabelli, 2015, p. 4). However, “empowerment” is an important site at which the centrality of the adult can be challenged. Firstly, empowerment implies a disempowered a-priori state. Empowerment has a subjectifying effect whereby the subject is knowable and governable (Dean, 2010, p. 69) in terms of their subordinate position. Hence empowerment describes an elevation of young people from objects, but only so far as a knowable inferior subject of research. Secondly, empowerment through research implies a hierarchical transaction whereby the lower status participant receives power from the higher status researcher (or the disembodied interview process itself). Whilst a vertical arrangement of the relationship persists (Åkerström & Brunnberg, 2013, p. 529), power needs to be understood in a non-adult centric way as something that is a feature of all relationships (Batsleer, 2008, p. 9).

An essential dynamic in the research encounter is the discursive formation of researcher and participant within the governing practices of research. Governmentality describes the relationship between power and knowledge as productive (Foucault et al., 1991, p. 102). Knowledge produces and regulates subjects who concurrently self-govern their own freedom (Allen, 2009, p. 399; Bacchi, 2009, p. 58; Tait, 1993, p. 48). Allen describes the adult centricity of the neo-liberal managerialism discourse within the ethics review process (2009, p. 407). This governing of research
constructs young people as passive and risky, and priorities the adult risk management activity. In a similar way the centrality of the adult is reinforced in Wogelmuth et al. and Clark’s focus on what the researcher brings to the encounter. The adult brings the research paradigm, manages risk, disseminates findings, and provides a means to achieve the participant’s outcome. I argue through participation in research young people achieve their own outcomes. Whilst this occurs within the research encounter, it is not centred around the adult. Instead it can be problematized as centring around the relationship between young person and researcher (McGarry, 2015, p. 3).

Methods
The findings discussed below result from a research project elucidating young people’s knowledge of violence and “fair process”. Fair process is a tenant of Restorative Practices theory suggesting principles by which young people can be engaged so as to develop their “trust and cooperation” (Kim & Mauborgne, 2003, p. 6). The project focused on young people who were located around sites of conflict between young people and adults. Two sites where selected due to their association with governing: 1) young people involved in child protection or juvenile justice systems; and 2) young people involved in Nonviolent Direct Action (NVDA). Twenty-eight young people participated in face-to-face interviews that lasted between 30 minute and an hour and half. Interviews took place in a location comfortable for participants (local youth centre, library, or their home). Participants where sixteen to twenty-five years of age. Thirteen identified as female, and fifteen as male. At the end of the interview participants were asked three questions: 1) what motivated you to participate in the interview? 2) How are you feeling? 3) Was the interview useful for you in any way? Interviews were recorded, transcribed, and de-identified so as to preserve participant’s anonymity. Patterns in participant’s responses resulted from thematic analysis.

Findings and Discussion
When invited to participate in the research one young person said they were “keen as fuck”. Traditional adult-centric views on research participation conceptualise young people as incompetent (Fox, 2013, p. 987), incapable (Allen, 2009, p. 404) or disinterested in participating in research (Gillies & Robinson, 2012, p. 163). Interactive, visual and creative mediums promise to increase youth participation (Åkerström & Brunnberg, 2013, p. 528). Themes could be identified in the current project data that reinforced this view, or align with the benefits Clark described. However, themes also emerged from the data which suggested young people achieved outcomes from participation that did not centre around the adult researcher. These outcomes can be categorized in two ways: 1) Practical, and 2) Discursive. Practical outcomes are those that the young person immediately achieved that changed their world in tangible ways as elucidated by them. Discursive outcomes are the ways in which the “institutionalised force” (Strega, 2005, p. 219) of knowledge generated through the interview change the way young person thinks and acts, and as such changes their world. The following discussion will explore both of these in detail drawing on examples from the data.

Practical outcomes
Overlooking practical outcomes from participation would demonstrate a high degree of adult centricity, as such, the young people in this study expressed a range of practical reasons for their participation. When asked why they chose to participate in the interview the participants responded in ways that were unsurprising and yet essential to a young person centred problematisation of participation.
Researcher: So tell me, why did you agree to have this conversation?

Young Person: I was, kind of not liking the other person in the classroom.

Researcher: Ok.

Young Person: I don't like other people.

For this young person the research provided an opportunity to exit an unwanted situation. This outcome had little to no relation to the research. Their agenda had no discernible connection to the researcher’s. Acknowledging young people’s manipulation of research for their own purposes continues the movement away from conceptualising young people as objects of research, to active subjects of research (Allen, 2008, p. 565; 2009, p. 396; Gillies & Robinson, 2012, p. 161; Harris et al., 2015, p. 584). The following young person similarly expressed their own agenda for participation.

The similarity between these two participants lies in their use of research to achieve their agendas.

Young Person: Because I have always wanted to speak to someone about it. Like always, and you just happened to come up. So I was like yeah for sure. I'd love to tell someone this story.

In this instance the participant’s and researcher’s agendas aligned. This alignment can be misleading and suggest a motivation that is adult centric; i.e. an outcome of participation is having your story heard (by an adult). However, this would overlook the simpler truth that the young person wanted to tell their story. The value of participation is the agentic telling of their story (Lyon & Carabelli, 2015, p. 13). Despite who is listening to the story, the young person’s world is changed by telling.

Finally, the following comment by a young person supports the findings from Wolgemuth et al. (2015) regarding the importance of the relationship within the research encounter. In this instance the researcher and the young person had met previously in a professional context.

Young person: I get to catch up with you. You are a sick cunt. And it has been eye opening sort of interesting day start. To see what you are studying and see how, for the little bits of psychology that I have studied here and there correspond to the violence and what not in your PhD.

Highlighted here is again the young person’s agenda to achieve something practical; i.e. the maintenance of a relationship. After the interview recording was stopped the young person offered to sell the researcher illicit drugs. Arguably this represents a further practical agenda for participation. This offer is likely to raise ethical concerns. This project underwent and received ethics approval.

However, to focus on the particulars of the ethics process at this point would ironically be a to focus on the concerns of adults in the research process. Allen described the potential for the concerns of ethics processes to paradoxically be “antithetical to the conduct of ‘ethical research’” (2009, p. 399). Focus on the risk assessment process in this paper would undermine the ethical concern that young people should be conceptualized as active capable subjects (not risky objects) of research.

To overlook the practical goals young people expressed for participating in research is to present an inaccurate picture of the research encounter, but also reinforces the adult centric nature of research. Certainly some agendas for participation carry risks that need to be managed by the researcher. However, conflicts between the agenda of researcher and young person are an important insight in and of themselves (Harris et al., 2015, p. 596).
Discursive outcomes

As identified by Clark (2010, p. 402), when asked about their motivation for participation young people express a desire to help others. In the current research this altruistic response extended beyond similarly situated young people, to a broader sense of collective humanity. Young people understood the research encounter as a means to give back and improve the lives of everyone. Again this desire can be problematised in the terms presented by Clark. However, in addition to being adult centric, Clark’s problematisation suggests a staged process whereby the data provided by the participant is disseminated by the researcher, which being read by others might then effect change in application. In contrast, through the discursive action in the research encounter the participant challenges and creates knowledge that directly shapes (or governs) their sense of self and the world (Foucault, Burchell, Gordon, & Miller, 1991, p. 79). In addition, the researcher is inexorably bound up in this discursive process and is also governed by productive power-knowledge relations (McGarry, 2015, p. 3).

Participants (including the researcher) are rendered self-governing subjects, and the world is immediately changed.

Young Person: I thought it might be a nice thing to do. Help someone out with their uni stuff. Um, yeah and also I guess, yeah, its yeah I find it good to talk about nonviolence and to, um, think about these things and clarify my ideas and all that kind of stuff.

This young person expressed a number of important outcomes which demonstrate the discursive effects of the encounter and challenge adult centricity. Firstly, they believed it might be a “nice thing to do”. The experience has value in itself. Again a desire to help someone else (the researcher) is expressed. Finally, they identify value in “clarifying my ideas”. Tait suggests that “youth” can be problematized as “doing of certain kinds of work on the self” (1993, p. 42). Though “youth” the young person generated knowledge about the world and themselves. With this knowledge they work on and govern themselves. “Youth” becomes an “artefact government” (Tait, 1993, p. 4) or an “artefact of expertise” (Kelly, 2010, p. 312). The research encounter is an opportunity through which the young person is active in the development of knowledge about themselves and the world.

In the following excerpt two young people wanted to be interviewed together. The exchange demonstrates the co-creation of knowledge and the subject.

YP1: I don’t know like, to help sort of thing. Cos I mean…

YP2: To help other people.

YP1: Yeah to help other people, like I mean. Yeah back in when I was younger the help that I got I am so thankful of. And the way I see it is if someone wants help or some information then I don’t see it as a problem sort of thing. You can’t really change what your past is.

YP2: You need to sort of help everyone else realize what is happening in life for you to realize as well.

The desire expressed here to help others might be achieved through the dissemination of the findings. Other young people might find their stories helpful, or practitioners might find guidance for professional practice. However, the interaction between the participants demonstrates the production of knowledge and the subject through conversation (McGarry, 2015, p. 1). Batsleer describes the way “sparks fly” in conversation and “power relations shift and are transformed” (Batsleer, 2008, p. 9). The subject producing discourse is not adult centric but rather is located in the relationship (McGarry, 2015, p. 5).
Conclusion
Despite attempts by youth researchers to move research methods away from “adult proxies” and incentivised mediums the practice and justification of youth research is persistently adult-centric. The developing body of literature around participant’s experience of research reinforces adult and researcher centricity. I have argued that one way to counter this discourse and the production of young people as risky and disinterested, is to examine young people centred outcomes from research participation. By asking young people about their reasons for participation this research has discovered that young people participate in qualitative research for at least two reasons: 1) practical outcomes and 2) discursive outcomes. Both outcomes can be understood as having subjectifying effects that are not centred around the adult researcher. However, it is not necessary, or perhaps even desirable, to extradite the adult from the analysis altogether. Rather these outcomes centre around the interaction between the two parties. The interaction itself is knowledge and subject producing. Young people and adult are both active in the productive cycle of self-governing. Working on themselves and the world around them can be understood as a central task of youth, and qualitative interviews are an opportunity to continue to this work.
References


Hazara stories of transition from flight to success: Reflecting on embodied interviewing practice in two interviews with post-settlement refugee Australian Hazaras

Laurel Mackenzie
School of Global, Urban and Social Studies, RMIT University

Abstract
This paper describes an interview I conducted in late 2015 with two Australian Hazara post-settlement refugees living in Dandenong. The paper explores themes of the stories they tell, from the trauma of their journeys to Australia to locating themselves as successful migrants in Dandenong. The paper also explores the embodied context of the interview itself, looking at the ways in which identities were constructed in the physical sphere of the interview, through objects, dress, behaviour and gestures. This attention to embodiment provides a reminder of the immediacy of the stories being told, which attempts to remove the fallacy of the invisible, omnipotent interviewer.

Introduction
The piece explores a narrative interview with two post-settlement Hazara refugees living in Dandenong, a South-Eastern suburb of Melbourne. The research investigated the question of how Hazaras narrate the stories of their experience in their transition from being Afghan to Australian Hazaras. In their accounts they locate themselves both within a paradigm of refugee experience as having suffered extreme hardships, and as successful migrants. An awareness of the embodied dynamic of the interview allows some interviewer reflections on the performance of identity within the space of the interview.

Both Hassan’s and Salmi’s stories are also stories of the lived effects of policy. In both of these stories the Australian policy context provides an invisible structure that guides the course of their narratives. In the context of other events, the progression of legal statuses attained by Hassan and Salmi’s father are what allow other events to unfold. In this way, the lived experiences described in this piece can be read as a way of understanding the lived effects of policy. Carol Bacchi’s method of policy analysis that suggests that the effects of policy may be assessed through three approaches: looking at its discursive effects, or the meanings that are produced; subjectivisation effects, or the kinds of subjects that are produced; and lived effects, or the effects policy has on
day to day experiences like life and death (Bacchi, 2009). Here, the lived experiences recounted in these narratives provide examples of the effects of policy on peoples’ lives.

**Background**

The Greater Dandenong region encompasses the suburb of Dandenong and five other adjacent suburbs, covering an area of just under 130 square kilometres. The City of Greater Dandenong calls itself the ‘city of opportunity,’ and has implemented welcoming policies and practices including programs for asylum seekers and survivors of torture, anti-racism policies, language learning, cultural centres and more. Dandenong is considered ‘the place to be’ for new Hazara migrants – when given the choice of other regions, even without knowing what or where Dandenong is, it is the locale they choose (Mackenzie and Gunatik, 2015). The two interviews in this piece describe successful migrants, whose active membership in the local Hazara community includes sending remittances to family members overseas, and leadership roles assisting other arriving migrants.

The relationship of Hazara refugees, recent migrants and post-settlement refugees to wider Australian society is a somewhat one-sided one. In broad terms, gross media depictions do not seem to differentiate between Hazaras and other Afghan ethnic groups – and even in academic and activist circles, ‘who are the Hazaras’ is a distinction that people are not generally able to draw. But to the Hazara post-settlement refugees I have interviewed in this project, the question of the relationship between Australian Hazaras and members of the wider Australian community is a crucial one. Respondents speak of wanting to give back not just to the Hazara community, but to the wider Australian community; and of wanting to demonstrate that the Hazaras are hard working, able to contribute to a wider society; not just sit around waiting for handouts. The women that I have interviewed are generally involved in education and resettlement programs for Hazara and other women migrants. The two interviews that form this piece are with respondents who relied on Hazara networks to make it in Melbourne.

**Methodology**

The research question guiding this investigation was “how do post-settlement refugee hazaras narrate their identity?” An attention to the embodied aspect of the interview and the recounted stories themselves stories adds depth to the possible analyses by relocating these in the context of being in the world, and subject to specific workings of power based on cultural, raced and gendered specificity.

The interviews in this piece were conducted in a project approved by RMIT’s Human Research Ethics Committee with post-settlement refugee Australian Hazaras who have been living in the greater Dandenong community for at least five years. Interviews began with an open-ended question “Can you please tell me the story of your life since you first thought you might come to Australia? I won’t interrupt, I’ll just take some notes to ask you about later.” The second part of the interview explored the accounts that emerged with questions drawn directly from the narrative, asked in the same order as they were recounted so as not to break the remembered gestalt (Chamberlayne et al., 2000; Wengraf, 2011). This type of interview is designed to allow the respondents’ stories to emerge uninfluenced - as much as possible - by interviewer expectations and assumptions. The interviewer is very careful not to interrupt, asking questions in the second part of the interview only in the order in which the story was told in the first place, that might lead down the rabbit holes of memory into further narratives.

This style of interviewing was developed in “recognition that social science, in its longues durees of positivism, determinism and social constructionism, has become detached from lived realities” (Chamberlayne et al. 2000: 1). Narrative interviewing as a whole, and particularly this biographical narrative interviewing method (BNIM) variant of it, is structured to try and

1 http://www.greaterdandenong.com/section/2512/diversity
reconnect with the realities of lived experience, to actually tell people's stories. Biographies, life stories, the way people tell their stories are a way of engaging with their own understandings of the psychosocial processes that shape them, the ways that life experiences are written on their bodies and experiences, and their own interpretations of these.

The body is where experiences of difference are inscribed. The embodied practice of the interview itself also formed part of the subject of analysis, through an understanding that my located subjectivity – my presence – had an effect on the interview itself, in accordance with Haraway’s (1988) understanding of situated knowledges. Removing the assumption of the disembodied, uninvolved interviewer opens space for the exploration of ways in which power and identity are performed, in the specific context of the interview. Following Canadian researchers Dyck and McLaren, this kind of understanding allows a focus on the “complex relationship between story-telling and its discursive and material context” (Dyck and McLaren, 2004, p. 527). That is, an understanding that the ways in which the stories of success were told to me were not unrelated to the particular identities that were being performed in the sphere of the interview, and an understanding that the physicality of the interview space contributes to the kind of stories that are told.

A focus on the embodied aspects of the interview allows understandings to emerge around how identity is performed and constructed from moment to moment. Following theorists like Mcdowell (1999), the physicality of the interview space itself is also constituent of identity. Practices as simple as greetings, or the ways in which we sit, are part of how identity is performed and discourses are negotiated. The space between interviewer and interviewee becomes one in which the “social locations of researcher and researched are at once intensified and provide a space for translating, with uncertainties, each other’s knowledges” (Dyck and McLaren, 2004, p. 519). In the slightly artificial, intensified context of the interview, Salmi and Hassan recounted to me their stories of coming from Afghanistan in a narrative arc that led up to and described their current successes, almost certainly influenced by the knowledge that I was going to write their stories. I was myself aware of performing the role of interviewer and academic. The interview, if seen as a performance, was a staged story of integration and cultural identity, where identities were negotiated and reconstructed through the telling of the stories.

The setting
When I arrived at the comfortable suburban house, the door was answered by Salmi’s sister, an older woman who Salmi later indicated was their (non-English speaking) grandmother. The younger women wore jeans, and headscarves in what I took to be a more modern style (one piece in slightly stretchy fabric, rather than a scarf wrapped around the head). I followed the example set by the pile of shoes at the door and slipped mine off; and Salmi offered me slippers to wear inside the house. I followed her into a large room ringed with cushions. Salmi introduced me to Hassan, her father’s business partner, whom I was also there to interview. I reached to shake his hand, but he backed away slightly apologising.

In my activist visits to detention centres I had grown used to meeting men who would overcome more conservative traditions and shake hands, even hug. I had forgotten my habit of approaching with hands in yoga prayer position at my chest and waiting for them to make the first move. It was a slightly awkward start to our first meeting. Salmi and I had corresponded via email after my research outline had been forwarded to her, but we had not met in person before. We sat on the floor, and Salmi placed a tray of wrapped chocolates and nuts and sweet tea between us. I arranged my symbols of respectable academic identity – papers, recording device, and consent forms – around me, and after talking through the process (including their right to withdraw from the research at any time), began the interview.
I interviewed Hassan first, and then Salmi. Throughout Hassan’s interview Salmi stayed quiet, interjecting only once in Dari when he was fumbling. After his interview was finished he left the room, and I conducted the same interview with Salmi. Both interviews finished with our drinking tea and eating a couple of the sweets, though after Salmi’s she gave me advice on my approach – noting that if I am interviewing Hazaras then I should be more familiar with their customs. I felt a shift in the power dynamic— I had tried to present myself as the expert, but she had reminded me that she and Hassan were the experts in their own situations.

Salmi is a young woman in her 20’s, Hassan is her father’s age. Both their stories describe a narrative arc from hardship to success. The reasons for this could be severalfold: firstly, it could indicate a desire to play the part of the ‘good’ migrant (Ahmed 2010). It could be part of the specific Hazara desire to locate their community as demonstrating qualities of desirable citizenship – both respondents are very conscious of their history and ties to Hazara communities. Relationship to family plays a large part in the recounted identities of both interviewees in this paper.

**Interview**

In his interview, Hassan described hardships including a harrowing boat journey and his time on a temporary protection visa (TPV).

In that time I was a TPV and I had a lot of problems… I stayed nine months in [detention] camp and when I was released I was working in a meat factory…

His family had attained UNHCR refugee classification and waited in a refugee camp in Djarkarta while he worked to save money to bring them to Australia. His TPV did not allow for family reunification, but his strategy was to earn enough to bring his family to Australia — then, since they were already formally classified as refugees, his legal status would also change, under Australia’s family reunification policy at the time.

I was working there for three years. Since my family [were going to] come here, I thought I have to start some business because I was sure in that time, when my family come here the lawyer told us if one of us be a refugee, directly all family will be refugees.

He told me about some of the hard aspects of being a refugee – working 15-hour days in the abattoir to send money to his family, who still wanted more; and how he cried when he telephoned his family and his young daughter waiting in Indonesia didn’t know him.

Dyck and McLaren describe how “the telling and listening of the interview was an embodied, emotional event” in their research (Dyck and McLaren, 2004, p. 524). In both Hassan’s and Salmi’s stories the intersubjective experience of hearing their stories was also an emotional one. In Salmi’s case she was the small daughter left behind – her family waited in Pakistan while her father sought permanent refuge first in Iran, then in Australia. She started to cry while recounting this part of her story.

We were left on our own, my mum, my older brother was eight at the time. My two sisters, one of them was five, my younger one was one. We were on our own in Pakistan and life was really hard there as well, because in there you know, you need a male person to live with you.

The fact that my dad wasn’t with us was very hard for all of us. Now that I think of it, it would have been the hardest for my mum, because she could understand everything.

The ‘everything’ encompassed the danger and fear that her mother worked to protect her children from while her father went through the stages of the refugee determination process in Australia, moving through internment, acquiring a Bridging Visa, then applying for and attaining his PR (permanent residency). Finally after five years he was able to bring his family out of hiding in
Pakistan under the Australian family reunification act, which allowed for the family members of a refugee also to be formally classed as refugees.

Salmi describes Australia as a safe place in contrast with Pakistan, where women can't go outside without a man accompanying them. She locates the safety she feels both in terms of Australia itself, but also associated with the presence of her father: “We are safe and everything is good and we're living with my dad”. Although Hassan longingly describes Afghanistan as an absent mother, he also refers to Australia as safe.

My country is like my mum. I can't change my mum with like a pretty girl because my mum is my mum. I know I love Australia for a lot of things. Facilities here and it's safe here and I got a job here - everything is all right.

Salmi mentions in passing some racism she had experienced in Australia, but (in common with other migrant narratives (Ahmed 2001, p. 135), she puts this down to people's ignorance and narrow-mindedness, and blames the media for perpetuating a culture of fear, locating her own experience in general as one of acceptance. The main difficulty she recounts is around the different education systems.

The system was very different from Pakistan. When we were going to school there, it was so much stricter. The teachers were more… authoritative and the students were listening and I was used to that.

Not academically stimulated, she moved to a different school, and she there found her English wasn't adequate to the tasks she had to complete. But – she described in a rush – she overcame these obstacles and graduated from Monash University. Then, following a chance meeting at a rally with a Hazara community leader, formed a women's support group for newly arrived migrant women.

So I was thinking about that - how to start something, how to do, how to help people. There was a protest in the city, in Melbourne City and it was for the rights of the Hazara people in Quetta, Pakistan because at that time they were being killed in Quetta. In there, I met this lady from the Hazara community, and she asked me what I wanted - you know, what I was doing. I told her this is my vision. This is what I want to do. And she said, why don't we start something together?

From this beginning Salmi became involved in setting up one of the largest Hazara women's support networks in Australia. Hassan too describes his success in Australia as due to the wider Hazara community. He opened his first shop by drawing on connections and cultural capital:

I talked to all my friends. I didn't know them in Afghanistan, just I knew in here and we were in the same compound. We're working and I asked them, come on, help me. Without anything, some of them give me $10,000, another one $5000. They helped me.

From here he frames his narrative as one of success, describing the opportunities available to his children in Australia that would not have been in Kabul.

I'm very happy, not only for myself, of course more for my family. My daughter, she is 18 years old now. She finished the school now. My son is around 25 and just last week he finished Uni and he studied as a civil engineer. If they had been in Afghanistan, no chance to study.

Conclusion
In their interviews, both Hassan and Salmi described their transition from sadness and loss to integration and success. Embodied experiences constitute the basis of these narratives – when Salmi describes the time in Pakistan as 'hard' she is referring to the limits placed on women's
embodied experience. Hassan’s ‘hard’ described long days in an abattoir. Both accounts are also about the bodily experiences of being refugees. Through their stories, Salmi and Hassan engage in the understanding and construction of Hazaras as an emerging migrant community in Australia. A theme of sadness can also be seen, located in the early parts of the narrative – but the narratives strongly locate the present as better than the past. Thus their narratives also produce them as ‘good’ migrants - through stories that link hard-working and forward-looking values, locating and constructing Dandenong as the site of a successful growing migrant community, and themselves as participating in it. Finally, The lived effects of policy can be seen in these narratives when the events recounted are placed against a policy background – in these narratives, policy around TPV’s and family reunification are prominent.
References


The Lucky Country vs. a Fierce Planet: Gamification and Simulation as Tools for Teaching Complex Social Theories of Sustainability

Liam Magee
Western Sydney University

Anthony Richardson
RMIT

Nicole Pepperell
RMIT

Introduction: the Challenges of Teaching Social Theories of Sustainability

This paper aims to outline some of the possible advantages of the web-based simulation tool Fierce Planet for the teaching of social theories of sustainability to undergraduates. Its contention is that such a tool can address some of the challenges involved in teaching social theory in general, and theories of sustainability in particular. While social theorists understand their work as eminently practical – as a means of mobilising the sociological imagination to orient our collective action in a complex world – the concrete relevance of social theory has long been recognised as notoriously difficult to communicate in a classroom setting (e.g. Orum 1980; Holtzman 2005). The position of social theory within undergraduate curricula – often segregated out from more advanced “applied” courses, and taught in introductory “general knowledge” courses to mixed-discipline cohorts – exacerbates this problem. Tacitly communicating that theoretical concepts are introductory matters, this alignment implies they are soon to be superseded as students advance to more specialised courses in which they can “get their hands dirty”.

To these general challenges can be added those more specific to the teaching of social theories of sustainability, involving complex relationships between economic growth, population growth and potential environmental limits. Frequently this requires confronting students with the enormous and even apocalyptic social implications of such theories, and the corresponding potential for pessimism about the powerlessness of individual social actors.

This combination, as Holtzman (2005) suggests, is potentially toxic for cognitive resources, enhancing the odds that students will become overwhelmed and disengage from the material entirely.

Enlisting students in more hands-on, practical, problem-based learning environments offers one means to address these challenges (Macheski et. al., 2008; Pedersen 2010; Osnowitz & Jenkins
Yet these techniques can often seem precisely inapplicable to abstract theoretical contents, and instruction often defaults to traditional practices such as lectures, assigned readings, class discussions, and essays (Harris, n.d.). Unfortunately, these practices only tend to reinforce the message that theoretical reflection is more particularly “academic” than the skills covered in other courses, which are more likely to offer students the chance to explore “real world” applications.

Background: Simulating a Fierce Planet

In this paper, we explore one important option for overcoming these problems: the use of a web-based simulation tool – which we have named ‘Fierce Planet’ – that enables hands-on, practical, problem-based scenarios to be deployed in the teaching of social theories of sustainability. In development since 2011, in its early stages the Fierce Planet tool took the form of a simple 2D “tower defence” game that could be localised to specific geographic areas and used to explore “triple bottom line” understandings of sustainability (Magee 2012). In early 2014, the project received a Sustainable Urban Precincts Program grant, which enabled the development of a more engaging and complex 3D simulation environment for Fierce Planet alongside a model undergraduate syllabus, including targeted readings and recommended classroom activities. This syllabus was designed to walk students through the historical development of social theories of the relationship of population, economic growth, and environmental resources, from Malthus through the present day. An analysis of this syllabus and the simulations developed to support it, along with a technical discussion of the agent-based-modelling techniques used by the tool, was published in Richardson et. al. (2015).

Here we present the next stage in the development of the Fierce Planet tool: the results of a simulated classroom exercise, involving a small-group lab activity with participants who were both current teaching staff in relevant undergraduate courses and, simultaneously, current students or recent graduates. This simulated classroom exercise was designed to provide feedback on what works well, and what still needs improvement, in both the tool itself and the model syllabus. We plan more extensive pilot testing among both more senior academic staff and students from a range of classes at RMIT University later in 2016. We describe the method for the pilot, analyse the pilot data and conclude by reflecting on the potential to extend Fierce Planet to support a wide range of teaching strategies, and to strengthen student comprehension of complex social theories of sustainability.

Method (1): A Simulated Series of Classes

The pilot study was designed to test the basic plausibility of the model syllabus, readings, simulations and classroom activities originally set out in Richardson et. al. (2015). Because that model syllabus covered content that could form the backbone of an entire undergraduate term, the pilot study necessarily sampled selectively from that syllabus, focusing on three specific theories:

1. Malthus’ (1798) theory of interaction between the geometric expansion of population and the arithmetic expansion of food supply, with consequent boom and bust cycles of population growth, resource depletion, population collapse, resource recovery, and population recovery;
2. The neo-Malthusian Limits to Growth (Meadows et al., 1972) theory that added variables of potential resource exhaustion and consequent dramatic collapse; and
3. A “cornucopian” theory – based specifically on Simon (1981) – which understands, contra Malthus and Limits to Growth, natural resources as infinitely substitutable. It further assumes increases in human population correspond to increased opportunities to discover new technological solutions to problems of energy or resource depletion – thus the greater the population, the greater the resource availability.
These three theories have the virtue of relying on a related set of variables – population and resources – which simplified the process of constructing and demonstrating how the simulation software works.

For purposes of the pilot test, these readings were abbreviated to brief selections of text that enabled readers to deduce the key variables significant for simulating a particular theory. These selections were both easier and more difficult than full readings would have been. On the one hand, they pre-identified for the participants the points regarded as most important in a given text – an activity that would more normally be reserved for a classroom exercise. On the other hand, they were much more compressed and difficult to read than a full text, which can gradually prime the reader for the author’s conclusions.

Ethics approval for the pilot was sought and obtained from RMIT University’s CHEAN subcommittee of the HREC (0000019327-04/15) on July 3, 2015. All participants received copies of the plain language information form for the study, and all signed consent forms agreeing to be audio recorded during the session while they participated in classroom discussions and guided computer simulations, as well as to respond in written form to a questionnaire involving 45 Likert-scale questions and two open-ended free response questions. Participants received a $50 voucher for a local book store in consideration for their time. It was made clear to participants that they would receive this voucher simply for arriving for the session, and that they would still receive the voucher even if they left without participating in the pilot.

A single two-hour pilot was run at a computer lab at RMIT University. Four participants were recruited from among the sessional teaching staff in the School of Global, Urban and Social Studies. The school was chosen because its teaching staff are responsible for conducting a wide array of introductory social theory courses designed for first-year undergraduates.

Sessional staff members were chosen for two reasons. First, introductory courses are very often large, with most students only interacting with permanent staff via lectures, but otherwise interacting primarily with sessional tutors, who are tasked with communicating course concepts in interactive sessions. If new instruments are not seen as viable by sessional staff – if they involve too high a learning curve, are too technical, or perceived as not adding value to classroom discussion – they are unlikely to find general use in undergraduate classrooms. In this sense, the recruitment technique was intended to establish a representative case study of the sorts of staff most likely to be asked to adopt a tool like *Fierce Planet* (Yin 2013). Second, these sessional staff were either currently students themselves in higher degree programs, or recent graduates from such programs. This dual identity enabled participants to reflect on the software both from the perspective of someone thinking about using this kind of simulation in their own teaching, and from the perspective of how they would respond as learners.

Based on Likert-scale questionnaire data, the four participants ranged in tertiary teaching experience, though they were skewed towards less experience. The least experienced had just finished their first teaching term, while the most experienced had taught for five years. Only one participant described themselves as “strongly agreeing” that they “regularly play computer games on personal computers, tablets or games consoles” – all other participants “strongly disagreed” with this option. Similarly, only one participant “agreed” or “strongly agreed” with statements that professed familiarity with agent-based modelling games or simulations; all others rated themselves as “strongly disagreeing” or “disagreeing” with these statements. Respondents were more mixed in characterising their awareness of, or education in, concepts of sustainability, limits to growth, theories of the relationship of resource use and growth, social indicators, and related concepts. One respondent rated themselves as having strong awareness and training in these areas, but other respondents provided mixed responses, suggesting greater familiarity with some of these concepts than others.
We considered the inclusion of participants without strong prior gaming or modelling experience to be particularly important, primarily to avoid such experience interfering with the assessment of the useability of this kind of instrument in a classroom environment. The skew of participants towards less experienced tertiary teachers was also beneficial in providing data on the ease with which Fierce Planet could potentially be implemented: given the increasing reliance on sessional staff for large undergraduate courses, a tool that could only be implemented by very experienced teachers would have limited value.

Method (2): Running the session
During the pilot session, participants were asked to work in groups of two, with each group sharing a computer that was logged into Fierce Planet. The session started with a brief explanation of its structure, and an opportunity for participants to read the plain language information form, and decide whether they were willing to sign the consent form. The audio recording was not commenced until all participants had done this. In the remaining 90 minutes, participants were led through the three simulation scenarios. Each simulation lasted approximately 20 minutes, followed by several minutes completing the relevant sections of the Likert-scale questionnaire. For the final 20 minutes, a general focus-group-style discussion of the Fierce Planet tool providing an opportunity for participants to reflect on how the tool could be improved, and how they could see it working, or not working, in a classroom environment.

Findings and Discussion: Discovering a Fierce Planet
The first simulation began by passing around brief samples from Malthus’ writings. Since the language of these texts is archaic and very dense, making sense of the text posed a significant challenge for all pilot participants. In particular, participants unfamiliar with Malthus were unable to work out, simply from the text, what the implications of his theory were. One nervously reconfirmed that the identities of participants would not be shared. The facilitator was able to reassure them, both that the study design protected them, but also that the text is genuinely difficult to understand. This provided an excellent opening to the simulation, which translated the ideas behind Malthus’ complex text into a form where they could be manipulated in practice.

The following screenshot illustrates what the participants saw in this portion of the session, soon after the simulation had begun. The dark grey patches show resource consumption, while the coloration of agents shows their health. On the bottom right, initial parameters of the simulation – e.g. rates of reproduction, consumption and resource recovery – can be configured.

![Figure 1 - Fierce Planet Simulation]
to test different scenarios, including those where Malthusian predictions are replaced by more sustainable outcomes.

Perhaps the most striking element of the pilot test, for the research team, is how directly the session produced the dynamics we would hope to see in a real-world classroom environment. We had expected, prior to running the pilot, that the greater experience of the pilot participants with teaching, as well as their higher levels of academic training compared to undergraduate students, would make it difficult to simulate the kinds of classroom discussions typical of undergraduate courses. Interestingly, however, we found that because several participants do not teach specifically in the area of sustainability, combined with the brevity of the passages, the resulting conversation emulated that of classrooms to a very high degree.

Initially, as is to be expected, participants found the interface confusing, with many apparent variables that could be manipulated and various colours that indicated the state of agents and resources. A flurry of questions arose from the room but, interestingly, these did not interrupt engagement with simulation: even as participants were asking what particular elements “meant”, they were also interacting with and manipulating the simulation.

As participants began to experiment with different options – for birth rate, for example, or resource replenishment rates – the different dynamics of Malthus’ theory began to play out. Participants responded with the kinds of statements more generally associated with a game, than with a discussion of a classic text of social theory. As the simulation built toward the population crash that Malthus predicted, the transcript includes excited exclamations such as:

“The world is coming to an end!”
“I’ve destroyed Melbourne!”
“We’re doomed!”

Some participants thought the sudden collapse of population meant that they had played the game “wrong”, and began asking what they needed to do to keep this from happening. This provided an opening both to discuss how they could manipulate the variables in the simulation, and to explain that they had – rather than make an error – instead accurately simulated Malthus’ prediction.

As population recovery started to happen, the transcript captures a new round of confusion: after such a drastic collapse, participants were expecting there would be no recovery. As the simulation settled into the boom-and-bust cycle Malthus’ theory predicts, this prompted another round of questions about whether participants were doing something wrong: were they not meant to have killed everyone off? This enabled another round of exploration of Malthus’ argument, but also prompted a brief competition – again very much like what often happens among gamers – to see whether it were possible to manipulate the simulation so that the simulated population would, in fact, die out, rather than recover.

Similar results applied to the other simulations: a “gamelike” level of excited engagement with what is happening in the simulation; attempts to “subvert” or “break” the simulations that had the effect of deepening the understanding of the detailed claims of the theory; and finally questions that enabled the details of specific theories, and the differences between theories, to be teased out, concretely and contextually, by a facilitator who circulated around the room as the simulations take place.

In the concluding discussion, feedback from participants was divided between suggestions for further improvement and some targeted advice on specific concepts. Improvements included tweaks to the interface to lower the learning curve for using the software and more time spent on each simulation (since the pilot was deliberately an intensified session, this feedback was expected).
Some participants felt better explanation was needed of specific concepts, particularly quantitative ones such as the use of ratios and maxima, and terms of art such as energy consumption. Some also worried about students deciding they “prefer” a theory – like the cornucopian model – that generally predicts better outcomes. Equally, one participant worried about the ethics of teaching via a simulation – concerned that *Fierce Planet* is encouraging a “gamified” reaction to simulations of life and death phenomena – while others argued that the simulation was significantly less detached than other modes of representing this kind of content. Thus one participant argued: “What I’ve been doing, is trying to keep my people alive”, while another saw the simulation as a step toward greater concreteness in understanding the implications of specific theories – an improvement on the depersonalised representations of graphs or statistical tables presented in the texts being taught. At the same time, these responses suggest the need for further development of the teaching tools that accompany the simulations, so that teaching staff have a clearer sense of how to respond to potential issues that might arise in classroom discussions.

Participants generally felt the software involved a learning curve too steep to deploy it just for one theoretical concept, in a single class. They were however optimistic about the possibilities of using it across multiple sessions, so that students could build on what they had learned, and to contrast different theoretical approaches. Overall, the session supported the value of *Fierce Planet* as a classroom tool. As one participant expressed:

> But I can see how this stuff – this sort of model – modelling is useful to help, perhaps to get to the key ideas that we need to think about. You know, so it’s, rather than sort of weeks of readings and lectures and that sort of stuff, you can sort of go, okay, here’s what this means, here’s what happens when you change this… for students to be able to see it, and play with it, and change something, and go ‘Oh shit! Look what happens when I do this!’ That means, if we thought about that in a real-world scenario, where would this idea - not necessarily that we’ve solved it - but how would this idea then go and apply to something larger like a public policy or some sort of program?

**Conclusion**

Such responses suggest the *Fierce Planet* model holds promise for enabling a more applied and hands-on form of classroom learning, even for courses whose contents may appear difficult to adapt to hands-on learning. The general air of excitement, as well as repeated expressions of identification with, and concern for, the agents being modelled, suggests the capacity for this kind of tool to create a high level of engagement with otherwise very abstract concepts. In a classroom context, we imagine this excitement could contrast productively with the apparent apocalyptic tone of the Malthusian simulation and its more contemporary ecological incarnations. Also striking was how often participants returned to the assigned texts, deepening and clarifying their understanding of key concepts: this suggests that traditional teaching techniques can be strengthened, rather than threatened, by the addition of a well-designed simulation.

The question remains whether a further round of testing with students will support these findings – an issue we shall investigate later in 2016. In future years, the project will turn to question of whether we can untether the software from its current relationship with a model course we have devised, to develop it into a more scalable system in which a wide range of social theoretical content can be modelled by a diverse array of classrooms.
References


Governmentality, Case Management and Risk of Young Post-release People.

Joel Robert McGregor
The University of Newcastle

Introduction
This paper will explore the tensions which arise for youth workers in the case management of young people released from Juvenile Justice Detention Centres. Young post-release people are classified as being at either a high, medium or low risk of re-offending after being released, Juvenile Justice NSW frames them as a risk subject. Hannah-Moffat (2005:34) discusses the transformative risk subject which features in ‘practitioner-based correctional narratives’. These narratives are concerned with re-integrating offenders by reducing their likelihood of recidivism through addressing the risks which they are seen to pose (Hannah-Moffat, 2005:43). For young people identified through this narrative, case management is an inevitable part of their post-release journey. As such this paper approaches case management as a form of governmentality, an ensemble formed by an institution to calculate and approach the exercise of disciplinary power (Foucault, 1991:102). In this context, the use of case management practices on post-release young people can be usefully understood as a form of disciplinary power. Accordingly, the governmental rationalities of case management and discourses of risk of post-release young people must be simultaneously understood in order to better understand what it means when youth workers discuss young offenders re-integrate into society. In doing so, this allows for an analysis of how young people are problematized and governed through case management.

This paper will draw upon preliminary data collected in the course of a PhD research project. It will focus on themes drawn from 8 qualitative interviews with case managers from one post-release service located in the Northern Region of NSW. Throughout the course of my fieldwork it became clear that the critical aspect of case management is the tension which exists in the negotiation of being an agent for the state and the interpersonal relationship which was built with the client. The accurate negotiate of this tension was seen, by youth workers, as critical to the delivery of their role. As such, they were persistent in reinforcing the key word of manager. They maintained that it was their job to help the client identify areas of need within their lives and help them get to better (Leslie, participant). For the client referred to by Leslie, getting to better was to stay clean from drugs, staying in school and to not reoffend. In order to achieve this, case management took a number of forms including the transitions from education to employment and assisted housing to private rental accommodation. In doing so, youth workers built a relationship with their clients whereby they were no longer seen as an agent who would be reporting back to the young person’s
Juvenile Justice Officer. Rather case managers were seen as a comrade who was there to help the young post-release person take responsibility for and action towards the ‘problems’ the state recognised they have (Hannah-Moffat, 2005:43). As will be explored in greater detail below, this relationship is crucial in the exercise of governmentality and discipline.

**Review of Key Literature**

On the 29th August 2014 Greg Smith, then Minister for Justice, announced a $12 million dollar 3 year funding scheme for ‘vulnerable young people who are at risk of becoming entrenched in the criminal justice system’. The scheme Smith (2014) announced, named the Joint Support Program, was to address the ‘criminogenic risks of young people’. As a set of dynamic risk factors, criminogenic needs are identified as predictive factors of recidivism (Ward and Stewart, 2010:127). They are said to be ‘targeted’ in order to reduce recidivism (Andrews and Bonta, 2010:309). These factors are defined by Andrews and Bonta (2010:310) as being a lack of prosocial activates, antisocial personalities and behaviours, inappropriate parental monitoring and substance abuse. In doing so, a discourse around young post-release people had been created. The Joint Support Program assigned a discourse of risk whereby young offenders are perceived to have ‘multiple problems’ (Moore, 2003:6) which the program would address.

The Joint Support Program was to use the case management service delivery model in order to address a young person’s risk of reoffending. As a mode of service delivery, case management is used across a variety of welfare sectors including offender management, disabilities, and homelessness (Frankel and Gelman, 2012:3). For young offenders, the risk of recidivism is identified at the young person’s time of bail through the Australian Adaptation of the Youth Level of Service / Case Management Inventory (YLS/CMI-AA) by Hoge and Andrews (2011 as cited in NSW Government, Police and Justice, nd) and the level of intervention through case management is determined. This risk assessment tool has developed around two assumptions. Firstly, ‘a young person’s criminal activity is caused by a complex network of variables (individual characteristics and circumstances)’, and secondly ‘interventions with high risk youth can be effective in reducing recidivism provided the interventions are targeted to a young person’s criminogenic needs and are delivered effectively’ (Hoge and Andrews, 2011 as cited in Juvenile Justice NSW, nd). Young people are assessed through a questionnaire, and given a score which determines the level of service delivered. The higher the score that a young person receives means the greater risk of re-offense and, as such, determines the level of intervention required. However, as has been previously noted by France (2008:7), scoring young post-release people lacks emphasis on the broader social context and the relationships of power experienced.

Case management is then delivered by community sector organisations. The score calculated by the YLS/CMI-AA upon release is materialised by the case manager as a plan to address the client’s needs and respond to their individual risk of reoffending. The most common factors which are addressed through case management are finding suitable accommodation, seeking employment or enrolment in education. Case managers serve to maximise the ‘personal and social functioning and independence’ of post-release young people (Moore, 2003:6). In this, case workers fabricate what Skeggs (2011:498) has described as a ‘governmental normative subject’ (Skeggs, 2011:498), or an individualised subject. This subject will be viewed by their Juvenile Justice Officer as being fit to function within a particular vision of the wider community, in this case defined by engagement with education and work. In order for this subject to come into effect, young post-release offenders are individualised and disciplined. Young people are made to account for their actions through their dealings with their case manager, while said case manager is a mandatory reporter to the young person’s Juvenile Justice Officer.

Therefore, case management operates as a form of risk-rationality (Dean, 2010). Case management is linked to clinical practice by addressing recidivism as criminogenic needs, alluding
to a medicalisation or illness of these young people. A young person’s risk of re-offending, scored through the YLS/CMI-AA assumes an ideal type of young person, based upon ‘moral assessments of values, lifestyles and experiences’ (Hannah-Moffat, 2005:37). As Hannah-Moffat (2005:36) explains, ‘the scientific claims of objective assessment mask the inherently moralistic/normative elements of this penal exercise’. Case management, as a risk rationality, exercises ‘bureaucratic or clinical judgement [using] the case note and the file’ (Dean, 2010:219). It is both a strategy of moral governance and a practice of the self. This risk-rationality makes assumptions about young people and seeks areas which can be transformed and adapted in order to produce ethical subjects.

Further, post-release young people become an instrument of discipline through the hierarchical observation of case management. Foucault (1977:170) submits that discipline makes individuals, it is an operation of power whereby the subject is both the instrument of its exercise and object of discipline (Foucault, 1977:170). And, hierarchical observation is an exercise of power that ‘coerces by means of observation’ (Foucault, 1977:170). For young offenders this hierarchical observation is undertaken by their case manager being a single gaze ‘illuminating everything’ (Foucault, 1977:170). Case management practices form an expertise whereby they a young person’s post-release journey is governed through the technology of risk. In doing so, young post-release offenders are the object of the discipline. They are individualised through the process of being managed, and their post-release journey is regulated and measured by the case manager.

Hence, post-release young people are both the instrument and object of discipline whereby their actions are mediated through the case manager’s moral discourse of right and wrong. However, in order to exercise disciplinary techniques, there must be technologies by which forms of knowledges are created in order to exercise governance in case management. Therefore, this paper will focus upon the practice and techniques of case management in order to better understand how the negotiation of techniques of power and knowledge influence the types of authority which are used in the control of a young person’s post-release journey. This paper will explore the practices of case management as forms of governmentality and technologies of agency (McDonald and Marston, 2005).

Preliminary Findings - Technologies of Agency
The disciplinary practice of case management has two aspects. The first is the importance of rapport and the notion of friendship which is contrasted with, secondly, being a mandatory governmental reporter. In the quote below Debbie highlights how she was able to effectively work with her client once a relationship was built. By constructing the program as voluntary Debbie is able to function as a case manager but also as a friend whereby she was able to exercise disciplinary power and, in doing so, revealing how governmentality is exercised through case management. Foucault (1977:177) outlines that disciplinary power is the regulation of individual behaviour, it is discreet and, in doing so, it is ‘less corporal’. Disciplinary power is exercised through the negotiation of interpersonal relationships where forms of authority are embodied and practiced. In order to influence a change in the behaviours of young people, technologies of agency are employed in order to ‘shape the way people present themselves and operate in the world’ (McDonald and Marston, 2005:380).

‘He was quite withdrawn to begin with, it didn’t seem like he was exceptionally keen.
So with umm JJ’s, if he doesn’t make an appointment with me it does get put down and he does breach so it’s voluntary to work with us or another service but they still need to do that. And then over that time I have been able to build that rapport with him and he usually comes in a little bit earlier, he stays, he wants to engage a little bit more’ – Debbie

Debbie, a youth worker and case manager, was discussing a client whose case planning is almost complete. She was highlighting the work that she had both done with him and was currently
doing in order to organise an exit plan for this young person from the program. Debbie reflected on how she was not able to effectively work with the client until he knew that there was no judgement and that she actually cared about him. In discussing this, the tensions which exist between being a case manager, a friend and a mandatory government reporter were emphasised. Debbie highlights if the young person does not make an appointment with their youth worker it will be noted as a breach of their bail conditions. The case management service that the young person engages may be voluntary but their involvement with a case manager is not. Hence, technical governance has constructed, what I have termed to be a ‘paradox of a voluntary service’. In effect, this created an environment for the young clients where they were made to take responsibility for their own actions. The onus is on themselves. However, the case manager is there to help. But, when required will report back to the Juvenile Justice Officer.

This tension was highlighted as a constant struggle for all youth workers in their relationship with young people. It was a constant process of negotiation for youth workers, however throughout the interviews conducted they continued to reinforce the role of manager in case managing their clients. They suggested that their job was to facilitate change for their clients rather than shape their decision making. This may be aiding in travelling to appointments, budgeting skills or employment opportunities. As such, Frankel and Gelman (2012: 32) outline how, in order to work with clients, a good case manager-client relationship is required. These parallels in undertaking case management highlight the tensions which exist when the notion of being a friend or confidant forms part of the disciplinary practices used. The interpersonal technology of being a friend overlaps and conflicts with maintaining themselves as a professional worker who may need to report back to the clients Juvenile Justice Officer.

Case management operates through the hierarchical observation of the youth worker. They are governing their client’s actions from a distance, framing governance as facilitating change. In doing so, the client to distances the case manager from being a state apparatus. Secondly, in order for this power to be effective youth workers maintained a close relationship with their clients. They often undertook their work on a personal level, distancing themselves from statutory services. All youth workers spoke about how it was doing the fun stuff (Gloria, participant) with their clients that brought about change. Interacting with them on a personal level while shopping or going to the gym was seen to enable a state of positive and seemingly equal interaction with clients. As such, the operation of discipline involves a complex organisation of trust and rapport with clients. Additionally, in quote below Maranda further highlights the need for rapport and trust while further building upon the notions of responsibility and self-governance.

‘Like it’s that kind of level of rapport and relationship building that I have noticed that is really different. And with this particular young man we, we’ve spent a lot of time together. You know, cooking and shopping and just having a chat. And, just being chilled and getting that relationship going so that when something happens, like he just comes here and tells me … he used ice again once a few weeks ago and came straight in and told me. He’s like I have to tell you, I need to get it off my chest, I did it once. And we really talked it through and it was like amazing to see that he came in and talked about it.’ – Maranda

Maranda highlights the importance of developing a close relationship with her client. She has spent a lot of time with the client which she refers to above. She was able to extend this close relationship in order to enact interpersonal technologies of governance whereby the client had a deficit, his ice usage, which he was comfortable in confiding in her in order to be remediated. An action which, by confiding in the case manager, could be detrimental to the young person’s post-release journey. In the quote above, Maranda highlights the themes of rapport yet further touches upon interpersonal technologies. Through the empathic authority seen above, confession can be
seen as a key interpersonal technology in case management for ‘transforming and ‘freeing’ the self’ (McDonald and Marston, 2005:385). The client transgressed the rules of the program, by using ice again, and felt the need to tell the case manager of his transgression. This client has become the perfect disciplined subject. In her client confessing to her, Maranda is enacting pastoral authority whereby the client has a shortfall which can be managed and improved upon.

Foucault (1978:60) demonstrates how confession is an obligation of Western society whereby ‘we no longer perceive it as the effect of a power that constrains us’. Confession becomes a form of pastoral power. Foucault (1982:783) outlines that the aim of pastoral power ‘is to assure individual salvation in the next world’. Although Foucault is discussing here the earliest forms of pastoral power, being the power of Christianity, this is still important in the workings of case management. The client has told the case manager the transgression in order to move forward or overcome the effects of his actions. As a confidant, the youth worker is exercising the parallels of the job, they can choose to add this case to their notes or be empathic in not recording the transgression in an effort to create change. However, in order for Maranda to get to the point of confession, had to first build rapport and trust with the client. Youth workers must gain and navigate a certain level of trust and friendship with their clients in order to effectively manage through cooperation rather than authoritarianism.

**Conclusion**

This article firstly outlines the governmental rationalities which are embodied within a young person's post-release journey. That is, case management is a rationality whereby discipline can be exercised. The case manager works intimately with their clients and therefore builds a close bond with them and, in doing so, are able to operationalize power through the confidant relationship which has been fabricated. The YLS-CMI (-AA) becomes a way of thinking whereby the actions of young offenders are rationalised and embodied in the exercise of case management. Further, the preliminary findings highlighted how different techniques are used by youth workers in order for disciplinary power to be carried out in discreet forms. It highlighted the importance of interpersonal technologies for case managers in order to exercise control over their clients.

Hence, in the preliminary findings of this project I have found that in order for case management to be effective, the authority of the case manager must be naturalised. That is, through the techniques which were explored above, case managers were able to become a friend to their client and therefore exercise disciplinary power and, subsequently, governmentality in a covert form. Thus, power is effective but it is not felt as being punitive. In order for a youth worker to manage the young person’s post-release journey, they must distance themselves from the state. This is where the role of the case manager is vital, they exercise governmental control without being the government.
References


NSW Government, Police and Justice nd, *Juvenile Justice NSW - Youth Level of Service/Case Management Inventory – Australian Adaptation*.


Positioning Transnationalism as a Theoretical Perspective for Understanding Migration

Toniey J Munro
James Cook University

Abstract
The emergence of transnationalism as a theoretical perspective marked a ‘transnational turn’ in the study of migration. Despite this, some continue to claim that the paradigm lacks a solid theoretical framework and analytical rigour for understanding this phenomenon, being considered a perspective as opposed to a theory. However, when unpacking the development of transnationalism as a theoretical perspective and, concomitantly, the way in which that development coalesces with critiques of the theory, it becomes apparent that this is simply not the case. This paper demonstrates that transnationalism offers a framework of substantial consequence to understand migration. It does this through considering the initial emergence of transnationalism, the operationalisation of the term transmigrant, whether transnationalism was, indeed, a new and novel phenomenon, the parameters for transnational social spaces, and how the state is situated in this particular theory and practice. As such, this paper elucidates how transnationalism is positioned as a theoretical perspective for understanding migration, noting that the ‘transnational turn’ in this study will only continue.

Keywords: transnationalism, transmigrant, transnational social space, methodological nationalism.

Introduction
While human migration has a long and varied history, the current period of neoliberal globalisation has altered the character of this mobility, reshaping almost all localities and societies. Various disciplines have sought to develop theories to understand this, with a move away from methodological nationalism allowing for the development of a transnational lens for analysing migration (Glick Schiller 2005:441; Wimmer and Glick Schiller 2002b; 2003). From this, there has been a ‘transnational turn’ in the study of human mobility (Faist 2004; 2013; Robertson 2013:73). Transnationalism is a way of exploring the nuanced migration journeys and experiences of transmigrants and the transnational social spaces they maintain, then relate this back to broader meso- and macro-level structures, and consider it across time and space temporalities (Glick Schiller et al. 1992a; 1992b; Robertson 2013). Ultimately, the adoption of this theoretical perspective is a ‘rejection of one-way, linear, and permanent models of migration’
and an acknowledgement that, rather, transmigrants maintain and perpetuate ties across territorial boundaries (Robertson 2013:15). Despite this transnational turn, transnationalism has long been considered a highly fragmented field that ‘lacks both a well-defined theoretical framework and analytical rigour’ (Portes et al. 1999:218), with the term itself remaining contested (Faist 2010; Robertson 2013:73). As such, some proponents claim that transnational approaches comprise a perspective rather than a theory (Faist 2004:333; 2010:1672). Assertions such as this can be dispensed with when considering how transnational approaches are thought of and situated in the migration literature. Transnationalism is categorised in two interconnected yet invariably distinct ways. The first is an epistemological perspective, so, a way of considering and undertaking empirical analysis of migration; the second, a way of making sense of patterns of migrant behaviours, social actions, institutions, and of migrants themselves (Robertson 2013). Thus transnationalism is both a theoretical lens for undertaking migration research and a descriptor of the social practices engaged in by transmigrants (Robertson 2013). In either instance, transnationalism provides a framework of substantial consequence for understanding migration. As such, the terrain it has mapped out is able to reconfigure the way in which key concepts that underpin contemporary society are thought of (Yeoh et al. 2003:208).

In order to understand this complex terrain, a review of the literature has been undertaken. Sense can be made of the current positioning of the concept through considering the development of transnationalism as a theoretical perspective and, concomitantly, the way in which that development coalesces with critiques of the theory. As such, this paper adopts just that structure. It considers the initial emergence of transnationalism, the operationalisation of the term transmigrant, whether transnationalism was, indeed, a new and novel phenomenon, the parameters for transnational social spaces, and how the state is situated in this theory and practice. In doing so, it will elucidate how transnationalism is positioned as a theoretical perspective for understanding migration. Following from this, it is axiomatic that it does, indeed, constitute a theory, and, as such, the ‘transnational turn’ in the study of migration will, no doubt, continue.

Transnationalism: The Emergence of a Theory
Transnationalism emerged as a new analytical perspective in the 1990s, being a deviation from conventional assimilation theory which saw that once immigrants adapt to their new country of residence the connections they have with countries of origin would diminish (Alba and Nee 1997; Gordon 1964). After conducting individual studies, Glick Schiller, Basch, and Blanc-Szanton (Basch et al. 1994:4-5) realised that the migration and simultaneous involvements they had witnessed could not be explained by dichotomised social science categories. In two subsequent papers the authors set out what transnationalism entailed, defining it as ‘the processes by which immigrants build social fields that link together their country of origin and their country of settlement’ (Glick Schiller et al. 1992a; 1992b:1-2). As there was a home/host duality present in this initial conceptualisation, the authors sought to move beyond this, meaning that transnational social fields stretched beyond just sending and receiving countries (Basch et al. 1994). Thus, at its core, the emergence of this paradigm was an acknowledgement that transmigrants could participate in multiple networks across countries, and that this did not pose problems to their integration in countries of residence (Basch et al. 1994; Glick Schiller et al. 1992a; 1992b; Portes et al. 1999).

Operationalising Transmigrants
Transnational forms of human mobility were understood to exist only in certain migration practices. As such, Glick Schiller et al. (1992b) were not seeking to build a single overarching theory for all types of migration, applicable to all localities. Rather, to develop a framework for understanding the ways in which certain types of migrants engaged in these practices and sustained those connections. In light of this, the authors suggested that there should be
a reconceptualisation of the term ‘immigrant’ in the context of those who build social fields, terming them ‘transmigrants’. This referred to people who:

develop and maintain multiple relations – familial, economic, social, organisational, religious, and political that span borders. Transmigrants take actions, make decisions, and feel concerns, and develop identities within social networks that connect them to two or more societies simultaneously (Glick Schiller et al. 1992b:1-2).

Despite initial attempts by do away with the term transmigrant as ‘nothing is gained’ from using it in the place of ‘immigrant’ (Portes et al. 1999:219), it is still used as a descriptor in the literature (Bauböck and Faist 2010). Understandably so as the vast majority of those engaging in migration practices do not fit the transnational pattern (Castles 2004:25; Castles et al. 2014:43; Portes and Rumbaut 2006:131). For those who do engage in such practices, however, using the term transmigrant seems in keeping with the development of a conceptual framework for understanding such transnational practices; providing relevant key terms for researchers to explore these ideas. Thus, it seems appropriate to use the term transmigrant to draw a distinction between those who do, and those who do not, fit the transnational pattern (Faist 2000; Glick Schiller 2003:105).

A New and Novel Phenomenon

The turn of the century saw new understandings being brought to the transnational paradigm (Ozkul 2012:2). Portes and colleagues (1999) sought to orient research by offering a refined mid-range practice-based model. In this they identified the potential impact that transmigrants have in forging boundary-breaking social fields and thus becoming future facilitators for the development and institutionalisation of economic, political, and social ties (Portes et al. 1999:228-229). In this, the authors advocated that assimilation theory does require revisiting in order to understand new modes of adaptation to receiving countries (Kivisto and Faist 2010:137). Furthermore, in this paper (Portes et al. 1999) the authors wanted to address a critique of transnationalism which pointed out that, in fact, it was not a new or novel phenomenon (Foner 1997:355), and, rather, these migration patterns and forms of connection have always existed (Levitt et al. 2003:565; Levitt and Jaworsky 2007:133.). The authors acknowledged that, indeed, back-and-forth movements by migrants have always been present, although they had not acquired the ‘critical mass and complexity necessary to speak of an emergent social field’ whereby transmigrants are simultaneously embedded in several societies (Portes et al. 1999:217).

In the alternative, some scholars acknowledged that although Glick Schiller et al. (1992a; 1992b; Basch et al. 1994) could establish a transnational phenomenon, it was not important in its scope or applicability as the studies conducted were limited to Latin American and Caribbean migrants, who have a particular social and historical relationship with the United States of America (Dahinden 2004; Waldinger and Fitzgerald 2004). The work of Portes et al. (1999; Portes et al. 2002) further rebut this critique in demonstrating that although habitual transnational activism was relatively low, Dominicans, Salvadorans, and Mexicans participated in regular and sustained transnational political and economic activities (Guarnizo et al. 2003). Based on this, and the earlier critique that transnationalism was not a new phenomenon (Waldinger 2013; 2015), there has been an acknowledgement that theorists overstated the novel nature of transnationalism when it first emerged (Levitt and Jaworsky 2007:133). Although, in the instance this did occur, it does not negate its relevance, with contemporary research recognising that while there are similarities to forms of migrant connections to homelands, the transmigrants types of ‘linkages are more than the homeland-immigrant connections of migrants in earlier periods’ (Vertovec 2004b:971). As such, transnationalism was indeed a new and novel phenomenon.
Setting the Parameters for Transnational Social Spaces

These ‘linkages’ that Vertovec (2004b) refers to above are the social fields that Glick Schiller et al. (1992b) first articulated (Levitt 2001), also being called ‘transnational communities’ (Portes 1999; Al-Ali and Kosser 2002; Voigt-Graf 2005) or ‘transnational social spaces’ (Faist et al. 2015; Pries 2001a; 2001b); it is the latter term that will be operationalised. These transnational social spaces are the ‘networks of networks that link individuals directly or indirectly to institutions located in more than one nation-state’, with these linkages being ‘part of the power dynamics through which institutionalised social relations delineate social spaces’ (Basch et al. 1994; Glick Schiller 2003; 2004; 2005; 2010). An early contribution to this was made by Pries (1999) who considered transnational social spaces to be the actual living spheres and projects of transmigrants that spanned a number of geographic and residential spaces. Further, Pries (1999:26) described four analytic dimensions, being the political and legal frameworks of the migration process, the material infrastructure, the social institutions, and the ‘identities and life projects of transmigrants’ (Yeoh et al. 2003:208). Faist (1999:40) built on this through identifying that these are ‘dynamic social processes’, not ‘static notions of ties and positions’ (Yeoh et al. 2003:208), which emerge ‘when persons in distant places are connected via symbolic ties’ that enable the transfer of various forms of capital (Faist 1999:42).

The literature has moved on to understand these social spaces to be fluid and constantly reworked through transmigrants simultaneous embeddedness in more than one society (Levitt and Glick Schiller 2004; Pries 2005; Smith 2001; 2005). These social spaces are multi-layered and multi-sited, existing in not only sending and receiving countries, but also other localities in which transmigrants are connected (Levitt and Jaworsky 2007:131). They incorporate both migrants and non-migrants ‘because the flow of people, money, and social remittances (ideas, norms, practices, and identities) within these spaces [are] so dense, thick, and widespread that non-migrants are also transformed, even though they do not move’ (Levitt and Jaworsky 2007:131-132). There is emerging literature, somewhat axiomatic in nature, which suggests that understandings of social spaces should also take into account online spaces (Kissau and Hunger 2010; Schrooten 2012; Vertovec 2004a). Whereby the electronic means by which transnational social spaces are maintained are explored and considered. Regardless of the shape they take, Vertovec (2009:24) suggests that these social spaces lead to enduring structural changes and should be analysed along four dimensions: the economic, political, sociocultural, and religious (Vertovec 2004b; 2009). It is in this sense that the parameters for transnational social spaces are set. Although this is not to say that all engagements with these social spaces are equal, rather they should be considered ‘along a continuum of different degrees of intensity’ (Fauser et al. 2015:1500), with the term ‘transnational practices’ used to describe what transmigrants do to maintain and sustain these transnational connections (Robertson 2013:75).

Situating the State: Methodological Nationalism

From understanding that these transnational social spaces transcend territorial boundaries, it is appropriate to identify that ‘the nation-state container view of society does not capture, adequately or automatically, the complex interconnectedness of contemporary reality’ (Levitt and Glick Schiller 2004:1006). Despite the expansive interdisciplinary literature that rejects the state as a unit of measurement, a recurring critique of transnationalism relates to how it situates the state (Waldinger 2015:5). This is referred to as methodological nationalism. This term was first used to critique a tendency of migration scholars to conflate the nation-state with the concept of society (Amelina and Faist 2012:1709; Glick Schiller 2010:110). By this, methodological nationalism is considered an intellectual orientation that presupposes territorial boundaries to be the natural unit of study, equating society with the nation-state, conflating the national interest for the purposes of social sciences (Glick Schiller 2005:440; Glick Schiller et al. 2006:613; Glick Schiller...
and Salazar 2013:185), and assuming that there is a shared culture, history, language, and religion among those who claim a common origin within the state, being separate and distinct from all others (Amelina 2010:7; Glick Schiller 2012b:524; Wimmer and Glick Schiller 2002; 2002b). Thus, methodological nationalism’s main assumption is that social reality consists exclusively of the state (Amelina 2010:7; Amelina and Faist 2012:1709). It was a move away from this that allowed for the development of a transnational lens for analysing migration, as it has been a ‘potent barrier’ to the study of transnationalism (Glick Schiller 2005:440).

Although this is true, the debate continues on how transnationalism situates the state with some contending that transnational scholars relegate the significance of states in part or in their entirety (Waldinger 2015:15; Waldinger and Fitzgerald 2004). It is not altogether incorrect to point out that the paradigm no longer privileges the state, with some transnational proponents claiming ‘states throughout the world are under siege’ (Appadurai 1990:305) as globalisation is ‘a definite marker of a new crisis for [their] sovereignty’ (Appadurai 2000:4). However, to assert that all transnational scholars have claimed the withering away of states is ‘simply incorrect’ (Faist 2010:1672). Seemingly, this critique arises out of a fundamental misunderstanding of transnationalism’s situation of the state (Glick Schiller 2010:109; Levitt and Jaworsky 2007:134; Smith 2001; Yeoh et al. 2003). This theoretical perspective ‘does not deny the role [and] continuing significance of state borders, institutions and surveillance powers’ (Agnew 1994:71). What it does do is allow social theorists to re-envision society: by ‘no longer equating society with the territorial boundaries’ of states, those who employ transnationalism are able to bring theoretical clarity to the study of social relations (Glick Schiller 2005:441). Evidently, rejecting this perspective ‘requires migration scholars to recover an approach to migration that does not use nation-states as units of analysis but rather studies the movement of people across space in relationship to forces that structure [the] political economy’ (Glick Schiller 2012a:18). Furthermore, if transnationalism is understood as sustained activities across territorial boundaries, then the importance of a ‘national scale’ and ‘national space’ that can be transcended must be apodictic (Willis et al. 2004:1); with no ‘national’ there can be no ‘transnational’ (Faist 2000; Pries 2009).

An implication of this, it should be noted, is that through moving beyond methodological nationalism it does not leave behind ‘the necessity to fix migration somehow in time and space, both on the ontological and the practical methodological level’ (Meeus 2012:1776). This means that new or different ‘fixes’ of human mobility are being created by migration researches (Deacon and Schwartz 2007). This nascent idea will, no doubt, continue to be explored in future publications, as will the link between the adoption of methodological nationalism and the positionality of the researcher (Shinozaki 2012:1811). As such, it seems essential to move beyond tacitly accepting that the lives of both transmigrants, and researchers, are defined and shaped by countries of origin; experiences and understandings are really rather nuanced and have the potential to transcend those territorial boundaries. As such, they should be explored. Even if this is not the case for researches, this positionality is most certainly a matter for consideration.

Conclusion
Through unpacking the concept of transnationalism, clear themes emerge regarding the fundamental assumptions of this approach, which assist in positioning it as a relevant theoretical perspective (Glick Schiller 1999; Levitt and Glick Schiller 2004; Portes and DeWind 2007; Robertson 2013). The emergence of this perspective was a notable deviation from previous assimilationist notions whereby migration was unidirectional and nationally bounded to one that is ‘multicultural, multidirectional, and deterritorialised’ (Robertson 2013). In adopting this theoretical perspective, it encompasses the study of both transmigrants adaptation to the receiving country and also ongoing relationships and connectedness with countries of origin (Inglis 2002; Robertson 2013). This is represented in the transnational social spaces that are created through
a constant flow of people, goods, ideas, and communications, and the transnational practices employed to maintain and sustain them (Levitt 2001; Portes 1999; Robertson 2013:74). Thus, the fundamental assumption underpinning transnationalism is a ‘rejection of one-way, linear, and permanent models of migration’ and an acknowledgement that, rather, transmigrants maintain and perpetuate ties across territorial boundaries (Robertson 2013:15). Whereby transnationalism itself is a way of exploring the nuanced migration journeys and experiences of transmigrants and the transnational social spaces they maintain, then relate this back to broader meso- and macro-level structures, and consider it across time and space temporalities (Glick Schiller et al. 1992a; 1992b; Robertson 2013).

This paper has considered the development of transnationalism, whilst simultaneously engaging critically with it, in order to understand how it is positioned as a theory for making sense of migration. It did this through focusing on five main areas of investigation, being the initial emergence of the paradigm, operationalising the term transmigrant, establishing that, indeed, transnationalism was a new and novel phenomenon, setting the parameters for transnational social spaces, and determining that despite moving beyond methodological nationalism, the state is still considered when adopting this theory. Through understanding this terrain, it becomes obvious that transnationalism does, indeed, offer a theoretical framework, with analytical rigour, for understanding migration. It is likely that this ‘transnational turn’ will continue in the study of migration.
References


Young People in a De-Industrialising City: Metaphors and Spaces of Flows

Meave Noonan

RMIT University

Introduction
This paper draws on the early stages of a PhD project that examines the discursive framing of young people’s employability skills, innovation and enterprise in globalised, precarious labour markets, with a specific focus on the regional Victorian city of Geelong. Geelong, as with many similar cities in the industrialised democracies, is increasingly drawn into wider dynamics of ‘neo-liberal’ globalisation and de-industrialisation, and my research seeks to explore some of the material and discursive conditions associated with Geelong’s reimagining as a post-industrial city. Entrepreneurialism, innovation and creativity are increasingly understood as critical factors in the economic recovery of ‘rust belt’ cities, and in the employment futures of the young people within them. In these de-industrialising economies, the comments of political and business leaders indicate that all labour market participants, be they young school leavers or retrenched workers, are increasingly imagined as the architects of their own opportunity structures.

This project adopts a genealogical approach in order to explore the following research question: ‘how is it that, at the start of the 21st century, we’ve come to understand the problem of youth unemployment largely in terms of employability skills, innovation and enterprise?’ Genealogy is a method of philosophical-historical inquiry most commonly associated with Michel Foucault, and involves ‘a practice of critique in the form of the historical problematization of the present’ (Koopman 2013: 2). The ‘three E’ definition of genealogy suggests that all genealogical studies are driven by the identification of episodes, examples and effectiveness (Vucetic 2011:1300). Episodes, which are often also termed historical series, epochs, events or moments, ‘are meant to perioditise the history of an object under study’, Vucetic (2011:1300) observes. Each episode is narrated through examples, which are themselves reconstructed in a discourse analysis of a range of historical documents (Vucetic 2011:1300). And lastly, for a genealogy to be ‘effective’ it must focus on a ‘problem’ – in other words, ‘a social phenomenon that appears (seems, feels) normal or true (commonplace, natural, intuitive)’, Vucetic (2011:1301) explains – and then turn it into a question, that is, ask how it came about in the light of contingency and power.

At this point in time, the genealogical investigation of this project is concerned with identifying and exploring some key ‘episodes’ as they relate to the history of Geelong’s de-industrialisation. In doing so, it confronts the problem of defining a ‘place’ like Geelong, in a world in which the
boundaries and borders of space are increasingly porous. This challenge highlights one of the
fundamental theoretical dilemmas faced by the discipline of sociology in the 21st century, that
of understanding, describing and defining ‘spaces’ and ‘places’ in a globalising world. How do
we, as sociologists, understand and frame Geelong as a place in which to do research about the
challenges and opportunities associated with young people’s labour market experiences?

In my initial attempts to explore this question, I will consider the work of geographer Doreen
Massey (1994, 2005), and sociologists Manuel Castells (2010), John Urry (2000, 2009) and
David Farrugia (2014, 2015) in problematising the notions of ‘space’ and ‘place’, and how they
have influenced sociological scholarship on the nature and meanings of the ‘local’ and the ‘global’.
The ‘spatial turn’ in sociology has prompted a reassessment of the adequacy of existing theoretical
and conceptual frameworks for describing globalisation processes in the second decade of the
21st century. With the emergence of the ‘space of flows’ have also come new fields of inquiry,
and new challenges for thinking about the significance of space and place into the future. These
include the various mobilities and movements of ideas, capital, and people; geographic and spatial
inequalities; the attachments of individuals to place and their implications for affect and identity;
and the gendered dimensions of the space of flows.

In this paper I will examine the contributions of the above-named authors in developing
conceptual frameworks and analytical tools for understanding the emerging ‘space of flows’. Prior
to this discussion, I will sketch the major contours of de-industrialisation and labour market
change in Geelong, as well as provide a brief overview of the focus of my research, young people’s
employability skills, innovation and enterprise in public discourse.

Geelong: A de-industrialising city
For much of the twentieth century, Geelong was a booming regional centre, boasting an array of
industrial operations that included oil refining, aluminium smelting, car components and glass
making, as well as a significant textile and clothing industry (Johnson 2009:474).

Geelong’s textile industry was established in the 1920s and 1930s, and in the 1940s, production
was booming across the city’s seven woollen mills in order to supply the war effort (Rice 2009:27-31).
Output was on a par with the centre of woollen and worsted cloth production in Bradford,
Yorkshire, earning Geelong the title of ‘Bradford of Australia’ (Rice 2009.ix). Roughly 30 percent
of Geelong workers were employed in manufacturing in 1933 (Australian Bureau of Statistics
1933), rising to 43 percent in 1947, and peaking at 46 percent in the mid-1950s (ABS 1947; ABS 1954),
before a period of significant and sustained decline that continues to the present day
(see Figure 1).

**Figure 1: Employment in Manufacturing in Geelong 1911-2011, expressed as a percentage of the total workforce.**

Source: ABS Census. Data for 1911 are for county of Grant, Victoria.
The mid-20th century was a period of peak optimism for Geelong’s manufacturing sector; at this time it was thought that employees of companies such as International Harvester and the Ford Motor Company could be assured of a ‘job for life’. International Harvester, a manufacturer of agricultural machinery, opened its Geelong plant in 1939, and went on to employ over 2500 people by 1966, out of a total of 4500 Australia-wide (Medson 1988:10). A combination of factors, including a saturated market and cheaper imports, forced the company into receivership in late 1982, with the workforce having dwindled to 600 loyal employees at the time of the plant’s closure (Medson 1988:14).

Social geographer Louise Johnson (2012:6) asserts that in the 1980s, ‘Geelong began the process of re-inventing itself’, planning for a future in which it would be less economically-dependent on heavy industries. Having once boasted that ‘Driving a Ford drives Geelong’, in the 1990s the Ford Motor Company began its long wind down, as new technologies and international rationalisation spelt the end of car manufacturing in the region (Johnson 2012:6).

More recently, during 2012-2015, Geelong has been harder hit by more job losses: aluminium production at Alcoa’s Point Henry smelter was stopped at the end of 2014, leaving more than 800 workers out of a job; Ford announced that it would close its Geelong and Broadmeadows plants by 2016; three hundred jobs were cut at Avalon airport with the closure of Qantas’ maintenance facility; and Boral Cement shed 100 jobs in 2013 (Paul 2014).

Against this recent history of de-industrialisation and job losses, much of the projected economic and employment growth in the region is clustered around the three areas of knowledge, healthcare and services (G21 Geelong Region Alliance 2013:30). Figure 2 below illustrates the dynamics of growth and contraction across the ten main sectors of employment in the Regional Geelong Area from 2006 to 2011.

This image of Geelong as a future knowledge-based economy was boosted with the recent relocation of several government agencies to Geelong, including the Transport Accident Commission (TAC), WorkSafe and the National Disability Insurance Agency (NDIA) (Lyons 2015:2). However, there is concern that the growth of the knowledge and healthcare sectors will not produce an associated rise in the number of local entry-level jobs, while the services, hospitality and tourism sectors have been associated with a high degree of casualisation and employee ‘churn’, poor remuneration and limited career structures. These and other factors represent significant challenges for those attempting to gain a foothold in the local labour market.
My research: Young people’s employability skills, innovation and enterprise in public discourse

The city of Geelong in the second decade of the 21st century represents a critical historical and spatial juncture for investigating labour market change and its impacts on young people. Geelong’s economy is implicated in changing global configurations of production as well as being reshaped by the reverberations of the 2007-08 Global Financial Crisis (GFC), a crisis which had a particularly detrimental impact on young people’s labour market prospects in many parts of the advanced capitalist world (International Labour Organization 2013: 2).

In this project, the collection of qualitative data will be concerned with mapping policy and media discourses as they relate to the employability skills, innovation and enterprise of young people. In the contemporary period, these discourses are shaped by a complex array of actors, among them the three levels of government – Federal, state, and local government in Geelong, various media outlets, think tanks and lobby groups, as well as young people themselves. These discourses seek to define the limits, possibilities, challenges and opportunities of enterprise and employment in globalised, precarious labour markets.

This project will employ a genealogical approach in order to analyse the historical ‘conditions of possibility’ that give rise to these contemporary discourses. This approach offers scope to analyse the ways in which different understandings of employability skills, innovation and enterprise circulate, translate and shift between different contexts, different settings, and different texts. In policy and media discourses, some understandings of young people’s employability skills, innovation and enterprise are regarded as more salient than others. I will explore the ways in which class, gender, ethnic and aesthetic dimensions, interacting with patterns of spatial and economic inequality in Geelong, are implicated in the privileging of particular representations of young people’s employability skills, innovation and enterprise.

The final section of this paper considers the changing meaning of ‘space’ and ‘place’ in a globalising world, and its implications for both the contexts and subjects of sociological inquiry.

How do we define and understand ‘space’ and ‘place’ in a globalising world?

John Urry (2000, 2009) and Manuel Castells (2010) have been influential in the development of new conceptual frameworks and analytical tools for understanding of the dynamics of ‘space’ and ‘place’ in a globalising world. Before turning to a fuller examination of the work of Doreen Massey and David Farrugia, I want to briefly discuss the ways in which Urry and Castells are shaping my thinking. Urry asserts that the ‘social as mobility’ is replacing the ‘social as society’ as the organising concept of sociological analysis (Urry 2000:1-2). More recently, Urry has had a central role in efforts to establish a ‘mobilities’ paradigm in social science, a field which ‘brings to the fore theories, methods and exemplars of research that so far have been mostly out of sight’ in order to remedy ‘the academic neglect of various movements, of people, objects, information and ideas’ (Büscher & Urry 2009:99-100). The concept of ‘flows’ is central to Castells’ monograph The Rise of the Network Society (2010). Modern society, he asserts, is ‘constructed around flows: flows of capital, flows of information, flows of technology, flows of organizational interaction, flows of images, sounds, and symbols. Flows are not just one element of the social organization: they are the expression of processes dominating our economic, political, and symbolic life’ (Castells 2010:442, original emphasis). ‘Nodes’, another key component of the network infrastructure, are the ‘location of strategically important functions that build a series of locality-based activities and organizations around a key function in the network’ (Castells 2010:443).

The late Doreen Massey (1994, 2005) probes the difficulty of thinking about ‘space’ and ‘place’, and the meaning of ‘locality’, in the context of the socially varied time-space changes associated with globalisation processes at the end of the 20th century. In her work Massey takes issue with the assumption in much academic and policy discourse of the identity of place as singular, fixed and
unitary, instead advocating a progressive sense of place which recognises that places are processes, rather than static entities, constructed out of shifting constellations of social relations (Massey 1994:154-156).

In developing the concept of the ‘power geometry’ of time-space compression, Massey seeks to describe the ways in which

Different social groups, and different individuals, are placed in very distinct ways in relation to these flows and interconnections...different social groups have distinct relationships to this anyway differentiated mobility: some people are more in charge of it than others; some initiate flows and movement, others don't; some are more on the receiving-end of it than others; some are effectively imprisoned by it (Massey 1994:149).

In some understandings of globalisation, local places are assumed to have no agency, in other words, place is figured as the inevitable victim of globalisation (Massey 2005:101). However, in the ‘relational understanding’ of neo-liberal globalisation advocated by Massey, “places” are criss- crossings in the wider power-geometries that constitute both themselves and “the global” (Massey 2005:101).

In Youth Studies David Farrugia (2014, 2015) has drawn on Doreen Massey's concept of power geometries, and Henri Lefebvre's theory of the 'production of space', in order to explore some of the spatial inequalities shaping young people's lives. Space and place have historically been marginal to the dominant theoretical perspectives in the disciplines of sociology and youth studies, Farrugia contends, and he highlights two possible reasons for this marginalisation. The first is the tendency to understand children and young people in terms of universal developmental processes and transitions towards adulthood, often resulting in disembodied and disembedded views of childhood and youth (Farrugia 2015:610). The second is the inherent ‘metrocentricity’ of sociological theorising, which equates modernity with the process of urbanisation, and implies that the rural is less sociologically significant than the urban (Farrugia 2014:295). A spatialised youth sociology, Farrugia (2014:300) argues, must be ‘attendant to the macro-level processes that create both urban and rural environments, as well as the specific histories of different localities and the way that this structures the transitions of young people from these places’.

A number of studies have demonstrated the utility of metaphors of networks and fluidity in highlighting the changing dynamics of the ‘local’ and ‘global’, as well as the lived experiences of globalisation by young people in spaces and places such as Geelong (see, for example, Warr 2009). Peter Kelly and Jane Kenway (2001), for example, examined how young people's vocational and educational training (VET) pathways are structured, as well as how Local Government Areas (LGAs) identify and position themselves in relation to networks that are connected regionally, nationally and globally. Kelly and Kenway's case study was of a rural locality whose economy is underpinned by the dairy industry, seeking to understand how it is that students from the local technical school ‘have no opportunities for VET work placements at [the dairy factory] site, and fewer opportunities for a post- school transition ‘across the road’ and into employment’ (Kelly & Kenway 2001:26). The dominance of flows over places has the potential to create ‘infinite social distance’ between people and places that may, indeed, exist in close physical proximity to each other (Castells 1996:477 cited in Kelly & Kenway 2001:26-27).

Conclusion

This paper has described the genealogical focus of a PhD project which explores the historical ‘conditions of possibility’ that enable the problem of youth unemployment to be framed largely in terms of employability skills, innovation and enterprise. In this paper, my concern is with exploring the problem of defining a ‘place’ like Geelong, in a world in which the boundaries and borders of space are increasingly porous.
This challenge highlights one of the fundamental theoretical dilemmas faced by the discipline of sociology in the 21st century, that of understanding, describing and defining ‘space’ and ‘place’ in a globalising world. In this paper I have considered the contributions of John Urry, Manuel Castells, Doreen Massey and David Farrugia in the development of conceptual frameworks and analytical tools for understanding the emerging ‘space of flows’. Their work offers rich theoretical and empirical insights to youth studies projects such as my own, and underscores the significance of ‘space’ and ‘place’ for the study of the lives of young people in a de-industrialising city.
References


Responding to the productivist paradigm: Experiences of farmers Victoria’s western Wimmera, Australia

Patrick O’Keeffe

School of Global, Urban and Social Science, RMIT University

Abstract
Since the early 1970s, Australian agricultural policy has emphasised the need for Australian farms to achieve productivity growth. This article aims to understand how farmers perceive the compulsion to apply productivist farming methods, such as the increased use of technological inputs and increases in farming scale. Furthermore, this article seeks to understand whether farmers feel that viable alternatives exist. To explore these themes, this article uses semi-structured interviews with representatives of 15 different farming businesses in Victoria’s western Wimmera. This research found that for many growers, property expansion resulted in a cycle of increased debt and reliance upon the use of productivist farming methods to generate income required to service these debts. Some farmers, however, actively rejected the dominant paradigms of growth and productivism, instead focusing on diversification, and the use of less intensive farming methods.

Keywords: Agriculture, productivism, neoliberalism, farming, structural adjustment

Introduction
Productivity growth is framed as essential for the success of Australian farmers (Australian Government 2015; Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation 2007). According to the 2015 Agricultural Competitiveness White Paper, published by the Australian Government, “the future success of Australian agriculture depends on smarter farming practices” (2015: 95). Smarter farming practices, in this context, are portrayed as those which seek to enhance productivity (Australian Government 2015). This emphasis on the continued increase in productivity has been the focus of Australian policy for close to five decades, with policy developed to support the ‘smarter’, most productive farmers, and encourage the exit of ‘unviable’ farmers from the industry (Australian Government 2015; Malcolm, Davidson & Vandenberg 2000; Productivity Commission 1996; Burdon 1993; Gray, Oss-Emer & Sheng 2014; Productivity Commission 2005; Higgins 2001).

The shift towards an emphasis on productivity, and away from governmental support for farmers, has contributed to a decline in farming populations and an increase in the average size of farm properties within Australia (RIRDC 2007; Sheng, Zhao & Nossal 2011; Knopke, Strappazzon &
The concentration of farming businesses, into fewer, though larger properties, is clear. This process of “adjustment” is framed by Malcolm, Makeham and Wright (2005: 61) as an inevitability, which is “actively” assisted by “governments of all persuasions”. Less clear, is the question of whether remaining farmers consider that viable alternatives to continual expansion exist. This article intends to explore this question, through the analysis of 15 interviews conducted with wheat farmers in Victoria’s western Wimmera.

This article commences by exploring the relationship between productivity growth, scale, technology and resource re-allocation. The implications this may have for Australian farmers is then explored. This article then outlines the methods used in this research, before a discussion of the key themes emerging from these interviews. In particular, this article seeks to understand how participants experience the perceived need to expand the size of their property, and whether farmers are actively rejecting the productivist paradigm.

Productivism

Agricultural productivity is described by Nossal and Gooday (2009: 4) as reflecting “changes in the efficiency of converting inputs into outputs”, and is pursued as a policy objective under the assumption that this will lead to increased living standards (Nossal & Gooday 2009). Productivism, as an approach to farming which aims to maximise productivity growth, is argued to result from the expanded use of technology, increases in farm size and scale and through the re-allocation of resources to more efficient farm managers (Nossal et al. 2009; Knopke, O’Donnell & Shepherd 2000; RIRDC 2007; Gray et al. 2014; Productivity Commission 2005; Lawrence et al. 2013; Dibden, Potter & Cocklin 2009). The increased use of technology is cited by many as being a key driver of increases in productivity growth (Nossal et al. 2009; Knopke et al. 2000; RIRDC 2007; Nossal & Gooday 2009). This includes the development and application of new herbicides, use of fertilisers, improvements in plant breeding, pest and weed control and enhancements in machinery size and capability (Knopke et al. 2000). Maximising the capacity of these technological advancements is related to scale of farming operations (RIRDC 2007; Nossal & Gooday 2009). According to the RIRDC (2007: 4), this could lead to increased consolidation of farm businesses, as “small farmers that are unable to employ the new technology cost effectively may lose their ability to compete”. Furthermore, economies of scale, achieved through increases in size, are also cited as an important driver of productivity growth (Nossal & Gooday 2009; Knopke et al. 2000; Malcolm et al. 2000). This is explained by Malcolm et al. (2000: 40), who states that:

An effective way to increase output for roughly the same overheads is to add say 20 to 30 per cent to the farm area, and farm it with the existing plant and about the same labour.

Agricultural productivity can be increased through structural adjustments, which encourage the re-allocation of resources (Nossal & Gooday 2009; Gray et al. 2014). This is associated with the concept of allocative efficiency, which is outlined by Hilmer, Rayner & Tapparell (1993: 4) as being maximised when “resources used to produce a set of goods or services are allocated to their highest valued uses”. In relation to agriculture, allocative efficiency is increased when resources are managed by the most efficient, most productive farm managers (Gray et al. 2014). Resultantly, it is argued that productivity increases with the exit of least efficient, least productive farmers from the industry (Nossal & Gooday 2009; Gray et al. 2014). This process is explained by Gray et al. (2014: 5):

At an industry level, ongoing resource reallocation is an important source of productivity gains…In particular, exits of less efficient farm businesses release scarce resources for use
by more efficient farms, which are able to expand and increase productivity, increasing the efficiency of resource use as a whole.

This emphasis on productivity compels farmers to try to maximise their productivity through technology use and increases in size, or face an uncertain future in farming. As stated by Gray & Lawrence (2001: 42) this can lead to farmers becoming “trapped in cycles of increasing productivity for diminishing returns”. Furthermore, this is associated with increased specialisation, with farmers focusing on the most productive land uses available, and environment damage (McKenzie 2014; Lawrence et al. 2013; Dibden, Potter & Cocklin 2009; Pritchard, Burch & Lawrence 2007; Gray & Lawrence 2001). In a policy context which has “encouraged the growth of productivist farming” (Lawrence et al. 2013: 31), it is unclear whether farmers themselves feel capable, or willing, to adopt alternative approaches to agriculture. With “financially stressed farm families” striving to “attain higher levels of productivity to survive” (Argent 2002: 11, cited in Lawrence et al. 2013: 37), Lawrence et al. (2013: 37) posed the question “Is there any likelihood of a more environmentally-benign post-productivist future?” While not addressing this question directly, this article aims to build upon the understanding of how farmers perceive the compulsion to apply productivist farming methods, and whether some farmers are utilising alternate approaches to farming.

Method
This research uses semi-structured face-to-face interviews conducted with farmers representing different farming businesses in Victoria’s western Wimmera. This region is highly dependent upon agricultural industries, particularly cropping, with a significant percentage of those employed in the area engaged directly in the agricultural sector (Australian Bureau of Statistics 2011).

Fifteen interviews were conducted in total. These interviews primarily took place in the homes of the participants and ranged from 40 minutes to one hour in length. Six of the interviews involved farming couples (such as a husband and wife), three interviews were conducted with family members (siblings and son) who operated the one business, and a further six interviews were conducted with sole representatives of the farming business, who in each case were male farmers. A snowball sampling method was used in conjunction with a key informant approach, with participants located through contact with local councillors, representative groups and community organisations.

Results and Discussion
While many included in this study lamented the social impacts of increasing farm sizes and the declining farming populations in the local area, few challenged the belief that the security of their farming operation was directly related to their capacity to continually expand in scope, and in doing so, increase their productivity and efficiency. Participants felt that in a climate where farming populations were declining, the smaller properties were most vulnerable to becoming “uneconomic”. This compelled farmers to continually increase the size of their properties. This pressure is explained by one farmer, who stated:

As long as you are average or above, then there’s a fair chance that your business is sustainable. As long as you are average or above, the pressure is not on you.

Throughout the interviews, participants expressed that this property growth was financed by increasing debts, which caused considerable stress for some. In addition, this increasing scale and scope of farming ensured the majority of farm businesses involved the active participation of numerous family members.

The perceived compulsion to continually expand the size of their properties was viewed by some participants in this research as a trap which they could not avoid. For some, this meant
that although they did not want to be conducting farming practices which they perceived to have negative environmental ramifications, they felt that this was unavoidable. As one farmer stated:

We probably don’t get paid enough for our commodities to actually make it a viable enterprise where you have enough left in the bank after you have sustained yourself and your family to keep doing sustainable environmental things. You have to actually keep doing things which are detrimental to the environment, because the consumers demand it. They will not pay, and if they won’t pay, well we’d better take the short cuts then that’s all there is about it.

This statement highlights how some farmers may acknowledge the environmental consequences of using productivist methods, though at the same time believe that there is little option if they want to remain viable. However, despite the trend towards larger farming properties, which was noted by all farmers participating in the research, some farmers were retreating from farming practices requiring the use of inputs and expanding property sizes. As one farmer commented:

I’m not paying huge dollars for chemical and urea and other fertilisers. For someone who may have payed $2,000 per acre, they take the risk. To me, the risk is phenomenal. If you’re pouring thousands of dollars of chemical and other inputs, you’ve got to get a big return…There are some things in the really big broadacre operation that don’t make a lot of economic sense.

While this statement highlights the risks associated with this approach, another farmer from a different property identifies what they perceived as a diminished connection between the farmer, their market and the people that consume their food, stating that farming had become a “clinical business”. This farming entity was comprised of a husband and wife, who felt that productivist farming was the antithesis of their own approach to agriculture, which prioritised their sense of connection with the land. As one member of this partnership stated:

It’s almost as if (farming) has lost its soul…It’s just become another factory business. And that is fine if that is what you want. But that is not what we want. And that comes back to having long links with the land, and wanting to improve the land and not make it worse.

For a small percentage of participants, rejecting the productivist paradigm was an avenue through which they could increase the viability of their farm. This was achieved through diversification, and a focus on developing products which met the needs of consumers seeking free-range, or chemical-free produce, and through the use of weed and pest control methods which did not require chemical inputs. Furthermore, for some farmers, the decision to limit their expansion allowed them to retain a greater connection with their land. This is indicated through an exchange involving a husband and wife partnership:

…this connection that you build up with the land develops when you do the work yourself.

It’s sort of like being a caretaker. And the older I get the more I feel that. That it’s not ours forever, so therefore it’s not ours to rape and pillage and get everything you can out of it for a season…And I think that this is something that has been lost. Personally I think it’s mainly a financial thing. People just get into so much debt…that [they] have no choice but to drain the land for all it is worth.

These comments highlight the importance that some farmers attribute to the connection that they have with their land, and how this may influence their decisions. However, this quote also alludes to the role that financial pressure plays in causing some farmers to farm their land with an intensity which may not be environmentally sustainable. Yet for these farmers, moving away from this intensive approach to farming is a way of developing their business without expanding the
size of their operation. This directly questions the prevailing belief that viability is directly related to the continual expansion of property size.

**Conclusion**

Through interviews with representatives of 15 separate farming entities, based in Victoria's western Wimmera, this research has sought to understand how farmers have responded to the discourse around farm size, productivity and efficiency, and therefore viability of farming operations. The majority of farmers participating in this study felt that there was no viable alternative to property growth. While some growers did feel trapped within the cycle of increased expansion and input use to enhance productivity, others viewed this more clinically as a business decision. A small number of participants in this research did actively reject the dominant paradigms of growth and productivism. This was motivated by a desire to remain close to the land, and to improve the land by employing environmentally sustainable farming methods.
References


Nossal, K., Zhao, S., Sheng, Y., & Gunasekera, D., (2009), Productivity movements in Australian
agriculture, Australian Commodities, 16(1), pp.206-216.


Rural Industries Research and Development Corporation, (2007), Drivers of structural change in Australian agriculture. RIRDC Publication No 07/057, Canberra: RIRDC.

Agency and the Interaction Order: The Feminine Tattooed Body

Benjamin C. Pinkard
Faculty of Arts, School of Social Sciences, University of Tasmania

Peta S. Cook,
Institute for the Study of Social Change, Faculty of Arts, School of Social Sciences, University of Tasmania

Abstract
In contemporary Western society, there is a strong focus on how the body looks and performs, and whether it requires regulation. These powerful expectations impact on individual embodiment—the lived experience of having and being a body, including the internalisation and enactment of socially constructed norms (Kosut and Moore 2010; Shapiro 2015). In this article, we focus on the ways in which tattoos are an embodiment of the interaction order (Goffman 1983); a symbolic mediation between individuals and the social structure. To achieve this, we draw upon the experiences of Rachael, a 24-year old woman employed as a receptionist with ten tattoos, to illustrate how social discourses about the ‘normalised’ feminine body can be reinforced and challenged through tattoos. This is evidenced by Rachael’s use of tattoos as part of a suite of ‘technologies of the self’ (Foucault 1988), which make her feel in control and align, and reconfigure, her body with social discourses of femininity. Our analysis highlights how the body is entangled in an interplay between broad socio-cultural contexts and personal embodiment, as witnessed in tattoos.

Keywords: tattoo; tattooing; body work; technologies of the self; interaction order; femininity

Introduction: Embodying Tattoos
Through the body, individuals encounter, understand, and negotiate the social world. As a result, what an individual does with their body, including body modification practices such as tattooing, holds special significance. Historical and anthropological research locates tattoos in ceremony and rites of passage, signalling one’s level of maturity and social status (Pitts 2003). This is largely divorced from the cultural appropriation of tattooing by the West which, until recently, has predominately been associated with social deviancy, the marginalised (sex workers, prisoners, and bikers), and the working class (DeMello 2014; Shapiro 2015). In the contemporary West, there
is an increasingly diverse population of people in the tattoo industry and with tattoos, with an estimated 36% of 18 to 25 year olds in the United States having a tattoo (Shapiro 2015: 48). These recent tattoo practices have largely been dismissed in academic scholarship as decorative, exhibitionist, narcissistic, and ‘empty signs,’ driven by consumer culture with no referent to wider social structures such as gender, ethnicity and class (Steele 1996; Turner 1999). This negativity is further witnessed in psychology, where tattoos have often been depicted as signs of self-injury, self-hatred, social maladjustment and immaturity (Atkinson 2004).

These perspectives overlook the lived experiences of having a tattooed body and the potential influence of the social. For example, Atkinson (2002) posits femininity is constructed through the patriarchal principles of what a woman should be: a slender, soft, innocent, and powerless body, suggesting women with tattoos subvert or challenge such ideals (Atkinson and Young 2001). Importantly, tattoos can be pro-social (Atkinson 2004); a way an active relationship to the body—both one’s own and that of others—can be formed, and a way in which to speak about, affirm and form relationships with others. Therefore, tattoos can be a visual acknowledgement of the interconnectedness between self, body, and society (Crossley 2005).

Maintaining or modifying the body, such as through tattooing, requires effort and time. They are “technologies of the self,” a way an individual engages in corporeal practices to achieve a “state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection, or immortality” (Foucault 1988: 18), and sense of self-identity. It should be noted such “body projects” (Shilling 1993) cannot be disassociated from social structures, as they are invested with the power and privilege that manifests in social expectations and norms (Shapiro 2015).

We argue tattooing is, and can, act as a technology of the self. The tattooed body can illustrate constructions of self and social belonging in the interaction order (Goffman 1983), which indicates the significance and influence of co-presence in producing the social self. Our case study of Rachael demonstrates tattoos can provide an individual a perceived sense of control in the pursuit of achieving a body which they desire and create, while also adhering to social (gendered) standards, providing a lens through which to examine contemporary understandings and practices of the female body within social contexts. Therefore, our research contributes a more nuanced, complex account of contemporary tattooing practices in the West, specifically in relation to feminine bodies that situates such practices firmly within the social and contemporary corporeal politics. Thus, tattoos provide a platform to explore the intersections of socio-cultural constructions of the feminine corporeality and an individual’s sense of self.

Methods
To explore these interests, we draw upon the case study of Rachael (a pseudonym), a 24-year-old woman employed as a receptionist with ten tattoos. Rachael’s narrative emerged from a larger research project using in-depth interviews with nine women and two men who have ‘hidden tattoos’: tattoos on parts of the body typically hidden by clothing or not readily on public display (such as on the sole of the foot). The interviews specifically explored the locations and meanings behind these ‘hidden tattoos’. Rachael emerged as a unique case who openly discussed the relationship between her tattoos and managing her embodiment as a young, slender, feminine body, which is why she is the focus of this article. As a result, while we acknowledge a case study of one cannot adequately capture the relationship between femininity and tattooing, this approach enables us to identify features that make Rachael’s experiences remarkable and unique (Stake 2008). Furthermore, the singular case study approach respects her experiences and presents them in detail, providing an agenda for future research into the feminine tattooed body.
The Case Study: Rachael

There are a variety of reasons individuals choose to tattoo their body. For Rachael, her tattoos mark her skin with her own self-narrative:

I’m not an art person or anything, but the tattoos and stuff I think is an expression of who I am and what I like, and... Individuality…

This highlights how tattoos are seen as personal marks and an extension of oneself. While most of Rachael’s tattoos are frequently disguised by clothing and are therefore not openly communicative to others, she often discusses them in relation to bodily display. Many of her tattoos are revealed when she wears fewer clothes such as dancing, or enjoying time at the beach. These present opportunities to expose her tattoos and body:

I find that a lot of my tattoos are on the parts of my body that I’m the most confident with. So, they’re, well I don’t want to sound like I flaunt my body, but the parts that I really like to show off, and the parts of my body that I like.

Tattoos draw attention to Rachael’s body and, as a result, she focuses on placing them on places she is proud of. In Rachael’s words, “I like that part of my body, so I want to put something on it”. When she displays her tattoos, this is a visual communication which reveals she feels assured about her body. Her tattoos therefore signify her feelings and levels of bodily confidence. In this way, through her tattoos, she actively directs the multiple gazes upon her body to those parts she has personally selected including her lower back, inner bicep, and calf.

As a female, Rachael’s displays of her tattooed body are noteworthy, given the cultural association of tattoos with maleness and masculine sub-cultures (Atkinson 2002). The public exposures of her tattooed body could be read as challenging or resisting the social expectations of the beautiful and docile feminine body, “to undermine constraining codes of body idiom and conventional ways about being […] ‘feminine’” (Atkinson and Young 2001: 137). Rachael does not openly critique these social norms (and indeed, some of her practices demonstrate alignment), but she does demonstrate her agency through a careful selection of where tattoos are placed on her body; they must be on areas of her body that she likes (which are emphasised by her tattoos) and are usually covered by clothing. She is discerning about when to, as she puts it, “show off” her tattoos, restricting this to particular seasons (such as summer) and bodily performances and displays (such as exercising or dancing). She also chooses not to display them in certain contexts, for example the workplace, where patriarchal constructions of the female body conflict with Rachael’s. She may choose the design and physical location of her tattoos, however, they are influenced by her socially sanctioned femininity and her perception of ongoing social stigma towards tattooed female bodies (Goffman 1983). Therefore, Rachael defines which sections of her body the gaze of others is directed, and when and where this will occur.

At the same time, while Rachael might be seen as resisting the social discourses of tattoos as masculine, the choice and placement of her tattoos aligns with femininity within the interaction order. For example, Rachael describes the flowers she has chosen as “pretty”, and this content aligns with socially established scripts for femininity. This can be read as apologetic for participating in such patriarchal practices as, for women to gain acceptance in the male sanctioned system of tattooing, their tattoos are more likely to be hidden, less visible (Atkinson 2002) and smaller (Shapiro 2015) than men’s tattoos. Therefore, while Rachael feels a sense of control (agency) through tattooing, her choices also reflect the social construction of the female body by their content, size, and location.
It is important to note, however, Rachael's displays of her tattooed body also dependent on her assessment of her body shape and appearance, and are not purely agentic. While tattoos assist her to develop and illustrate her sense of self, Rachael feels the need to engage in further forms of technologies of the self to be comfortable in displaying them:

[...] I think tattoos are a constant reminder that they are on the body, people are going to see them, so kinda keeps me in the mind frame that I wanna keep my body, looking good, and comfortable with my body so that you can show them off.

Tattoos function as a permanent reminder of the body, foregrounding it in Rachael’s consciousness. What she also indicates is the visuality of tattoos becomes revealed in interaction with others, exposing and rendering vulnerable her tattooed and feminine self. As such, while the tattooed feminine body may challenge social expectations on beauty, Rachael shows how the display of tattoos within the interaction order may strengthen adherence to female bodily norms. As Atkinson (2002: 220) explains, “women's tattoos are layered with culturally established, resistant, and negotiated images of femininity,” and are not simply “rebellious” or “personally emancipating”. Tattoos increase Rachael's attention to whether her body is “looking good”. This alters the surface of her body, and influences her corporeal experiences and practices to ensure her body ‘fits’ and can be displayed in a way that avoids loosing ‘face’:

And that, you know, people always go, 'you're gonna get saggy!', and 'you're gonna get stretch marks!', and 'that's a prime area that things are gonna go south!', and it's like well, having the tattoo there in a way, kinda, keeps you on top of keeping in shape, and keeping your body, where you want it. Because you want them to always look good, you want your tattoos to look good. [...] it just helps keep you on track.

Rachael is therefore conscious about the appearance of her tattoos, which reinforces her body consciousness. For her tattoos to look their best (that is, attractive), Rachael feels she must engage with body projects of exercise and diet to ensure she remains slender. Going “off track” is associated with weight gain (“stretch marks”) and ageing (“sagging”) while being “on track” involves keeping her body “in shape” and allows her to display them with confidence and fit in with the social construction of the female body. She is aware of the size and shape of her possible, future embodied self, which she subjectively manages through self-surveillance and discipline (Foucault 1988), as informed by social interactions (Goffman 1983).

Rachael’s tattoos are “technologies of the self” (Foucault 1988)—tools that encourage her engagement with a range of body projects (Shilling 1993) that promote slenderness and youthfulness. This demonstrates her conformity to social expectations of feminine corporeal discipline, and illustrates her self-identity and confidence are connected with social expectations of the desirable slender feminine body. While Rachael might be seen as subverting certain cultural ideas of femininity through her tattooed body, her consequent body work practices demonstrate her compliance with socially constructed images of the disciplined, slender, young, feminine body (Atkinson 2002).

Rachael's body work could be reduced to narcissism due to her desires to “show off” her body and tattoos. She could also be viewed as a hapless victim of an oppressive, patriarchal body culture. Rachael’s tattoos, however, are body projects over which she has exercised some level of control, and are tools that help her manage her body. As noted by Immergut (2010), there is little any agent can claim as their own except perhaps the physical body, even if it is only an illusion. Rachael has exercised some choice and agency within the context of the interaction order, which emerges alongside her conformity to the normative feminine body. In this way, the consequent body projects which her tattoos prompt are ways for her to manage and address the potential social and personal angst that could emerge from having a body that does not conform (Shapiro
2015). She shapes and controls her body, but is also subjected to social pressures to exercise this control. Thus, her ability to be creative with her tattoos is informed by her social relations in the interaction order (Goffman 1983).

Conclusion
In the past, tattoos have been cast as socially ‘deviant’, but our case study of Rachael highlights they can also enable compliance with normative expectations and practices of the body (Atkinson 2004). As influenced by the interaction order, Rachael is conscious of how actual or potential physical changes can alter the appearance of her tattooed body and render her vulnerable. Therefore, tattoos become “technologies of self” (Foucault 1988) which influence Rachael’s relationship with her body (present and future), her embodied practices (such as exercise), and her social interactions.

We suggest this reveals tattoos as multi-faceted. Rachael’s tattoo locations demonstrate her confidence with certain sections of her body, but also her ability to cover them given the stigma towards a tattooed (feminine) body. Indeed, maintaining her professional work image—in addition to her bodily confidence—is an important factor in the hidden placement of her tattoos. They also assist her to achieve and maintain her sense of self. At the same time, Rachael’s tattoos are normalising. They remind her to comply with the social expectations of a slender feminine body, and avoid the stigma and vulnerability associated with social (bodily) deviance. Furthermore, Rachael’s tattoos are also evidence of her role in the interaction order where slenderness and youthfulness of her feminine body must be preserved. As noted by Shapiro (2015: 49), “Even when women seek freedom and power over their bodies, the meanings women attach to their tattoos are ‘culturally written over’ by larger society”. Rachael’s experiences and negotiations of her feminine tattooed body illustrate the intricate interplays that occur between agency and the interaction order. Therefore, her tattoos are not ‘empty’ of meaning, but are a constant reminder of her body as an individual and social experience.

As our case study of Rachael illustrates, tattoos become technologies individuals use to express agency and create their sense of self, how this is exhibited in and through the body, and what this says about the influence of social interactions. Rachael manages a variety of social discourses exhibited in and through the performances of her feminine tattooed body and her consequent body projects, which highlights the subtleties and complexities of contemporary tattoo praxis. Therefore, demonstrating the ongoing relevance of gender to tattooing practices, living with a tattooed female body, and the self-discipline of feminine corporeality in a consumer culture.
References


Risky food and water? Health and environmental knowledge and information-seeking in Australia.

Angela T. Ragusa,
School of Humanities & Social Sciences, Charles Sturt University

Andrea Crampton
School of Biomedical Sciences, Charles Sturt University,

Abstract
Despite the centrality of health to collective well-being, many people fail to heed, or critically question, human or environmental health advice. Our research explores individual knowledge of key issues targeted by government health campaigns and policy guidelines for risks faced daily through food and water consumption and documents information sources participants used for air, water, environment, and health risk/quality advice. Findings challenge stereotypical assumptions that higher-educated individuals have high health and environmental literacy. Despite many holding general and advanced degrees, variation and illiteracy emerged regarding awareness of daily recommended dietary guidelines, with limited awareness of daily recommendations for fruit and vegetables and varied knowledge about fried food, dairy, and red meat consumption. While many knew treating tank or river water is required before consumption, several were unaware of the associated risks. The Internet and television constituted participants’ key information sources for all issues examined. Given the high cost, negative effects, and risks (including death) from poor diet and exposure to microbiologically-contaminated water, we argue new ways of communicating health and environmental risk factors are required that a) bypass political, economic, and corporatist interests; b) engender critical knowledge consumption; and c) incorporate demographically-relevant strategies and campaigns reflecting individualistic and group practices/preferences.

Keywords: Communication, Drinking Water, Environmental Literacy, Health Literacy, Media, Sociology of Knowledge

Introduction
Primary social survey data is presented from an exploratory study of Australian university employees to examine individual awareness, or ‘literacy’, of two contemporary issues with great capacity to affect well-being: 1. basic nutrition (daily recommended servings of dairy, meat, fried
food, fruit and vegetables) and 2. non-municipally-supplied drinking water (tank and river). By comparing basic nutrition literacy for topics widely disseminated through government guidelines and health campaigns seeking to educate Australians about risks associated with diseases influenced by modern Western ‘lifestyles’ (Thorburn et al. 2014), and drinking water from sources microbiologically known to be ‘risky’ (Boi et al. 2016; Crampton and Ragusa 2016), it offers a snapshot of ‘what’ was ‘correctly’ or ‘incorrectly’ known according to current policy recommendations. Next, it contributes to communication research by presenting information sources participants consulted about risks associated with the environment, health, air, and water quality. Theoretically informed by health and environmental risk/literacy, it contributes to a limited yet growing body of sociological work exploring the nexus between individual knowledge and well-being assessment, critically questioning if/how knowledge construction and dissemination ought to be improved.

Theory & Literature Review

Sociological theories exploring risk and knowledge construction in contemporary Western society reveal risk assessment is not only derived from individual cost-benefit judgments, but further reflects perceptions shaped by social norms and a plethora of information differentially communicated (Beck 1992). Despite being labelled ‘knowledge societies’, Western culture may be characterised as ‘risky’ because our capacity to generate voluminous, and often contradictory, data has, from a critical perspective, engendered greater confusion than clarity, knowledge, or ‘literacy’ (Beck 1992).

Conceptually, critical and post-structural theory have advanced our capacity to question how and why some discourses, knowledges, are adopted while others get branded heretical, or simply silenced. For instance, poststructuralist theory well describes how discourse frames the content and interpretation of knowledge, making communication a thoroughly socially constructed act affected by many social factors, particularly power (Foucault 1969; 2004). Further, the sociology of science has long questioned how ‘scientific’ issues get framed, advanced, silenced, or refuted (Kuhn 1970; Harding 1991) while contemporary health research, informed by critical theory, evidences power laden ideologies driving ‘modern’ medicine/science and consequences such objectives pose to human health and well-being, especially those driven by corporatism and inequitable systemic factors (Campbell 2013).

Despite a plethora of social theory with great capacity to articulate the negotiated realities and knowledges shaping humanity’s future, the social construction of scientific knowledge and environmental risks continues to pose elusive threats to human and non-human health/well-being (Crampton and Ragusa 2016). For example, through investigating perceived drinking water quality, our prior research extensively demonstrates perception trumps environmental risk exposure, with most Australians and New Zealanders interviewed relying on social and aesthetic factors, rather than empirically-derived health-threatening indicators, to make drinking water decisions (Crampton and Ragusa 2014; 2010; 2009; 2008). Conversely, bottled water research reveals, despite known environmental degradation from non-renewable, single-use plastics, individual consumption decisions are largely based upon economic, not health factors; ‘real’ and/or perceived health risks insignificantly affected bottled water purchase decisions (Ragusa and Crampton 2016). Likewise, others note perceived risk from environmental factors does not correlate with predicted or actual risk; perceptions are influenced by physical environmental indicators/changes and social factors, such as the media (Finnis et al. 2015).

The value of scientific literacy for improving ‘appropriate’ risk perception is differentially valued in academic research (Tranter and Booth 2015). Public concern about socio-environmental factors demonstrates varied opinion based on unknown information sources. Recent survey
research revealed Australians' low concern for their own and environmental health, with just 1% of respondents concerned about pollution or water conservation and 3% concerned about health in contrast with issues such as terrorism (6%) and unemployment (11%) (Levine 2015). Australians, New Zealanders and Americans also demonstrate greater scepticism towards anthropomorphic climate change and associated environmental/social risks than other developed countries, including the UK (Tranter and Booth 2015).

Understanding perceptions about risk exposure, and awareness of knowledge sources from where perceptions are derived, is crucial to reduce real and perceived risks to human and environmental well-being. Traditional government health campaigns are criticised for taking a 'one-type-of-advice-suits-all' approach and their ignorance of the role environmental, cultural, and socioeconomic (SES) factors play in affecting individuals' capacity to follow suggested behaviours (Baum and Fisher 2014). Although large scale campaigns, particularly those applied across whole, rather than local, populations, are somewhat effective in changing behaviours of high-SES groups, they rarely are effective in promoting change amongst disadvantaged groups (Slama 2010). Similarly, some individuals respond better to communication of negative outcomes from risky behaviour while others are more receptive to campaigns promoting positive messages (Ludolph and Schulz 2015), suggesting effective campaigns require tailoring for target populations while allowing for individual differences.

As health promotion strategy gaps produce calls to switch from individual behaviour-based approaches to policy-driven changes that reduce SES-derived health inequities (Baum and Fisher 2014), need exists to identify and understand public awareness and campaign message effectiveness. Public health campaigns draw on social psychology and cognitive behaviour theories that assume communicating health risks and behavioural change benefits logically leads individuals to change behaviour (Baum and Fisher 2014). Rose (1985), however, found targeting population risk factors, rather than concentrating on 'high-risk' or 'diseased' individuals seemingly too late to help, is more effective.

Health politics affects decision-making at micro and macro levels and public perception of risk factors can influence governments’ willingness to legislatively address issues (Robert et al. 2008). Targeting health risk factors, such as reducing sugar levels in food, rather than individual behaviours, such as reducing sugar consumption, requires governmental/legislative intervention and corporate cooperation (Cobiac et al. 2010).

Targeting individual behavioural, rather than social, change, is politically easier, particularly for organisations with inadequate resources to tackle corporations. The complexity of socio-environmental ‘well-being’ thus not only hinges on what constitutes ‘good’ health, it is a socially-constructed complex, power-imbeded web of political, social, and scientific factors differentially known and communicated. To begin addressing these ‘risks’ requires greater understanding of ‘what’ information is individually known so the harder task of dismantling ‘who’ created that knowledge and ‘why’ may be critically interrogated and clearly communicated.

Methods
In 2013, a pilot survey was conducted to generate exploratory insights about university employees’ basic environmental and health literacy. As a large, inland regional university with multiple campuses located in rural and regional areas, the pilot survey’s purpose, obtaining a baseline level of staff knowledge, constituted the ‘first step’ in an applied, as well as academic, project we are leading to develop an organisational change initiative. Sixty quantitative online surveys were completed with University Human Research Ethics approval using the university’s internal announcement system for recruitment. All participants received a project description, gave informed consent, and no adverse consequences resulted. Although every member of the
population (450 ongoing employees) had an equal opportunity to participate, findings do not seek to be generalisable beyond the sample due to the low (13.3%) response rate (Neuman 2011).

The survey consisted of demographic and substantive close-ended questions chosen in light of research literature (Bryman 2012). This paper reports findings about participants’ health literacy and sources consulted to obtain environmental and health information. Health literacy data was collected for two key issues, nutrition and drinking water, using multiple-choice questions permitting one answer. Nutritional health literacy explored knowledge of recommended daily servings for fruit and vegetables, dairy, red meat, and fried food.

Drinking water literacy was assessed by knowledge of tank and river water safety. The question, “From what information source do you receive information?” was asked for environmental health, personal health, air and water quality to identify from where participants obtained information, with 6 answer-options provided (television, the Internet, radio, newspapers, professionals/experts, and/or friends/family) and opportunity for multiple answers. Surveys were de-identified to protect anonymity and data entered into SPSS to generate descriptive statistics and a chi square test of significant difference between groups to provide exploratory findings for future broader-scale research.

**Findings & Discussion**

Demographically, the 60 participants predominantly were Australians (83%) residing in New South Wales (78%). More women (68%) than men completed the survey and many were well educated, with 40% having a postgraduate degree and all except one completing a Bachelor’s (23%) and/or high school degree (35%). Mean age was 43, ranging from 18-75. Table 1 summarises the sample’s demographic profile.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1: Sample demographics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest Degree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nationality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Residing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Substantively, most correctly identified the nationally recommended daily servings for dairy (67%), fried food (68%) and meat (90%), yet only 28% knew how many fruit and vegetables should be eaten as Chart 1 illustrates.

Further, 63% thought 5 or fewer fruit and vegetables were sufficient and 15% thought 2 or fewer daily were sufficient for good health.
A range of significant correlations emerged between knowledge of recommended daily intakes and demographics. Weak correlations existed for ‘nationality’ and ‘rurality’ for daily fruit and vegetable servings, with those born outside of Australia (r=.281, p=.03) more inclined to know 7 (2 fruits, 5 vegetables) are the daily recommended guidelines. Rurality was associated with less knowledge of healthy fried food servings (r=-.267, p=.039), yet greater knowledge of fruit and vegetable intake (r=.297, p=.021), despite the whole sample exhibiting the lowest health literacy for fruit and vegetable servings compared with dairy, meat, and fried food. Age, gender, and educational levels affected nutrition literacy, albeit for specific knowledge. For example, although a moderate correlation with gender (r=-.384, p=.002) suggested women had greater knowledge that fried food is unhealthy, overall, gender was insignificant for nutrition literacy.

Demographic factors thus appear worth further consideration to determine how to improve basic nutritional literacy in Australia. Descriptive statistics suggest investigating relationships between demographic characteristics (i.e., gender, age, nationality, education, rurality) and specific health literacy issues may help to better tailor and target messages to social groups as prior research suggests (Ludolph and Schulz 2015). For instance, messages about negative health implications from excessive red meat consumption appear to have reached more individuals sampled, with 90% knowing 2-3 servings daily is considered bad for human health than those (28%) understanding health benefits from eating sufficient fruit and vegetables. These findings reflect national trends showing although more Australians (a 293,000 increase 2013-2015) reduced red meat consumption and/or became vegetarian (Price 2016), only 2% met the recommended daily guidelines for fruit and vegetables (Nagaratnam 2015).

Examination of participants’ knowledge about risks related to exposing themselves to environmental toxins by consuming unsafe drinking water revealed similar literacy levels compared with nutritional literacy. Overall, 67% knew tank/65% knew river water was safe to drink if boiled or filtered. Still, nearly a quarter (24%) thought it was ‘ok’ to drink untreated tank water, which could put their health at risk, and 3% thought untreated river water was safe to drink. The sample’s overall low drinking water literacy was further conveyed by heightened risk perceptions, with 10% thinking tank water is ‘always bad to drink’ or ‘don’t know’ and 32% thinking the same for river water. Significant associations emerged with rurality and employment for knowledge of tank and river drinking water safety. Unsurprisingly, rurality was associated with greater knowledge, specifically it’s only safe to consume boiled or filtered tank (r=.267, p=.039) and river water (r=.277, p=.032). Given the sample’s rural locations, this finding is locally relevant and suggests need to educate non-rural staff/students working/living in rural environments about risks and safety precautions around consuming untreated tank and river water, as well as assuaging fear about safely treated non-municipal water supplies.

Environmental and health literacy are often acquired ad hoc from uncritically-consumed resources of questionable quality (Adams and Gynnild 2013; Rains 2007). Thus, understanding how to ‘reach’, or communicate, ‘best-practices’ regarding ‘legitimate’ environmental and health
risks first requires understanding what information sources individuals seek out, and trust, to acquire such knowledge. Sociologically, the most trusted information sources are often not those with scientifically-evidenced knowledge (Crampton and Ragusa 2016). Chart 2 demonstrates media were by far the preferred source for all environmental and health information in contrast with experts and family/friends.

![Chart 2: Mediated vs Unmediated Knowledge Sourcing](image)

While media sources may have greater environmental/health information than family/friends, and all scientific expertise is biased to some degree according to critical sociology of science and technology theory (Harding 1991; Latour 2004), the power dynamics associated with media production and communication coupled with participants’ primary reliance on media (~80% consulted media and 16% or less consulted unmediated human sources) highlights vast potential for bias or miscommunication of environmental and human health issues, as science communication research elsewhere details (Moser 2016). With nearly 90% sourcing environmental and air quality information from the media, for example, great potential exists for partial, inaccurate, or highly ‘biased’ communication. Given air quality perceptions have been found more aligned with political identification, rurality, information access, and age than actual measures of air pollution (Brody et al. 2004; Edgley et al. 2011; King 2014), mounting evidence exists for evidence-based education, perhaps commencing with higher-quality Internet and television-based campaigns given their preference as an information source for health/environmental information (Chart 3).

![Chart 3: Information sources for environmental & health information](image)

As climate change communication research demonstrates, broad issues affecting all levels of society require multiple information dissemination approaches, not continued reliance on the historically normative ‘singular media’ focus (Moser 2016). Although critical media and
communication studies assert the Internet’s democratic potential, particularly for knowledge susceptible to manipulation by vested interests (Lau et al. 2012), its magnitude and scope renders quality ‘assurance’ a complex task. Given environmental and health risk information is differentially communicated, with content and reporting frequency varying among academic and popular outlets (i.e. journals, policy, press releases, etc.), the relevance of reducing the divide between scientific/public understanding and matching communication outlet with audience needs/preferences for improved ‘practical’ outcomes (i.e. better health/well-being) cannot be over-emphasised.

In conclusion, this research has shown, despite the highly educated (40% Masters/PhDs/23% Bachelors degrees) nature of the sample, considerable health and environmental literacy variation existed regarding drinking water and nutritional knowledge. Findings question whether higher SES is associated with greater health literacy (Slama 2010) and the effectivity of individualistic, behavioural-driven campaigns for improving public health knowledge (Baum and Fisher 2014), particularly when knowledge is largely derived from media sources, such as the Internet and television, which exhibit variable quality and veracity. While the medically-pronounced need for governmental, legislative and corporate cooperation to address systemic health risk factors (Cobiac et al. 2010) is laudable, we question if it is plausible given their differing vested political/economic interests. Critically considered, there exists great need to create campaigns derived from empirically-known environmental and health risks, not individualistic perceptions, which are effectively communicated through reputable sources.
References


Insights from the Sarvodaya Five Stage Village Development Model for Sustainable Development Planning and Strategy Formulation – A Spirituality-based Approach

Praveena Rajkobal
Deakin University

Abstract

Most developing countries around the world are still struggling to determine national sustainable development strategies, which successfully integrate rural sector development into national planning. The United Nations recognise the role of civil society organisations in providing insightful frameworks for sustainable development planning and strategy formulation. This article examines the Five Stage Village Development framework of the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement in Sri Lanka, and the contribution it can make to the achievement of SDGs. The Sarvodaya model depicts a bottom-up process of development which ascends in the order of personality development, community development, village development and ultimately national development. After conducting empirical research into three Sarvodaya tsunami resettlement villages, which were designed according to the Five Stage Village Development strategy, the paper finds that the Sarvodaya model is quite effective in creating governance structures and patterns of community cohesion that are important to the achievement of most SDGs. The paper recommends broader patterns of collaborations among the State and the Movement to support the expanding economic growth at the village level in order to integrate rural development with national development more effectively.

Keywords: SDGs, spirituality-based approaches, Five Stage Village Development, National development, Sarvodaya Movement, Sri Lanka

Introduction

The United Nations General Assembly made a transition from the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) to Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) in September 2015. 17 Sustainable Development Goals which are, alleviation of extreme hunger, ensuring healthy lives, promoting wellbeing, providing equitable education, achieving gender equality, providing access to clean water and sanitation, promoting sustainable economic growth and employment opportunities, establishing patterns of sustainable consumption, addressing concerns related to climate change...
and impacts, and the conservation of natural resource bases, now provide the overarching framework for the eradication of poverty (United Nations, 2015a, 2015b). As governments are struggling to integrate these goals into their national development strategies, the United Nations Department of Economic and Social Affairs Division for Sustainable Development (United Nations, 2015) recognised the assisting role that can be played by grassroots and faith-based organisations. This paper examines the work of such a grassroots movement in Sri Lanka called the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement, which is primarily based on a Buddhist philosophy. The Movement develops rural villages adopting a Five Stage Village Development strategy. Through the lens of the works of religion and development and religion and governance scholars (Channell, 2000; Gauthier, Martikainen, & Woodhead, 2016; Halafoff, 2013; Marshall, 2013; Tomalin, 2013) and sociologists of religion and environment (Johnston, 2013), this paper examines the strengths and weakness of the Sarvodaya Model to the achievement of SDGs. The paper argues that the Five Stage Village Development Model is quite effective in creating governance structures and patterns of community cohesion that are important to the achievement of most SDGs. However, the various actors of governance still have to create broader patterns of collaborations to carefully integrate this spirituality model into national planning. Collaborative networks among the government, other NGOs and Sarvodaya should encourage expanding economic growth at the village level through integrating Five Stage Development Model with models of national development.

**Analytical Framework**

Religion and spirituality based movements can mobilise resources that are important for the implementation of sustainable development goals through an emphasis on values. For one, volunteerism is a form of spiritual practice for most of these movements (Marshall, 2013; Channell, 2000). Through their emphasis on volunteerism as a spiritual practice, most religion and spirituality based movements are able to tap into community capacity by creating cohesive communities, which can lead to community empowerment in the long term (Marshall, 2013; Tomalin, 2013). Also, as Marshall (2013) points out, religion and spirituality based movements are able to deliver alternative modes of development by treating development as based on moral development. This method has led to public, private and citizen-based activities that have strengthened capabilities at the local level. Moreover, religious values can strengthen collaborative partnerships with various other governance actors such as the State, the private sector and the communities (Johnston, 2013). Further to Johnston's (2013) argument, studying the work of the Multifaith Movement, Halafoff (2013) also demonstrates how religious values can create effective collaborative networks for governance through dialogue, which also is an important aspect of sustainable development. However, as scholars such as Gauthier, Martikainen, & Woodhead (2016) point out, capitalist and neoliberalist relations can change religious and spiritual values of communities, leading either to a decline or a transformation. The paper examines these arguments in relation to the Five Stage Village Development framework of the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement.

**Methods**

This paper is based on a qualitative methodology and the method of in-depth interviewing. The paper contains primary data collected from semi-structured interviews with the Founder and the General Secretary of the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement, three Sarvodaya village-level leaders, and 30 Sarvodaya villagers in three Sarvodaya communities. In-depth interviewing is a derivative of the broader method of interviewing, which is a type of conversation that can let the researcher gain great insights into the interviewee's perspectives, lives and experiences by probing into the areas that are important to the questions investigated in the research (Babbie, 2007; Minichiello et al., 2008). In-depth interviewing was important for this research as it aimed at gaining a thorough
understanding of the Five Stage Village Development plan from the perspectives of the Founder and the leaders of the Sarvodaya Movement. Further, it was also important to engage in in-depth interviews with the villagers to understand how the Sarvodaya frameworks affected changes at the individual and the community level and to learn the effectiveness of Sarovdaya methods in the development practices at the community level. The paper also draws from a comprehensive review of literature on the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement, sustainable development, and religion and development in order to analyse the findings of primary data within the broader context of religion and development, sustainable development, and the frameworks within which the Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement operates.

The Sarvodaya's Five Stage Village Development Plan and the Path to National Awakening
The Sarvodaya Shramadana Movement started in Sri Lanka in 1958 as a Buddhism and spirituality-based movement for rural development under the leadership of Ahangamage Tudor (A.T.) Ariyaratne. Reflecting Marshall's (2013) argument that religion and spirituality based movements can deliver alternative forms of progress through moral development, Sarvodaya's notion of successful development too comes from a moral and spiritual basis.

According to the Sarvodaya philosophy, the individual, through the spiritual changes that start within her/himself, projects that change onto the wider society, initiating a “Total Awakening” process which progresses in the order of Individual Awakening, Community Awakening, Village Awakening, and National Awakening. Awakening, a Buddhist concept, essentially refers to the realisation that the energy to end suffering lies within the self (Oman, 2013). Applying this belief, Sarvodaya conceptualises the Five Stage Village Development Plan and the related process of total awakening as elaborated below.

Sarvodaya’s spirituality based bottom-up framework for development begins at the individual level. Therefore, Stage 1 of village development concentrates on the reformation or the transformation of the individual to see his/her own power to make positive changes in the community. In Stage 1, through spiritual training, the individuals are taught to transcend the identity constructs that inhibit development in village communities such as caste, race, religion and political opinion. The tool that is used in spiritual training is the Buddhist technique of meditation. The villagers contemplate at length on loving-kindness, joy in the joy of others, generosity and donation, pleasant speech, compassion, equanimity and equality. After meditation, the villagers get together in a ‘shramadana camp’ to put these qualities into practice. The word ‘shramadana’ means the voluntary donation of one’s labour and time. The formation of a shramadana camp in a village symbolises the solidarity and unification of individuals through Individual Awakening. The Sarvodaya's Stage 1 of village development therefore corroborates with Channell (2000) and Marshall (2013)’s argument that religion and spirituality based movements are resourceful in using volunteerism as a spiritual practice to create community cohesion to support development. The shramadana camps are not limited to the voluntary contribution of labour and time of the local village community, but are also open to the wider society. This allows for the formation of urban and rural collaborations and to create networks with other actors of development, such as the government.

The Stage 2 of village development is the establishment of village level societies. The rural leadership that emerges through Individual Awakening in Stage 1 is further enhanced through the creation of groups in Stage 2, leading to Community Awakening. Ariyaratne ( 1989a, p. 92) identifies this as the phase which is “necessary to organise people of all age groups as social formations”. Sarvodaya philosophy holds that “the individuals and the group need parallel development” (Ariyaratne, 1989b, p. 48). After or alongside the shramadana camp, the Sarvodaya's leaders categorise the various interest groups according to the values, strengths and needs by which these groups can contribute to the village development process. As Ariyaratne
(1989b) explains, generally there are six groups. The “village human resources”, as Ariyaratne (1978, p.104) calls them, are grouped basically into the Children’s Group (age 6-15), Youth Group (16+), Mothers’ Group, Farmers’ Group, and General Elders’ Group. Although this is a general categorisation of groups, Ariyaratne (1978, p.104) emphasises that groups are formed and “opportunity is provided for as many people in the village as possible, young and old, to participate constructively and collectively in their own developmental efforts”.

The Stage 3 of the village development scheme aims at establishing the political and economic power structures that bring development and social justice to the rural populations. The rural societies at this stage are equipped with village level democratic institutions that govern the village with bottom-up grassroots participation (Ariyaratne, 1978). These institutions are called the Sarvodaya Shramadana Society (SSS) (the direct translation of this is the Sarvodaya sharing of labour society). The SSS gains a legal status through its registration in the Parliament. Ideally, the SSS acquires the ownership of land for economic activities, maintains a bank account, provides loans, engage in financial activities and start various economic activities in the village (Ariyaratne, 1989b).

In Stage 4, the village should become completely independent in terms of self-financing, employment, production and consumption. The SSS of these villages are able to earn an income from local resources and fully function economically by establishing economic activities, providing employment and paying full time workers (Ariyaratne, 1989b). Stages 3 and 4 of Sarvodaya village development are therefore exemplary of what Marshall (2013) describes as religion and spirituality based movements’ ability to change access to primary economic resources (land, credit, employment and communication) through a philosophy based on moral development. At this stage Sarvodaya advocates a holistic approach to community development, satisfying ten basic needs – clean and adequate drinking-water supply, balanced diet, minimum clothing, a clean environment, simple housing, basic communication facilities, access to energy sources, education, and cultural and spiritual satisfaction.

The stages 3 and 4 of village development reflects Village Awakening as in these stages the villages achieve their full potential. Once the awakening process reaches the level of Village Awakening, it should flow onto the national level. Therefore, in Stage 5, the self-financing and self-reliant villages connect other lesser developed villages in a network, creating a cluster of villages (Ariyaratne, 1989b, p. 46). Usually a village that has come to Stage 5 could support a network of five to ten villages (Ariyaratne, 1989c). For a summary of the 5 Stages see Table 1 below.

**Table 1: The Sarvodaya Five Stage Village Development Plan and the corresponding component of the Total Awakening Process**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Main Activity</th>
<th>Corresponding component of the total awakening process</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Stage 1</td>
<td>Problem analysis, identification of needs and sharing of one’s labour and time to perform these services for the community</td>
<td>Individual Awakening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 2</td>
<td>Establishment of village level societies and groups</td>
<td>Community Awakening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 3</td>
<td>Setting up programs to meet the basic needs of the village and setting up institutions</td>
<td>Village Awakening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 4</td>
<td>Measures to produce income and employment within the village</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Stage 5</td>
<td>Support other village communities</td>
<td>National Awakening</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Discussion
The Movement’s framework of development is resourceful in the modelling of spiritual capacities of individuals, as pointed out by Marshall (2013), Tomalin (2013) and Channell (2000), to create alternative modes of development and social cohesion. If successful, the model has the potential to achieve most SDGs. Firstly, the Five Stage Development model can deliver better governance by creating cohesive communities through creating local leadership and ownership of resources for poverty alleviation. Secondly, the Movement’s concept of ten basic needs can deliver most SDGs by establishing a basis for sustainable consumption and for the satisfaction of basic human needs.

As the study of the three Sarvodaya villages revealed, the villages progressed considerably well up to the stage of Community Awakening. The Sarvodaya had played a major and a successful role in uniting the community through Pre-schools, Kids Groups, Youth Groups, Mothers Groups, and Elders’ Groups. With the Movement’s involvement and guidance, all three villages own the infrastructure to meet ten basic needs. Together with the Movement’s backing, the better exposure to the market brought unprecedented socioeconomic changes to all three villages. Since at present the villages are developed beyond the point of satisfying the Ten Basic Needs, all three villages feel the need for greater levels of development. However, further development has stopped demonstrating a trend of stagnation somewhere between the Stages 3 and 4. This stagnation has also halted the Total Awakening Process, disrupting the sense of village community. These circumstances of the villages are indicative of Gauthier et al. (2016)’s position that capitalist and neoliberalist relations can change religious and spiritual values of communities, leading either to a decline or a transformation. As the research revealed, arguably the spiritual values of the community have transformed not only to expect an interdependence within the closed village community itself, but to aspire a much broader interdependence also with the social actors that are outside of the village community.

While the strengths of the Five Stage Village Development Model are duly recognised, a weakness of the model is that it does not account for the broader patterns of interdependencies, which have led to the collapse of the model at the level of Community Awakening. Although the Five Stage Village Development have achieved many SDGs related to poverty alleviation and wellbeing, it does not include methods to establish well-regulated sustainable economic growth and expansion. As the villages achieve higher stages of development, such as those of 3 and 4, the focus should change from spirituality to maintaining the economic stability recognising that spiritual values could change during economic growth (Gauthier et al., 2016). The Movement should form better collaborative partnerships with the national level actors who are the State and the private sector in order to progress up to National Awakening. Collaborative partnerships can satisfy the broader levels of interdependencies expected by the villagers. As Johnston’s (2013) and Halafoff (2013) hold, religion and spirituality based movements are also resourceful in forming these collaborative relationships through dialogue and tapping into similar value orientations among the various actors. The Movement should explore its potential to establish these effective collaborative relationships. The States and the private sector should also play an enabling role for movements like this, who are successful to a greater degree on its own, but require enabling functions to bring their alternative modes of development to the national level. These collaborations could effectively bring religion and spirituality based movements’ resourcefulness to the level of national policy formulation thereby for a full implementation of all SDGs.

Conclusion
As developing countries aim to formulate national sustainable development policies that comprehensively coordinate the development of rural villages within the national development strategies, the Sarvodaya Five Village Development plan presents an insightful model that is
founded on spiritual principles of compassion and interconnectedness. The spiritual framework of the Movement creates an alternative mode of development changing power and economic relations of rural communities. The development model of the Movement also creates spirituality based solidarity, social cohesion and integration at grassroots levels. All these prove to be successful in the delivery of most Sustainable Development Goals. However, a transformation of community spiritual values occurs at the higher levels of economic growth as the villages expand beyond the closed boundary of the community. This alters the sense of community with a need to look for broader levels of interdependencies between various other actors of development. The Movement’s model has not still sufficiently taken these changes into account and that prevents the model from ascending to a level of national development. There is a lack of coordination between the State’s development policies with that of the Movement. The State should have policy mechanisms that are in line with such effective alternative modes of development delivered by grassroots religious and spiritual movements. The Movement should also invest in creating much broader collaborative partnerships with the State and the private sector to address the needs for broader level interdependencies.
References


Evictions and Urban Socio-spatial Relations: Evidence from a Southeast Asian Metropolitan Area

Redento Recio
The University of Queensland

Abstract
Public spaces in cities often contain mixed land uses and activities, which render its surrounding streetscapes a coveted location for different stakeholders. The significance of streets shapes an array of socio-spatial relations among various players in the area. In the urban global South, informal street vending contributes to the complexity of socio-spatial interactions. In many cases, vendors’ presence generates hostile treatment from governments, which see hawkers as an obstruction. Often, state authorities resort to evictions to keep vendors off strategic streets and sidewalks. Viewed as a legitimate government apparatus to impose order, evictions target practices and players that are seen to disrupt a neat and regimented system of urban existence. When street hawkers resist, evictions typically result in violence and other conflictive encounters. Beyond the usual conflict-oriented framing, however, this paper illustrates how evictions serve as a critical engagement arena between the state and street vendors. By examining eviction episodes in one informal vending district in Metropolitan Manila, the paper underscores the value of locating grassroots collective action, self-help mechanisms, and state engagement as embedded in the continuing struggle for access to contested public spaces and the power relations in urban centres.

Keywords: Evictions, urban socio-spatial relations, public spaces, informal vendors

State and Urban Socio-spatial Relations
The mixed land uses and functional activities in urban public spaces render its surrounding streetscapes a coveted space for different stakeholders. This significance of streets, as a site for economic activities and social interactions, shapes an array of relations among various players. These multiple relations are important to forming social capital, which reduces the vulnerability of poor people to a host of problems (Moser & Lister, 1999; Colletta & Cullen, 2000). Yet, social capital is also unevenly distributed (Lyons & Snoxell, 2005) and afflicted with exclusionary element (Putzel, 1995). Thus, in informal vending, urban sociologists and planners emphasize the need to pay attention to vendors’ relationships and the tension that arises from such connections (Yatmo, 2008) especially since social network bridges diverse interests, create social norms (Weng & Kim, 2016), and supports subtle forms of state resistance (Musoni, 2010). For hawkers who
occupy public spaces to engage in livelihood activities (Flock & Breitung, 2015), access to streets and sidewalks constitutes an economic lifeline to cope with urban poverty.

In characterizing urban poverty, Wratten (1995) sees state and police intervention as a source of urban poor’s vulnerability. Many urban poor people “experience the state in negative ways – as an oppressive bureaucracy which attempts to regulate their activities without understanding their needs” (Wratten, 1995, p. 4). In the case of street vendors, this adverse state engagement manifests in the constant threat and experience of eviction, which amounts to deprivation of access to and control over vending spaces. As a result, evictions constitute a major threat to street vendors, whose health and livelihoods get disrupted (Brown, 2006; Recio, 2015).

Despite this, some scholars contend that conflict-ridden encounters such as evictions engender new conditions and forms of relations (Crossa, 2009; Nicholls & Uitermark, 2016). This is apparent in interactions on public spaces, which are embedded in and “a product of social negotiation and contest” (Mitchell, 1995, p. 131). The succeeding sections explore this critical dimension of evictions based on the context of Baclaran, one of the largest informal vending districts in Metropolitan Manila, Philippines. The empirical data are a product of a ten-month fieldwork (May 2015 to February 2016), which employed interviews, focus group discussions, observations, and life-history.

Baclaran Vending District

Baclaran vending district is located on the political and administrative boundaries of Pasay and Parañaque, two component cities of Metropolitan Manila. The official zoning maps of both Pasay and Parañaque cities designate the district as a commercial area. However, the series of observations reveal that Baclaran is home to establishments with diverse functions other than commercial undertaking. Figure-1 on the next page shows the multiple activities in Baclaran district. One of these functions is the practice of religious faith. The Redemptorist Church, a Catholic pilgrimage site that hosts thousands of devotees, is located in Barangay 1 Baclaran.

Based on an interview with a church leader, around 120,000 people visit Baclaran church every Wednesday. This is one factor for the huge volume of foot traffic in the area’s adjacent streets and sidewalk spaces.

Aside from Christian churches, three Mosques stand near Baclaran. These religious structures cater to the Muslim residents and traders, many of whom are engaged in street vending. Further, Baclaran is a place for shoppers who want to avail of cheap products such as shoes, bags, clothes, household accessories, and schools supplies, among others. These goods are sold in shopping malls and wholesale centres, which hire salesladies and stevedores living in the surrounding residential communities.

Various groups provide diverse estimates on the size of Baclaran street vendors. Local officials and vendor leaders claim that there are about 1000 to 3000 vendors in the area. The researcher’s field observation reveals that there are around 1500 semi-fixed stalls, movable carts and steel panels of vendors during ordinary days and almost 4000 during peak days (Wednesday, Saturday and Sunday) and/or Ber- months2 (September to December).

---

1 Barangay is the smallest political-geographical unit in the Philippines. It has formal village-level government structure with elected executive and legislative officials.

2 During ordinary days, vendors earn between PhP 100.00 (US $2.17) and PhP 500.00 (US $10.9). Their income on peak days are always more than PhP 500.00 (US $10.9) a day. For some, the average peak day income is about PhP 3,000.00 (US $65.22).
Street Vendor Evictions: Continuities and Ruptures

In the early 1980s, old Baclaran vendors recall how they used to play a cat-and-mouse game with the police who would occasionally evict informal hawkers from streetscapes. Since there were fewer vendors then and the sidewalks were still spacious they could easily carry their vending materials and walk to a safe place. Besides the 1980s’ experience, vendors remember three other eviction episodes that have affected their activities in Baclaran. Table-1 reflects these episodes and the key attributes that the vendors associate with the three events. It shows how the characteristics of evictions and the hawkers’ responses have evolved across the three episodes.

**Table 1: Eviction Episodes in Baclaran**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Eviction Episodes</th>
<th>Lead Agency</th>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Vendors’ Responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DOTC Secretary</td>
<td>DOTC and</td>
<td>Early 1990s</td>
<td>• Random clearing operations; • Unselective</td>
<td>• Run from the police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oscar Orbos</td>
<td>Police Department</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMDA Chair</td>
<td>MMDA</td>
<td>2005-2009</td>
<td>• Random clearing operations; • Sometimes covered by the media; • Violent; • Unselective</td>
<td>• Run from the police; • Resist eviction; • Organize vendors; • Negotiate with MMDA; • Negotiate with national and local governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bayani Fernandez</td>
<td>(BF)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMDA</td>
<td>MMDA; Police; Local governments</td>
<td>2010-present</td>
<td>• Negotiated; • Sometimes random; often announced prior to clearing operations; • Selective</td>
<td>• Run from the police; • Organize vendors; • Negotiate with local governments; • Self-demolition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-BF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Vendors refer to two periods when they talk about forced evictions that the government initiated to remove all street obstructions. The first one occurred from the late 1980s to early 1990s during the time of Oscar Orbos as head of the then Department of Transportation and Communication.
At that time vendors had to play hide-and-seek with police and DOTC personnel, who pursued random evictions or tagged locally as ‘clearing operations’.

After that period, the vendors faced another series of evictions when Bayani Fernando\(^3\), head of the Metropolitan Manila Development Authority (MMDA) from 2002 to 2009. The primary intent of the street clean-up was for the MMDA to manage the traffic and promote public safety. From the random and unselective clearing operations by the DOTC, the evictions became more violent. When asked to share about their experience during Fernando’s reign as MMDA Chairperson, vendors explained how they got more indebted to money-lenders since they were unable to sell for fear of violent encounters with MMDA operators. Barangay officials and hawkers claimed that during that period, criminal incidents (e.g. pickpocketing) in the area escalated as more people were deprived of the opportunity to earn a living.

Some hawker leaders also recounted that a few Muslim vendors got hurt when they had physical confrontations with the MMDA demolition team. Moreover, it was during this period when hawkers began talking to each other about their conditions. They established ties with local political organizers, and entered into negotiations with the MMDA and other national government agencies. Some leaders even engaged in political organizing work to promote social protection. A few vendor organizers took part in dialogues facilitated by barangay and city officials, who saw the need to intervene for the unemployed vendors. Others joined political rallies of organizations that promised to help them deal with the MMDA clearing operations.

The third episode represents the current situation of Baclaran vendors. While the MMDA still monitors the streets, evictions are often done by the police and local government offices. In Pasay City area, the Mayor’s Total Clean Team (MTCT) is in-charge of policing street vendors every day. When there are big national events or famous international visitors (e.g. when the Philippines hosted the Asia-Pacific Economic Conference last November 2015), the MTCT convenes the vendor leaders and informs them about the need to vacate the streets. The leader would then instruct their members to voluntarily demolish their stalls and put them back up once there is an instruction from the city government. Despite the agreement between vendor leaders and the city government, other ambulant peddlers who are not part of the discussions still roam around the area to earn a living.

In the neighbouring areas within the Parañaque City jurisdiction, the police, city and barangay officials clear the streets especially if there are complaints from formal commercial establishments. These clearing operations usually target the ambulant vendors who have no association and political connection to local officials. This vulnerability of ambulant vendors explains why a persistent coping mechanism is to run from the police even though some strategies have changed. As Table-1 shows, this has consistently figured in the three episodes, which began during the earlier evictions when vendors were fewer and unorganized. To date, unorganized ambulant vendors who feel incapable of building political ties resort to hide-and-seek strategy to deal with evictions. The nature and extent of responses, therefore, also depends on vendors’ capacity to organize their ranks and engage in negotiations with government officials.

In addition, the fact that government authorities conduct clearing operations upon the request of irritated formal commercial stall owners underscores another character of eviction – it is tied to property ownership and relations. This has to do with the character of streets and sidewalks as public property and their proximity to privately owned spaces. When tackling property-related issues, it is crucial to pay attention to Krueckeberg’s (1995) view of property as more than objects or possessions, but rather as “a set of relationships between the owner of something and everyone else’s claim to that same thing” (p. 307). That is, one person’s right to use or profit from a property

\(^3\) Fernando used to be the Mayor of Marikina, a component city of Metropolitan Manila, where he enforced strict policy to promote clean and orderly streets.
maybe at the expense of someone’s or everyone else’s claim about the same thing (Krueckeberg, 1995). This framing is critical to understanding the vendors’ struggle for access to contested streetscapes. While the access to and control over vending spaces entails relational rights (Porter, 2011), deprivation of such equally indicates relational issues, particularly property ownership and power relations.

Viewed in this light, evictions become an expression of power relations – an assertion of private property owners’ control and state authority over streets versus informal vendors’ access to economic spaces. Alas, in a political environment where state officials are entangled in multiple relations – from legal contracts to patronage ties - this property relation turns into a question of the structures of power. In other words, those who are more powerful get to influence and determine when eviction is needed, how it will be carried out and who will be affected. Eviction, therefore, is not only about promoting order. It is also an expression of power structures, property ownership and relations in particular.

In many instances, the relations involved in property ownership and the appropriation of public-private spaces are riddled with conflicts. The evolving engagement strategies between the state and vendors reveal another character of eviction in relation to conflict - its ability to generate new conditions and arrangements. As Nicholls and Uitermark (2016) contend, “a conflict is more than a collision of pre-given actors, views, and interests. Conflicts constitute actors and create new conditions of possibility, driving forward changes in the physicality of cities, how they are perceived, and how they are governed” (p. 6). When linked to informal vending, Crossa (2009) narrates how exclusionary policies against Mexican street vendors do not necessarily lead to fragmentation of social networks. Instead, the networks transform over time as excluded groups are able to recast and reclaim their right to the city and create representational spaces of resistance (Crossa, 2009). In similar vein, while evictions demonstrate the clash of interests and exercise of authority, they also generate new forms of socio-spatial conditions, coping mechanisms, and power relations. Esperanza⁴, a veteran vendor leader, captured this capacity of conflict when she described the aftermath of the series of violent evictions.

Many people got unconscious [after the violent evictions]. Many things happened. When we realized that this is how we should act, this is what we should do, we just nurtured it. Before, we never did that because we were afraid. Because when you are caught bribing government officials, you will be arrested. So we did not engage in it as we were afraid. Now, we have learned how to act – how we can show our appreciation to government officials [who allow us to vend]. We have realized that this is how we can survive. You need to learn many strategies. You need to follow to avoid troubles. Otherwise, it is really difficult.

This explanation shows how a series of violent evictions has forced informal vendors to rely on patronage relations. The patron-client ties involve maintaining smooth interpersonal relationship with local officials through occasional gift giving and bribery practices.

Lastly, eviction is also used as a tool to introduce regime change. In both cities, vendors and barangay officials claimed that clearing operation is a common practice right after elections, especially when a new set of officials takes control of the local government. As one official said, vendors are evicted to inform them that they now have to deal with a new powerful player.

Interviewer: What is the political sense of a clearing operation [after the elections]? What is its purpose?

Local Official: During the turnover of power, eviction is a normal event to show that new people are now in power… It is for the vendors to acknowledge the new regime.

⁴ Esperanza is pseudonym of a vendor leader to protect her identity
Eviction as an Engagement Arena

At this point, it is becoming clear how the nature of eviction has evolved and affected the conditions of vendors. It has generated multiple responses from different players and has been embedded in relational dynamics. In other words, eviction has become a critical arena for engagement where the interaction between vendors and state institutions takes place. The diagram below (Figure 2) situates eviction in the larger terrain of practices and mechanisms that vendors employ to gain access to and control over contested spaces.

**Eviction as an Arena for State-Street Vendor Engagement**

![Eviction Diagram](image)

The diagram illustrates how occupying the streets is always coupled with the threat of eviction. From the previous section, it is clear that unorganized ambulant hawkers avoid eviction by running from the police. After the clearing operation, they would go back to the streets. This has been the recurring action for those who do not have any organization. However, for those who have ‘associations’ led by recognized leaders, the strategy goes beyond the occupy-streets-face-eviction cycle.

Vendors undertake two simultaneous steps as a defence against and as an offshoot of evictions. First, they mobilize their own ranks, which is a form of self-governance among the fragmented groups of vendors. They do this by talking to fellow hawkers who agree to observe a set of informal rules. The informal regulations cover issues and steps concerning financial mechanisms (loans, rent) and the management of hawk ing spaces. Certain accountability mechanisms are enforced to ensure that everyone gains a sense of security and protection. For instance, a transaction that involves a loan or a vending space sale/rental agreement requires a vendor to serve as a witness. In some cases, the agreement entails signing on a document in front of a barangay official to legitimize the arrangement.

Another important effort is how organized hawkers build and strengthen ties to political organizers and local government officials. Political relations are crucial for vendors who need to contend with how the prevailing laws treat them as illegal. Strengthening political ties range from nurturing a patronage relation to an electoral engagement. As mentioned in the previous section, preserving patronage ties entails giving ‘gifts’ to local officials during their birthdays and remitting a weekly collection of ‘goodwill’ money to assigned middle-persons who, in turn, give it to undisclosed personnel in barangay or city government. For the electoral engagement, vendor leaders use their numbers as leverage to engage with local officials and gain their consent to...
occupy certain areas. For migrant hawkers, they register in one barangay to obtain a legal identity as a voter.

In building political ties, vendors primarily deal with street-level bureaucrats and political organizers, who negotiate on behalf of local government officials. Arguably, it constitutes an actual state engagement. State-street vendor encounter therefore emanates from the latter’s illegal status and thrives on patronage relations. Some vendors admit that the accountability in these political relations is weak, if not completely absent. In other words, the government can still demolish their vending stalls anytime even if there is informal agreement against eviction. Some hawkers are also unsure whether the collected money reaches their allies in the government. Yet, vendors say they cling on to this tenuous political bond since it has afforded them access to vending spaces and a sense of readiness in case there would be evictions.

Conclusion
The foregoing account illustrates how certain activities, mechanisms, and relations are forged as a defence against and as a result of evictions. While the usual approach to examining evictions emanate from the state capacity to enforce policies and impose order, this paper demonstrates other critical dimensions that shape the socio-spatial relations arising from clearing operations against informal vendors. It illustrates how evictions are entangled in property ownership and power structures. The paper also underscores the value of locating grassroots collective action as well as state-street vendor engagement as embedded in the struggle for access to and control over contested vending spaces. As a result, these mechanisms contribute to the overlapping and fluid governing relations, an important dimension often overlooked in the analysis of socio-spatial interactions in cities and urban centres.
References


Building Community in Masterplanned Estates: No Place for Culturally Diverse Aspirations?

Christian Roggenbuck
Centre for Urban Research, RMIT University

Abstract
Prevailing forms of developing new residential land in Australia are Masterplanned Estates, which integrate ideas of place-making and building locally-based communities within the development. At the same time these areas have been attracting an ethnically diverse population. The paper focuses on the need to address the aspirations towards local social involvement from residents with a culturally diverse background, for whom community may have a different social meaning, more specifically. Reviewing literature on the relationship between the social environment and the experience of settling for migrants’ community is conceded as an enabling as well as inhibiting process. The analysis of the academic discourse on Masterplanned Estates in Australia undertaken to date emphasises that the commodification of community as a social code may constrain other forms of community and the expectations of residents’ from culturally diverse backgrounds have been insufficiently considered. The paper argues that the constructed narratives of community do not necessarily reflect the diverse aspirations of residents. Therefore, more unpacking of the process of masterplanning is needed to enable a more comprehensive understanding of culturally diverse experiences and meanings of community.

Keywords: Community, Cultural Diversity, Masterplanned Estates, Migration, Settlement, Suburban Development

Introduction
Masterplanned Estates (MPEs) have become a widely adopted way of developing new residential areas in Australia. They differ especially from more traditional suburban structures in the way that ‘community’, social interactions and a certain lifestyle are actively promoted and incorporated in the plans by the developers (Minnery & Bajracharya 1999; Walters & Rosenblatt 2008). This connection between community building and place making however raises fundamental issues in regards to the scope of the developers in achieving these targets and the capacity of planning to contrive social outcomes. Therefore, the way ‘community’ is implemented as an essential feature of MPEs has fostered broad academic discussions in Australia (Cheshire, Walters & Wickes 2010; Freestone 2010; Gwther 2005; Johnson 2010).

With migrants coming from various backgrounds and contributing significantly to population growth in Australia it is known for its cultural and ethnic diversity (Jacobs 2011). In particular
the main metropolitan areas of Australia are attracting new residents, who over-proportionally settle in the growing outer suburbs. Creating a cohesive social environment is more than a top-down policy declaration of a multicultural society, but is locally played out including the lived experience for migrants (Babacan 2010; Sandercock 2003). The process of settling in a new place is hence more than crossing a border and instantaneous belonging to a new social environment, but involves a long-term complex adjustment to prevailing norms, values or practices (Galligan, Boese & Philips 2014). The settlement process for migrants is connected to everyday experiences in their immediate spatial surroundings and thus a subjective component as well as a reaction to the environment. This individual connection cannot be engineered, but is a combination of individual responses to change and the efforts of the host society in terms of integration or reaction to an ethnically more pluralistic society (Amin 2002; Ward, Bochner & Furnham 2003).

This paper aims to emphasise the ambivalence of the conceptualisation of community in MPEs and the experience of residents from culturally diverse background. The first section introduces the relevance of community for migrants settling in a new social environment and trying to create a sense of belonging. Building up on this the following part demonstrates that the way community is implemented as social code in MPEs may constrain other forms of community. The paper concludes by identifying a gap in knowledge in regards to culturally diverse aspirations of residents and the need to address these.

Importance of Community for Migrants

Migration can not only be comprehended as a spatial movement of relocating and settling in a different place for a longer period of time, but as a process of entering into another cultural environment (Colic-Peisker 2008). Living in new social surroundings means that previous norms are not necessarily applicable anymore and thus a process of adjustment, adaptation or integration is experienced. This process is two sided however with migrants settling in their new social environment at the same time as the host society enabling processes of transformation and not requiring adjustments outside of the confinement. ‘[…] the key challenge is indeed that of striking the balance between cultural autonomy and social solidarity, so that the former does not lapse into separatism and essentialised identities, and so that the latter does not slide into minority cultural assimilation and western conformity.’ (Amin 2002, p. 20).

An approach of acknowledging and including the cultural background of migrants could allow communities to develop in a more socially inclusive way. In this perspective social inclusion recognises cultural diversity as contributing to society. Not being socially excluded is a precondition for expressing the cultural self. Social networks or communities can act as an embracing mechanism for social inclusion, which enables individuals to have the confidence in enacting with their surrounding (Jacobs 2011). The idea of community as a warrant of certainty, safety and security is especially prevalent in a world, which has been characterised as ‘insecure’ and ‘full of risk’ (Bauman 2001; Beck 2012). This conceptualisation of community as an object of hope could have two-fold consequences for migrants. One the one hand, the promise of belonging may be especially intriguing, since the process of adapting towards new social environments implies uncertainty and creates vulnerability. One the other hand, the creation of stability in community is build-upon notions of unity and sameness. Such communities may be oppressive of ‘other’ behaviours and migrants may be labelled as ‘strangers to be feared’ (Colic-Peisker 2011). As inter-ethnic relations and conflicts are mainly experienced at the neighbourhood level, racism and acceptance of cultural difference is often part of everyday life (Amin 2002). For migrants fear or oppression may prevent proactive engagement with places and feelings of insecurity can make establishing a sense of belonging more difficult. Feeling excluded from the ‘sameness’ imposed by community may lead to a retreat into ‘ethnic enclaves’ or the clustering in ‘affinity environments’ (Friedmann 2005).
Conceptualising and emphasising communities as a continuous process makes the understanding of the various expectations and aspirations of residents especially important since communities shape individual’s life and affect social inclusion. Though the way of implementation is crucial to achieve these targets, since community on its own is not necessarily a key resource for cultural understanding (Amin 2002). This is particularly the case if community is commodified as one cohesive entity. Not only does this idea of a locally-based coherent community prove to be a romanticised myth of the past, but also imposes the danger of enforcing norms or patterns of behaviour and thus ends-up being an oppressive concept (Mulligan 2014). Therefore, it is significant to create an open-ended process drawing on cultural diversity to allow multiple inclusive communities to develop and recognising that these may be overlapping concepts for individual residents.

Community in Masterplanned Estates

Through providing affordable housing MPEs are attracting mostly first home buyers and have become a prevalent form of developing new residential areas in Australia. An essential feature of MPEs is the incorporation of social infrastructure in a deliberate community-building process led by the developers. This facilitation of forming local community ties has become a ‘core business of property developers’ (Rosenblatt, Cheshire & Lawrence 2009, p. 128). By planning the estate around open spaces and social facilities interaction between residents should be enabled. Though the developer is not only active in the initial planning stage, but is as well an ongoing facilitator of the community-building process by establishing social activities and groups, providing local newsletters and setting up covenants regulating design and behaviour. In this regards the community-building process initiated by the developers encapsulates an enabling and constraining vision for the individual estate. Community is thus produced as a social code and value system. This has fostered broad academic discussions in Australia and the way ‘community’ within estates is being constituted has been critically assessed. Current research on MPEs has been focusing on the perspectives of developers, the way residents are involved in the local community, the governance structures within these developments as well as health and wellbeing outcomes (Gleeson 2004; Goodman, Douglas & Babacan 2010; Maller & Nicholls 2014; McGuirk & Dowling 2011; Walters & Rosenblatt 2008).

In this setting some residents are seeking more than just a ‘sense of community’ as expectations and aspirations towards community may differ between residents who move to these estates. Contributing aspects for this desire are previous experiences of community or the lack thereof (Nicholls & Maller 2014). The narrative of community may be seen as an additional amenity or commodification of social life, which does not require any social involvement or broader engagement and which is provided as a ‘buy-in’ to the neighbourhood (Cheshire, Wickes & White 2013; Dowling, Atkinson & McGuirk 2010; Rosenblatt, Cheshire & Lawrence 2009).

Studies have demonstrated that developers are targeting specific groups of people and promoting particular lifestyles in MPEs and thus these are not planned for ‘marginalised’ groups (Cheshire, Wickes & White 2013; Wood 2002). Even though research has emphasised the expectations of residents towards the idea of ‘community’, so far the aspect of analysing previous experiences of community has been insufficiently considered in this context. In particular studying the integration of various aspirations of residents with culturally diverse backgrounds has not been researched specifically in MPEs. This aspect is particularly significant since the integration of various interests of residents has been stressed to be important for achieving social cohesion, as these estates are becoming more ethnically diverse (Cheshire, Wickes & White 2013; Warr & Robson 2013). It is in this context relevant to understand, how individuals having migrated to Australia perceive and incorporate the idea of community into their everyday life. Coming from another cultural background, their understanding of and aspiration for community, may differ.
completely from the dominant Anglo-Australian conception of community (Warr & Robson 2013).

Research on migrants living in other urban settings in Australia suggests that local ethnic communities often play an important role in their experience of moving to a new place. These may function as a support network for the initial settlement process and as a substitute for living within a more extended family environment previously (Edgar 2014; Galvin 1980). Next to this research on intra-ethnic relations, studies have focused on migrants’ integration into their local neighbourhood and their housing arrangements in Australia. Processes of adapting to new forms of neighbourhood and dwellings are complex with migrants trying to bring previous customs along as well as adjusting to perceived Australian norms (Beer & Morphett 2002; Lozanovska, Levin & Victoria-Gantala 2013).

These insights suggest that previous experiences of neighbourhood and intra-ethnic relations have an influence on migrants’ aspirations towards community and thus translatable to living in a MPE. However, these estates establish a certain built and social environment as they are set-up by developers having a specific approach to community development. This form of community may be targeted towards ‘mainstream’ views of a society, which has been described as having no cultural resource towards community (Walters & Rosenblatt 2008).

Conclusion
Even though the term ‘community’ has a positive connotation, its consequence may be ambivalent and the idea should be critically viewed (Bauman 2001; Delanty 2010; Mulligan 2014). With Masterplanned Estates being developed around the notion of ‘community’ and being specific places for everyday encounters of residents from diverse cultural background they create the possibility of recognition of cultural difference and integration of various expectations towards community in order to create an inclusive, socially cohesive place. Therefore, a more in-depth understanding is needed of the expectations and aspirations towards community of residents with a culturally diverse background in MPEs and their process of adaption towards Australian conceptualisations of community.

It is this relationship between residents’ various aspirations, the narrative of community-building and the connection of an individual estate to its spatial and social surroundings, which has been insufficiently considered. Research in the Australian context so far has been focusing on the experience of residents living in a Masterplanned Estate, their involvement in locally based communities and the development of individual estates in terms of governance structures or health and wellbeing outcomes. With the population of these areas becoming more socially and culturally diverse, a broader understanding of various aspirations and ways of living is needed (Warr & Robson 2013).

For residents with a culturally diverse background an estate specific conceptualisation of community may be contradictory to their various aspirations towards community. With themes of safety, which can be associated with narratives of ‘sameness’ and fear of the ‘other’, being prevalent in these developments deviating norms or behaviours may be excluded or oppressed. Thus, the structure of MPEs and their conception of community may have an effect for residents coming from a different cultural background by enabling or constraining certain social practices. In this sense more unpacking and more rigorous assessments of the techniques of masterplanning are needed (Cheshire, Wickes & White 2013; Gleeson 2004). In this perspective recognising differences and enabling multiple non-constraining forms of community to develop is crucial as ultimately it are the residents from all kinds of social and cultural backgrounds shaping and experiencing their chosen estate.
References

Amin, A 2002, *Ethnicity and the Multicultural City: Living with Diversity*, Department of Transport; Local Government; Regions and ESRC Cities Initiative.


Lozanovska, M, Levin, I & Victoria-Gantala, M 2013, ‘Is the Migrant House in Australia an
Australian Vernacular Architecture?’, *Traditional Dwellings and Settlements Review*, vol. 14, no. 2, pp. 65-78.


Infrastructural unevenness in Bangladesh: A ‘privatised world of technological improvisation’

Ritu Parna Roy
University of Auckland

Abstract
Urban infrastructures and networks in the Global South are known to grow and function on self-help, privatised, and informal systems and practices. The urbanites generate a range of improvisational strategies to combat ‘normal’ infrastructural disruption. Drawing on ethnographic data, this paper examines how the urban middle-class Bangladeshi households produce their own improvisational strategies and practices to sustain and continue to function in everyday life with regular power cuts. In examining the processes and practices of improvisation and coping this paper contributes to the new ‘infrastructural turn’ (Amin 2014) in the social sciences. In particular, it highlights ways in which infrastructure is done differently in the Global South.

Key words: urban infrastructure in Global South, incrementalism, improvisational strategies

Drawing inspiration from the idea of “people as infrastructure” (see Simone 2004), and modern subjects leading “infrastructural lives” (see Graham & McFarlane 2015), this paper illuminates ‘normal’ power failure in urban Bangladesh and considers the improvisational ventures of urbanites to survive these infrastructural disruptions. The paper offers a perspective which focuses on the everyday experiences of urban infrastructures rather than perceiving infrastructure as urban technology (see Graham & McFarlane 2015). The first section of the paper discusses some of the predominant characteristics and particularities of urban infrastructures in the Global South including its unevenness, improvisational nature, and the incremental practices it engenders. Drawing on ethnographic data, the subsequent section focuses on a set of specific improvisational strategies and alternatives that are used to combat everyday power failure in urban Bangladesh.

Urban infrastructure in Global South: An uneven, incremental, improvised landscape
Growing critiques of urban theories focus on their failure to articulate and understand the reworked, improvised, incremental, and informally growing urban space, systems, and infrastructures in cities in the Global South (Silver 2014; Morley 2012). While repair and improvisation have been pivotal for megacities in the Global South, this aspect of urbanism is neglected in the dominant discourse of urban studies (Graham & Thrift 2007). These discourses fail to comprehend the idiosyncratic, socio-material construction of Global South, and arguably, all cities. Thus, labelling
urban infrastructure in the Global South as ‘non-functioning’ or ‘poor’ tends to conceal the fact that infrastructure is inherently prone to breakdowns and is always in need of maintenance and repair (Graham & Thrift 2007:5). A mundane lack of maintenance, or repair, the failure to appropriately retrofit can bring down a well-built infrastructure at any time, and in any place.

Instead, infrastructure is often assumed to be operating, functional and universal. In reality, infrastructure is highly variable (Morley 2012). Thus, for Berlant (2016: 393), infrastructure is defined by use and movement. Infrastructure in countries of the Global South, such as Bangladesh, often does not resemble the Western template and related ideas of urbanism and urban structure. Western infrastructural ideologies, that tend to normalise an always existing and always functioning system, have long been proved invalid and inapplicable for Global South and / or Third World cities (Graham & Thrift 2007; Morley 2012). Rather, these cities are developing their own forms of urbanism. This is in contrast to the Western imagination of cities as well-planned, organised, localities with high-tech, and with uninterrupted facilities and infrastructure. Most of the megacities in the Global South have an infrastructural existence that is uneven, incremental and improvised (see Silver 2014; Simone 2015).

Urban infrastructure and amenities have grown, expanded and been distributed unevenly in most of the Global South cities. For example, Bangladesh has achieved an impressive growth and penetration in telecommunication and ICTs sectors, but middle-class urbanites still have disrupted access to basic amenities such as electricity, water, transport. The number of mobile phone users in Bangladesh has crossed 130 million, and there are 61 million internet subscribers (Bangladesh Telecommunication Regulatory Commission 2016). Thus, there is a coexistence of ‘slums and shopping malls, traffic jams and pollution, dust-filled factories and high rise universities’ in major metropolitans in Bangladesh (White 2012:1430).

The practice of incrementalism is the prevalent norm in megacities in the Global South due to scarcity of resources, finance and planning. Urbanites gradually keep adding a little-bit-at-time to built environments, livelihoods, and social networks (Simone 2015:24). The gradual effort is made in terms of financial investments, savings, and decision-making to start or supplement an existing network or infrastructure; instead of making or re-making it at once. This process often requires flexibility and constant adjustments and changes to decision-making and planning. The gradual or incremental practice initiates fluidity and scope for improvisation both in the process of building and rebuilding or repairing infrastructures (Simone 2015). For Silver (2014:788), the incremental practice is also used by urbanites to rework the connection of electricity and building or rebuilding the living space/house:

“Incremental infrastructures can thus be understood as in-the-making, undergoing constant adjustment and intervention, and in a permanent state of flux”.

Flux is linked here with frugality. Frugal innovation and improvisation is very common and known in different names in different countries in the Global South. For instance, the practices and principles of ‘Jugaad’ in India, ‘Shanzhai’ in China, or ‘Microfinance’ in Bangladesh epitomise frugal innovation and improvisation as a response to overcome infrastructural deficits and the scarcity of resources (see Ferdousi 2015). ‘Jugaad’ is an Indian colloquial term which implies a quick fix or self-repair with available resources to provide solution to a given problem including infrastructural failure (Birchell 2011). Harsh climate and scarcity of resources trigger frugal innovation as a self-preserving instinct (Rej 2013). But this practice of self-preservation is no-longer limited to the Global South. Frugal innovation has garnered attention from Western academia and businesses considering the future possible constrains in economy, environment and resources (see Zeschky et al. 2014).
It is noteworthy that the longstanding simplified distinction between the cities of Global South and Global North has started shrinking due to recent major infrastructural interruptions in the latter (Graham & Thrift 2007). For example, it has been argued that Western countries will experience more frequent power outages in the future due to peak oil, infrastructural neglect, global warming, the shift to renewable energy resources, and increased demand for electricity, and so on; all of which might turn a ‘smart city’ into a dumb one (Byrd & Matthewman 2014: 85-86). If this happens, the high-tech Global North cities might have to replicate the South’s ‘privatised worlds of technological improvisation’ which is currently used as a survival strategy for Third World city dwellers to combat infrastructural fragility in their world (Morley 2012:95). For example, Graham and Thrift (2007:14) noted that substantial blackouts in 2001 and 2003 in USA and Canada led to the rapid implementation of coping strategies, backup generators and alternatives by citizens, novel actions which have long been routine in the Global South. Thus, an understanding of the socio-material construction of megacities in the Global South might be important and useful better mitigate for infrastructural disruption in developed countries in the future.

Urban Bangladesh: A ‘privatised world of technological improvisation’

‘Infrastructure’ perhaps evokes imagery of concrete or the physical forms of pipes, wire, circuits, bricks and tiles. But beyond its materiality, infrastructure has a social and symbolic significance which encompasses everyday life. For Berlant (2016:393), infrastructure is the pre-condition for sociality: ‘the living mediation of what organises life’. Everyday life is both practiced and produced. The struggle and negotiation with infrastructure such as water, power, waste, and transport are dominant sites of the production of everyday Bangladeshi life (see Appadurai 2015: xiii). Well-built, well-functioning and easily accessible infrastructure is often hidden or forgotten. Thus, infrastructure in Global North is usually considered a black box. It is taken-for-granted. On the contrary, due to continual disruptions urban infrastructure in the Global South makes a recurrent appearance in everyday discourses and activities (Graham 2010).

“Infrastructure disruptions radically transform urban life as urbanites seek to adjust, and cope with, uncanny worlds of darkness, cold, immobility, hunger, thirst, or dirt. Often, the sense of crisis and the search for alternatives helps forge new ideas about what urban life might be” (Graham 2010: xi). The process of repair not only involves restoration of the infrastructure but also requires coping with the breakdowns, and improvisations to continue functioning in alternative ways. In Global South megacities the politics of everyday urban life is played out through unequal struggles to improvise and get hold of amenities such as power, water, transportation, and communication. These services hardly reach the level of reliability that would allow them to be taken-for-granted (Graham 2010). People wait or improvise in order to gain control of basic utilities and resources to function in everyday life (Howe et al. 2016).

For Morley (2012:93-95), in Third World or Global South megacities, people live in thoroughly privatised worlds of technological improvisation where survival strategies are based around fragile but flexible local networks. The everyday life of the urban Bangladeshi middle-class operates and survives on several improvisational strategies, and privatised alternative arrangements. For example, power cuts are a regular problem in Bangladesh due to the gap between actual demand and generation of electricity. This gap is mitigated by rolling blackouts or feeder rotation strategies which involves purposive and planned power cut for certain hours in certain areas, locally known as ‘current nai’: the absence of current or electricity. To combat the situation, the households depend on an alternative, personalised, provisional source of electricity which is known as Instant Power Supply (IPS). IPS is a battery-sourced standby small electrical supply unit which supplies power to households when there is none from the national grid. “A general IPS consists of a charger circuit, a battery, an oscillator circuit and an output circuit. The charger circuit charges
the battery properly by using the main supply when it is ON” (Mahbub et al. 2012:1). IPS is different from conventional generators. It is completely automatic and does not need any fuel. Thus it does not produce any noise or air pollution like a generator does (Mahbub et al. 2012:1).

As Graham (2010) suggests, getting electricity, water or communication requires constant improvisation for the city dwellers of the Global South. The idea of having an IPS or an alternative power supply does not end the problem, rather it triggers a set of diverse improvisational strategies such as rationing, and prioritising needs. This is because the battery of an IPS has a limited capacity for certain hours of backup. A 500 watt and 12 volt battery of IPS provides two hours backup for 3 tube lights, 3 electric fans, and 1 TV, or alternate combination (RahimafroozIPS 2016). Households seek to maximise the backup time and the longevity of the battery. For instance, activities such as children’s education, the physical well-being of children and the elderly get priority over recreational activities in terms of IPS power. The power from IPS is mostly used to secure uninterrupted operation of lights and fans in the households so that the children can continue their study in the evening as well as to prevent discomfort and illness from extreme summer heat and humidity. One of my participants Mrs. Sultana noted:

I always prioritise children’s needs and their study when it comes to consumption of electricity from alternative source. As you know… the machine (IPS) has a certain capacity for supplying power. We usually get most affected by load shedding during summer evenings between 6 to 11 o’clock as it is the peak hours. Ironically, this is the time when children usually study. So, I have to ensure their uninterrupted study.

She further added:

I avoid watching TV or doing any other leisure activities to maximise the backup hours of the IPS so that the children can study uninterruptedly. I also try to limit the number of lights and fans when it operates on IPS. For example, if the children are studying in one room, I would like to have rest of the members to be sited or work in the next single room rather than being in different rooms and consuming power from different points of access in the home.

For Silver (2014), incremental practices involve the informal construction and extension of infrastructures. Global South city dwellers embrace incremental strategies to secure electricity in everyday life. The installation of IPS requires self-finance and labour, and it is an informal, unsanctioned, system. Installation requires re-wiring and re-arrangement of existing connections. Thus, the entire process of setting up an informal, alternative arrangement for electricity is a form of self-help (see Morley 2012; Simone 2015).

Infrastructural disruption and breakdowns also initiate the process of un-blackboxing (Graham & Thrift 2007). Urbanites become more conscious and knowledgeable about functionality and construction of infrastructure which eventually helps them to cope with and respond to infrastructural breakdowns in an efficient way. The adoption of a voltage stabiliser device could be seen as an improvisational strategy which perhaps un-blackboxed the supply of electricity by demonstrating the importance of a stable voltage for Bangladeshi middle-class households. For example, one of my participants Mr. Kabir noted that their TV and refrigerator were damaged due to the sudden increase of voltage which made them decide to purchase a voltage stabiliser. He noted:

The voltage fluctuation is a common problem, especially during the summer. In one summer day, we had regular load shedding. When the power resumed in the home the voltage was so high that my TV and refrigerator were damaged in one go. It was a good lesson for all of us in the house. After that incident, we turned off or unplugged all possible domestic gadgets and devices soon after the power cut. We turned them on
again after the power resumed and felt stable. And finally, now I have a voltage stabiliser which protects my gadgets from burning or damaging due to the fluctuation of voltage.

He further stated:

Honestly speaking, I was not aware of the voltage issue and how it might cause damage to electric appliances or dramatically shorten the life of your gadgets before I lost my TV and refrigerator. Now I know that a dramatic increase or decrease of voltage may burn or damage the internal circuit of your electronic gadgets.

As suggested by Graham and Thrift (2007:5), infrastructural failure or disruption often triggers the invention of new solutions and the solutions or improvisational strategies often lead to innovations. For example, improvisational and coping strategies with black-outs ultimately led to the invention and use of technologies that have battery backup such as charger lights and fans. The use of charger lights and fans allows urbanites to get a hold of alternative light and cooling systems when there is a power failure. Further it is a cost effective alternative to IPS for a certain hours.

**Conclusion**

Everyday urban life is mediated through infrastructural complexes (Graham & McFarlance 2015). In particular, urban life in Bangladesh encompasses routine infrastructural disruptions such as power cuts. Urbanites generate their own improvised ways for surviving and coping with regular infrastructural failure. The improvisation often leads to frugal innovations and usages of new alternative arrangements such as IPS. The installation and usages of IPS further initiates a set of improvisational strategies and adjustments including re-wiring the connections, and rationing or prioritising needs for power consumptions within the households. The use of a new set of power stored technologies such as IPS, voltage stabiliser, charger light and fan to survive disrupted power supply in urban Bangladesh has turned the household into a technology rich landscape rather than one without consumer technologies. Everyday life is practiced and produced (Appadurai 2015: xiii) through improvisations, making do, frugal innovations or coping strategies to survive normal infrastructural disruptions in Bangladesh which eventually turns it into a ‘privatised world of everyday technological improvisation’ (Morley 2012:95).
References


Gender and Civic Engagement: The Bagcilar Municipality Women’s Council in Istanbul

Oznur Sahin

Institute for Culture and Society, University of Western Sydney

Abstract

Turkey, a predominantly Muslim country, is a secular democracy with no official state religion. Secularism permeates the space and everyday life practices of people in Turkey in relation to, rather than as the opposite of, religion. This relationship, which involves both contestation and interaction between the secular and religious, plays out a role in place-making and spatial subjectivities. In this paper, I scrutinise women’s participation in urban life that is shaped through discursive and performative practices of the secular and religious in the district of Bagcilar in Istanbul. Bagcilar has been governed by Islamist oriented parties since it gained municipal status in 1992. The Bagcilar Municipality has not only produced projects and organised events for women, but also initiated the Bagcilar Municipality Women’s Council as part of the United Nations Development Programme on citizen participation and local democracy. Drawing on my fieldwork in Bagcilar in 2015, I argue that a new form of civic engagement in new spatial arrangements have emerged for women in a district shaped by Islamic political discourse, pious practices and gender segregation.

Keywords: Urban governance, Civic engagement, Gender, Islamist discourse, Locality.

I got headwinds in there [The Bagcilar Municipality Women’s and Family’s Cultural and Arts Centre], picked up speed. I mean, I’m going, I’m on a path and going ahead. I wanted to carry this on to other areas. I decided on teaching at that point. The push here for me was the Women’s and Family’s, was the [Bagcilar Municipality] Women’s Council in the Women’s and Family’s. The Women’s Council gave me this energy, this push; the positive approach, the positive energy of the friends there, the teachings there, the social environment. The social environment of this place affects you whether you want it or not, but in a positive way.

(Interview with Melek, 14.07.2015)

Melek’s narrative gives us an insight into women’s empowerment, sociality, and the role of place, which is “not only as active as any community or institution, but also the medium through which much of the latter is orchestrated” (Amin 2014: 156). Place as an agent of sociality is not impartial. It is rather, politicized, here with gender and Islamic ideology, which in turn results in segregated spatial arrangements for women in some public spaces in Bagcilar, a district in Istanbul, Turkey. This then brings an intimacy to women’s relationship with publicness and
yields to a new form of civic engagement. As Neil Smith and Setha Low (2006: 6) emphasise, “An understanding of public space is an imperative for understanding the public sphere.” Thus, it is crucial to recognize that transition from the home to city for women through such new spatial arrangements mediates their engagement with urban life. In this paper, I suggest that new spatial arrangements in Bagcilar based on Islamic political discourse, pious practices and gender segregation, which seemingly conflict with the notion of civic agency in a strict sense, actually enable women’s civic participation in urban life.

I examine events and activities organised by the Bagcilar Municipality Women’s Council (BMWC) through which urban space is regulated and women are mobilized in a district that is predominantly shaped by Islamic discourses and populated by migrants from Anatolian cities in Turkey. In particular, I focus on the BMWC, which was initiated as part of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) for citizen participation and local democracy.

Deborah Stevenson (2014: 139) argues that transnational bodies such as the UN “necessarily work with and against the national, prioritizing cities and urban cultures at the same time as endorsing the autonomy of the nation.” Such entanglements between the transnational, national, and local create a form of urban governance which is also tightly linked to the identity of district. Doreen Massey (1994: 277) describes localities as “constructions out of the intersections and interactions of concrete social relations and social processes in a situation of co-presence.” Massey (1994: 156) also argues that places are processes without boundaries, shaped by relations which “interact with and take a further element of specificity from the accumulated history of a place.” Drawing on Massey’s idea of relational space, this paper focuses on the BMWC as an outcome of social and political relations that are embedded in the spatial organisation of districts and shaped at the intersection of multiple discourses and practices of the local, national, and global.

This paper has two main parts. In the first, I give a brief historical, social, and cultural background of the identity of Bagcilar that shapes place-making processes regarding women’s urban participation. I discuss how the discourses of family and religion embedded in the place are used to mobilize women in a gendered realm. Then, in the second part, I take a more detailed look at an event organised by the BMWC at the municipality’s Women’s and Family’s Cultural and Art Centre (WFCAC). Here, I aim to show how staging as an urban governance technique orchestrates women’s performances and civic participation in the city.

Methods
This study draws upon part of the fieldwork conducted for my thesis in Bagcilar, Istanbul in May-July, 2015. A global metropolis with a population of almost seventeen million, Istanbul is divided into 39 districts; these have “an independent legal status with an independent budget, and a self-government system including a mayor, an assembly of elected politicians and a local office” (Eraydin et al. 2014: 6). Bagcilar, located on the European side of Istanbul, is the city’s largest district by population, with over 755 thousand residents; it was also the first district to be governed by Islamist oriented parties. Since 1992, the year that Bagcilar gained municipal status as a district in its own right, it has been governed by only two mayors, both from the same political background and who are now members of the current national ruling party, the Justice and Development Party (Adalet ve Kalkınma Partisi, AKP).

As the literature demonstrates, the activities of Islamist women organising in their local neighbourhoods was a major factor in the rise of Islamist political parties in Turkey (Arat 2005, Gole 2002, Saktanber 2002); it is not surprising, therefore, that the BMWC has been functioning effectively for some time now. The BMWC was initiated in 2001, as part of the Turkey Local Agenda 21 action plan following the launch of the UN’s Agenda 21. One of the most notable implementations of the Local Agenda 21 was that of City Councils, which, in general, are
one-third comprised of central government and municipal officials, and two-thirds by NGOs. City councils were legalized by the Municipality Law (Law 5393), in 2005. In collaboration with the Bagcilar Municipality, the BMWC, which consists of 45 women from a variety of backgrounds, organises seminars, conferences, social gatherings, reading groups, and celebrative and commemorative events for women in the district.

In researching events affiliated to the Bagcilar Municipality, I conducted semi-structured, face-to-face interviews with municipal officials, mainly deputy mayors, and the heads of the relevant departments, as well as women from the BMWC, who are participants as well as the organisers of these events. The interviews took place at the Bagcilar Municipality (main administrative building) and the WFCAC. As the main focus of this study is on events that shed light on the governance of urban space and civic participation, I studied a range of Bagcilar Municipality publications and attended several events organised by the Municipality and BMWC.

**Bagcilar**

Bagcilar is populated mainly by internal migrants, people who moved to the city from rural areas starting from the 1950s and increasingly after the 1970s as part of the urbanising transformation of the country. Migrants of diverse ethnic backgrounds in Bagcilar created their own informal networks based on kinship and shared geographical (provincial) origin through which they engage with the city. These informal networks among co-locals rapidly became formal organisations and associations and they are still mediating between local people and the authorities in matters regarding the district and the community (Erder 1999). There are 22 associations located in each neighbourhood of Bagcilar, according to the population density of people who share the same provincial origin. These organisations play an essential role in organising community life and fostering a sense of belonging to the metropolis in Bagcilar—as articulated in the interview conducted with the deputy mayors at the Bagcilar Municipality: “It is very essential for NGOs [the associations] to organise events in the city in the context of urbanisation [and] belonging to the city.”

One of the recent collaborations between the Bagcilar Municipality and the associations was the project called “Happy Family, Peaceful Society.” Targeting women (mostly housewives) and involving seminars on issues related to women and family affairs, this project was held at association venues. Seminar topics focused on such issues as “Healthy Communication in Marriage: Conflicts and Resolutions” and “The Development of the Sense of Responsibility in Children and School Success.” The Bagcilar Municipality used the networks and infrastructure of these associations in order to reach out to women, for whom the associations are the only means of participating in public life; at the same time, it extended women’s civic engagement, by including them in a larger project that spreads beyond the boundaries of associations. Based on his research in one of Istanbul’s districts where an Islamist municipality was elected, Cihan Tugal (2009: 429) explains the relationship between the immigrants in the city and the Islamist municipality thus:

> By blurring the distinction between belonging to Istanbul and belonging to provincial towns, the Islamist party was able to win the hearts of the immigrants. Islamists thus constructed a solid relationship with the urban poor not only by protecting pre-existing immigrant communities but by expanding and transforming these communities.

This solid and dynamic relationship between immigrant communities and the Islamist municipalities rendered further negotiations among men on women’s participation in urban life. The deputy mayor recounts how the Municipality convinced men to let their wives attend seminars:

> “You get uncomfortable with your wife’s going there,” they said to the husbands, referring to the Municipality facilities, but seminars will take place, he continues “in your village association, in [a place of] your own village... [and] then, they [husbands] say that that is okay.” As Yuval-Davis
(1997: 37) states, “women’s membership in their national and ethnic collectivities is of a double nature”; this is because “women, like men, are members of the collectivity”, while also “there are always specific rules and regulations which relate to women as women.”

The notion of gender is thus interlaced with the urban governance of Bagcilar in a particular way. The Municipality mobilizes women in urban spaces within a familial context that is full of gender connotations. In other words, women’s urban identity is clearly defined in this context along traditional lines, as either a mother or a wife. The notion of family on the one hand defines the mixed-gender public space and on the other legitimizes the presence of women in public spaces through spatial regulations based on community norms.

The Bagcilar Municipality’s discourse on family and familial norms that regulates and organises the space and civic life of women is reinforced through a religious discourse based on the sayings of the prophet Mohammed, such as “Paradise lies at the feet of the mother.” Or, in a poster for an event related to the internationally funded project, “The Butterfly Effect against Violence against Women,” the Prophet’s word are again quoted, but with “Your wives are entrusted to you by God” using “your wives” to replace the word “women” in the original. This religious discourse is also embedded in women’s narratives. For instance, a woman who attended the reading group organised by the Bagcilar Municipality can easily relate to the Quran, noting that the first command of God is ‘to read’—in the sense of reading the Quran, of course. The blurred distinction between the secular and religious way of readings unfolds the contestation and interaction between the secular and the religious rather than opposing them to each other. Thus, it is not experienced as problematic for the BMWC women to sometimes get together to read and analyse a novel and then, afterwards, read the Quran.

**Staging as governance of space and performing as civic engagement**

The closing ceremony marking the end of the events calendar of the gym organised at the WFCAC involves staging, the most crucial part of the women’s activities, as the stage becomes a form of governance in itself, regulating and reproducing the identity of the district and women through performance. Lewis Mumford (1937:93) defines the city “as a theatre of social action.” Christine Boyer (1994: 74) suggests the resemblance between the theatre and urban space, as both are “places of representation, assemblage, and exchange between actors and spectators, between the drama and the stage set.” Certainly, the form of stage invites citizens, in particular women, to spend more time outside of their houses and merge with urban life.

The staged representation of a particular type of womanhood through “the performative practices of place-making” (Tse 2014: 202) and the repetition of such representation is maintained through the events calendar designated according to local, national, or global events and celebrations, such as the national celebration of the Turkish Republic, International Women’s Day, or the commemoration of the birth of the Prophet Mohammed. These are usually staged at the WFCAC, which was built by the Municipality as a five storey building exclusively for women, with a conference and exhibition halls, offices, classes, kitchen, laundry, and a gym. There is a small café run by women just outside of the building, along with a small market space with stalls allocated to women for free. Access to the building is through the market after passing through an arch-shape entrance where two security booths are located on either side. These new spatial regulations for women to participate in urban life based on gender segregation generate seemingly paradoxical yet efficient places of sociality.

The gym at the WFCAC was turned into a stage for the closing ceremony organised in June, 2015. While some women who attended the gym on a regular basis were on the stage as part of the ceremony, others were watching performances with other guests, generally female relatives or friends of those women. The sports equipment was replaced by chairs, and a couple of tables full of
pastries, cakes, and cookies were placed in the hall of the gym. The food, and overweight women, including one of the gym trainers, indicated that the gym had apparently more meanings than the universal discourse of “being fit and looking healthy” (see Wright et al. 2006).

The ceremony started with opening speeches, followed by a tap-dance performance given by the gym attendees. Then, a Turkish classical music singer sang some songs, and women played games on the stage. The hall was very crowded with children and women, some of whom had dressed up as if they were going to a wedding party (weddings are often the only dancing events that working class women get to attend). Since many women were more interested in eating, dancing, and having fun together than watching performances, they eventually took over the stage, where they danced for long hours.

As Kurt Iveson (2007: 202) suggests, “some kinds of exclusion might be justified on the grounds that they facilitate the exploration of forms of co-presence and public sociability which are not possible in other public spaces.” Thus, the gym as a place of sociality rather than exercise enabled an intimate engagement with the public for women. Women do not just get together for entertainment at the gym, though; rather, entertainment arises as an outcome of their civic engagement with the city through sports.

Conclusion

In this paper, I have discussed how women's participation in urban life is shaped at the intersections and interactions of the local and the international. The locality in this case is underpinned by the UN by means of funding and policies regarding place, culture, and citizenship through which the city is simultaneously located in a transnational context; yet, the ontology of the district coupling with the ongoing local politics, which is interlaced with the Islamist discourse in Bagcilar, affect the way women engage with the city. Although it seems contradictory for women's urban participation to be shaped through a conservative discourse of gender relations within a familial context, women develop a sense of belonging to the city within this context. Thus, I argue that the specific spatial arrangements based on gender segregation in Bagcilar enable women’s civic engagement with the city.
References


On Castoriadis and Ricoeur’s Conceptions of creative social imaginaries

George Sarantoulias

School of Social and Policy Studies, Flinders University

'([I]t is the union and the tension of instituting and of instituted society, of history made and of history in the making.' (Castoriadis 1987, p.108)

The tension between the instituted and the instituting is a fountain of creativity and action. The tension brings forth new forms unique to the specific society that can become significant historical moments. The creativity, from which new forms of action, beliefs, and values emerge, is an ongoing process characteristic of both autonomous and heteronomous societies. My specific interest and this paper’s focus is on action as it relates to Castoriadis and Ricoeur’s respective elucidations of social imaginaries. Both Castoriadis and Ricoeur, think of action as being explicitly creative. Similarly, social imaginaries presume an image of society as creative and self-creating. Castoriadis’s elucidations emphasise that social imaginary significations bring forth novel forms of social action. Ricoeur’s hermeneutic approach identifies the cultural imaginary’s two poles, ideology and utopia, as that which mediates new forms of social action. This paper describes, first, what the social imaginaries framework is, and second, what the creativity of action is. Third, the paper describes Castoriadis’s social imaginary significations and Ricoeur’s ideology and utopia as their specific articulation for social imaginaries.

Social imaginaries can be understood as frameworks for understanding social reality in its multiple forms. The emergence of the social imaginaries field marks ‘a qualitative shift in the way that social, cultural and political phenomena are understood and problematised’ (Adams et al, 2015, p. 16). The social imaginaries concept is a promising theoretical framework which elucidates the cultural meaning that shapes each society and civilisational complex. Further, social imaginaries can be thought of as instituted, and instituting, cultural projects of power and social doing. In the sociological tradition, the concept of social imaginaries is rooted in Emile Durkheim’s (1976 [1912]) collective representations and Benedict Anderson’s (1991[1983]) ‘neo-Durkhemian approach to imagined communities’ (Adam et al 2015, p. 18). Social imaginaries are embedded in culture and essentially give rise to various cultural articulations of the world. Charles Taylor argues (2002, p. 106) that social imaginaries should not be thought of as static
entities. Rather, social imaginaries are ‘schematised in the dense sphere of common practice’ and transform through a dialectic process (Taylor 2002, p. 106). Taylor states (2004, pp. 23-26) that social imaginaries should be thought of as ‘backgrounds’, which allow social life to operate, rather than theories or ideologies. Social imaginaries are the source of a society’s understanding of their cosmogony, solidarity, myths and narratives. and their projected trajectory for the future. These examples are indicative of the metaphysical and pragmatic realities which are brought forth through a society’s cultural articulation.

The social imaginaries framework offers a conceptualisation of social reality by way of ‘images, stories, and legends’. This is no different to the way everyday people understand their world. Social theory, however, conceptualises social reality by way of abstract theoretical terms that can be seen as alienating and unapproachable by individuals that are not specialised in the domain. Taylor (2002, p.106), however, argues that social theoretical contributions eventually feed into and become part of the social imaginaries held by society. Nevertheless, if social theory’s raison d’être is to help conceptualise, critique, and pave a way to alter social reality, then it is essential that it is understood by all of society not just the few ‘elites’ that have the capacity to decipher abstract notions articulated in a highly specialised language.

To clarify further what is meant by the social imaginaries framework I will show its relation to culture. For my purpose, I employ an understanding of culture which regards art, beliefs, values, laws, and ways of acting as being specific to each society’s unique articulation of the world. That is to say that the word culture is taken in its literal sense as something that is in a state of growth influenced by the environment that it is within. The sui generis development of a society’s culture can be attributed to the societies underlying social imaginaries.

This paper draws on the body of sociological knowledge that has demonstrated that creativity is an intrinsic element of social action. The conception of a creativity of social action challenges the notion’s functionalist and structuralist interpretations (Joas 1996[1992]). To emphasise the creative aspect of action does not mean that sociology needs to focus on ‘paradigmatically or exceptionally creative types of action’ (Arnason 1996, p. 105). Creativity, rather, should be seen ‘as an analytical dimension of all human action’ (Joas 1996 [1992], p. 116; Arnason 1996, p. 105). The social imaginaries framework takes action as being creative and self-creating. In order to understand the creative dimension of action, I will contrast it to the functionalist view of action. In doing so, I will focus on the ontological presuppositions that are implied when looking at the social world through the functionalist lens. Functionalists understand the social world as being comprised of structures and institutions which have specific functions. When applying the functionalist framework, social phenomena are evaluated based on the consequences, or telos, they bring forth. Functionalist research produces detailed descriptions of the underlying structural patterns that are often not observable. The creativity of action challenges the functionalist and structuralist view of the subject being incapable of bringing forth new forms of action into the world. Within the functionalist paradigm, agents are not seen as the authors of their own lives, instead, the structures and institutions in society are what bring forth social reality and the construction of the subject’s identity. The main distinction between the social imaginaries framework and that of functionalism is that action is understood as being the product of agency, in response to situations, rather than structure. In the creativity of action, agency is brought to the fore and emphasised. That is to say that human societies are essentially creative and continuously bring into existence novel ways of being and acting in the world. For a theory that incorporates a creativity of action, new forms of action are not necessarily the product of mimesis, as functionalism would have it, rather they emerge as the result of new situations arising and the human capacity to creatively address them. Domingues argues that there is evidence of the notion of creativity in the work of
both classical and contemporary social theories even if their focus was not explicitly on it (2000, pp. 467-9).

For Cornelius Castoriadis, social imaginary significations, his term for social imaginaries, take on a very ontological character. For Castoriadis, society cannot be separated from the notion of history. That is to say that the society is in a continuous creative process which is greatly influenced by the society's social imaginary significations. Castoriadis's earlier work on social imaginary significations incorporated social doing. It can be argued that an understanding of action has always been in the background. The emphasis is placed on his articulations of the ontological condition of social imaginary significations. For Castoriadis social doing was important, but he was more interested in developing an anthropology of the creative imagination and as such 'social doing' and 'action' became marginalised and less important in his later works (post-1975). Adams (2011, p. 2) argues that in The Imaginary Institution of Society (1987[1975]) Castoriadis begins his project with 'an elaboration of the ontological preconditions of autonomy, but it metamorphoses along the way into an ontology of the social-historical'. In the second part of The Imaginary Institution of Society he commences his anthropology of the creative imagination. During this period 'social doing' and 'action' are relegated to teukhein— or technique. The earlier period is more phenomenological while the later period is ontological.

Castoriadis's understanding of history as the 'self-unfolding of society', the 'emergence of new forms' (Arnason, 2014, p. 33), emphasises his critique of functionalism. Castoriadis recognised that human societies have a 'functional component', however, he argued that they 'are not reducible to systems with given needs' (Arnason, 2014, pp. 32-3). For 'cultural definitions always enter into the making of societal needs' and are then understood through symbolic networks of meaning (Arnason, 2014, p. 32). In Castoriadis's elaboration of social imaginary significations and the radical imaginary's creative bringing forth of institutions, he introduces 'a tripartite typology of significations' which 'correspond to the perceived, to the rational or the imaginary' (Castoriadis, 1978, p. 139; Arnason 2014, p. 33). Arnason's reconstruction of Castoriadis's typology identified its Kantian background (2014, p. 33) and the role of the imagination to perception and rationality. Castoriadis links the imaginary to the social-historical field. Although the imaginary element 'is to be distinguished from the components based on perception…or rationality' its continuous 'interaction with these two aspects…as the modus operandi of the imaginary source' and of the social imaginary significations created (Arnason, 2014, p. 33) emphasise the primacy of the imagination in the creation of symbolic networks. Castoriadis's importance for a critique of normative and rational frameworks which try to understand social action becomes clear when the primacy of the imaginary realm in shaping 'patterns of perception as well as frameworks and horizons of rationalisation' is recognised (Arnason, 2014, p. 34).

Paul Ricoeur was a philosopher who was best known for merging phenomenology with hermeneutics, but who also stressed the importance of engaging with the social sciences, especially around the notion of creativity and action (1981a). As a student of phenomenology, Ricoeur, begins with the premise that the 'world' is already there outside of the individual consciousness. That is to say, individuals are born into a culture, or a cultural articulation of the world which is unique to that society. Drawing from his affinity to hermeneutics, Ricoeur held that all understanding is based on interpretation. Ricoeur's approach emphasises the interpretative aspect of action. Ricoeur thinks of the indirect aspect of society, the interpretative aspect, the symbols, the narratives, the cultural texts, all of which act as mediators for action. The social imaginary relates to the ensemble of narratives held by a society and which mediate its social reality in a very practical sense. For Ricoeur the imagination is 'the general function of developing practical possibilities' for acting in the world. His understanding of the imagination's function is its
‘practical power to innovate, rather than the psychological function of reproducing perceptions’ (Foessel 2014, p. 513).

For Ricoeur a theory of cultural imagination entailed placing ‘the two phenomena of ideology and utopia within a single conceptual framework’ (1976, p. 17; 1981b). Ricoeur's work on the social imaginary, which is brought forth as result of his intellectual encounter with contemporary notions of the productive imagination and the reproductive imagination, identifies ideology and utopia as being the two poles of the social imaginary. Adams et al (2015, pp.22-23) argued that ‘[t]he ideological imagination reproduces an image that society has of itself (usually a founding image/myth), whilst the utopian imagination produces alternative images of society that put ideological images into question’. That is to say that ideology can be seen as being that which binds society together. This is significant for ideology has carried a negative connotation as being that which distorts reality. The second pole is the concept of utopia. This can be seen as the no-place that one needs to be ‘in’, to be ‘able’, to critique the instituted ideological frameworks of society. For Ricoeur action is mediated by the interpretation of the symbolic matrix that makes up a cultures’ specific articulation. Furthermore, Ricoeur takes action to be the primary human condition. As such for him the social imaginary is the domain of practical life and social action is the domain of practical reason and life.

An example that can help clarify further what is meant by social imaginaries is necessary. I will begin by drawing on Castoriadis's understanding of the dual project of modernity. For Castoriadis there are two main social imaginary significations that have been the catalysts for a mode of being-in-the-world. The first is the pursuit of rational, or pseudo-rational, mastery and the second is the project of autonomy. I will contrast the social imaginary of a society that has strong religious beliefs, which incorporate the earth as being intrinsically important and divine, with the capitalist imaginary which regards the earth as devoid of any divinity. A society that believes the earth is a divine entity will have very different predispositions towards it than a society which is capitalist. To further the example, one must look at the underlying elements that draw the parameters of reason and rationality for each society and, as such, also draw the bounds of action. Unlike the religious society, the capitalist society sees the world as an object, a resource that if mastered can lead to monetary gain. On the one hand, the end goal in a capitalist society, that which is intrinsically valuable, is money. On the other hand, one could argue that the end goal for the religious society is the preservation of the divine entity and its inhabitants i.e. the earth and all beings living on it. By outlining the goals held as valuable by each society, it becomes evident that the sui generis objectives, beliefs, values, and laws are all in line with their specific social imaginary. The social imaginary of the pursuit of rational mastery is in line with the Weberian ‘disenchantment of the world’. The processes of capitalist rationalisation reduce the world to a resource that does not have any value if it cannot be used in a way that produces profit. Social imaginaries can be seen as a society’s specific predisposition to the world and its underlying ontological assumptions about the human condition. To expand on this further, the religious society perceives its position in the world as being similar to the role of an older sibling who is responsible for protecting and caring for their younger family members. Shamanic traditions talk of the earth's creatures as being family members who are all equally as important. Antithetically, the capitalist imaginary introduces a hierarchical framework in which all beings are positioned. According to the capitalist imaginary the top tiers of the hierarchy are reserved for those that have capital. The lower someone is on the hierarchy the less valuable they are. This is a sharp difference to the social imaginary of the religious society that takes all beings as intrinsically valuable. The social imaginary(-ies) of a society is a matrix which has its own unique set of rules and possibilities for action. These unique sets of rules are what Castoriadis calls institutions. Institutions, according to Castoriadis, are seen, in their ‘broadest and most radical sense’, as ‘norms, values, language, tools, procedures and methods of dealing with things and doing things’ (1997, p.6).
This paper commences with a description of social imaginaries and the creative dimension of action. Further, the paper links history to the creativity of action inherent in social imaginaries. Thereafter, the focus shifted towards a brief elucidation of both Castoriadis and Ricoeur’s specific notions of social imaginaries reconfigured as social imaginary significations and ideology and utopia respectively. In order to explain the importance of social imaginaries for understanding types of action an example contrasting the capitalist imaginary and the imaginary of a society who sees nature as divine was put forth.
References


Death, Modernity and Harry Potter: Why is a story of magic and mortality popular in disenchanted, death-averse times?

Melinda Turner

Department of Social Inquiry, La Trobe University

In 1918, Max Weber described the culture of modernity as disenchanted or, more literally, demagicalised. He meant that the authority of science has supplanted that of traditional religious belief in the modern secular West (1918: 155). Weber construed science broadly, as the systematic pursuit of knowledge: an enterprise that is progressive and forward-focused. Modern cosmology is therefore, unlike that which preceded it, always unfinished, perpetually open to revision in the light of new discoveries and fresh evidence. So too, Weber argued, is the life of the modern individual future-oriented. This open-endedness has significant existential implications, which Weber spelled out. Death, when it strikes, abruptly halts the forward momentum of life, which might have continued if only the knowledge to avert it – knowledge that may be just over the horizon – was already at hand. Death thus inscribes the current limit of progress, a limit against which modern culture continually strains. Science has, as Weber put it, stripped death of its meaningful place in human life.

Zygmunt Bauman refers to death as ‘the scandal’ of modernity: an ‘emphatic denial of everything that the brave new world of modernity stood for’ (1992: 15 & 134). He nominates death aversion, ‘a concern with health and an obsessive worry about death- carrying agents’ as ‘the most salient feature of modern life’ (1992: 2). Further, he suggests that this preoccupation with forestalling our eventual demise ironically moves death from the horizon of life into its very centre. Death comes to dominate life; an abiding presence, it haunts and directs our every step. Ulrich Beck (1992) and Anthony Giddens (1999) make a similar point when they characterise contemporary society in terms of risk calculation and mitigation.

It is within this cultural context that a story about magic and death has been received with extraordinary enthusiasm. Its success was not anticipated; twelve publishers turned down the first Harry Potter novel before Bloomsbury took it on. Yet, over the two decades since the publication of this first installment of the seven novel series, the story has pervaded a myriad of cultural domains including the arts, the academy, politics, international relations, legal studies and science. Its characters and images are now readily recognizable and have become well integrated into the cultural representations of the West. Harry Potter, the boy who discovers he is a wizard, is known
within the narrative that tells his tale as ‘the boy who lived’ (PS, p.18) He is also emphatically alive within Western culture. This is the best-selling book series in history.

Why has a story about magic and about death struck such as chord in our supposedly demagicalised and death-averse culture? In particular, why are so many adults enthusiastic about the story? British novelist and Booker prize-winner A.S. Byatt, describes these grown-ups as ‘childish adults’. In her review of the fifth novel, she contends that their enthusiasm is fuelled by a need for ‘comfort’. As she puts it: ‘[w]e like to regress’ to a simpler, more innocent stage, as a ‘restful’ respite from the complexities of adult life (Byatt, 2003). In this paper, while conceding that there is some textual evidence to support Byatt’s interpretation, I argue against such a reading and suggest that adults see more in the story than this.

First, we consider the evidence in favour of Byatt’s ‘regression’ reading. Harry first experiences the magical domain when he visits Diagon Alley to buy supplies for school; he is about to embark on his education at Hogwarts School of Witchcraft and Wizardry. This initial transition from ordinary non-magical (Muggle) to magical London strongly suggests a movement back in time. In Diagon Alley, people wear top hats, long robes and gold and scarlet livery. Instead of prosaic shops, there is an Owl Emporium, an Apothecary and other quaintly named establishments. Arcane items are available for purchase, such as cauldrons, wands, ‘strange silver instruments … quills and rolls of parchment, potion bottles, globes of the moon…’ (Rowling, 1997: 56). Here Harry meets goblins and hears talk of vampires, hags and dragons. It seems that he has entered a realm radically other and earlier than familiar modern reality.

This impression of fantastical otherness is reinforced when Harry arrives at Hogwarts. The school is a castle, perched on top of a mountain on the edge of a black lake. It is replete with a Great Hall, dungeons, turrets and towers. Light is supplied by flaming torches and flickering candlelight; presumably, there is no electricity here. In addition to resident ghosts and plants that squeal and strangle, things understood to be inanimate in our world are here animate: books bite, portrait subjects converse and move in and out of their pictures, buildings appear and disappear, staircases vary their destinations, correspondence explodes and so on. Humans are not the only agents in this world. Animals and a whole range of magical beings and objects have agendas of their own. This connotes a medieval experience of a cosmos alive with ‘powers’ and agency; it is a striking contrast to the modern cosmos of inert matter.

However, the reader is not allowed to settle into a comfortable nostalgia for an enchanted past. As the story unfolds, initial impressions of difference from contemporary life are gradually and inexorably eroded. In fact, from the very beginning there are hints that the distinction between the two domains is not as clear as appearances suggest. Magic is first shown to be tangibly present in the ordinary world right at the start of the story, in the form of a large tawny owl that flies unnoticed past the window of 4 Privet Drive. This location, in the suburb of Little Whinging, is the home of the Dursley family. They are Harry’s relatives, with whom he comes to live in his infancy following the death of his parents. Although the Dursleys and Little Whinging are decidedly unmagical, the presence of the owl signifies that the borders between the magical and the Muggle are permeable.

The names and locations of the portals used to cross from one domain to the other are another clue. The Hogwarts Express leaves from Platform 9 ¾, invisibly positioned between Platforms 9 and 10 at London’s Kings Cross Station. Similarly, London’s magical shopping precinct is accessed via The Leaky Cauldron, a small, shabby pub in the heart of the busy modern city. The pub opens via an ostensibly solid brick wall into Diagon Alley, whose name suggests a dimension of reality that exists not in parallel but slant-wise to the ordinary and commonplace.
Despite its archaic features, the magical world resists conclusive identification with a particular historical period. A steam train conveys students from London to school in the wilds of the Scottish Highlands. Thus, the Hogwarts Express is a product of the industrial age; while not contemporary, neither is it medieval. The more familiar Harry grows with the magical world, the more he recognizes its similarity to ordinary life.

Byatt objects to the ‘symbiosis’, as she puts it, that exists in the story between the magical world and that of ordinary contemporary experience. It rankles with her that witches and wizards use trains and hospitals, read newspapers, play competitive sport and are hamstrung by bureaucracy. These elements are, for her, an unwelcome intrusion in a genre that is meant to distract from rather than invoke the reality of modern life. For her own excursions into nostalgic comfort she prefers – and she implies that others with a similarly cultivated literary sensibility would concur with this preference – to be transported unambiguously back in time to:

earlier parts of our culture, when supernatural and inhuman creatures … inhabited a world we did not feel we controlled. If we regress, we regress to a lost sense of significance we mourn for (Byatt, 2003, my italics).

Byatt’s reaction is noteworthy for its Weberian insistence that an enchanted worldview is incompatible with a mature existence in the modern world. Weber spoke of regression to a lost past being the resort of those who could not ‘bear the [disenchanted] fate of the times like a man’ (1918: 155). Also Weberian is Byatt’s conviction that a ‘sense of significance’ is irretrievably lost, leaving us to ‘mourn’ its absence – and in weaker moments to return to it in wistful regression.

But perhaps Byatt is mistaken in claiming that this story’s appeal to adults is based on nostalgic yearnings. Perhaps the symbiosis of the magical with the modern, rather than being a generic aberration, is in fact the reason for adult interest in the story. The magical world is not represented as an idealized, or even a more comfortable version of modern reality: far from it. It too, as it becomes increasingly apparent, is susceptible to disenchantment and its effects.

Magical society is highly bureaucratized, governed by an all-powerful Ministry of Magic and, over the course of the story, there is an escalation in bureaucratic control of citizens’ lives. In the fifth novel Dolores Umbridge, Senior Undersecretary for the Minister for Magic, joins the Hogwarts teaching staff as a Ministerial appointment. Her inaugural speech exhorts the school community to:

move forward … into a new era of openness, effectiveness and accountability, intent on preserving what ought to be preserved, perfecting what needs to be perfected, and pruning wherever we find practices that ought to be prohibited (Rowling, 2003: 193).

Umbridge’s language is immediately recognizable to adult readers as that of the contemporary bureaucrat or politician. Although it reduces most of the students to a glassy-eyed stupor, Harry’s friend Hermione astutely sums up the tenor of Umbridge’s speech: ‘It means the Ministry’s interfering at Hogwarts’. This interference begins with the introduction of ‘Ministry-approved’ curricula.

Umbridge’s powers are augmented when she is appointed ‘High Inquisitor’ of the school, commissioned to assess other teachers’ compliance with Ministry regulations and to enforce a proliferation of ‘Educational Decrees’ that incrementally restrict the freedom of students and staff. Umbridge’s cloyingly sweet exterior conceals a ruthless and fanatical devotion to rules and procedures; she is Weber’s ‘specialist without spirit’ (1930: 182) par excellence. Peter Ciaccio compares Umbridge with the Nazi Adolf Eichmann (2009:43). She exemplifies what Hannah Arendt termed ‘the banality of evil’ (1963) as she executes her duties for the Ministry, sanctioning the torture of students and overseeing the systematic persecution and imprisonment of Muggle-born witches and wizards.
Harry’s nemesis, the malevolent wizard Lord Voldemort, is Hitler to Umbridge’s Eichmann (Appelbaum, 2009:96). Over the course of the story he orchestrates a return to power and his supporters gradually infiltrate and corrupt the Ministry. They are abetted in this by a weak Minister of Magic, Cornelius Fudge, who is so preoccupied with shoring up his own power that he turns a blind eye to the real evil threatening the community. Rowling acknowledges that the parallel with the rise of the Third Reich is intentional and that the character of Fudge is based on Neville Chamberlain, Prime Minister of the United Kingdom from 1937-1940, who fatally underestimated the threat Hitler posed to Europe (Reagin, 2011).

In the sixth novel, Fudge is succeeded by the strategic Rufous Scrimgeour who attempts to bribe Harry into an alliance with the Ministry. Scrimgeour seeks to exploit Harry’s reputation as ‘the Chosen One’ so as to boost people’s confidence in the Ministry. He is not so much interested in the reality of Harry’s situation as in public perception. As he puts it: ‘it’s all perception, isn’t it? It’s what people believe that’s important… it’s all about giving people hope, the feeling that exciting things are happening’ (Rowling, 2005: 323-4). Harry’s integrity and the status of truth are at stake here. Weber noted that the demise of Western Christendom left the modern West without an over-arching system of values. So too is there tension in the magical world between competing systems of value: self interest, political expedience and other motivations for action are represented in the priorities of different characters.

At the beginning of the sixth novel, Fudge and Scrimgeour meet with the Muggle Prime Minister of Britain to discuss a series of disasters that have affected both communities. At the end of their conversation the Prime Minister exclaims:

‘But for heaven’s sake – you’re wizards! You can do magic! Surely you can sort out – well – anything!’ (Rowling, 2005: 24)

Scrimgeour and Fudge exchange an incredulous look and then Fudge responds, kindly, as if stating the obvious: ‘The trouble is, the other side can do magic too, Prime Minister’ (Rowling, 2005: 24).

This exchange marks the point in the narrative when an escapist reading of the story ceases to be credible. It is clear that magic is no panacea. So, if it does not solve the problems of life with the wave of a wand, what is the function of magic within the story? Its most obvious role is to function as a kind of alternative technology, different but analogous to that of the contemporary West. Whilst Muggles dress in contemporary clothing and use the familiar tools of the modern West, witches and wizards wear robes and use magical means to control their world. The different material culture of the magical world serves as a source of humour in the narrative. Magic is, in other words, a means of power and control and, as Fudge implies, whether it is used for good or ill depends on the character of the one who wields it. There are deeper, more fundamental issues at stake than whether an individual is magical or Muggle.

A more subtle use of magic in the narrative is that it invites the reader to entertain the unexpected and encourages an openness to the mysterious and inexplicable. It provides, as it were, a place outside the take-for-granted assumptions of a modern worldview. Once this attitude of wonder is awoken in the reader, the story directs its focus to the enigmatic aspects of the characters’ being. All the significant characters have depths that are only revealed gradually – and never completely. The crucial dividing line in the story falls, I suggest, not between Muggle and magical, but between those who can ‘see’ and those who remain blind to the mysterious nature of their own being and that of others. It is here that the enchantment of the story lies: in the enigmatic depths of being.

Harry and Voldemort begin their lives in very similar circumstances. Both were orphaned in infancy, both were released from dreary childhoods by the discovery of their magical powers and
bothe found a ‘home’ in Hogwarts school. Both started out with what Bauman might call a very modern attitude to death, considering it a scandal and the worst thing that could happen to a human being.

Voldemort was born Tom Riddle but at sixteen, on the brink of maturity, he rejected his past, and fashioned for himself a new identity ‘Lord Voldemort’. This chosen name signals his ambition to become immortal and all-powerful, recognizing no authority over himself. Voldemort shows the ugly side of the modern quest for ultimate control over human life. His name can be translated three ways from the French: ‘fight-from-death’, ‘flight-of-death’ and ‘stolen-from-death’. All of these are apt. The sole focus of Voldemort’s life is its infinite extension and he is ruthless in his pursuit; along his way all others are reduced to expendable means in the attainment of the one end he has in sight. Voldemort is blind to the mystery of his own being and to that of others. He is self-centred, yet his vision is finally shown to be too small. His fatal mistake was made on the cusp of adulthood when, underestimating the enigma of his own being, he rejected the riddle that he was. By the end of the story, he has failed not only to attain immortality but even to become a man he has not only failed to become a man; he has reduced himself to something less than human.

Might Voldemort’s wasted life sound a warning to our death-averse culture? Bauman asserts that ‘the modern spirit’ has been from the beginning hubristic, predicated on a belief in ‘human omnipotence’ (Bauman 1992, pp. 145-6). Voldemort shows the futility and dangers of this illusory quest.

By the end of the story, ‘the boy who lived’ has turned seventeen and become the man who lives. The story of how he arrives at maturity shows a way of being, of accepting the enigma that he is, that is very different to Voldemort’s abortive existence. Perhaps it is this other way that has caught the imagination of readers and inspired such enthusiasm.
References


Militarisation of the Urban Environment and the Consequences of the Climate Justice Movement: Dystopian Visions of the late-capitalist city from Melbourne to Paris

Alexander Waters

RMIT University

Introduction

Three mega-trends; financialisation, the War on Terror and the militarisation of the urban environment, have coalesced in recent years to produce a political environment in which traditional repertoires of social movement mobilisation (such as nonviolent marches) are no longer able to effect movement goals and are increasingly understood as a soft or low level form of terrorism. Liveability (and efforts to widen its scope) under the dystopian conditions of ‘crisis Neoliberalism’ must therefore be re-evaluated. This inquiry employs a classical Marxist theoretical framework drawing especially on Harvey's understanding of financialisation (2012) and Graham's conceptualisation of the ‘New Urban Militarism’ (2010).

By financialisation I mean the shift from the industrial productive mode of capitalism commonly described as Fordism to the speculative mode of capitalism which began in the 1970s, and the complex reformulations this process has imposed upon society, the state and the economy. The political-economic empowerment of the finance sector has also notably contributed to both the fact and the growing public understanding of widening inequality; for instance; the Occupy Wall Street slogan, coined by David Graeber, of “We Are The 99%”. Militarisation is understood as the “reorganisation of civil society for the production of violence, the normalisation of military paradigms of thought, policy and action, and aggressively disciplining rebel bodies, cultures and spaces” (Graham 2010: 60). Thus, the logic of both the War on Terror and the financial crisis of 2008 have acted as catalysts to what I refer to as the Dystopian late-capitalist city.

How can a city be considered liveable if the average citizen spends a third or half of their income on rent or their mortgage; with the attendant stress as to whether they will be able to pay the utility bills or buy groceries? As relates to the commons and the Neoliberal governmentality’s steady privatisation of them for finance-capital accumulation, how can the popular class find their city liveable when education, healthcare and the basic necessities of a decent standard of living are increasingly presented as commodities that only the deserving elite should be able to afford?
Following Lazzarato’s (2011) theory of indebted man, financialisation seen as a tool of social control aimed at depoliticisation of the popular class. In order to resist its consequences, the city must be re-politicised as a site of struggle for a better life for all and not merely the elite enclave of expatriates which the Economist survey (EIU 2014) privileges as a universal subject. Recent waves of social movement mobilisations proffer an incipient process of politicisation beyond the traditional confines of militant activism, wherein the popular class as a subject may be undergoing a profound realisation of its own agency in the wake of wider sociological transformations wrought by austerity, gentrification, the draconian consequences for democratic participation during the ‘War on Terror’ and the ecological crisis.

This paper is divided into the following five sections. In section 1) Melbourne’s status as the world’s most liveable city is critiqued through the prism of flaws in the Economist survey’s methodology (2014). In section 2) militarization of the urban environment is analysed as the necessary enforcer of the depoliticized Neoliberal order entering the phase of what Clover (2016) described as a new age of riots and uprisings. In section 3) Neoliberalism’s endgame combined with the War on Terror is discussed as having produced the conditions on the ground in Paris during the UN COP21 negotiations in December 2015. Drawing on interviews and participant observation conducted, I hypothesise that Paris is the harbinger of the dystopian militarized city, where civil liberties, privacy, the right to public assembly and political expression itself are increasingly under attack. In section 4) I discuss some of the consequences of the Climate Justice Movement (CJM) to offer a counter analysis to the hegemonic discourse which portrayed the social movement mobilisations as irrelevant. I suggest that CJM mobilisations laid the groundwork to subsequent developments in France such as the new “Up All Night” movement to oppose the El Khomri labour laws, the global “Break Free” direct action to temporarily shut down coal, oil and gas infrastructure and “Fossil Free” divestment campaigns. In section 5) I discuss a proposed solution to the current malaise, involving the radical re-politicization of the state as an actor within regional and global coalitions.

Melbourne, the world’s most liveable city?

For a number of years Melbourne has been listed as among the world’s most liveable cities by the Economist Intelligence Unit’s (EIU) annual survey (2014). This paper seeks to challenge that view, firstly, by drawing on a much more dystopian picture of urban life under the governmentality of neoliberal austerity. If cities are only liveable for the gentrifying inner city enclave, what does this suggest about the quality of urban life for the great majority whom the EIU’s index excludes?”

It is worth noting that the study’s methodology tends to be ignored in the extensive mass media coverage it has received. For instance, the study excludes everything beyond the innermost 4-kilometre radius from the centre of the city. In Melbourne’s case this means means everything beyond Burnley to the east and Brunswick to the north is erased. What of the citizens of Tarneit, South Morang or Dandenong? Those who reproduce the city and commute in such as construction workers, operators of port machinery, delivery drivers, telecommunications operators and so on. As far as the EIU’s scope is concerned, these places do not exist, so the material experiences of those millions is erased. As Lees, Bang Shin and Lopez-Morales (2016) point out, this is true for debates about urbanisation and gentrification at the global scale. As sociologists, we need to critically resist the portrayal of the petite- bourgeoisie’s experience as universal experiences.

Of course the inner core is “liveable” if you exclusively poll the expatriate businesspeople who make up the constituency of The Economist! But as Lefebvre theorised (1967), the gap between rural and urban (and for our purposes; the gap between ‘downtown’ and suburban) is increasingly blurred as planetary processes of urbanisation blend supply lines, transport and communications networks without regard for lines on any map. Thus, one cannot meaningfully describe the quality of life (either within or beyond the central city) without looking at the metropolitan scale.
Militarization of the urban environment: violence as the necessary enforcer of the depoliticized Neoliberal order

The Neoliberal project has produced global cities in its own image, just as it has fostered global institutions like the WTO and IMF, and indeed individuals who cannot see beyond the fog of what Fischer (2009) called “capitalist realism” (epitomised by Thatcher's TINA doctrine). Cities such as this are characterised by the aesthetics of Disneyfication wrought by capital’s tendency for commodifying anything in a particular place with a ‘unique’ quality capable of providing monopoly rents (Harvey 2012), and above all by the anxiety of financial precarity imposed by these policies. The commodification of central Melbourne’s unique spaces (laneways, street art, hole in the wall bars and so on) speak to this phenomenon, and the particular experience of gentrification accelerated in part by the local tourism industry.

Processes of gentrification (and deindustrialisation for that matter) cannot be maintained in a smooth, self-propelling manner. The privatisation of the urban commons by capital can be interpreted as a postmodern form of the enclosures which swept the English countryside in the centuries preceding the Industrial Revolution. In the present late stage of neoliberal governmentality, the militarisation and securitisation of urban space has become necessary to the defend and impose the wider pattern of social relations through the increased threat and practice of state violence. In this endeavour, I draw on French sociologist Wacquant’s (2011) notion of the punitive state-market 'neoliberal Leviathan'. This regime does not limit its disciplinary attention to the poor or the criminal. It is in fact focused on transforming the city into a militarised space with a valorised and riot-gear clad police presence, ubiquitous surveillance technology and the privatisation of the public realm. These conditions are not merely present during a temporary emergency, but are increasingly becoming normalised as permanent characteristics.

Ahmed (2016) illuminates how the arms industry, in its planning for waves of highly profitable ‘riot contagion’, does not differentiate between war between two or more states in a place like Mosul and riot control between the state and its own citizenry in a place like Ferguson. All fields of operations are merely markets for commodities to be exchanged; demands to be supplied, needs to be met. Drawing on the example of Athens since 2008, Clover (2016) goes so far as to suggest that we are living in a new era of uprisings wherein the riot is unending, and the city’s people recognize the police as a kind of foreign occupation force (in this case imposing the will of the Troika). As the country’s former Finance Minister Yanis Varoufakis argued, Greece was the ‘canary in the coalmine’ to the rest of Europe.

1 “practices laissez faire toward corporations and the upper class, but is fiercely interventionist and authoritar- ian when it comes to dealing with the consequences of economic deregulation for those at the lower end of the class spectrum.’ This is because the imposition of market discipline is not a smooth, self-propelling process, it meets with re- calcitrance and triggers resistance; it translates into diffusing social instability and turbulence among the lower class; and it practically undermines the authority of the state. It requires institutional contraptions that will anchor and support it, among them enlarged and energetic penal [and criminal justice] institutions.” Wacquant (2011)

2 The Snowden revelations taught us much about the way governments view their own people. Panoptical sur- veillance and the militarisation of the police could be seen as the digital and urban faces of the 21st century state. What motivates political actors who advance this program? Greenwald (2016) suggests that ‘the possibility of being monitored radically changes individual and collective behaviour. Specifically, that possibility breeds fear and fosters collective conformity. If we think that we’re being watched, we might stop visiting certain websites or avoid saying certain things to avoid seeming suspicious.’

3 The report provides insight into the thinking of Western governments engaged in imperialist interventionism in the Middle-East. As Cameron (2013) argued, the war on terror, beginning in 2003, provoked a paradigmatic foreign policy shift that has had profound effects on domestic social order. It has provoked a new kind of subject formation through every day practises of security. We are encouraged to dehumanise the ‘Muslim Big Other’.
Neoliberalism's Endgame: Paris during the ‘COP21’ summit as a harbinger of the Dystopian Militarized City

In December 2015, the UN held the highly anticipated 21st COP summit in Paris to negotiate a binding treaty on climate change among the 195 gathered member states; a majority of whom sent a head of state. This was regarded as a moment of political instability, akin to an election campaign, during which what was ‘impossible’ at any other time suddenly became possible. Hopes were high that the agreement would resolve many of the longstanding problems that detonated at the Copenhagen summit of 2009; the multi-issue conflict between the Global North and South, the disenfranchisement of frontline communities – especially people of First Nations and the unequal distribution of wealth, political clout and technology to build the clean energy infrastructure needed to shut down the coal mines and oilfields currently spewing carbon into the atmosphere. In hindsight, the agreement signed in Paris was never going to be a magic bullet, but anticipation in the lead up to the summit indicated that substantive progress could be made to begin addressing these and other issues.

The nascent CJM had spent two whole years forming an overarching congress of over 130 civil society organisations referred to as “Coalition Climat 21”. Representatives would meet weekly, and more frequently in the 6 months leading up to the summit. It included some of the institutional memory of the ‘Climate Justice Now’ network that had mobilised in Copenhagen for the 2009 COP, significantly now incorporating ATTAC, 350.org, Avaaz, OxFam and the WWF. The ‘People’s Climate March’ was planned for November 29th the day before the opening of the summit to send an emphatic message to the heads of state gathered that the several hundred thousand or perhaps even a million marchers from around the world united to demand climate justice.

Then came the terror attacks of November 13th, in which 133 were tragically killed and ISIS later claimed credit for (to the barely disguised delight of war hawks from Moscow to Washington). The French government was swift to cynically exploit the opportunity to maximise the ‘War On Terror’ opportunities to criminalise dissent by imposing a blanket ban on street demonstrations with extraordinary ‘state of emergency’ measures that were to last months after the conference was over. At the height of the most important climate change negotiations between the leaders of nations in years, the planned Peoples Climate March, the “Red Lines” action at the summit’s closing and every public gathering to express a political message in between were declared illegal.

The intent was clear: democracy was to be kicked out of Paris. In came the riot-control police. President Hollande referred to the attacks as ‘an act of war’, immediately announcing increased airstrikes on Syria and that 11,000 extra security officers would now blockade the Le Bourget conference centre throughout the summit. At the national level, the Ministry of the Interior announced that 120,000 officers from the National Police and the Gendarmerie were to be called up for duty. This was a substantive escalation of the pre-existing police state that Paris already represented. Naturally, this had a deterrence effect on the scale of mobilizations planned by the Coalition Climat 21 network.

The consequences of the Climate Justice Movement

Despite the unfavourable political opportunity structures for the CJM during COP21, the movement achieved some noteworthy consequences. Successful social movements have both revolutionary and reformist wings whose relationship is characterised as dynamic and supportive of one another’s material, mutual goals. The CJM featured a faction representing the institutional left (large NGOs, non-profits and political parties) which at first proposed marches as their strategy, and then abandoned these plans when the state of emergency began. It should be

Incidentally, commercial activities (football games and outdoor shopping festivals for Christmas) that involved the public gathering in their thousands were allowed to continue; only the political ones were banned.
noted that without the support of these authoritative voices, rank and file activists were left without definitive guidelines as to how to participate in attempts to disrupt or influence the COP21 process. The other faction, representing the more radically anti-capitalist, grassroots and independent tendency in the environmental movement, was fixed on direct action; adopting a strategy of disrupting and discrediting the legitimacy of the whole COP21 process. This lack of cohesion between the two tendencies fuelled an unproductive dynamic throughout the summit. Police repression appeared to specifically encourage this infighting and framing of “dissent as proto-terrorism”, for instance by placing several dozen French environmental activists known for direct action under house arrest and through targeted raids of squats where activists and artists were known to have gathered.

Against this dire background, three significant consequences of the CJM are worth highlighting to counter the notion that social movements are irrelevant and have no power to influence culture or institutions. Firstly, 350.org co-ordinated a highly ambitious wave of direct actions known as the “Break Free” [from Fossil Fuels] week in early May 2016. Across 12 countries known for fossil fuel companies developing new infrastructure (Canada, Australia and Nigeria for example) thousands of individuals participated in occupations of coal mines, blockading of coal ports, shutting down oil and gas fields; intervening in the extraction producing climate change itself. Secondly, “Fossil Free” divestment campaigns to pressure large institutions to withdraw capital from coal, oil and gas companies are proliferating across the planet. These campaigns have now cumulatively deprived the industry of $3.4 trillion (Henn 2015). Over 500 universities, city governments, TNCs and other institutions have announced plans for divestment. Thirdly, activists during COP21 challenged the police state measures imposed by the national government. In doing so, they laid the groundwork for what may be the most significant anti-austerity uprising in Europe yet in the “Up All Night” movement, unfolding at the time of writing in mid-2016. Beginning after a call by unions for a general strike as a rebellion against the El Khomri labour reforms which sought to abolish the 35-hour workweek, then morphing into a populist movement incorporating students, the unemployed, pensioners and others occupying the ‘Place de la République’ (where the People’s Climate March began) in scenes reminiscent of the Paris Commune of 1871. In short, the CJM laid the groundwork for more significant struggles within France and around the world. What all three of these consequences have in common is that they tie into processes of politicisation which empower and embolden ordinary people to participate in politics by refusing to wait for the politicians to address a problem on their behalf. After 21 years of COPs and not much progress to show for it, their logic seems arguable.

Re-politicizing the state as an actor within regional and global participatory coalitions
A proposed solution could involve the radical re-politicization of the state as an actor within regional and global coalitions for social justice. Lefebvre’s (1967) concept of the “right to the city” invoked the right of the popular class to rebuild the city in such a way as to prefigure a socialist set of relations, production and reproduction. In this sense, we acknowledge that inequality cannot disappear overnight, that we should perhaps accommodate ourselves for the moment to some “acceptable level of inequality”, while struggling to bring the basic essentials of a decent standard of living into the commons. While mansions still exist under the ownership of the wealthy, networks of popular organisations could wage campaigns for a “bill of rights” for all citizens in their city; to universal housing, education, healthcare and so on. In the current political

---

5 Additionally, the conference centre where UN delegates negotiated was more insulated from civil society actors than previous COPs, leaving almost no space for protest to directly influence the negotiations. Meanwhile, fossil fuel industry firms and the banks financing them (such as Engie, Suez Environement and BNP Paribas) played a heavily engaged role in both sponsoring the conference and writing the agreement itself, revealing the democratic deficit at the heart of the UN and the state-based framework of environmental governance more broadly.

6 Barcelona En Comu provides a blueprint for this, with its anti-evictions campaign which elected current mayor Ada Colau.
environment, the ALP brought a proposal to end negative gearing on investment properties to the 2016 federal election. Why not extend its logic by establishing a housing policy review with the aim that homelessness will be permanently eradicated through an affordable housing program within 12 months?

Melbourne itself has approximately 80,000 homes that sit empty as the investors simply collect capital gains, while approximately 20,000 of the city’s people remain homeless. Given that there are four empty homes for every homeless person, this is not a logistical problem, but a political one. As long as people passively accept “capitalist realism” (Fischer 2009) and remain disengaged from seeking to use the machinery of the state to advance social justice instead of the demands of capital for unending accumulation, this will remain so.

**Conclusion**

This paper began by arguing that the blindness of the EIU’s liveability survey to phenomena like gentrification leads it to universalise the petite-bourgeoisie’s experience of the city and the erasure of the popular class’ experience. I extended Wacquant’s logic of the punitive neoliberal state to the militarisation and ‘enclosure’ of the city. I discussed some of the consequences of the CJM during COP21 which, despite the scale of police repression in Paris during the summit, have emboldened activists and their supporting communities to mobilise around the world. I discussed one potential solution to the democratic deficit at the heart of the late-capitalist city, which is embodied in the radical re-politicization of the state as an actor within multi-issue coalitions.

Finally, when applying our sociological analysis to the historic inequality, structural violence and sheer indifference of the late-capitalist city to its citizenry, we are obliged to not merely envision a more socially just city but, more importantly, to help organize coalitions to make it a reality.
References


Sex as work? Theorising unwanted sex in stable heterosexual relationships

Catherine Weiss

RMIT University

Abstract

The idea that sex is a form of work has been widely examined in the context of prostitution, but much less so in the context of unwanted sex imposed on women in stable heterosexual relationships. This is in spite of periodic feminist characterisations of unwanted sex in stable heterosexual relationships as a form of work. I critically examine this notion through a consideration of the work of Christine Delphy and Diana Leonard, who portray “sexual work” as part of housework performed by women in marriage. Subsequently, I illuminate the potential problems with this argument through the extension of Carole Pateman’s work on marriage and prostitution to the issue of unwanted sex. Finally, I point to an alternative analysis compatible with Pateman’s work in the writings of Colette Guillaumin, whose concept of sexage allows an understanding of unwanted sex as part of the individual and collective appropriation of women. This paper makes a contribution to the literature on partner rape and intimate partner violence, areas of relative neglect in feminist sociological theorising.

Keywords: unwanted sex, sex work, partner rape, prostitution, marriage, materialist feminism

The idea that sex is a form of work performed by (largely) female partners for their male partners within stable heterosexual relationships has some degree of currency in feminist popular and scholarly analyses of marriage and relationships (e.g. Delphy & Leonard 1992; Duncombe & Marsden 1996; Federici 2012 [1975]; Maushart 2011). In this literature, it is seen as part of or related to housework and/or emotional labour. However, given the potential conflict between understanding unwanted sex as “work” as opposed to as a form of sexual abuse, it is important for feminists to understand and to question the logic underlying this analysis and to consider its implications for understanding power relations between men and women in heterosexual relationships. The high frequency of heterosexual relationships in society and the concomitant likelihood that the imposition of unwanted sex affects a very large number of women makes this an issue of some urgency. This paper argues that feminists are misguided in understanding unwanted sex as “work” instead of as a form of sexual abuse or rape, and suggests that this phenomenon can be better accounted for using the work of Carole Pateman and Colette Guillaumin.
I consider “unwanted sex” to be sex that is not desired or sought out by one partner. Such sex may be consensual in a formal sense (Muehlenhard & Peterson 2005; Logan et al. 2015), is not necessarily violent and may, once begun, be experienced as pleasurable by the non-initiating partner (Basile, 1999). Although there is a legal and, increasingly, a cultural distinction between consensual and non-consensual sex (West, 1995), in practice it is difficult to define consensual sex, at least in non-formal terms. This is suggested by the fact that several empirical studies have found that women submit to unwanted sex not only as a result of direct coercion (whether subtle or overt), but as a form of “relationship maintenance” (e.g. Finkelhor & Yllo 1985; Logan et al. 2015); that is, when the perceived benefits of engaging in sexual activity at that time, such as reducing relationship tension or preventing her partner from leaving her, outweigh the negatives (Basile 1999; Impett & Peplau 2002; O’Sullivan & Allgeier 1998). This paper therefore addresses all unwanted sex, whether or not it is formally consensual; it is the analysis of this unwanted sex as “work” by some feminist theorists that forms its subject.

Although the issue of whether sex can be considered a form of “work” has been widely debated in the context of prostitution (e.g. Agustín 2007; Ekman 2013; Jeffreys 2006), it has barely been touched upon in the domain of sexual relations between partners in stable heterosexual relationships; instead, the idea that sex is a form of (house)work that women perform in relationships has sometimes been used by feminists in an apparently uncritical way (e.g. Delphy & Leonard 1992; Federici 2012 [1975]; Maushart 2011 [2001]). An example of such writing can be found in the work of Silvia Federici:

For women sex is work; giving pleasure is part of what is expected of every woman… In the past we were just expected to raise children. Now we are expected to have a waged job, still clean the house and have children and, at the end of a double work-day, be ready to hop in bed and be sexually enticing.” (Federici, 2012 [1975]:19, emphasis in original)

And a more recent example from sociologist and journalist Susan Maushart’s popular 2001 book Wifework:

“…for many married women, sex is simply another form of wifework – another way in which women routinely service the physical and emotional needs of their male partners at the expense of their own.” (Maushart, 2011 [2001]:169)

Neglect of critical approaches to ‘sex as housework’ occurs along with lack of attention in feminist and other scholarly literature to broader issues such as partner rape (e.g. Finkelhor & Yllo 1985; Martin et al. 2007; Russell 1982), the role of sexual violence in intimate partner violence (e.g. Logan et al. 2015; White et al. 2008), and the notion of “unwanted sex” generally, including its relationship to sexual coercion and abuse (e.g. Basile 1999; Muehlenhard & Peterson 2005).

Here, I use the work of a number of feminist theorists to question the conception of unwanted sex as a form of work within stable heterosexual relationships, and propose an alternative analysis. Firstly, I examine the work of sociologists Christine Delphy and Diana Leonard as an example of feminist work that portrays sex in marriage as a form of work performed by wives for husbands. Secondly, I interrogate the notion of sex as work within relationships using the work of political theorist Carole Pateman. Finally, I outline a third approach, from sociologist Colette Guillaumin, which avoids the problems raised above and which has the potential to contribute to a more theoretically productive analysis of unwanted sex in heterosexual relationships.

According to materialist feminist Christine Delphy (e.g. Delphy & Leonard 1992; Delphy 1980), households are defined by patriarchal relations because male household heads systematically benefit from the labour of their wives and other dependents (unpaid housework, child-rearing, and material upkeep of husbands through emotional, sexual and other forms of labour).
This relationship is institutionalised in marriage, which exists in large part to facilitate men’s appropriation of their wives’ labour. Delphy and Leonard link this appropriation to the economic deprivation of women: as women are less able than men to support themselves financially due to various forms of economic discrimination in the public sphere, there is some degree of economic pressure on them to marry (or remarry following divorce). After a woman marries, economic discrimination worsens (for example, through pregnancy discrimination), entrenching her dependence on her husband and further facilitating his appropriation of her labour.

Delphy’s earlier work does not mention sexual relations between husbands and wives or male violence within the family. However, in her 1992 book *Familiar Exploitation* written with Diana Leonard, which represents the culmination of her work on this topic, she categorises it as a form of work. For example:

“The obligation to do work within family households is prescribed, especially by sex and marital status. That is, family dependants, and especially female dependants, must do unpaid family work; and wives must also do sexual and reproductive work.” (Delphy & Leonard 1992:111)

The suggestion that wives undertake “sexual and reproductive work” may appear unobjectionable at first glance — after all, wives, almost by definition, frequently undertake such activities voluntarily within marriage. However, the framing of these activities as forms of work is difficult to justify on a logical basis when it is considered what we are then forced to concurrently permit.

Rather than wives, consider the recasting of sexual relations with children in families as “work”; this has been done by researchers applying Delphy’s theory to analyse work performed by male and female working class children (Adkins & Leonard, 1995, p. 326). While the example may not seem parallel to that of wives because children cannot consent to sexual relations, let us not forget that the sexual relations under consideration for wives are already those that are unwanted.

Although Adkins and Leonard do recognise that children’s “sexual labour” is sexual abuse and note the “illegality and moral repugnance” of sexual relations with children (326), it nonetheless seems inappropriate to characterise what is very clearly sexual abuse as “work”. Calling child sexual abuse “work” portrays it as a form of exchange, implying that there is some form of mutual agreement reached and that the parties involved have some degree of equality. It thus acts to make invisible the violence and coercion involved in child abuse and the significant harm caused to children. Since this argument holds for children, it can and should be extended to cover the so-called “sexual work” performed by women in heterosexual relationships; to fail to do so is to weaken our ability to condemn child sexual abuse and to leave intact the notion of men’s ownership over the bodies of their wives and children.

Carole Pateman is critical of feminists (including Delphy) who characterise the labour women perform in marriage as “work” (1988, p. 133); this forms part of her broader disagreement with feminists who suggest that husbands appropriate the labour power of their wives in a way analogous to the appropriation of wage workers’ labour by capitalists (131). Pateman argues that it is both inaccurate and unhelpful to compare the “conjugal labour contract” (117) to the employment contract. It is inaccurate for a number of reasons: for one thing, the employment contract in fact presupposes the existence of the marriage contract in that the construction of the “worker” assumes he has someone (a woman) to take care of his daily needs (a point whose continuing relevance is made abundantly clear by the difficulties faced today by women trying to combine partnership and/or motherhood with paid work) (131). Further, wage labourers stand as civil equals to their employers in the public sphere, whereas wives remain in the private sphere where inequality is considered “natural” (136-137). In a society in which the content of the concept of “work” has been defined by men in men’s interests, “work” is something that men do
in the public/capitalist sphere; what women do in the private sphere, while it may share some similarities with “work”, is something else (135). Pateman calls it “domestic service” (136).

Pateman’s more challenging argument, however, is that the comparison between marriage and employment contracts is *unhelpful*. This is because it suggests that feminists believe that labour power can be separated from the person of the worker. She reminds us that the idea that labour power can be separated from a worker like pieces of material property is a political fiction (150); in reality, labour power is an integral part of a worker’s body and person. When an employer contracts to use the labour power of a worker, what they actually get is the right to command “the self, person and body of the labourer during the period set down in the employment contract” (203) because this self, person and body of the worker is inseparable from their labour power. If feminists accept that the tasks performed by women in marriage can be separated from the persons of the women who perform them, they are left unable to criticise any other institution or argument that relies on this particular political fiction and remain consistent. Thus, for example, feminists could not criticise the labour contract itself, leaving them unable to address, among other things, the massive exploitation of women (and men) wage workers around the world. Feminists also could not criticise the arguments commonly made that practices like prostitution and surrogacy are forms of work “like any other” (143). Since many feminists do want to criticise such arguments, consistency is important here.

Because feminists have worked hard over many years to establish the illegitimacy of rape and sexual abuse within relationships, the criticism of arguments that prostitution and surrogacy are forms of work “like any other” is especially relevant to the issue of unwanted sex within marriage and relationships. Since Pateman does not consider sex a form of “work” but something different, “domestic service”, her work is of use in developing an alternative understanding of unwanted sex within relationships that does not rely on likening it to “work”.

Considering Pateman’s understanding of prostitution provides a way forward in understanding unwanted sex as something other than work. In the case of prostitution, the instruments used to do the “work” are not machines but human bodies; women’s bodies. Unlike in other forms of work, where employers are most interested in the commodities produced by workers (and hence workers can often be replaced by machines, an outcome often desirable to employers), in prostitution clients are inherently interested in the “worker’s” body (203). The “sexual services” she supposedly provides are inseparable from her body and her person in a way that services provided in other forms of work are not. Even in forms of work in which employers do have an intrinsic interest in bodies, such as professional sport, these bodies are not directly used by those employers.

I would like to extend Pateman’s argument to cover the imposition of unwanted sex on women in relationships. It follows from her discussion of marriage and prostitution that unwanted sex is equally not a form of “work” that a woman performs: the “sexual services” that she supposedly provides to her partner are not separable from her person and thus it is the woman’s whole body and person which is used, not just her labour power. Thus, Pateman’s work offers us a way to understand why unwanted sex is not work, at the individual level.

Pateman’s work is well complemented by that of the sociologist Colette Guillaumin (e.g. Guillaumin 1995a; 1995b), whose work offers a way to understand unwanted sex in the context of broader societal arrangements. Working in the same tradition as Christine Delphy – materialist feminism – Guillaumin’s work is nonetheless characterised by some important differences. Rather than arguing that women’s labour is appropriated within the institution of marriage, Guillaumin argues that women’s *entire person* is appropriated by men, including their body from which their labour power emerges. In marriage:
The fact that there is no limit put on work [i.e. a specific set of tasks to be performed], no measure of time [i.e., working hours], no notion of rape (this is of primary importance) shows that this ceding is done en bloc and without limits. And in consequence what is ceded is not labour power, but indeed the material unit which forms the individual herself. (Guillaumin 1995a:191, emphasis in original)

This appropriation takes place both individually, within the institution of marriage, and collectively, in the appropriation of the class of women by the class of men.

…marriage is only the institutional (contractual) surface of a generalized relationship: the appropriation of one sex class by the other. It is a relationship which concerns the entirety of the two classes and not a part of each of them, as the consideration of the marriage contract alone might lead one to believe. The marriage contract is only the individualized expression—in that it establishes an everyday and specific relationship between two particular individuals—of a general class relationship where the whole of one class is at the disposition of the other… [Marriage] legalizes and confirms a relationship which exists before it and outside of it: the material appropriation of the class of women by the class of men—sexage. (Guillaumin 1995b:193, emphasis in original)

This collective appropriation can explain why it is women who perform, for example, the vast majority of the “care work” of society; even unmarried women, lesbians, and nuns are subjected to this form of appropriation (Juteau & Laurin 1989). Guillaumin coined the term “sexage” (by analogy to the French “esclavage” [slavery] and “servage” [serfdom]) to describe this social relation between men and women.

Guillaumin’s concept of sexage has the potential to explain unwanted sex within relationships as one facet of the individual appropriation of women’s entire person through the institution of marriage or other forms of stable heterosexual relationship. Further, her concept of collective appropriation raises interesting questions about the relationship between women’s sexual availability to men in marriage and their sexual availability to the class of men as a whole, for example in prostitution and pornography.

Thus, the combination of Pateman and Guillaumin’s analyses are well suited to addressing the phenomenon of unwanted sex in relationships. Using their work it is possible to create a framework within which unwanted sex can be understood as a phenomenon harmful to women, creating a basis for feminist theory and activism to combat it. Such a framework contributes to the questioning of notions that sex can unproblematically be considered work, challenges cultural expectations of women’s sexual availability in heterosexual relationships, and contributes to expanding definitions of sexual abuse and rape to better reflect the reality of the power relations under which heterosexual relations take place.

The specific harms of the imposition of unwanted sex on women in heterosexual relationships have not been widely explored. However, research on date rape and partner rape – with which unwanted sex shares some characteristics – have found significant and severe effects on victims (e.g. Boucher et al. 2009; Flack et al. 2007). Even though physical violence is often absent in unwanted sex, the potential consequences of this repetitive and routine violation of women’s bodily integrity on their physical and mental health should not be disregarded.
References


Social exclusion in the everyday: (Re)conceptualizing student-migrant experiences in Australia

Xinyu Zhao

School of Humanities and Social Sciences & Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation, Deakin University

Abstract
In Australia, the past two decades witnessed a dynamic growth of international student enrolments. This large-scale mobile population has been welcomed and celebrated due to their potential to increase educational institutions’ revenue and boost local economy. Behind the hype, researchers and educators are increasingly concerned with their experiences of social exclusion in different aspects of life. Based on these studies, this paper examines the conceptual ambiguities around “social exclusion and inclusion” underlining these empirical research. It argues that the problematics of “social exclusion” and “social inclusion” as conceptual tools and the “everyday” as a theoretical lens could facilitate a nuanced approach towards the complexities of student-migrant experiences in Australia. This paper concludes by highlighting the importance to situate future empirical studies in the conceptual complexities of “social exclusion” to foreground the constant interactions between student-migrants as social agents and the social contexts that exclude them in a multidimensional manner. Subsequently, ethnographic methods such as participant observation and in-depth interviews are needed in unpacking the complex agencies of these student-migrants.

Keywords: student-migrants, social exclusion, social inclusion, the everyday, ethnographic methods

Introduction
Recently, increasing media coverages of exploitations and crimes against international students in Australia – Indian students in particular – have unravelled the fact that international students are not merely “students” who spend most of their time on campus; but more importantly, they are “temporary” migrants who are actively engaged in a variety of activities in the broader Australian society and are vulnerable to different forms of exploitation (Marginson et al. 2010; Nyland et al. 2009). Indeed, there has been growing acknowledgement of the blurring boundaries between international students and skilled migrants against the background of countries providing education-migration pathways through their immigration policies and the fact that many of the international students are not only studying in the destination countries, but also working during their stay overseas or are planning to work in the host country after graduation (Baas 2010; Nyland et al. 2009; Robertson 2013b). This is reflected in the rising adoption of the notion of
“student-migrant” which denotes the intimate affinities between, sometimes a hybridization of, education and migration outcomes. In this study, “student-migrants” is adopted in preference to “international students” to recognize both the education-migration nexus in Australia and the fact that these students are actively engaged in other social institutions other than education. That said, in a country where they are supposed to live as temporary visitors for months or years these student-migrants are unable to fully engage in all aspects of Australian life (Paltridge et al. 2012), even though many of them remain residing in Australia after graduation for an extended period of time to work or apply for permanent residency (Baas 2006; 2007; 2010; Robertson 2013b; Robertson & Runangaikaloo 2014). Being temporary excludes them from access to the social resources and welfare services that are available to Australian students (Marginson et al. 2010; Robertson 2016).

In fact, student-migrants’ experiences of social exclusion and marginalization have attracted much scholarly and public attention (Australian Human Rights Commission 2010; Australian Federation of International Students 2010; Jakubowicz & Monani 2010; Marginson et al. 2010; Paltridge et al. 2012; Penn et al. 2013; Sherry et al. 2010; Sherwani 2015). Based on these studies and beyond, this paper particularly examines the conceptual ambiguities around “social exclusion and inclusion” underlining these empirical research. It argues that the problematics of “social exclusion” and “social inclusion” as conceptual tools and the “everyday” as a theoretical lens could facilitate a nuanced approach towards the complexities of student-migrant experiences in Australia. Subsequently, ethnographic methods such as participant observation and in-depth interviews are needed in unpacking the complex agencies of these student-migrants.

**Student-migrants facing exclusion(s)**

So far, available evidence suggests that student-migrants experience exclusive practices in the labor market. They are concentrated “in the lowest strata of student employment”, being partly a result of “racial discrimination and stereotyping” (Marginson et al. 2010: 119). In addition, language barrier has been identified as a major challenge that excludes international students from proper job opportunities in the host society (Birrell 2006; Christopher & Hayes 2008), thus leading them to take up jobs that they would never do in their home countries. In Australia, the Melbourne City Council’s survey in 2006 found that “39 per cent of students wanted better part-time work opportunities and 48 per cent believed their ability to connect to the job market needed to improve” (cited in Marginson et al. 2010: 124). In the meantime, Kell and Vogl (2012) pointed out in their examination of the transnational students’ lived experiences in Australia that high cost of living expenses aggravates their financial difficulties and often “forces students into either working in illegal or working legally in unregulated low-wage jobs that are often dangerous and typified by exploitation” (Kell & Vogl 2012: 134). Unfortunately, even after their graduation, these student-migrants still experience this form of nationality-based exclusion from the labor market due to their temporary visa status (Gribble & Blackmore 2012; Robertson 2011; 2014).

From a spatial perspective, the issue of housing further exacerbates the exclusion of overseas students living in the inner urban and suburban areas. Marginson et al. (2010) advocated the urgent need to address the housing problems faced by international students in countries where international education has been commercialized, such as in Australia and the UK. The study detected an emerging reality that “university managers have turned away from the subsidized accommodation traditional in university colleges in favor of profit making housing partnerships” (Marginson et al. 2010: 172). Subsequently, students of challenging socio-economic backgrounds are left alone and excluded from appropriate housing options. This change gives rise to the growing demand of quality, secure accommodations to meet the neglected needs of international students.
While the shortage of decent housing is worrying, extant housing choices offered to international students have also been critically examined. The high-rise apartment buildings designed particularly for international students in Australia are argued to have contributed to a form of spatial exclusion that separates international and domestic students (Fincher 2011). This separation is demonstrated to be spatially generated by the segregated nature of these purpose-built apartment buildings which are occupied almost one-hundred per cent by students from overseas. Fincher later explained that the student-migrants’ concern with security led them to live close to campuses, which further confined them to “the public spaces nearby” and to exclusion from contact with “diverse groups that might bring them a sense of social inclusion in the city more broadly” (Fincher 2011: 188).

The research findings inform us of the possibility that the exclusions experienced by student-migrants can be internalized and integrated into their everyday mundane lives even though there is no sign of major exploitation. Moreover, it also suggests the constant interactions between the distributional (access to housing) and relational (social interactions) dimensions of social exclusion. Along with the distributional forms of exclusion where student-migrants are deprived of access to quality social resources, the relational dimension of social exclusion is also haunting them in host societies. What worries most academics is the finding that student-migrants’ social networks mostly consist of international students from their home nations or other countries (Kashima and Loh 2006; Kashima and Pillai 2011; Rosenthal et al. 2006). It is noted that while the composition of the international students’ social networks could be diversified, they “often have more friends who are fellow citizens from the home country living (and studying) in the same host country” (Gomes 2015: 521).

The segregated pattern of networking is further problematized when international students encounter stereotypes, discrimination and prejudice. Church (1982: 551) noted that “ethnocentric attitudes and stereotypes” inhibit “positive social interaction” between international and local students. In the Australian context, 9.9 per cent of the respondents to Schweitzer’s survey (1996) of 446 students from overseas reported discrimination. Robertson et al. (2000) surveyed 408 undergraduate students from overseas at one Australian university where 20 students mentioned 46 incidents of racial discrimination on campus. Outside the university, “racist remarks or actions” were the third most frequently mentioned problems after “difficulty making friends with locals” and “difficulty understanding slang, idioms, [and] colloquial language” (93). A University of Melbourne report (2004) pointed out that many academic staff held an underlying prejudice towards students from the Asian region and regarded them as problematic.

A review of the above empirical studies points to the multidimensional characteristics of student-migrant experiences in host countries. Admittedly, they face challenges in different aspects of life caused by exclusive structures and practices. However, the complexities and problematic nature of their experiences of social exclusion are yet to be conceptualized. Specifically, it is implied in the literature that the experiences of social exclusion such as segregated living style and limited entry into the job market are always undesirable and unwanted. As a result, they are viewed as victims who need to be “included” or “integrated” with the help of external forces. What have been less addressed are the complex strategies of these students in coping with the social contexts that constrain or exclude them. Admittedly, there has been a growing body of literature addressing student-migrant agencies in pursuing academic well-being and intercultural interactions (Pham & Tran 2015; Tran 2016), in identity making and fulfilling personal aspirations (Martin 2014; Qin 2012), and in seeking political rights (Robertson 2013b). However, in the discussions below this paper will argue that a nuanced and clearer conceptualization of “social exclusion” as a social process and a theoretical concept is helpful to grasp the complexities of student-migrant experiences.
The problematics of social ex/inclusion

The notion of social exclusion was first coined to refer to a segment of the French population who were believed to be “physically disabled, mentally disabled or socially maladjusted” (Evans et al. 2000). However, this stigmatizing connotation was soon sidelined when it was later introduced into the social sciences in the early 1990s to “extend the focus beyond poverty by focusing on the relation between the individual and the society” (Fangen 2010: 133). It has been more broadly used to describe a variety of social problems in contrast to one-dimensional concept of poverty: for example, unemployment, ghettoization, fundamental changes in family life, exclusion from financial services and lack of political participation (Room 1995; Room & Britton 2006). Therefore, it has been conceptualized as a social phenomenon underpinned by multiple deprivation and disadvantages that prevent people from full participation in society.

Approaches towards the issue of social exclusion have been diversified. In her seminal work on the phenomenon of social exclusion, American sociologist Hillary Silver (1994) detected three major conflicting paradigms explaining the emergence of social exclusion, rooted in different philosophical traditions. These approaches are diversified in emphases yet share the common belief that people who are socially excluded are not only excluded from material resources or income, but also from other social dimensions. Therefore, “social exclusion” has been regarded as a multi-faceted concept enabling the researchers to go beyond the focus on material poverty to examine the diversified forms of deprivation in the society (de Haan 1999). More recent efforts pointed to various forms of social exclusion in different social arenas. For example, in her review of the studies on the social exclusion and inclusion of young immigrants, Fangen (2010) pointed out that the complexity of social exclusion lies in the possibility that “exclusion from one arena at the same time is followed by inclusion in another arena” (Fangen 2010: 137). The multidimensionality of social exclusion challenges the idea that there is a segment of population who are completely excluded from the society they dwell and implies that social exclusion is more of a complex and dynamic process where circumstances change and evolve constantly rather than a static outcome (Popay et al. 2008).

The complex and dynamic features of disadvantage underpinning the concept of social exclusion can be categorized mainly into two intertwined dimensions: distributional and relational (De Venanzi 2003; Room 1995). Therefore, social exclusion is not only about unequal distribution of wealth and social resources, although it is still a worrying perspective for international students as temporary visitors living in a country on a long-term basis without citizenship (as shown in the preceding literature review); more importantly, the concept also denotes unequal power relations in social interactions that produce ruptures between people and society (Khan 2012). Similarly, in the first of a series of Social Development Papers prepared for the Asian Development Bank, Amartya Sen (2000) scrutinized the connotation and application of the idea of social exclusion by exploring its connections in relation to discussions of poverty and capability deprivation. Sen argued that the notion of social exclusion is helpful in terms of “its practical influence in forcefully emphasizing – and focusing attention on – the role of relational features in deprivation” (Sen 2000: 8).

In the literature on social exclusion, the definition of social inclusion remains implicit and unproblematised: the opposite of social exclusion, or being not socially excluded (Pradhan 2006; Rawal 2008). In other words, social inclusion remains a response to the increasing issues of social marginalization and exclusion. This implied normative assumption of social inclusion has been questioned and critiqued by many, arguing for a clearer conceptualization of what constitutes social inclusion as well as its problematic nature (Cameron 2006; O’Reilly 2005; Jackson 1999; Askonas & Stewart 2000; Hickey & du Toit 2007). In his critical exploration of social inclusion, Cameron (2006) pled for a more explicit conception of social inclusion in order to avoid excessive
academic focus on the problems and deficits of the excluded only. The contested discussions of how to define social inclusion is also manifested by debates over the relationship between social exclusion and inclusion. O’Reilly (2005), for example, argued that it is best to conceptualize social exclusion and inclusion “as a sort of sliding scale rather than as a binary function, so that inclusion and exclusion are the extreme poles of a continuum of relations of inclusion/exclusion” (O’Reilly, 2005: 84). Although still positioning social exclusion and inclusion at two opposite poles, O’Reilly did acknowledge the complex variables and details that problematize the dynamics of social exclusion and inclusion.

Similarly, other researchers point to “moral meta-narrative” that underlie many empirical studies (Hickey & du Toit 2007: 3), which tend to neglect the contexts of inclusion, assuming that all forms of inclusion are inherently desirable (Jackson 1999; Kabeer 2000). This implied top-down perspective sees people who experience social exclusion as passive recipients of protection and support without acknowledgment of their own agency. What should receive more attention is the fact that both exclusion and inclusion can lead to unwanted consequences, especially when the incorporation is in adverse terms. Therefore, we need a more nuanced approach towards the issues of social exclusion and inclusion so that complexities and contexts are considered. At the same time, we need to take into consideration human agency which plays a vital role in the processes of social exclusion and inclusion. Individuals may mobilize their own resources to cope with the exclusions they experience (Vobruba 2000). Not all those who are socially excluded desire a form of social inclusion defined and designed by others, especially when they expect to encounter adverse outcomes when they are “socially included”. Under such circumstances, some may prefer a status of “social exclusion” to resist the hegemonic discourse. This is important as it indicates that social exclusion could be more than social processes but also social practices that individuals impose on others or themselves. However, we should bear in mind that this form of exclusion is fundamentally different from the “social exclusion” underlined by domination and unequal power relations.

All this said, we need to rethink and problematize the boundaries between social exclusion and inclusion when applying the concepts in empirical studies (Pradhan 2006). We need to transcend the simple binary opposition to achieve a nuanced understanding of the complexities of social exclusion and inclusion. This study argues that the complexities of social exclusion provide a lens through which people’s everyday lived experiences could be examined. To achieve this end, more attention should be paid to people’s everyday experiences of social exclusion and inclusion in various aspects of life and the contexts in which these experiences are embedded. Such an approach helps reveal the complex relations between the experiences of exclusion and how people respond, adapt and negotiate agentically, which contribute to our understanding of people’s lived experiences.

**Living with social exclusion and inclusion**

Increasingly, social scientists are taking up the lens of the everyday to understand how the “wider structures and discourses filter through to the realm of everyday practice, exchange and meaning making, and vice versa” (Wise & Velayutham 2009: 3; Harris 2013; Noble 2005). Drawing from long traditions in sociology, a focus on the everyday highlights the mundane and the hidden and attempts to find out what is extraordinary about the ordinary. A perspective of everyday life thus allows us to gain in-depth knowledge of how social exclusion is lived on the ground and in what implicit ways it is perceived, accepted or resisted.

The preceding section on the complexities of “social exclusion” and “social inclusion” unravels the importance to contextualize the terms in order to avoid simplistic and normative assumptions of the outcomes of social exclusion or inclusion. For this reason, a small but growing body of research attends to the everydayness of social exclusion (Webb 2010; Valentine et al. 2002).
Whereas there has been expansive literature on student-migrants’ everyday experiences of social exclusion and discrimination (Sherry et al. 2010; Graycar 2010; Gomes 2015; Penn et al. 2013; Sherwani 2015), the “everyday” remains under-conceptualized and so is the concept of “social exclusion”. The problematic nature of social exclusion in the everyday setting helps foreground the complex experiences and agencies of these student-migrants and brings to light the constant interactions between students and social contexts.

What does an everyday perspective add to the understanding of social exclusion and inclusion? First of all, the mundane sites of everyday life bring to light the intertwined and fragmented interactions between social exclusion and inclusion. The blurry boundaries between social exclusion and inclusion are best exemplified in everyday situations. Secondly, an everyday perspective reminds researchers of the importance of human agency in “negotiating” being excluded or included. It helps bring to light the “creative and reflective actions taken by individuals” (Webb 2010: 8). As pointed out by Webb, “the everyday is that which escapes the abstractions of social life found in dry statistical determinants” and “the place where individuals routinely defy the categories and governmentalities of policy makers” (Webb 2010: 9).

On the empirical level, the everydayness of social exclusion is examined in Valentine et al.’s study (2002) which explored the inclusionary and exclusionary potentials of contemporary ICTs for children in the UK. Specifically, access to computers has unexpectedly produced forms of “everyday social exclusions” in that those children who have developed close affinities with computers are considered by the rest to be “sad”, “boffins” and “geeks” (Valentine et al. 2002: 307). As a result, these computer-literate children experience and feel the exclusion on a daily basis.

In the context of the present study, the lens of everyday life enables a shift from the academic interest in identifying and describing social problems and disadvantages faced by student-migrants to a more in-depth examination of how these challenges impact their everyday lives in Australia and how they subsequently respond to these situations. To sum up, the complexity of the concept of social exclusion and inclusion allows the researcher to question the taken-for-granted culture of integration towards student-migrant populations and unpack the complexities of their lived experiences as well as their relations with the “Australian society”.

Concluding remarks
As part of a bigger PhD project which examines the intersections of experiences of social exclusion and everyday social media practices among Chinese student-migrants in Australia, this paper has reviewed the extant empirical studies on student-migrants’ experiences in Australia and beyond, suggesting their vulnerabilities to exclusion and marginalization in various sectors of life. However, the problematic nature of social exclusion and inclusion remains implicit in these empirical studies.

Despite the growing academic interest in revealing student-migrants’ agencies, the current literature is limited in terms of its scope. For instance, whereas the student-migrants’ socio-cultural and academic agencies have been studied, the political and economic dimensions have been comparatively under-addressed. Moreover, what is still unclear is how these student-migrants’ responses to experiences of social exclusion in different dimensions influence each other. For example, their strategies towards economic exclusion may be linked to their experiences of socio-cultural marginalization.

This paper, therefore, argues the importance to situate future empirical studies in the conceptual complexities of “social exclusion” to foreground the constant interactions between student-migrants as social agents and the social contexts that exclude them in a multidimensional manner. By situating the problematics of “social exclusion” in the sites of everyday life, it brings to
light the heterogeneous nature of student-migrant experiences and seeks to avoid simplifications of the “excluded” or “included” situations. Adopting the lens of everyday life, the paper calls for ethnographic research methods such as participant observation and in-depth interviews to capture the nuances of the student-migrants’ everyday experiences and negotiations. As a method that enables us to understand, “in the round and in depth, how people make sense of their lives” (Hine 2015: 1), ethnography facilitates a nuanced approach towards student-migrants’ lived experiences.
Reference


Tran, L. (2016). Students' Academic, Intercultural and Personal Development in Globalised Education Mobility. In C.-h. C. Ng, R. Fox, & M. Nakano (Eds.), Reforming Learning and Teaching in Asia-Pacific Universities (pp. 95-113). Singapore: Springer.

University of Melbourne. (2004). Students from Asia: Issues in learning and teaching. Melbourne:
Faculty of Education and Asialink, University of Melbourne.
Local Organising Committee

Assoc Prof Farida Fozdar,
Assoc Prof Loretta Baldassar (Discipline Chair)
Assoc Prof Martin Forsey
Dr Donella Caspersz (Business)

Associates:
Dr Greg Acciaioli (Anthropology & Sociology)
Prof Mark Israel (Law)
Prof Harry Blagg (Law)
Dr Hilde Tubex (Law)
Prof Jo Elfving-Hwang (Asian Studies)

Postgraduates:
Ms Catriona Stevens
Ms Adele Millard
Ms Maki Meyer
Ms Ashleigh Haw
Dr Alka Sabharwal

Contact TASA for more details: admin@tasa.org.au